# Educating Citizens for "Sexual Manners": Politics of Sexuality between 1945-1965 in Turkey

Laden Yurttagüler Akkuş

A dissertation presented to the

Atatürk Institute for Modern Turkish History at Boğaziçi University

in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

November 2022

#### **Declaration of Originality**

The intellectual content of this dissertation, which has been written by me and for which I take full responsibility, is my own, original work, and it has not been previously or concurrently submitted elsewhere for any other examination or degree of higher education. The sources of all paraphrased and quoted materials, concepts, and ideas are fully cited, and the admissible contributions and assistance of others with respect to the conception of the work as well as to linguistic expression are explicitly acknowledged herein.

Copyright © 2022 Laden Yurttagüler Akkuş Some rights reserved.



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0 International License.

To view a copy of this license, visit http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/4.0/

#### **Abstract**

Educating Citizens for "Sexual Manners": Politics of Sexuality between 1945-1965 in Turkey

Laden Yurttagüler Akkuş, Doctoral Candidateat the Atatürk Institute for Modern Turkish History at Boğaziçi University, 2022

Professor Nadir Özbek, Dissertation Advisor

This study aims to examine the discourse on "sexual manners" that has become visible in the public sphere in Turkey between 1945 and 1965, a period marked by political, economic, and social changes. On the one hand, "sexual manners" turned into a constructive and regulative discourse for concepts such as femininity, masculinity, marriage, family, reproduction, and birth control, based on the legitimacy of "scientification," when the sexuality of the citizens was considered invisible and muted in the public sphere. The sexual manners discourse, produced by the authors gathered around Seksoloji magazine and similar publishing houses, developed discussions in line with the global literature for the well-being of the individual and collective body. On the other hand, sexual manners contributed to the circulation of new norms for "desired" citizenship by aiming to regulate intimate relations between individuals. This dissertation aims to discuss the transformation regarding the "appropriate sexuality" of the period by focusing on the tensions between discourse and practice through subjects such as virginity, sexual pleasure, divorce, and extramarital affairs.

108.278 words

#### Özet

Yurttaşların "*Cinsi Terbiyesi*": Türkiye'de 1945-1965 Arası Cinselliğin Politikası

Laden Yurttagüler Akkuş, Doktora Adayı, 2022 Boğaziçi Üniversitesi Atatürk İlkeleri ve İnkılap Tarihi Enstitüsü

Profesör Nadir Özbek, Tez Danışmanı

Bu çalışma, siyasi, ekonomik ve toplumsal dönüşümlerin damgasını vurduğu 1945 ve 1965 yılları arasında Türkiye'de kamusal alanda görünür olan "cinsi terbiye" söylemini incelemeyi amaçlamaktadır. Kamusal alanda öznelerin cinselliğinin görünmez olduğu düşünülen bu dönemde, "cinsi terbiye", bir yandan, "bilimsellik" meşruiyetine dayanarak cinsellik ve cinselliği çevreleyen kadınlık, erkeklik, evlilik, aile, üreme, doğum kontrolü gibi kavramlar için kurucu ve düzenleyici bir söylem olmuştur. Seksoloji dergisi ve benzer yayınevleri çevresinde buluşan yazarlar tarafından üretilen cinsi terbiye söylemi, bireysel ve toplumsal bedenin iyi hali için dünyadaki literatüre ile esgüdüm tartışmalar üretmişlerdir. Diğer yandan, cinsi terbiye söylemi, bireylerin arasındaki mahrem ilişkileri düzenlemeyi amaçlayarak, makbul yurttaşlık hali için yeni normların dolaşımına girmesine katkıda bulunmuştur. Bu tez, bekaret, cinsi haz, boşanma, evlilik dışı ilişki gibi konular üzerinden söylemle pratik arasındaki gerilimlere odaklanarak dönem içinde "olumlanan ve uygun bulunan cinselliğin" dönüşümünü tartışmaya açmayı amaçlamaktadır.

108.278 kelime

#### Curriculum Vitæ

#### LADEN YURTTAGÜLER AKKUŞ

15/05/1976 in Istanbul, Turkey

#### EDUCATION

Ph.D. Atatürk Institute for Modern Turkish History

Boğaziçi University

2022

M.A. Atatürk Institute for Modern Turkish History

Boğaziçi University

2004

B.A. Educational Sciences Department

Boğaziçi University

2001

#### PROFESSIONAL APPOINTMENTS/EMPLOYMENT

- Coordinator for Youth Studies Unit, Istanbul Bilgi University (2015 present)
- Coordinator for Center for Civil Society Studies (CCSS), Istanbul Bilgi University (2005 present)
- Lecturer Istanbul Bilgi University (2005 present)
- "Promoting Human Rights in School Textbooks" Project Coordinator, History Foundation (2002-2003)

#### **PUBLICATIONS**

"Gençlik, Gönüllülük ve Katılım." In *Türkiye'de Gönüllülük: Deneyimler, Sınırlılıklar ve Yeni Açılımlar*, edited by Emre Erdoğan, Pınar Uyan-Semerci, Nurhan Yentürk and Laden Yurttagüler. İstanbul: Istanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2020.

- Partnership between the European Commission and the Council of Europe in the field of Youth, *Shrinking Democratic Civic Space for Youth*, Tomaž Deželan and Laden Yurttagüler, Youth Partnership Policy Paper, Strasbourg: EU-CoE Youth Partnership, 2020.
- "The Impact of Youth Policies in Turkey." Power2Youth Horizon Working Paper No. 10, May 2016.
- "Gençlerin Özerkliği Var Mı?" In *Özerklikler ve Özgürlükler açısından Türkiye'de Gençlik Politikası*, edited by Laden Yurttagüler, Burcu Oy and Yörük Kurtaran. İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2014.
- 1930-1990 Meclisin Gençlik Söylemi. İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2014.
- *Gençlik Çalışmaları Tarihi*, edited by Yörük Kurtaran and Laden Yurttagüler. İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2014.
  - "Yoksullukla Mücadelede STK'ların Rolü: Hizmet Verme ve Sosyal Hak Anlayışı Arasındaki Gerilim." In *İnsan Hakları İhlali Olarak Yoksulluk*, edited by Pınar Uyan. İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2010.
- "Savunuculuk, Yurttaşlık ve Katılım." In *Savunuculuk ve Politikaları Etkileme* (with Nurhan Yentürk, Yiğit Aksakoğlu, İrfan Neziroğlu, Habip Kocaman, Ebru Ağduk). İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2010.
- "Civil Society Dialogue in Action: A Review of Civil Society Workshop Series." In *Civil Society Dialogue Between Turkey and France: Transcending Stereotypes*, edited by Senem Aydın-Düzgit and Ayhan Kaya. İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2009.
- "Gençlik ve Sosyal Dışlanma." in *Türkiye'de Gençlik Çalışması ve Gençlik Politikaları*, edited by Nurhan Yentürk, Yörük Kurtaran and Gülesin Nemutlu. İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2008
- Gönüllülerle İşbirliği. (with Alper Akyüz), İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2006.

#### TEACHING EXPERIENCE

■ Lecturer at Istanbul Bilgi University

Courses taught: Civil Society Theory (2015-present); Global Civil Society

(2019-present); Advocacy and Lobbying for CSOs (2014-2020); Active

Citizenship and Participation (2016-2019); Volunteering and Human Resources for CSOs (2015-2016); Social Movements and Social Policies (2015-2016); Civil Society, NGOs and Participation (2010-2016); Gender and Everyday Practices (2014-2016); Social Responsibility Course (2006-2014); NGO Capacity Building and Management (2012-2013); NGOs and Capacity Development (2009-2012); Youth and Europe (2010-2011); NGO Management and Capacity Building (2009-2010); Social Responsibility, Civil Society and Istanbul (2009-2010).

#### LANGUAGES

- Turkish –Native Speaker
- English Fluent
- German –Advanced

#### PROFESSIONAL MEMBERSHIPS/AFFILIATIONS

■ Member of the Pool of European Youth Researchers – Youth Partnership of European Commission and Council of Europe

to my mother, *Güveyre* and to my father, *Sezar* 

### Table of Contents

Agragia	-	laamanta	3/3 17 7 7
ACKIIOW		iscincins.	xviii
		lgements	

1	INTE	RODUCTION 1
	1.1	From <i>Democracy Manners</i> to <i>Sexual Manners</i> during Changing Times 3
	1.2	Formation of <i>Sexual Manners</i> discourse between 1945 and 1965 10
	1.3	Periodization, Sources and Outline of the Study 25
2	EDU	CATING CITIZENS FOR "SEXUAL MANNERS" 33
	2.1	Increasing Visibility of Sexuality in the 1950s 38
	2.2	Tools for Sexuality 72
	2.3	Why Sexual Manners? 84
	2.4	Presentation, Content, and Forms of <i>Sexual Manners</i> 124
	2.5	Who to Teach — Whom To Teach 167
	2.6	Appropriate Sexuality 201
3	CON	STRUCTION OF MARRIAGE AND FAMILY 237
	3.1	Family as the Core Unit 245
	3.2	Marriage as a Process in the Making 260
	3.3	W hat Kind of Marriage is Imagined? 270
	3.4	Divorce as a Possible, but Un-wanted Practice 278
4	CON	CLUSION 293

Bibliography 299

### Abbreviations and Acronyms

DP	Democrat Party (Demokrat Parti)
LPP	The Law on Population Planning (Nüfus Planlaması
	Hakkında Kanun)
NDP	National Development Party (Milli Kalkınma Partisi)
PHL	The Public Hygiene Law (Umumi Hıfzısıhha Kanunu)
RPP	Republican People's Party (Cumhuriyet Halk Partisi)
SPA	State Planning Agency (Devlet Planlama Teşkilatı)

#### Acknowledgements

It will be a rather long acknowledgement since it took a long time to research and write this thesis. This dissertation was interrupted by my personal and political engagements. Wonderful people have supported and encouraged me during the process. Without them, I would probably have given up. This part of my studies came to an end, and for that I'm relieved and pleased.

First of all, I'd like to express my thanks to the supervisor of this dissertation Nadir Özbek, who encouraged me to continue my studies and complete this dissertation. As a lifelong advisor to my studies, I'm deeply grateful for his support. I also thank my committee members, Berna Yazıcı, Gülhan Balsoy, and Cengiz Kırlı for accepting to be a part of this journey and for their insightful feedback. I'd like to express my gratitude to Pınar Uyan specially, for being an academic mentor, an encouraging friend, and an enthusiastic fellow traveler on my journey.

I want to send my best greetings to Necla Turunç, our deceased secretary at the Ataturk Institute, who was always supportive to all of us. Leyla Kılıç deserves my thanks. Kadriye Tamtekin, who has always been so helpful and friendly from my very first contact with the Ataturk Institute till today, and Dilek Tecirli earn my special gratitude.

In my academic journey as a bachelor, master, and doctorate student, I was lucky to be a part of Boğaziçi University. I met extraordinary people along the way, from whom I learned a lot. I'm deeply grateful for having such an empowering opportunity. I hope that Boğaziçi University can conserve its mind-opening and critical environment also for its prospective students.

In my life, I met wonderful women who did not only intrigue me with intellectual discussions. But they also became a source of inspiration for me. Ferhunde Özbay, who passed away in 2015, has not only been my professor. She was also a dear friend to me. I wish that she could see the end of this study. Ayşe Buğra became an inspiration for my intellectual discussions. Nurhan Yentürk became an enforcing support to finish this dissertation. You stood by younger women like me in many areas of life. I'm deeply thankful to you all.

I've been engaged with civil society organizations working on rights-based issues in Turkey for the last twenty years. I had the chance to meet and work with very courageous and inspiring people. In the name of them, I'd like to thank all of my colleagues at Istanbul Bilgi University's Center for Civil Society Studies.

I have dear friends who support me even in extraordinary situations. Particularly, I want to give my thanks to Işıl, Adis and Eren, who gave their time, read the versions, made suggestions, and saved me from my digital-problems. You all are precious.

Last but not least, I want to thank my family. I would have given up without the encouragement and support of my dear mother Güveyre and father Sezar. Thank you for believing me. My grandmother Nebahat inspired me to look at the 1950s with her stories. Without her, I would not be interested in the 1950s. My dear Toprak accompanied me patiently during long hours when I was writing. A heartfelt thanks goes to my husband, Volkan. From cooking delicious meals to increasing my spirit, he supported me through this journey.

"It may be in our sexuality that we are most easily enslaved, both men and women. It maybe there, even as free men and women, that we find freedom hardest to keep. The politics of the flesh are the roots of power."

– Ursula K. Le Guin, Four Ways to Forgiveness

#### Introduction

In the social science literature, the 1950s are frequently associated with the aftermath of the Second World War, the dipole world, and the beginning of the Cold War. In tandem with developments in political life and political structure, the decade witnessed transformations in economic structure with mass production and mass consumption, in international relations, in popular culture, and even in social life and the everyday practices of individuals. World-wide developments coincided with the discussions and changes in Turkey's political regime, economic developments, and social life. Turkey's political regime shifted to a multi-party system in the mid-1940s, resulting in a radical transformation in the political structure.

For a discussion on the transformation process of the world during the 1950s, see: Eric Hobsbawm, *Age of Extremes: the Short Twentieth Century 1914-1991* (London: Abacus, 1995). Mark Mazower, *Dark Continent: Europe's Twentieth Century* (New York: Penguin, 1999). For Turkey, see: Feroz Ahmad, *The Making of the Modern Turkey* (London, New York: Routledge, 1993).

Simultaneously, this transformation has dramatically changed citizens' participation in political processes.<sup>2</sup> Furthermore, it has sparked fresh discussions regarding the boundaries and limits of citizens' freedom, as well as their ability to participate in decision-making processes. Economically, Turkey began to link with the rest of the world and assess its population in the light of the "development" debate.3 Paralel to the efforts about the "development of the country," Turkey was influenced by the global discussions over the necessity for "expertise" in managing social issues (and its population). The quest for expertise brought Turkey closer to the academic and popular discussions produced by the United States' academia.<sup>4</sup> The decision makers of the country sought expertise in many areas regarding social<sup>5</sup> including migration, health, housing, poverty, and child mortality, all of which could have a significant impact on the population's well-being.<sup>6</sup> The transformations in the political, economic, and managerial structures generated changes in society, ranging from the consumption habits of the citizens to the use of communication mediums such as the rise of popular press.<sup>7</sup>

The contours of citizenship have been re-defined as a result of a combination of political, economic, social, and management-level developments, in line with the construction of democratic processes, new

Cemil Koçak, İktidar ve Demokratlar Türkiye'de İki Partili Siyasi Sistemin Kuruluş Yılları (1945-1950), Cilt 2, second edition (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2018). Tanel Demirel, Türkiye'nin Uzun On Yılı: Demokrat Parti İktidarı ve 27 Mayıs Darbesi (İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Yayınları, 2011).

Gağlar Keyder, *Türkiye'de Devlet ve Sınıflar*, trans. Sabri Tekay, fifth edition (İstanbul: İletisim Yayınları, 1999). Roger Owen and Şevket Pamuk, *A History of Middle East Economies in the Twentieth Century* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1999).

<sup>4</sup> Cangül Örnek, "1950'li yıllarda ABD ile buluşma: Anti-komünizm, Modernleşmecilik ve Maneviyatçilik" (Ph.D. Dissertation, Marmara University, 2010).

David G. Horn, *Social Bodies: Science, Reproduction, and Italian Modernity* (Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1995), 99, 127.

Pat O'Malley, "Governmentality and Risk," in *Social Theories of Risk and Uncertainity, an Introduction*, ed. Jens O. Zinn (Malden, Oxford, and Victoria: Blackwell Publishing, 2008), 52-75. Mitchell Dean, "The Malthus Effect: Population and the Liberal Government of Life," *Economy and Society* 44, 1 (2015): 18-39.

<sup>7</sup> Selda Bulut, "Hürriyet Gazetesi: 1948-1953 Döneminin Yayın Politikası" (PhD Dissertation, Ankara University, 2007), 4.

co-existence practices in the public sphere, and the creation of new institutional structures, respectively. Consequently, the introduction of new norms in various areas of life became necessary. Attributes of citizenship, engagement in the public sphere, and formation of new norms and behaviors addressing individuals' daily practices were discussed under the notion of *terbiye* (manners). *Terbiye* as a concept became visible in public debate that determines the limits and norms of citizens' behavior, ranging from etiquette in the public sphere to how to participate in a democratic regime. Furthermore, *terbiye* extended its influence to the regulation of the private sphere, the private (*mahrem*) and sexuality of individuals, giving rise to the concept of *cinsi terbiye* (sexual manners).

This study intends to analyze the discursive and practical construction of "sexual manners" in Turkey between 1945-1965, its influencing actors, and its impact on the discussions and practices of the citizens regarding sexual matters.

## 1.1. From Democracy Manners to Sexual Manners during Changing Times

Sexual manners (*cinsi terbiye*), which is a joint concept in reference to sexuality (*cinsellik*) and manners (*terbiye*) increased its visibility and was discussed in the public sphere in the second half of the 1940s. Since the establishment of the Republic, both the manners (*terbiye*) and sexuality of the citizens have been concerning topics for the decision-makers. Manners (*terbiye*) has been associated with efforts to educate and form citizens. In the 1930s, *terbiye* was mostly used as a concept that covered pedagogy, education, and discipline of children and young people. Füsun Üstel points out the importance of adding citizenship education courses to the school curriculum to enhance national education (*milli terbiye*) in the early years of

Bedi Ziya Egemen, *Terbiye İlminin Problemleri ve Terbiye Felsefesi* (Ankara: Ankara Üniversitesi Basımevi, 1965). For an interchangeable use of education (*eğitim*) and discipline (*terbiye*), see: John Dewey, *Demokrasi ve Terbiye*, trans. Avni Başman (Ankara: Devlet Matbaası, 1928).

the Republic.<sup>9</sup> Yiğit Akın analyzes the physical education (*beden terbiyesi*) courses for children and young people during the 1930s.<sup>10</sup> In the second half of the 1940s, the outreach of *terbiye* as a regulatory concept expanded to areas where noticeable changes had occurred, such as the new ways of *democracy*.

On July 7, 1945, ten days before the Potsdam Conference, Nuri Demirağ applied to the Ministry of Interior Affairs to establish a party, Milli Kalkınma Partisi (National Development Party- NDP), which historians considered a milestone from a single-party regime to a multi-party regime in Turkey. Other political parties followed the NDP in a newly increasing democratic wave, which also entailed the establishment of the Demokrat Parti (Democrat Party-DP). DP was established by a group of Cumhuriyet Halk Partisi (Republican People's Party-RPP) members who were opposed to, particularly, the economic policies of the current government. After intense discussions at the assembly, four representatives resigned from the RPP in 1945 and established the DP in 1946. 11 The formation of political parties was the turning moment in the change of the political regime. The first multi-party election of the Turkish Republic was held on July 21, 1946, which ended with a controversial win for the RPP. In the second half of the 1940s, the political life of Turkey started to experience critical changes in the political system, such as the formation of new political parties, multiparty elections, changing laws regarding the political structure and the political culture, such as the emergence of oppositional voices, demanding more space for freedom of speech, and discussions about "democracy culture."12

<sup>9</sup> Füsun Üstel, "Makbul Vatandaş"ın Peşinde, II. Meşruiyet'ten Bugüne Vatandaşlık Eğitimi (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2004).

<sup>10</sup> Yiğit Akın, *Gürbüz ve Yavuz Evlatlar: Erken Cumhuriyet'te Beden Terbiyesi ve Spor* (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2004).

<sup>11</sup> Koçak, İktidar ve Demokratlar, 15-75.

<sup>12</sup> Cemil Koçak, *CHP İktidarının Sonu Türkiye'de İki Partili Siyâsî Sistemin Kuruluş Yılları* (1945-1950), *Cilt 6* (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2017), for the formation of political structure, 355-401; for radio discussions, 163-172. Koçak, *İktidar ve Demokratlar*, for the 1946 elections, 455-532. Tanel Demirel, *Türkiye'nin Uzun On Yılı: Demokrat Parti İktidarı ve 27 Mayıs Darbesi* (İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Yayınları, 2011).

After the 1946 election, the parliamentary turned into a "real" discussion platform, which hosted heated debates between the RPP, the ruling party, and the "main" opposition party, the DP. Along with parliamentarian debates, political discussions in the public sphere escalated and found a place in the pages of various types of publications. In the second half of the 1940s, daily and weekly publications started to flourish in parallel with the developments in publishing technology that catered to visual material.<sup>13</sup> Their numbers and their circulation increased noticeably, in particular, between 1948 and 1954, 14 which was a sign of the attempts to reach a wider public. Moreover, the newspapers were associated with political parties or ideas in the embodiment of the editor-in-chief, who engaged in polemics through the pages of their newspapers. 15 During the 1945-1955 period, Zafer, Vatan, and Milliyet were considered to be associated with the DP. Ulus was considered the mouthpiece of the RPP. Hürriyet was considered the defender of pro-America and democratization.<sup>16</sup> In parallel to the technical developments in the press sector, distribution opportunities had been developed for the published materials. The circulation of printed material had increased significantly compared to the previous decade, with the second half of the 1940s and, increasingly, during the 1950s. The availability of the media provided a broader space for public political discussions. In addition to the press, the radio was also instrumentalized for political propaganda.<sup>17</sup> With the help of the written media, the discourse on

Levent Cantek, Cumhuriyetin Büluğ Çağı: Gündelik Yaşama Dair Tartışmalar (1945-1950) (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2008). Bulut, Hürriyet Gazetesi: 1948-1953 Döneminin Yayın Politikası, 4. Nazife Güngör, "Türkiye'de Popüler Kültür ve Çizgi Roman," Gazi University Journal of Economics and Administrative Sciences 12, 1-2 (1996): 337-354.

Bulut, "Hürriyet Gazetesi: 1948-1953 Döneminin Yayın Politikası," 4. Cantek, *Cumhuriyetin Büluğ Çağı*.

Bulut, "Hürriyet Gazetesi: 1948-1953 Döneminin Yayın Politikası," 3. Cantek, *Cumhuriyetin Büluğ Çağı*. Funda Şenol-Cantek, "Ellili Yıllar Türkiye'sinde Basın," in *Türkiye'nin 1950'li Yılları*, ed. Mete Kaan Kaynar (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2015), 423-427.

Bulut, "Hürriyet Gazetesi: 1948-1953 Döneminin Yayın Politikası," 1.

<sup>17</sup> Cem Pekman, İstanbul Radyosu: Anılar, Yaşantılar (İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Publishing, 2000). Cem Pekman discussed how radio makes the dissemination of popular discourse possible.

democratization and freedom was promoted and distributed at the end of the 1940s and throughout the 1950s.

The discussions regarding democracy did not only focus on the structures and processes of the representative democratic system. The political system was changing towards a multi-party structure, echoing through the discussions about the norms, culture, and structures of democracy in the public sphere. Behice Boran stated that a habit and a tradition of criticism and opposition started to be established during this period. The rules and regulations of the multi-party system, critics of the opposition against the political power, the right of monitoring and resistance of the opposition were thoroughly discussed. At the 1950 election, citizens of the Republic used voting as a way of expressing their political struggle and, also, as a result of their new "democracy manners."

Meanwhile, the adequacy and capability of the citizens regarding the democratic culture were causing severe concerns among the decision makers and opinion leaders in society. Hence, leading figures of society (from different political circles) attempted to install the "culture of democracy" in the attitudes and behaviors of the citizens through different channels. *Terbiye* as an approach was used to define, standardize, and distribute the norms of a newly constructed or changing situation. Regarding democracy, *terbiye* aimed to create proper and desirable citizens for the Republic, who would have sufficient information and attitude to act in a newly changing democratic system. While the structures of the political

Behice Boran, *Türkiye ve Sosyalizmin Sorunları* (İstanbul: GünYayınları, 1968), 43–44. "Bir tenkit ve muhalefet alışkanlığı, geleneği oluşmaya başladı."

Boran, *Türkiye ve Sosyalizmin Sorunları*, 43–44. "...çok partili demokratik rejimin politik ve parlamenter kuralları, muhalefetin iktidarı tenkit, denetleme ve ona karşı koyma hakları bu devrede enine boyuna tartışıldı, savunuldu."

<sup>20</sup> Sinan Yıldırmaz "Demokrat Parti ve Dönemi: Sol Tarihyazımında "Kayıp" Zamanın İzinde," *Praksis*, 18 (2009), 36–37.

Whether it was as a result of these attempts or not, according to Yıldırmaz, the initial attempts of getting organized and establishing associations have roots in the 1950s, which were also real cause of the social movements of the 1960s. Sinan Yıldırmaz, "Demokrat Parti ve Dönemi: Sol Tarihyazımında "Kayıp" Zamanın İzinde," 40.

Norbert Elias, *Uygarlık Süreci, Cilt 1*, trans. Ender Ateşman, eleventh edition (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2021).

system were changing, members of the new Republic aimed to be prepared for the changes in order to "deserve citizenship status" and act according to the needs of the new regime. Within the *terbiye* framework, it was aimed to encourage citizens to have appropriate etiquette (manners) regarding democracy, which invited citizens to find *balance* and *harmony*, and avoid *excessive* behaviors in a democratic system. The changes in the structures and legislation of the political system coincided with the promotion of "democracy manners" among the citizens in the second half of the 1940s and the beginning of the 1950s. After his resignation from RPP due to his appointment as the new governor of Istanbul, Fahrettin Kerim Gökay launched a meeting with journalists. While he was answering questions, he stated that he saw "democracy schools" in foreign countries to teach democracy manners to the citizens. He stressed the importance of democracy manners and said that "We have to walk this way." 26

Discussions about citizens' manners did not begin and end with complying with democratic values. Due to the changes in various platforms of society, decision-makers of the country stressed the need for citizens to be educated in various areas, such as public etiquette,<sup>27</sup> which refered to appropriate behaviors in public as a result of new ways of life. Following "democracy manners" and "public etiquette," a similar invitation regarding

Tanıl Bora, "Cumhuriyet, Demokrasi ve Muhafazakar Türk Cumhuriyetçiliği," in *Medeniyet Kaybı Milliyetçilik ve Faşizm Üzerine Yazılar* (İstanbul: Birikim Yayınları, 2006), 31.

Nusret Köymen, *Demokrasiyi Kurtaralim: Demokrasiyi Kurtaracak Halk Eğitimidir* (İstanbul: Türkiye Basimevi, 1952).

One of the symbolic attempts of the period was launching "democracy education" in schools such as "Okullarda Demokrasi Terbiyesi," *Cumhuriyet*, 26.09.1949. "Fahir Ersen, Tetkikler: Muhtelif gayeli okullar açılırken," *Milliyet*, 15.12.1953. "... orta öğrenim çağında çocuklarımızı da *demokratik terbiye anlayışına* uygun ve mevcut imkanlardan faydalanarak yeni bir tip okulun kurulması kararlaştırılmıştır." (italic mine)

<sup>&</sup>quot;Vali Kanuna Uyarak CHP'den istifa etti," *Cumhuriyet*, 23.10.1949.

Gottfried Andreas, *Görgü: 1. En Yeni ve İleri Muaşeret Usulleri*, trans. Turan Aziz Beler (İstanbul: İnkılâp Kitabevi, 1943). Süheyla Muzaffer, *2. Subay, Asker, Memur, Mektepli ve Umumiyetle Herkes için Modern Adabı Muaşeret* (İstanbul: İnkılâp Kitabevi, 1940). For the public etiquette, see: Serpil Sancar, *Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti* (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2012), 236.

sexuality was articulated by the opinion leaders under the title of "sexual manners" (*cinsi terbiye*).

Concerns regarding regulating sexuality and sexuality-related issues did not arise suddenly in the 1950s. Since the establishment of the Republic, sexual matters, which were considered as potential threats to the well-being of the social (population) have been on the agenda of the decision-makers. The laws and policies of the early Republican period, which were related to sexuality, aimed to ensure healthy reproduction and, consequently, a healthy population. The population of Turkey in the 1927 census was 13,648,270, which was considered highly insufficient for the developmental (economic) goals and protection of the country (military power).<sup>28</sup> In the first decade of the Republic, measures regarding the population focused on two subjects. The first one was ensuring the increase of the population both by taking preventive measures and by promoting pro-natal policies. The second one was preventing deaths through combating infectious diseases.<sup>29</sup> To support the agenda of "promoting births and protecting health," sexuality-related laws and policies were enacted in four main areas: venereal diseases, prostitution and obscenity, and practices related to birth control such as miscarriage and abortion.

Umumi Hıfzısıhha Kanunu (The Public Hygiene Law-PHL) of 1930 was the crystallized version of the legislative framework that addressed early Republican concerns. Similar to the "social hygiene laws" in other countries during the 1930s, the PHL aimed to protect the health of the population and future generations. The PHL covered regulations regarding sexuality-related issues to protect the population's health such as the prevention of venereal diseases, and to promote reproduction, such as the prohibition of contraception. Among the topics, the PHL prioritized the prevention of venereal diseases such as syphilis. In conjuction with the PHL, the Ministry of Health organized campaigns to raise public awareness and educate the

For a critical discussion of the 1927 census and its calculations, see: Frederic C. Shorter, "The Population of Turkey after the War of Independence," *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 17, 4 (1985): 417-441.

The third one is related to migration movements. However, the effect of migration movements on the formation of population policies should be studied separately.

citizens about the harmful effects of venereal diseases.<sup>30</sup> Public education about sexuality was limited to disease control and had a "negative" reference regarding informing the public. The narrative of the educational material aimed mainly to warn the public about the destructive consequences of sexuality. Like the legislation on venereal diseases, regulations and policies about contraception were based on restrictions, which reinforced the "negative" tone about sexuality.<sup>31</sup>

Other than prohibitions and warnings, which were loaded with negating connotations, discussions on sexuality were limited with few marriage manuals in the 1930s. Marriage manuals emerged as a new genre around the turn of the century, aimed at informing engaged and married couples about conjugal relations such as wedding night or mechanism of sexual intercourse. As Müge Koçaklar demostrated, few authentic or translated marriage manuals were published in Turkey during the 1930s, which had limited circulation and remained at the margins of public discussion. Except for promoting reproduction (birth giving), the *sexuality* of individuals was invisible in the public narrative. Consequently, a *laissez faire* approach was dominated public discourse in terms of educating citizens about sexual subjects such as functions of sexual organs, sexual conduct or pleasure.

With the end of the Second World War came a wave of democratization and liberation discussion in the public press, which thrusted forward concepts such as "free society," "free citizen," and "free mind." This tendency was strengthened and articulated during and after the discussions regarding the revisions to the 1931 Press Law. "*Matbuat Kanunu'nun Bazı* 

Murat Arpacı, "Hastalık, ulus ve felaket: Türkiye'de frengi ile mücadele (1920-1950)," *Toplum ve Bilim*, 130 (2014): 59-86.

Jonathan Zimmerman, "A Family of Man? Sex Education in a Cold War World, 1940-1964," in *Too Hot to Handle: A Global History of Sex Education*, ed. Jonathan Zimmerman (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2015).

Roy Porter and Lesley Hall, *The Facts of Life: the Creation of Sexual Knowledge in Britain, 1650-1950* (New Haven and London: Yale University, 1995).

Müge Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality: A New Perspective on the Modernization Project in Turkey from 1931 to 1959" (PhD. Dissertation, Boğaziçi University, 2007).

Maddelerinin Değiştirilmesi Hakkında Kanun" (Law on Amending Some Articles of the Press Law) was enacted in September 1946 after the heated debates in parliament about freedom of speech, a free society, free citizens, and a free press. According to Levent Cantek, with the new law, popular publications started to include various subjects-including sexuality related topics-in its pages with the abolition of the censorship in the press.<sup>34</sup> The second part of the 1940s witnessed the rise of the popular press with the introduction of two newspapers, *Hürriyet* in 1948 and *Milliyet* in 1950. Both newspapers adopted a new approach that aimed to appeal to a larger public by using easy-to-consume content. The new atmosphere of the day enabled the press to deal with easy subjects such as magazine news about the lives of artists or subjects from the lives of ordinary people, such as crime news. As a result of combination of freedom and magazines, subjects related to sexuality started to emerge in the pages of newspapers and journals. While newspapers reserved their content, relatively, for informative news (such as "how to educate children about sexuality" 35), journals and popular manuals provided information and discussions about various subjects, including appropriate sexual behaviors. sexuality in marriage, virginity, homosexuality, legal advice on marriage, divorce, and health advice on sexuality.

## 1.2. Formation of "Sexual Manners" Discourse between 1945 and 1965

"Cinsi terbiye" (sexual manners) appeared as a general topic in the published press, which covered all the sexuality-related subjects. In addition to subjects directly sexuality-related, sexual manners aimed to provide information about gender roles, marriage, the division of labor in marriage, conception, and contraception. The forthcoming figures of the era tried to draw the lines between the appropriate and the unacceptable and between

Cantek, *Cumhuriyetin Büluğ Çağı*. Ayşegül Şentürk, "1931 Matbuat Kanunu'ndaki Değişiklikler Üzerine Kronolojik Bir Değerlendirme: Basın Hürriyeti Bağlamında Meclis Tartışmaları ve Basındaki Yankılar," *Tarih İncelemeleri Dergisi* 30, 1 (2015): 199-230.

<sup>35</sup> Dr. Recep Ferdi, "Cinsi Terbiye," *Milliyet*, 12.11.1954.

the healthy and the abnormal by using "sexual manners" as an informative and educative tool for the citizens of the young Republic. Sexual manners was instrumentalized as a discourse to regulate the sexuality of individuals while constructing roles such as womanhood and manhood, institutions such as marriage, concepts such as virginity, homosexuality, and processes such as reproduction, birth control, and abstinence. More clearly, "sexual manners" became the constructing discourse for the new sexuality and, particularly, for the new womanhood in the 1950s.

The *Seksoloji* journal became a symbol and flagship for the usage and dissemination of the concept. Seksoloji was first published in April 1949 and continued until May 1954. As can be seen from the years, the subject started to be discussed under the RPP government and continued after the 1950 election under the DP period. Although the journal ended its annual publication in 1954, the publishing house continued to prepare annual almanacs about sexuality and sexual manners. Moreover, other published materials covered sexuality-related subjects and discussions about sexual manners throughout the 1950s.<sup>36</sup> In other words, sexual manners as a concept continued to exist and spread throughout the decade through the mainstream press, such as daily newspapers, monthly journals from different genres, and popular manuals. *Cinsi terbiye* has become a popular topic for presenting appropriate sexual norms and informing citizens for self-education.

36

In the literature, the 1950s in Turkey are frequently associated with conservatism. Therefore, even the existence of a journal named Seksoloji is quite interesting and controversial. However, in this study, I prefer not to focus on the "conservatism paradigm" to mainstream the discussions. In this study, I try to display the visibility of sexuality and "sexual manners" in the popular press, and their relations with reproduction during the period. For future studies, it could be interesting to examine the symbols of the "conservatist" journals to understand their reactions and their handling of "appearing" sexuality. For a couple of the "conservatism" discussions of the period, see: H. Bayram Kaçmazoğlu, *Demokrat Parti Dönemi Toplumsal Tartışmaları* (İstanbul: Doğu Kitabevi, 2012), 63-123. Bayram Koca, "Ellili Yıllarda Merkez Sağ: Demokrat Parti'nin Özgürlük ile İstismar Arasındaki Dini Politikaları," in *Türkiye'nin 1950'li yılları*, ed. Mete Kaan Kaynar (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2015): 293-319. Tanıl Bora and Necmi Erdoğan, "Muhafazakar Populizm," in *Modern Türkiye'de Siyasi Düşünce: Muhafazakarlık*, *Cilt 5*, ed. Tanıl Bora and Murat Gültekingil (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003): 632-644.

The sexual manners discourse was constructed as a layered, scientific, and self-regulative discourse by the writers of the period. Sexual manners attempted to inform the audience about various parts and processes of sexuality through a multi-layered discourse. In marriage manuals and articles on sexual manners, some writers focused on giving detailed descriptive information about sexual organs, their functions, and possible abnormalities and venereal diseases with (so-called) neutral and scientific language. Furthermore, they supported their narratives with illustrations or photographs to elaborate their explanations by displaying the "unseen" parts of the body.<sup>37</sup> With advances in printing technology, magazines began to publish even colored images of sexual organs, both with an anatomical and an aesthetic gaze.<sup>38</sup>

In parallel to the descriptive and explicative articles on sexual organs, texts on sexual manners discussed the mechanism of sexuality. The authors of sexual manners explained the process of sexual intercourse, the limits and ways of sexual pleasure, "exceptional" situations such as virginity, the necessities of "wedding night," the reasons for infertility and impotence. The authors combined anatomical descriptions with the mechanical process of sexual intercourse to demonstrate the physical components. Yet, the content of the texts did not end with medical, biological, or anatomical knowledge on sexuality.

Some authors, such as Marie Stopes in Married Love, which was translated into Turkish and published several times during the 1940s and 1950s, addressed intimacy, engagement, love, marriage and marital roles of the spouses alongside providing information on how to achieve sexual pleasure for woman and man together. Some writers, such as Heinrich Kisch, whose books on women's role in marriage were translated into Turkish as "Kadın ve Evlilik Sanatı" (Woman and Art of Marriage) by Seksoloji Publishing in 1951, were particularly focused on listing the duties and responsibilities of a woman in marriage, and portraying the "desired"

37 Michel Foucault, *The Birth of the Clinic: An Archaeology of Medical Perception* (London: Routledge, 2003), 146.

Aslı Yapar Gönenç, "Türkiye'de Dergiciliğin Tarihsel Gelişimi," *İletişim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 29 (2007), 71.

wife. Thus, writers of sexual manners considered sexuality as a process that was constructed by a set of ideas influenced by cultural, religious, and scientific discourses and practices performed by an individual and collective body. While they narrated sexuality as a process, they did not only focus on the sexual conduct in their texts. Rather, they defined relational processes from the "art of love" to the "science of procreation," such as the limits of flirting under "good girl," conjugal relations under "good wife," and mother-child relations under "good motherhood." Consequently, sexual manners as a discourse penetrated to various layers of daily life while attempting to regulate human relations in accordance with the demands of "appropriate sexuality."

In the 1950s, sexuality related texts did not bring the attention on the possible and potential harmful effects of sexual conduct. Rather, writers used an "affirming" tone for "good sex" for the wellbeing of individuals and the public. Sexuality-related issues, particularly venereal diseases, were on the agenda of the decision-makers for the good of the public during the 1930s. In the 1950s, the focus on venereal diseases was widened and covered other sexuality-related areas to enlighten the ignorant public by equipping them with sexual manners. The same period also witnessed changes in the information's narrative regarding the goals of providing sexual knowledge. While the narrative of the 1930s stressed "protecting the population from harmful effects," in the 1950s, writers underlined the importance of the psychological well-being of society as well as the physical. Interestingly, they personified society as a collective body, whose well-being should be protected and, therefore, managed by the decision-makers.

Simultaneously, individual well-being became a discussion topic regarding and related to her or his sexuality, which was handled in conjugal relations. A "good sexual life" was presented as one the main elements for a person's physical and psychological well-being. Since sexuality was only consented in a marital relation, norms of "good marriage" became also a subject to be included in the sexual manners literature. Unlike previous decades, sexuality and sexual pleasure in a marriage were regarded as a natural, normal, and even necessary aspect of a good and sustainable marriage. The writer's emphasis on the naturalness of sexuality pointed out

mutual sexual pleasure for spouses. In other words, the literature of sexual manners normalized woman's sexual conduct and pleasure in the public discussion, which had previously not been openly discussed or recognized by the social scientists. In other words, sexual manners' writers of the period did not confine female sexuality to reproduction. Rather, they articulated openly and publicly that sexual pleasure is possible, normal and even necessary for women. When authors published articles on sexual manners in the newspapers and journals, they did more than just help to communicate and disseminate sexual knowledge. However, they recreated a new sexuality, with its own norms and limits.

While sexual matters turned into articles about appropriate sexuality, venereal diseases, reproduction, and even birth giving in the pages of newspapers and magazines under the title "sexual manners," the publicness of sexuality became a controversial discussion topic due to its potentially harmful and corrupting effects on the morals of individuals and society. The sexual manners writers' response was not limited to explaining the benefits of educating an ignorant public. They did, however, highlight the scientific origins and content of sexual manners. <sup>39</sup> The leading magazine of the period about sexual manners, *Seksoloji* argued in its first volume and throughout its publishing life that the articles they produced, translated, and published are based on contemporary scientific knowledge. <sup>40</sup> Scientific knowledge became one of the regulative discourses as a medium for defining the "truth" of things. <sup>41</sup> In other words, scientific discourse became the dominant narrative, which defines appropriate sexuality, the roles and dynamics of (marital) relations, and the desired physiological and

<sup>39</sup> Muzaffer Aşkın, "Anketimizin Bilançosu," *Seksoloji*, 13 (1950), 4-8. Muzaffer Aşkın, "Anketimizin Bilançosu," *Seksoloji*, 14 (1950), 4-8.

<sup>40 &</sup>quot;Çıkarken," Seksoloji, 1 (1949), 1.

Michel Foucault, "Truth and Power," in *Power/Knowledge Selected Interviews and Other Writings 1972-1977*, ed. Colin Gordon, trans. Colin Gordon, Leo Marshall, John Mepham, Kate Soper (New York: Pantheon Books, 1980), 109-133. Foucault names it as "*Politics of Truth*." Patrice Maniglier, "The Order of Things," in *A Companion to Foucault*, ed. Christopher Falzon, Timothy O'Leary, and Jana Sawicki (Malden, Oxford, West Sussex: Wiley-Blackwell Publishing, 2013), 104.

psychological conditions for sexual conduct according to the rules of science (*truth*).

Along with the rise of scientific discourse, experts' voice came to the forefront in the formation of sexual manners. The group of experts came from different disciplines, including law, anthropology, psychology, sociology, and medicine. Their contributions to constructing sexual manners have appeared in the written media in the form of articles and books, as well as speeches in seminars or radio programs. Medicine as a discipline and doctors as its main actors, had the remarkable influence on the development of sexual manners discourse. 42 The health of the population has been a governing concern for collective well-being since the establishment of the Republic. Particularly infectious diseases, including venereal diseases such as syphilis and gonorrhea were considered harmful threats against the health of the population. As a result, the early Republican period invested heavily in fighting infectious diseases to ensure a healthy population, which was led by doctors on both the policy and practice levels. In the 1950s, the medicalscientific discourse was infused into everyday discussions through translated texts and experts' views, which were popularized and disseminated in newspapers and magazines in various forms, such as health advice columns. 43 Sexual manners took its place in the health columns, which provided guidelines for appropriate sexuality.

Parallel to its political and cultural proximity to the United States, the writings on sexual manners in Turkey were conceptually and methodologically influenced by the global and, in particular, American approach. During the 1940s and 1950s in Turkey, authors who produced

<sup>42</sup> Hera Cook, The Long Sexual Revolution: English Women, Sex, and Contraception 1800-1975 (Oxford, New York: Oxford University Press, 2004). Hera Cook argues that power medicine slightly decreased in England in the 1950s compared to previous period. However, in Turkey, medicine had still significant power on the regulation of life and also sexuality during the 1950s.

Recep Doksat, "Sağlık Ansiklopedisi: Frengi," *Milliyet*, 17.04.1958. Recep Doksat, "Sağlık Ansiklopedisi: Frengi," *Milliyet*, 18.04.1958. Recep Doksat, "Sağlık Ansiklopedisi: Frengi," *Milliyet*, 19.04.1958. For the Republican health policies, see: Asena Günal, "Health and Citizenship in Republican Turkey: An Analysis of the Socialization of Health Services in Republican Historical Context" (Ph.D Diss., Boğaziçi University, 2008).

authentic texts about sexual manners were distinguished by their involvement with international scientific (and academic) circles. The authors' works prominently featured science-related references and a predominance of scientific vocabulary. Translations from foreign languages, in addition to the original texts, were a source of sexual manners literature in Turkey during the 1940s and 1950s. Newspapers and magazines articles. published pieces such as informative self-assessment questionnaires, news, and interviews translated from foreign languages. The translated texts were typically selected from internationally renowned sexology texts, which primarily consisted of marriage manuals and sexual education books.<sup>44</sup> In terms of publication quantity, circulation and dissemination range, the publications of American sexology circles dominated the period's literature on sexual manners. Thus, American authors and their texts occupied a greater portion of the translations globally and in Turkey.<sup>45</sup>

Sexology magazine for its montly volumes. In addition to the periodic articles, the publishing house translated well-knowm and contemporary studies (books) on sexual subjects into Turkish. One of the symbolic names of the literature on sexual matters, Alfred Kinsey's "Kadınların Cinsi Hayatı Hakkında Kinsey Raporu" (Sexual Behavior in the Human Female), which was published in 1953 in the United States, was translated into Turkish in 1955 by Seksoloji Publishing.<sup>46</sup>

Furthermore, authors of sexual manners formed in-person relationships with their counterparts. In 1952, the editorial board of *Seksoloji* approached to build a relationship to Margaret Sanger. Due to preparation work of the population conference, Sanger was in India and could not meet with the representative of *Seksoloji*, Necdet Erder, a doctor who was completing his neurology specialization in the United States. However, Sanger replied with

Books such as Marie Stopes, *İzdivaçta Aşk* or Theodor Hendrik van de Velde, *Cinsi Münasebetler*.

Such as, Hannah and Abraham Stone, *Evlilik Rehberi (Seksoloji Yayınları, Yeni Seri, 2)*, trans. N.P. (Istanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1955).

<sup>46</sup> Alfred C. Kinsey, *Kadınların Cinsi Hayatı Hakkında Kinsey Raporu (Seksoloji Yayınları Yeni Seri, 1)*, trans. N.P. (Istanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1955).

an appreciative letter and brought the *Seksoloji* team and Abraham Stone together to discuss and start a collaboration between the Sanger Institute and *Seksoloji* magazine. As a part of this collaboration, *Seksoloji* did not only translate the texts of the Institute's writers into Turkish. The editorial board also hosted Abraham Stone in Turkey in 1952. During his one-week visit, he met with expert doctors on sexual and reproductive issues, such as Naşid Erez and Kazım Arısan from Guraba Hospital, gave three public conferences in *Eminönü Halkevi* (Public House) and *Öğrenci Lokali* (Student Locale) and met with public authorities such as Fahrettin Kerim Gökay, a psychiatrist, and also, the governor of Istanbul.<sup>47</sup> Sexual manners authors in Turkey did not only follow current sexual literature through publications. They also tried to develop in-person relationships with the circles working on sexuality. In other words, they tried to connect with the groups that were developing the contemporary literature on sexual knowledge.<sup>48</sup>

While the authors working on sexual manners were bringing the contemporary narrative on sexual matters to Turkey, remarkable differences emerged in term of the "producers" of the sexual knowledge with their foreign counterparts. Subjects related to sexual matters were debated and presented under the auspices of associations or institutes all across the world. Beginning in the 1930s, associations or institutes such as in the United States and in Germany - conducted studies, organized conferences and published manuals and journals to examine sexuality and to inform public about sexuality starting from the 1930s. <sup>49</sup> In Turkey, writers of sexual manners gathered around *Seksoloji* publishing, which will be named as "the Seksoloji circle" in this study, instead of establishing a formal body. The Seksoloji circle was composed of experts such as doctors, public figures, publishers, and translators. Individuals from or related to this circles wrote

<sup>47</sup> Orhan Karaveli, "Dr. Abraham Stone ile Bir Hafta," Seksoloji, 46 (1952): 1-7.

Veronika Fuechtner, Douglas E. Haynes, and Ryan M. Jones, "Introduction: Toward a Global History of Sexual Science: Movements, Networks, and Deployments," in *A Global History of Sexual Science*, 1880–1960, ed. Veronika Fuechtner, Douglas E. Haynes, and Ryan M. Jones (Oakland, California: University of California Press, 2018), 4-5.

<sup>49</sup> Atina Grossman, *Reforming Sex: The German Movement for Birth Control and Abortion Reform*, 1920-1950 (New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995).

periodically and consistently on sexual manners. After the *Seksoloji* publication ended its activities, members or related individuals of the circle continued to produce texts on sexual manners throughout the 1950s and the early 1960s. This study underlines the initial emergence of sexual manners in the public sphere and its influence on the formation of marriage, marital relations, sexual and reproductive practices. Consequently, the voice of the writers and publishers, the *Seksoloji circle*, were heard dominantly in this study.

The *Seksoloji* circle (and related writers) were composed of mainly male writers. The number of female writers, publishers, public figures, or translators who worked on sexual manners, was extremely limited in the 1950s. Hence, women's voice could not be heard or easily extracted from the texts, which caused two interrelated problematic issues. First of all, women's sexual experiences were hidden between the lines, those required an archaeological excavation to bring to light. Second, sexual manners could not reflect experiences of women since it was mainly produced by male writers. In other words, female sexuality was described by men, who had no idea how women experienced sexuality. As a result, sexual manners was produced as a gendered form of sexual knowledge. Therefore, this study particularly focused on the construction of female sexuality from a critical perspective, which was described as the fundamental factor in shaping the norms of "appropriate sexuality" and "desired reproduction" by the writers of sexual manners.

In Turkey, authors and groups working on sexual manners took a hesitant approach to form an organized movement that would advocate teaching sexual knowledge in classrooms. They did not act in an organized way to change the education curriculum and participate in education policymaking processes. Although a few authors such as Faruk Akbeğ developed individual suggestions, which appeared in the pages of newspapers, magazines, and manuals, for introducing sexuality information into the school curriculum, <sup>50</sup> their suggestions did not find place in the official curriculum or in the classrooms. Some also suggested educating teachers

50

Faruk Akbeğ, "Okullarda cinsiyet eğitimi: Maarif şurası üyelerinin dikkatine sunulur," Seksoloji, 42 (1952), 1

rather than adding to the school textbooks or curricula, which was implemented through seminars or conferences conducted by well-known gynecologists such as Kazancıgil.<sup>51</sup> However, these informative sessions stood out as exceptional efforts to educate teachers. As a result, popular publishing became a venue for reaching out to and educating the public about sexual manners. Moreover, the role of popular publishing in sexual education was praised by the prominent figures of the *monitoring generation*.<sup>52</sup>

The significance of educating the public about sexual manners was underlined in many areas, starting from the health columns of the newspapers to the special publishing houses in Turkey. On the one hand, supporters of "sexual manners" emphasized the personal and social benefits of teaching the "correct" knowledge about sexual manners to the ignorant public. On the other hand, they discussed the pedagogical dimension of transferring sexual knowledge to the public, in particular to children and young people. At the end, as Peyami Safa stated, the supporters aimed to provide correct knowledge on sexual manners with proper methods to the public.<sup>53</sup> According to Safa, with this information, individuals would be informed about their sexual conduct and learn how to manage themselves and their sexualities.

Similar to health advice, individuals were asked to use "sexual manners" to monitor and protect themselves from unwanted consequences, starting from psychological problems to venereal diseases.<sup>54</sup> On the one hand,

Tevfik Remzi Kazancıgil gave a speech on "sexual manners in school" in the 1949 dated Education Council. "Muallimler Birliğinin terbiye toplantıları," *Cumhuriyet*, 16.07.1949.

According to Levent Cantek, the monitoring generation is consisted of peopled who were born at the end of the nineteenth century and at the beginning of the twentieth century. Cantek claims that the legitimacy of the monitoring generation is based on their active involvement in the foundation process of the Republic. Cantek listed names such as Peyami Safa, Mithat Cemal Kuntay, Refik Halid Karay, Vedat Nedim Tör, Yusuf Ziya Ortaç and Selim Sırrı Tarcan as a part of monitoring generation. Cantek, *Cumhuriyetin Büluğ Çağı*, 25-33.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Anketimiz - Peyami Safa," Seksoloji, 9 (1949), 5.

Patrich H. Hutton, "Foucault, Freud, and the Technologies of Self," in *Technologies of the Self, A Seminar with Michel Foucault*, ed. Luther H. Martin, Huck Gutman and Patrich H. Hutton (London: Tavistock Publications, 1988), 132.

writers asked individuals to learn about appropriate sexuality. On the other hand, individuals were encouraged to seek knowledge about their sexualities. Consequently, individuals were expected to regulate their sexual behaviors according to the appropriate norms, which were determined by scientific knowledge. Foucault defines these self-monitoring and self-regulative practices as *technologies of self*. With the technologies of self, he referred to "practices whereby individuals, by their own means or with the help of others, acted on their own bodies, souls, thoughts, conduct, and way of being in order to transform themselves and attain a certain state of perfection or happiness." Sexual manners, which is considered as *a technology of self* in this study, was introduced as an informative discourse with the goal of assisting individuals in regulating and conducting themselves appropriately.

According to Foucault with the technologies of self, the self constitutes itself as a subject.<sup>56</sup> The individual turns him or herself into a subject,<sup>57</sup> by operating on her or his own body, her or his own soul, her or his own thoughts.<sup>58</sup> The subjectification process works in cooperation with "objectifization through science,"<sup>59</sup> and "dividing practices."<sup>60</sup> However, Foucault underlines the agency position of the subject with subjectification. In subjectification, the subject is not only a passive recipient who is objectified by scientific knowledge, or excluded by regulative or corrective

"Introduction," in *Technologies of the Self, A Seminar with Michel Foucault*, ed. Luther H. Martin, Huck Gutman and Patrich H. Hutton (London: Tavistock Publications, 1988), 4. Micheal Foucault, *The History of Sexuality, Vol. 3: The Care of the Self*, trans. Robert Hurley (New York: Pantheon, 1986), 37-68.

Micheal Foucault, *The History of Sexuality, Vol. 2: The Use of Pleasure*, trans. Robert Hurley (New York: Pantheon 1985), 11.

<sup>57</sup> Michael Foucault, "The Subject and the Power," in *Michael Foucault: Beyond Structuralism and Hermeneutics*, ed. Hupert Dreyfus and Paul Rabinow (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1982), 208.

Paul Rabinow, "Introduction," in *The Foucault Reader*, ed. Paul Rabinow (London: Penguin Books, 1991), 11.

<sup>59</sup> Michel Foucault, "The Subject and Power," Critical Inquiry 8, 4 (1982), 777.

Michel Foucault, "The Subject and Power, Afterword to Hubert L. Dreyfus and Paul Rabinow," in *Michel Foucault: Beyond Structuralism and Hermeneutics*, ed. Hubert L. Dreyfus and Paul Rabinow (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1982), 208.

practices. Sexual manners discourse has not only offered to diagnose and categorize individuals based on their physical beings, psychological situation or sexual conduct. However, authors and supporters of sexual manners asked individuals to compose their actions according to social norms, scientific knowledge, and legislative framework about sexuality. 61 Alan D. Shrift interprets this process as "a regime of perpetual selfsurveillance that results in the *internalization*" of norms. 62 The subject "takes all the disciplinary tasks of society upon itself and forces itself to conform to social norms without any external authority imposing those norms."63 Norms such as etiquette or manners become a code for the subject to regulate herself or himself accordingly.<sup>64</sup> Hence, conforming to norms was not only a coerced process that was led by external actors. Rather, the subject works on her or his attitude and actions based on her or his will.<sup>65</sup> The subject regulates itself across multiple platforms, beginning with corporeal actions such as her or his sexuality and her or his gestures, to her or his role in households and public space. Hence, subjectification presents itself in diverse forms, from sexual orientation to gender roles.

As discussed, the writers of sexual manners touched on various subjects to define, inform, and explain sexuality-related issues, from sexual organs to gender roles. They produced a set of interlinked narratives about sexual illnesses, abnormalities, womanhood, virginity, and motherhood, which were affected by different disciplines, norms, and value systems. Furthermore, they repeated their discourse on diverse platforms to reinforce the message about desired sexuality and desired sexual citizens. Last but not

Micheal Foucault, *Discipline and Punish the Birth of Prison*, trans. Alan Sheridan (New York: Vintage Books, 1995 [1979]).

Alan D. Schrift, "Discipline and Punish," in *A Companion to Foucault*, ed. Christopher Falzon, Timothy O'Leary, and Jana Sawicki, first edition (Malden, Oxford, West Sussex: Wiley-Blackwell Publishing, 2013), 141. Foucault, *Discipline and Punish*, 146.

Schrift, "Discipline and Punish," 141. Foucault, *Discipline and Punish*, 146. Here, Focault discusses, in detail, the function of Panopticon as a symbolic self-regulatory mechanism.

Michel Foucault, *The History of Sexuality, Vol. 1: An Introduction*, trans. Robert Hurley (New York: Pantheon Books, 1978), 1, 71-80, 91, 120-31, 155-59.

Hutton, Foucault, Freud, and the Technologies of Self, 131.

least, they invited citizens, particularly women, to conform to the boundaries of natural, normal, and appropriate sexuality.

The discussions on "sexual manners" kept their presence in the popular press throughout the 1950s and the beginning of the 1960s. Throughout the 1950s, contraception and birth control became a part of the sexual manners despite the fact that propaganda of contraception was legally prohibited by the Public Hygiene Law and the Criminal Code. In the late 1950s and the early 1960s, contraception and birth control took an increasingly prominent place in sexuality-related discussions. Meanwhile, the prohibitions regarding contraception and birth control were growingly criticized, particularly, by doctors. In 1958, Zekai Tahir Burak, the chief physician of the Ankara Hospital, sent a report to the Ministry of Health that was based on his observations regarding miscarriages in the hospital. In his report, Burak stated that more than 500.000 women died due to the intended miscarriages in a year. Burak brought "intended miscarriages" to the government's attention with the framework of the mother and child mortality, and population health. The Ministry formed a committee to work on mother and child mortality and intended miscarriages based on the outcomes and suggestions of the Burak's report.

After the 1960 military coup, the discussions on birth control and natal policies escalated with the establishment of the State Planning Agency (SPA) in 1960. The SPA's perspective linked population and reproduction policies to development discussions. Nusret Fişek, a public health expert who became a symbol of the 1960's efforts to design new population and natal policies, collaborated closely with the SPA experts and brought together the concerns from the fields of health and development. By the hand of the SPA, population policies and reproduction policies were discussed and structured to foster the development of the country, which was materialized in the 1962 First Five-Year Development Plan. From the 1958 report (taken as a symbolic date) to 1962, the concerns regarding the "quality of the population" were juxtaposed to the discourse that prioritized "a healthy population" in forming population and reproduction policies. The discussions on the "quality of the population" covered conditions such as health, education, and skills of the individuals for the development of the country. Accordingly, the first Five-Year Development Plan underlined the importance of "quality of population" for the development of the country. To achieve this goal, the plan proposed a shift in natal policies and implementing birth control programs. Based on the Development Plan, preparations for a family planning law began in 1963. After three coalition governments of the RPP, one general election, and one Justice Party (*Adalet Partisi*) government, the Law on Population Planning (LPP) came before the parliament in 1964 and was enacted in 1965.

Throughout the changing process of natal policies, some figures like Nașit Erez, a well-known gynecologist and academic from Istanbul University, took part in the front lines of both subjects – sexual manners and pro-BC activities. On the one hand, they kept publishing articles and books about sexual etiquette. On the other hand, they advocated actively for birth control through establishing associations, giving speeches, and participating in the committees formed by Nusret Fişek. Even though in numerous countries like Austria, the United States, Hungary, England, and Germany, sex education was inextricably linked to reproduction and, consequently, birth control discussions, in Turkey, the line between sex education (sexual manners) and reproduction-birth control was rather faint.<sup>66</sup> The shift of the discourse from a comprehensive sexual manners to a birth-control focused family planning was overshadowed by the natal policy debates. The discussions on regulating sexuality with the discourse of "sexual manners" in the second half of the 1940s were replaced by the attempts and policies of regulating births through "family planning education" in the mid-1960s. In the second part of the 1960s, the term "sexual manners" changed and was turned into "sexual education" (cinsellik eğitimi). Moreover, it focused more

For the link between sex education and reproduction-birth control in different countries, see: Eszter Varsa, "Sex Advice East and West: Sex Education and Family Planning in Cold War Austria and Hungary," *The History of the Family* 25, 4 (2020): 649-670. Valerie J. Huber and Michael W. Firmin, "A History of Sex Education in the United States since 1900," *International Journal of Educational Reform* 23, 1 (2014): 25-51. Jane Pilcher, "School Sex Education: Policy and Practice in England 1870 to 2000," *Sex Education* 5, 2 (2005), 153-170. Atina Grossman, *Reforming Sex: The German Movement for Birth Control and Abortion Reform*, 1920-1950 (New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995).

on the abnormalities instead of the appropriateness of sexuality. Hence, it moved to the margins while "family planning education" took center stage.

This study aims to display and analyze the transformation of a regulative discourse, sexual manners, in the political, economic, and social changing times of the Turkish Republic. The writers of sexual manners did not confine themselves to the mechanics of sexuality or functions of sexual organs. Rather, they wrote on various subjects that they associated to sexual conduct, including gender roles, virtue, reproduction, immorality, and marital relations. In short, they produced articles on human relations. Their emphasis on talking and writing about sexuality turned sexual manners into a frontier of the policing process.<sup>67</sup> Moreover, they contributed to the construction process of new citizens, who were asked to behave according to the changing needs of time from democracy to sexuality. Hence, this thesis examines their responses to particular topics and practices, which changed based on contemporary developments such as pre-marital sexuality, virginity, divorce, or birth control. In a broader sense, this study aims to examine how the discourse of sexual manners penetrated different areas of life, such as sexuality, femininity, marriage, reproduction, social good, individual happiness, and virginity, between the years 1945 and 1965.

Before presenting the periodization, sources, and outline of the study, I want to point out three areas that were insufficiently mentioned or not covered in my thesis. The first one is related to the individuals' daily experiences of sexuality. The goal of this study is to demonstrate the existence of sexuality and sexual manners discourse in the public sphere in Turkey between 1945 and 1965 that was either not seen or not recognized in the social sciences literature. Hence, the voice of sexual manners writers was heard more in the study, while the reflection of individuals' experiences was limited to the "third-page" court news, case decisions of Adalet Dergisi (Justice Journal), and reader's letters. My future research will concentrate on how individuals, particularly women, perceive sexual manners and experience sexuality.

Hutton, Foucault, Freud, and the Technologies of Self, 136. Foucault, History of Sexuality 67 I, 23-25, 69-70.

The second one is related to the medical developments during the period. Although I tried to examine and touch upon the medical discussions regarding sexuality, technical developments, policy transformation, the changing education system, the changing health structure of the government, and the interconnectedness of medical experts (particularly in the fields of obstetrics and reproductive health) to the world were not discussed sufficiently in this study. The developments and transformations in reproductive health clearly impacted the practices of women regarding their sexuality and fertility, as well as the change in natal policies. Hence, there is a need for further research about the effects of these changes on the perception of sexuality, and, accordingly, on the changes of natal policies.

The third missing part is related to a more comprehensive discussion. In the academic literature, the DP period is often associated with conservatism and the significant role of religion in politics. Interestingly, assessments regarding sexual manners and natal policies in the name of religion were very limited in the popular published media, except for some concerns about "openness" (that I mentioned in chapter 3). However, this study did not examine the published material that was produced by the (so-called) conservative writers. Although the views of some writers, such as Peyami Safa, and some magazines, such as Büyük Doğu, who are associated with conservative circles in the current literature were reflected in the study, conservative publishing was not analyzed in detail. This study focused on daily or monthly popular publishing with high circulation due to the search for "public visibility" of sexuality in mainstream media. Even though I tried to include some critics and objections from conservative circles, this study did not analyze how conservative-called discourse handles topics such as sexuality, female sexuality, family, and reproduction. As a result, more research into how different publics perceive sexuality and sexual manners is required.

# 1.3. Periodization, Sources amd Outline of the Study

The period examined in this study needs further explanation regarding its unconventional timeframe compared to political and economic history. The period from the late 1940s to the early 1960s was portrayed as the

"post-Second World War" period in the social science literature. The history of the 1950s was written by taking the Second World War as a milestone and was assessed under the influence of the consequences of the war. As Hobsbawm stated, social scientists use the "post" prefix when they cannot fully define or understand future happenings. Yet, they were also assured of the importance of a single event or concept. In this case, the Second World War that left the 1950s under its shadow was the "big" event that transformed the lives of millions drastically, dramatically, and rapidly all around the world. The history writing of the 1950s was mostly driven by the impacts and consequences of the war on the nation-states, which either turned into finding a way of being "discharged of all liabilities" or became a process of "waiting for the groundbreaking 1960s."

Similar tendencies were seen in the social sciences, particularly in the 1950s Turkish Republic historiography. Even though groundbreaking developments occurred between 1945 and 1960, the period was commonly described as a "transition period." The concept of *transition* was used for political structures such as "transition to a multi-party system" and

Hobsbawm, *Age of Extremes: the Short Twentieth Century 1914-1991*, 288. In his well-known study, Hobsbawm reserved a special chapter for the developments of the post-war period and named the chapter "*The Social Revolution 1945-1990*" to stress the change in the mentality of everyday practices universally. Also, see Ann Douglas for a critical reading of the "post" prefix (particularly for the "post-modern" and "post-colonial") in history writing and cultural studies: Ann Douglas, "Periodizing the American Century: Modernism, Postmodernism, and Postcolonialism in the Cold War Context," *Modernism/Modernity* 5, 3 (1998), 71-98.

For a critical analysis and comparison of the history writing on the Second World War, see: Richard Bosworth, "Nations Examine Their Past: A Comparative Analysis of the Historiography of the "Long" Second World War," *The History Teacher* 29, 4 (1996): 499-523. In his article, Bosworth analyzes the history writing of the 1930s after the Second World War and how current political developments influenced history writing in Germany.

Thanks to Sinan Yıldırmaz's study, I can enrich my discussions regarding the periodization of my study. For a detailed discussion about the historiography of the Turkish Republic – particularly the 1950s - and peasantry in Turkey, see: Sinan Yıldırmaz, "From "Imaginary" to "Real": A Social History of the Peasantry in Turkey" (PhD. Diss., Boğaziçi University, 2009), 1-4.

The following studies can be given as examples: Feroz Ahmad, *Demokrasi Sürecinde Türkiye 1945-1980*, trans. Ahmet Fethi, second edition (İstanbul: Hil Yayınları, 1996).

economic structures such as "transition to a liberal economic system."72 Describing the period as a "transition period" implied that the period was not wholesome. Rather, it was considered a "bridge" with a narrative of "forward-going" that connected two "interesting" periods of the Turkish Republic: the 1930s and the 1960s. 73 However, seeing the period as a bridge would be a teleological assessment that evaluates the period from today's perspective. Moreover, it leads to neglecting the critical developments of the period by focusing on the events that led to the transition. Another problem with the "transition period" is related to its emphasis on political and economic history. The periodization of Turkey's post-Second World War history was dominated, specifically, by the highlighted events of political history, such as the transition to the multi-party system, the 1950 elections, and the 1960 military coup. Changes in other areas (particularly reproduction for this study) were overshadowed by the transformations in, mainly, political and economic areas. This study discusses the period as a "transformation era" (change era) for subjects such as sexuality, marriage, marital relations, reproduction, and birth control.

The analysis in this study starts with the increasing visibility of sexual matters and sexual manners in the public sphere in the second half of the

Nihal Karaincioğlu, "Türkiye'de Çok Partili Sisteme Geçis ve Demokrasi Sorunları," in *Tarih ve Demokrasi: Tarık Zafer Tunaya'ya Armagan*, ed. Üniversite Ögretim Üyeleri Derneği (İstanbul: Cem Yayınevi, 1992). Asım Karaömerlioğlu, "Turkey's 'Return' to Multi-Party Politics: A Social Interpretation," *East European Quarterly* 40, 1 (2006). Kemal H. Karpat, *Turkey's Politics: The Transition to a Multi-Party System* (New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1959)

- The period was also diagnosed as the decade where the Turkish Republic integrated to liberal economic system, particularly, from the perspective of economic history. For the discussions on "economic transition", see: Çağlar Keyder, "Türkiye Demokrasisinin Ekonomi Politiği," in *Geçis Sürecinde Türkiye*, ed. Irvin Cemil Schick and Ertugrul Ahmet Tonak (İstanbul Belge Yayınları, 1990). Keyder, *Türkiye'de Devlet ve Sınıflar*.
- 73 Studies on Turkish history have focused mostly whether on the formation of the Republic on the "one-party" period, on its mechanisms, the leading actors, and the mentality, in short, on the 1930s or on the 1960s on the "new" institutions such as state planning agency, on the formation of the new parties, on the new constitution, on the youth movements, on the economic debates; in short on the "after the military coup period." The in-between period was found interesting only for particular events such as 1946 elections, Korean War, the 6-7 September events of 1955 and the 27 May coup by the historians.

1940s. As a result of a change in Press Law in 1946, sexuality and the new woman with her sexual role emerged discursively through channels such as popular magazines, popular books, visual images, and even movies. Unlike the conventional periodization of the historiography of the Turkish Republic, the study ends with a symbolic date, the Population Planning Law (PPL) in 1965. After the enactment of the PPL, family planning education took over mainstream discussions regarding sexuality.

#### 1.3.1 Sources

The layered construction of sexuality requires the examination of sources produced by different actors, including state actors, popular and academic publications. As Cantek stated, newspapers that are transferring, interpreting, or narrating recent events become "natural" reference sources while studying history. Because newspapers aimed to cover all aspects of daily life, they became important sources for understanding, observing, and analyzing what kinds of topics were important to the people who lived at the time.<sup>74</sup> Fundamental events of individuals' life cycles such as sexuality, marriage, and reproduction have found their place in the pages of the newspapers as news, stories, feuilletons (tefrika), opinion columns, illustrations, photographs, or advertisements. Hence, this study uses two main newspapers, Milliyet and Cumhuriyet, to follow the discussions regarding sexuality in the popular press. Milliyet and Cumhuriyet were chosen due to their high sales numbers, their impact on popular discussions<sup>75</sup> and their symbolic meanings.<sup>76</sup> Additional news from other newspapers such as *Hürriyet* and *Vatan* were also used as complementary sources to display the commonality of the discussions and the spirit of that

<sup>74</sup> Cantek, Cumhuriyetin Büluğ Çağı, 7.

<sup>75</sup> Ali Naci Karacan, "Bir de demokratları deneyelim." *Milliyet*, 10.05.1950.

Bulut, "Hürriyet Gazetesi: 1948-1953 Döneminin Yayın Politikası," 2. Selda Bulut stated that Milliyet started its life right before the win of the Democrat Party and received the support of the Democrat Party. Bulut also added that the core team that established the Milliyet were Ali Naci Karacan, Peyami Safa and Cemil Cahid. For the relationship between Milliyet and DP, see: Nuran Yıldız, "Demokrat Parti İktidarı (1950-1960) ve Basın," *Ankara Üniversitesi SBF Dergisi* 51, 1 (1996), 489-490.

period. The newspapers helped to analyze the *appropriate* as well as the *excluded* sexual practices through courthouse and police reports, advisory columns on health, sexuality, and law, opinion pieces, and informative articles.

The second category of sources for this study is comprised of popular journals. The articles in the popular journals could be assessed as opinion builders since they were focused on particular subjects and more elaborated than newspaper articles with "user-friendly" language. Due to its unique and relevant subject area, Seksoloji, a popular monthly journal, became the primary source for this study. Apart from Seksoloji, Hayat, Sağlığımız and Aile turned into supporting sources, which covered topics such as marriage, child care, home decoration, and fashion. Columns. sexuality, recommendations, suggestions, health-related serials, and information on the anatomical knowledge provided by the doctors took an important place in the popular journals. The writers of the health columns turned into professional experts, the doctors, who were also asking for the recognition of medicine as the source of power. The language of the columns carried the tone of expertise and knowledge, which were disseminated and "popularized" by the magazines.

In this study, the narrative on sexuality is not followed solely through newspapers and popular magazines. Laws and regulations about sexuality were used to display the state's approach and efforts to regulate sexuality. As a part of the state's documents, Supreme Court (*Yargıtay*) decisions are also included to examine life stories through *Adalet Dergisi* (Justice Journal). Adalet Dergisi provided precious exemplary cases regarding sexuality.

Last but not least, the academic literature of the era became an important source for this study. The academic journals of Istanbul University and Ankara University had started to include articles on areas such as law,<sup>77</sup> anthropology,<sup>78</sup> and sociology during the 1950s and early 1960s.<sup>79</sup> In

Law journal of the Ankara University Law Faculty and law journal of the İstanbul University Law Faculty.

Anthropology Journal of the Ankara University Language and History-Geography Faculty, Faculty Journal of the Ankara University Language and History-Geography Faculty

<sup>79</sup> Örnek, "1950'li yıllarda ABD ile buluşma," 144-156

parallel to the academic writings, which were produced by the local academia, international academics also started to conduct research and produce articles on Turkey in different fields of the social sciences. During the 1960s, especially with the establishment of demography as a social science, the number of surveys on Turkish society increased significantly. The demographers of the period did not only provide knowledge about the quantity of the population. They have also worked on the composition of the families, power dynamics in the households, and spousal roles in the marriage to understand natal patterns.

The number of articles on Turkey's society and population increased significantly due to partnerships with foreign universities. Therefore, this study uses academic research and articles that were produced by foreign, mostly American, academics during the era. Given the significant influence of American empirical social sciences on Turkish academia during the 1950s,<sup>80</sup> these academic studies provided valuable data on subjects such as marriage age, marriage patterns, and birth control attitudes of individuals, where data from official state institutions such as the State Statistics Institute was lacking until the mid-1960s. Secondly, these articles enabled the display and analysis of the paradigms of the social sciences during the period where discussions on modernism had particular importance in analyzing Turkey.

# 1.3.2. Outline of the Thesis

In the 1950s, sexual manners played a regulative role in the construction of new citizenship. The authors did not only provide information about sexuality to the citizens. However, they also discussed subjects related to and affecting sexuality. Hence, this study is composed of two main chapters, which focus on the reasoning, content, and impact of sexual manners. The first chapter, which is a rather long discussion, aims to reveal the visibility of sexuality and sexuality-related discussions in the 1950s in Turkey. Sexuality, particularly female sexuality, was considered invisible in public space untill the 1980s in the literature on sexuality.

80 Örnek, "1950'li yıllarda ABD ile buluşma," 144-156.

However, this study argues that the 1950s witnessed the visibility and construction of sexuality in public spaces. Hence, this chapter intends to display the visibility and discursive construction of sexuality in the framework of "sexual manners." This part examines the actors – "producers" – along with the "targeted" audience of sexual manners. Last but not least, the first section analyzes the limits of appropriate sexuality in the 1950s, pointing out how the authors dealt with subjects such as virginity, homosexuality, and extramarital affairs.

The second chapter centered on the narratives and practices of marriage. Marriage was portrayed as the main and only institution through which one could experience sexuality. This chapter focuses on the discourses that describe "desired marriage" for the sake of the individual and society. Also, marriage discussions served the purpose of describing conjugal relations, spousal roles, and the effects of "undesired" spousal behaviors on society. Therefore, the second chapter examines the attitudes of the era's authors on everyday life events such as flirting, love, companionship, and divorce. In this research, I narrate the story of how shifting values and the influence of popular culture, modernization, and development discussions contributed to a new way of thinking about sexuality.

# EDUCATING CITIZENS FOR "SEXUAL MANNERS"

Policies of reproduction aim to regulate, on the one hand, the reproductive practices of individuals. The daily practices of individuals are affected by reproduction-related choices, whether directly or indirectly. Reproduction contains episodes throughout the human life cycle, especially the female life cycle. The episodes of reproduction are generally formed around the discussions on birth, birth control, birth attendants (from midwives to gynecologists), and childcare. Also, reproductive practices are mostly considered within institutional contexts such as family and marriage. In these institutions, reproductive practices are woven with cultural, religious, and scientific discourses and practices. The woman, whom these institutions surround, stays at the center of the reproduction-related discussions as the main agent of the process. On the other hand, the policies related to reproduction are associated with the concerns of population control, social policies (including the politics of care), market trends, social

movements, and developments in technological and medical knowledge.<sup>1</sup> Although all these discussions are highly related to and essential elements of reproduction, sexuality, as the profound element, is either neglected or discussed separately from human reproductive practices in the literature. Attempts to regulate reproduction are examined separately from practices to discipline sexuality.

Academics focus on the reproduction around a variety of subjects in the literature.<sup>2</sup> The forthcoming one is related to population and population management, including the procreative tendencies of minority and/or disadvantageous groups,<sup>3</sup> but also more detailed issues such as birth rate and its consequences.<sup>4</sup> Another cluster came together around medicalization of

Faye Ginsburg and Rayna Rapp, "The Politics of Reproduction," *Annual Review of Anthropology*, 20 (1991): 311. For a detailed edition of the reproduction policies: Faye Ginsburg and Rayna Rapp ed., *Conceiving the New World Order: The Global Politics of Reproduction* (London: University of California Press, 1995).

Besides a general literature search, for this part, I have studied the content of two academic journals with a particular focus on women in the last ten years. One of the journals published by Sage publications is called *Feminist Theory*. The other journal was Signs, which was published by the University of Chicago Press. Both journals follow the general conceptual and academic trends in feminist and women's studies. As for the references, I avoid giving recurrences that could be found in the conventional literature regarding reproduction. I tried to refer to the sources with a feminist or gender-sensitive perspective.

Regarding the reproduction of minorities or immigrants, the literature focused on the subject due to the concerns related to nationalism or discussions about sharing the resources of the (social welfare) state. Leo R. Chavez, "A Glass Half Empty: Latina Reproduction and Public Discourse," *Human Organization* 63, 2 (2004): 173-188. For bookreview, see: Ivonne Szasz, "Fertile Matters: The Politics of Mexican- Origin Women's Reproduction by Elena R. Gutiérrez," *Signs* 34, 4 (2009): 1008-1010. Leith Mullings, "Resistance and Resilience: the Sojourner Syndrome and the Social Context of Reproduction in Central Harlem," *Transforming Anthropology* 13, 2 (2005): 79–91. Michele Rivkin-Fish, "Conceptualizing Feminist Strategies for Russian Reproductive Politics: Abortion, Surrogate Motherhood, and Family Support after Socialism," *Signs* 38, 3 (2013): 569-593. Carole H. Browner, "The Politics of Reproduction in a Mexican Village," *Signs* 11, 4 (1986): 710-724.

John F. Martin, E. A. Hammel, Marvin Harris, William H. James, John H. Moore, P. Govinda Reddy, Francisco M. Salzano, Russell Thornton, John W. M., "Changing Sex Ratios: The History of Havasupai Fertility and Its Implications for Human Sex Ratio Variation [and Comments and Reply]," *Current Anthropology* 35, 3 (1994): 255-280.

reproduction<sup>5</sup> and medicine related issues such as pregnancy,<sup>6</sup> (sex) hormones,<sup>7</sup> medical metaphors,<sup>8</sup> reproductive technologies,<sup>9</sup> and reproductive autonomy of women.<sup>10</sup> The third cluster is around birth control mechanisms<sup>11</sup> and abortion.<sup>12</sup> Another cluster is about the politics of care<sup>13</sup>

Eugenia Georges, *Bodies of Knowledge: The Medicalization of Reproduction in Greece* (Nashville: Vanderbilt University Press, 2008).

- Brian P. Bloomfield and Theo Vurdubakis, "Re-Engineering the Human: New Reproductive Technologies and the Specter of Frankenstein," International Journal of Social Sciences 1, 1 (2006): 19-24. Jenny Gunnarsson Payne, "Grammars of Kinship: Biological Motherhood and Assisted Reproduction in the Age of Epigenetics," Signs 41, 3 (2016): 483-506. Cynthia R. Daniels and Erin Heidt-Forsythe, "Gendered Eugenics and the Problematic of Free Market Reproductive Technologies: Sperm and Egg Donation in the United States," Signs 37, 3 (2012): 719-747. Lisa C. Ikemoto, "Eggs as Capital: Human Egg Procurement in the Fertility Industry and the Stem Cell Research Enterprise," Signs 34, 4 (2009): 763-781. Maura A. Ryan, "The Introduction of Assisted Reproductive Technologies in the "Developing World": A Test Case for Evolving Methodologies in Feminist Bioethics," Signs 34, 4 (2009): 805-825. Sven Bergmann, "Fertility Tourism: Circumventive Routes That Enable Access to Reproductive Technologies and Substances," Signs 36, 2 (2011): 280-289. Mary Lyndon Shanley and Adrienne Asch, "Involuntary Childlessness, Reproductive Technology, and Social Justice: The Medical Mask on Social Illness," Signs 34, 4 (2009): 851-874. Susan Markens, Surrogate Motherhood and the Politics of Reproduction (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2007). Sarah Jane Toledano and Kristin Zeiler, "Hosting the Others' Child? Relational Work and Embodied Responsibility in Altruistic Surrogate Motherhood," Feminist Theory 18, 2 (2017): 159 - 175.
- About the legislative, judicial, and medical intervention into the individual's "choices": Anne Donchin, "Toward a Gender-sensitive Assisted Reproduction Policy," *Bioethics* 23, 1 (2009): 28–38.
- Margaret Boulos, "The global biopolitics of the IUD: How science constructs contraceptive users and women's bodies Chikako Takeshita," *Feminist Theory* 16, 1 (2015): 113 116.
- 12 Kelly Suzanne O'Donnell, "Reproducing Jane: Abortion Stories and Women's Political Histories," *Signs* 43, 1 (2017): 77-96. Jennifer M. Denbow, "Abortion as Genocide: Race,

Victoria Browne, "Feminist Philosophy and Prenatal Death: Relationality and the Ethics of Intimacy," *Signs* 41, 2 (2016): 385-407.

Sari Irni, "Steroid Provocations: On the Materiality of Politics in the History of Sex Hormones," *Signs* 41, 3 (2016): 507-529.

About medical metaphors, female body and reproduction, see, Anita Wohlmann, "Of Termites and Ovaries on Strike: Rethinking Medical Metaphors of the Female Body," *Signs* 43, 1 (2017): 127-150. Maria Fannin, "Placental Relations," *Feminist Theory* 15, 3 (2014): 289 – 306.

such as maternal care,<sup>14</sup> motherhood,<sup>15</sup> legislative and administrative mechanisms of adoption.<sup>16</sup> Where the concern was the sexuality of women, the literature focused on the scientification of sex,<sup>17</sup> marriage and marital relations,<sup>18</sup> coupling processes of the spouses,<sup>19</sup> legislative mechanisms regarding marital affairs,<sup>20</sup> sexuality or non-sexuality of women.<sup>21</sup> The

Agency, and Nation in Prenatal Nondiscrimination Bans," *Signs* 41, 3 (2016): 603-626. Mary Gilmartin and Allen White, "Interrogating Medical Tourism: Ireland, Abortion, and Mobility Rights," *Signs* 36, 2 (2011): 275-280. Kimberly Kelly, "In the Name of the Mother: Renegotiating Conservative Women's Authority in the Crisis Pregnancy Center Movement," *Signs* 38, 1 (2012): 203-230.

- Daniel Engster, *The Heart of Justice: Care Ethics and Political Theory* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007)
- Joan B. Wolf, "Framing Mothers: Childcare Research and the Normalization of Maternal Care," *Signs* 41, 3 (2016): 627-651.
- 15 Kate Boyer, "'Neoliberal Motherhood': Workplace Lactation and Changing Conceptions of Working Motherhood in the Contemporary US," Feminist Theory 15, 3 (2014): 269 288. Orna Donath, "Regretting Motherhood: A Sociopolitical Analysis," Signs 40, 2 (2015): 343-367. Jessaca B. Leinaweaver, "Practice Mothers," Signs 38, 2 (2013): 405-430. Jill S. Greenlee, The Political Consequences of Motherhood (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2014).
- Margaret F. Gibson, "Adopting Difference: Thinking through Adoption by Gay Men in Ontario, Canada," *Signs* 39, 2 (2014): 407-432. Laura Briggs, *Somebody's Children: The Politics of Transracial and Transnational Adoption* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2012).
- 17 Veronica Sanz, "No Way Out of the Binary: A Critical History of the Scientific Production of Sex," *Signs* 43, 1 (2017): 1-27. For a comparative bookreview, David A. Rubin, "The Classification of Sex: Alfred Kinsey and the Organization of Knowledge by Donna J. Drucker, Gentlemen's Disagreement: Alfred Kinsey, Lewis Terman, and the Sexual Politics of Smart Men by Peter Hegarty, Fuckology: Critical Essays on John Money's Diagnostic Concepts by Lisa Downing, Iain Morland, and Nikki Sullivan," *Signs* 41, 2 (2016): 464-471.
- Alasia Nuti, "How should marriage be theorised?" *Feminist Theory* 17, 3 (2016): 285 302.
- Monica Liu, "Surrogate Dating and the Translation of Gendered Meanings across Borders: The Case of China's E-mail-Order Brides" *Signs* 41, 1 (2015): 29-53.
- Srimati Basu, "Judges of Normality: Mediating Marriage in the Family Courts of Kolkata, India," *Signs* 37, 2 (2012): 469-492. Lois Harder, "The State and the Friendships of the Nation: The Case of Nonconjugal Relationships in the United States and Canada," *Signs* 34, 3 (2009): 633-658.

LGBTI+ and Queer studies introduced more out-of-box area in the literature. The critical perspective brought by these studies has enabled scholars to question the established (*dichotomic*) categories of sex, sex roles, and sexual tendencies, which are closely related to reproductive practices. The parental and reproductive demands of the movement could be followed in academic writings, with a particular focus on individual (civil) rights.<sup>22</sup>

In all these studies, which should be considered valuable contributions to the literature, reproduction or reproductive practices are not presented as linked to sexuality or sexual practices. Although sexuality is an integrated part that conditions the roles, practices, attitudes, and processes surrounding reproduction, it has only been investigated as a complementary or invisible subject in reproduction studies. Its relationship with reproduction was hidden under other discussions, such as population policy, legislative mechanisms, and medical concerns, or taken as a "side-effect." However, the relationship between sexuality and reproduction is symbiotic. Every policing attempt that aims to regulate reproduction, directly or indirectly, shapes the sexual practices of individuals. Mutually, every attempt to limit or control sexuality also intervenes and influences the reproductive practices of the individuals. Therefore, analyzing and contextualizing the sexual practices of individuals becomes a crucial step to understanding the construction of reproductive policies. In other words, it is difficult to follow the development, justification, and impact of reproductive policies without understanding the conceptualization of sexuality and the sexual practices of individuals.<sup>23</sup>

Kristina Gupta, "Compulsory Sexuality: Evaluating an Emerging Concept," *Signs* 41, 1 (2015): 131-154. Jocelyn Bosley, "From Monkey Facts to Human Ideologies: Theorizing Female Orgasm in Human and Nonhuman Primates, 1967–1983," *Signs* 35, 3 (2010): 647-671

Saskia E. Wieringa, "Portrait of a Women's Marriage: Navigating between Lesbophobia and Islamophobia," *Signs* 36, 4 (2011): 785-793. Anna Marie Smith, "Reproductive Technology, Family Law, and the Postwelfare State: The California Same- Sex Parents' Rights "Victories" of 2005," *Signs* 34, 4 (2009): 827-850.

There are also differentiating studies in the literature that take reproduction as a process and develop an analysis that includes sexuality. For an analysis of two "anti-maternal" German feminist women from the beginning of the 20th century, see: Kirsten Leng, "Permutations

The social policies of the Turkish Republic were influenced by the "change" process of the 1950s. The effects of change have influenced every aspect of life, starting from social policies and everyday practices to gender roles. Hence, the reproduction policies, which spread in every layer of life, were transformed due to the changing norms and perceptions of the 1950s, both at the policy level and in the everyday practices of individuals. Sexuality, as a part of the reproduction process, was not excluded from these changes on the conceptual and practice level. This chapter analyzes the construction of the "new sexuality" in the 1950s in Turkey. The first part of the chapter touches upon the new "visibility" of sexuality in general and the "first" clear visibility of female sexuality in particular. During the construction process of sexuality, the citizens of the Republic were informed regarding the lines between acceptable and condemned sexual practices by the opinion leaders of the era. The following part of this chapter analyzes the discussion that produced the discourse and the content about the proper "sexual manners." The limits of sexual manners also determine the characteristics of "appropriate" sexuality, sexual practices, and norms. The last part of this section aims to display the borders of proper sexuality with a particular focus on female sexual practices.

# 2.1. Increasing Visibility of Sexuality in the 1950s

The population was considered one of the most critical problems in the early Republican period. The early Republican elites put great effort into

of the Third Sex: Sexology, Subjectivity, and Antimaternalist Feminism at the Turn of the Twentieth Century," Signs 40, 1 (2014): 227-254. For the discussions of same-sex partnership and conception: Petra Nordqvist, "Feminist heterosexual imaginaries of reproduction:Lesbian conception in feminist studies of reproductive technologies," Feminist Theory 9, 3: 273–292. For the studies which assess reproductive practices along with female sexuality, see: Elaine Tyler May, Homeward Bound: American Families in the Cold War Era (New York: Basic Books, 2008). Elaine Tyler May, America and the Pill: A History of Promise, Peril, and Liberation (New York: Basic Books, 2010). Jemima Repo, The Biopolitics of Gender (New York: Oxford University Press, 2016). Alexander Sanger, Beyond Reproductive Freedom in the 21st Century Choice (New York: PublicAffairs, 2004).

increasing the population. The decision-makers have focused on three policy areas to increase the population: protecting and improving the nation's health, regulating migration for re-population, and, most of all, promoting reproduction as part of pro-natal policies. Sexuality was seen as a hidden subject in two areas. The first one was related to the nation's health. The early Republican decision-makers focused on fighting against epidemics such as tuberculosis, cholera, malaria, and sexually transmitted diseases (STDs), particularly syphilis.<sup>24</sup> They aimed to decrease the mortality rates. Also, they worked for the betterment of the current and future nation's health. Regarding the nation's health, STDs had become a crucial problem for the reproductive practices of individuals. STDs like syphilis and gonorrhea were seen as threats to healthy births and the health of future generations.<sup>25</sup> Writers warned the grooms and brides-to-be about the potential dangers of syphilis and tuberculosis.<sup>26</sup> Public education and campaigns against STDs were used to raise awareness, with a particular focus on male sexuality.<sup>27</sup> In the 1930s in Turkey, sexuality-related discussions focused on protecting the nation from the dangers of sexual practices and increasing the number of healthy births.

Reproductive practices were the second area where sexuality was implicitly linked. Individuals were encouraged to give healthy births and contribute to the population of the country. Notably, women were asked to

Ceren Gülser İlikan, "Tuberculosis, Medicine and Politics: Public Health in the Early Republican Turkey" (MA Thesis, Boğaziçi University, 2006). Günal, "Health and Citizenship in Republican Turkey," 143-277.

Arpacı, "Hastalık, ulus ve felaket: Türkiye'de frengi ile mücadele (1920-1950)," 59-86. Gül Özsan, "Türkiye'de Modernleşme ve Kadın Sağlığı Politikaları" (PhD. Diss., Mimar Sinan Güzel Sanatlar Üniversitesi, 2007). Pınar Öztamur, "Defining a Population: Women and Children in Early Republican Turkey, 1923-1950" (MA Thesis, Boğaziçi University, 2004).

Naciye Emin Hanım, "Sütninelerin, Ahçılarınızın, Hizmetçilerinizin Kanlarını Mutlak Muayene Ettiriniz," in *Sıhhat Almanağı*, ed. Mazhar Osman (İstanbul: Kader Basımevi, 1933), 698. Kilisli Rıfat, "Vereme Karşı," *Sıhhi Sahifalar*, 6 (1930), 161-164.

Hulusi Behçet Bey, "Zührevi Hastalıklar Hakkında Halka Mahsus Sıhhi Terbiye," *Sıhhi Sahifalar*, 1 (1930), 26. Ali Eşref Bey, "İçtimai Dertlerimizden Biri," in *Sıhhat Almanağı*, ed. Mazhar Osman (İstanbul: Kader Basımevi, 1933), 232.

prioritize "being a mother" as their national duty. <sup>28</sup> Although promoting reproduction was a popular subject, female sexuality, which was bound to reproduction, was invisible in the public sphere. For the honorable daughters of the Republic, sexual pleasure was a hidden and strictly disgraceful subject. <sup>29</sup> If sexuality became visible in the press, it was restrained within the borders of medical subjects.

Meanwhile, social relations and social space were changing dramatically. As a part of the modernization project of the Turkish Republic, the concept of citizenship was constructed for men and women. As Yeşim Arat stated, citizenship was used as a strategic tool by the elites of the new Republic. When the new decision-makers recognized citizenship rights, their agenda was to increase social integration (cohesion) and strengthen the state as an institution.<sup>30</sup> On principle, the elites of the Republic defended equality between men and women. With the 1926-dated new Civil Code, marital relations, along with the subjects of inheritance and property, were regulated in line with the principles of the modern state. When the right to vote for women was legalized in 1934, it provided women the same rights as men to become parliamentarians formally.<sup>31</sup> The modern and young Republic used and promoted the motto of "equality among women and men" in the representation of the new regime.<sup>32</sup> However, the

Aksu Bora, "Türk Modernleşme Sürecinde Annelik Kimliğinin Dönüşümü," in *Yerli Bir Feminizme Doğru*, ed. Aynur İlyasoğlu and Necla Akgökçe (İstanbul: Sel Yayıncılık, 2001): 77-107. Tanıl Bora, "Analar, Bacılar, Orospular: Türk-Milliyetçi Muhafazakar Söyleminde Kadın," in *Şerif Mardin'e Armağan*, ed. Ayşe Öncü and Orhan Tekelioğlu (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2005): 241-282. Deniz Kandiyoti, "Cariyeler, Fettan Kadınlar ve Yoldaşlar: Türk Romanında Kadın İmgeleri," in *Cariyer, Yurttaşlar, Bacılar* (İstanbul: Metis Yayınları, 1997): 133-147. Nükhet Sirman, "Kadınların Milliyeti," in *Milliyetçilik: Modern Türkiye'de Siyasi Düşünce, cilt 4*, ed. Tanıl Bora (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2002).

<sup>29</sup> Laden Yurttagüler, "Social Policies on Female Body in the 1930s in Turkey," 123.

Yeşim Arat, "Türkiye'de Toplumsal Cinsiyet ve Vatandaşlık," in *75. Yılda Tebaa'dan Yurttaşa Doğru*, ed. Artun Ünsal (İstanbul: Tarih Vakfı Yayınları, 1998), 67-68.

<sup>31</sup> Arat, "Türkiye'de Toplumsal Cinsiyet ve Vatandaşlık," 68.

For the equality struggle of the women of the era and the state's presentation of its role see: Yaprak Zihnioğlu, *Kadınsız İnkilap* (İstanbul: Metis Yayınları, 2003). Yeşim Arat, "The Project of Modernity and Women in Turkey," in *Rethinking Modernity and National* 

"neutral" and "universal" rules of citizenship were based on the norms of masculinity and male experiences.<sup>33</sup> When the new Republic recognized the "same" rights for women, first of all, some rights were adopted from already existing rights, which were based on the experiences of men.<sup>34</sup> Secondly, some rights (articles) in the 1926 dated Civil Code were not even arranged according to principles of equality. For example, although men and women were entitled to equal rights in the constitution, the husband was identified as "the head of the family."<sup>35</sup> Moreover, the structural changes necessary for developing equal opportunities were not even considered by the Republican elites.

In parallel, the new Republic asked its citizens to participate and fulfill their duties for the modernization of the country. Women were assigned to be "daughters of the Republic" and "mothers of the nation" by the male elites of the Republican project to raise the new generations of Turkey.<sup>36</sup> Fatmagül Berktay argues that the Kemalist male elites of the era described the Kemalist enlightened (*aydın*) woman as someone "who internalized the familial, social, and national duties."<sup>37</sup> The leading female figures of the era embraced and promoted this role since the Republican project provided for them an opportunity to be incorporated. They were expected to fulfill this role, literally, by giving birth. Also, they were held

*Identity in Turkey*, ed. Sibel Bozdoğan and Reşat Kasaba (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1997).

- Carole Pateman, *The Sexual Contract* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1988), 2, 8.
- About the invisibility of women's movement and women's struggle for right to vote until 1934, see: Zihnioğlu, *Kadınsız Inkilap*. Zihnioğlu discusses the struggle of women for recognition in the decision making processes and the unresponsiveness of the Republican elite.
- 35 See the Chapter 3 for a detailed discussion about the Civil Law.
- Fatmagül Berktay, "Batılılaşma," in *Modern Türkiye'de Siyasi Düşünce, Modernleşme ve Batıcılık*, *Cilt 3*, ed. Murat Gültekingil and Tanıl Bora (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2002), 284. Berktay uses the narratives produced by two leading nationalist figures of the period. She quotes Cemil Meriç, who described the role of a woman as being a mother and loyal wife in order to serve the "nationalist cause," 279. Also, she discusses the discourse produced by Peyami Safa, who classified women into two categories, good woman versus bad woman. His classification was based on the willingness of women to become mothers of the nation, 280-283.
- 37 Berktay, Batılılaşma, 284.

responsible for protecting and transferring the "inner values" of the nation.<sup>38</sup> Berktay argues that the new role of women in the nationalistic project was to mobilize "the reproductive resources of women" for the well-being of the nation in a utilitarian way.<sup>39</sup>

The duties and roles of women continued with their symbolic contribution as the modern faces of the Republic. In Republican Turkey, the public sphere was constructed as an area to display the modernity level of society. Therefore, the daily practices of the citizens were strictly regulated and controlled by the state-supported modern behaviors. In the 1930s, women's physical appearances became an important tool to display the modernization of society. As part of its advertising, "modern" appearances of women in the public sphere were encouraged by the elites of the new Republic. The Turkish woman's new physicality was regarded as a symbol of the modern Turkish Republic. Besides the symbolic meaning of appearance, the description of equal citizenship provided the opportunity of

Ayşe Durakbaşa, *Halide Edib: Türk Modernleşmesi ve Feminizm* (Istanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2002), 104. Durakbaşa claimed that formal education was a part of the role of the women as mothers of the future generations. Since they are going to raise the children of the nation, they should be educated well enough to raise healthy and moral children. Also, they could contribute to the Turkish society in the development and improvement of the country by being perfect models for children. Deniz Kandiyoti, "Kimlik Kavramı ve Yetersizlikleri," in *Cariyer Bacılar Yurttaşlar* (İstanbul: Metis Yayınları, 1997), 165-166.

<sup>39</sup> Berktay, "Batılılaşma," 279.

<sup>40</sup> Sirman, "Kadınların Milliyeti."

<sup>41</sup> Kandiyoti, "Kimlik Kavramı ve Yetersizlikleri," 157. Arat, "Türkiye'de Modernleşme Projesi ve Kadınlar," 82-99.

<sup>42</sup> Ayşe Kadıoğlu, "Cinselliğin İnkârı: Büyük Toplumsal Projelerin Nesnesi Olarak Türk Kadınları," in *75. Yılda Kadınlar ve Erkekler*, ed. Ayşe B. Hacımirzaoğlu (Istanbul: Türk Tarih Vakfı Yayınları, 1998), 96.

Sancar, *Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti*, 113. She argued that women were active in the years during national struggle. However, after the foundation of the Republic, women were excluded from the political arena in the early years of Republic. Sancar brought the case of the 1924 constitution where women were not given the right to vote. Aykaç, "Kemalist Utopia, Study of the Propaganda Magazine: La Turquie Kemaliste (1934-1948)." Sibel Bozdoğan and Reşat Kasaba ed., *Rethinking Modernity and National Identity in Turkey* (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1997).

participating in the newly constructed public sphere.<sup>44</sup> The modern Turkish woman was encouraged to participate and perform their new roles and duties in the public areas regulated by the latest norms and laws.<sup>45</sup>

The early republican period witnessed changes in the relations between men and women. Men and women of the Republic started to gather in social spaces such as schools, stores, balls, and ceremonies. The places where men and women gathered appeared as sexualized social spaces since those people were unrelated and started to recognize each other for their sex and sexuality. Women in public spaces became more open to the new regulative mechanisms since they were also representing the *modern*. However, in societies where social relations between men and women are limited by kinship and otherwise forbidden, cultural roles for *how they are supposed to interact with each other in sexualized spaces* do not exist. Besides, the norms of social relations were not set definitively. Therefore, shared public spaces required new norms for managing these encounters. Several tools, including the popular press and formal education, were used to establish norms and raise awareness among society members. Women

Ayşe Durakbaşa, "Türk Modernleşmesinin Kamusal Alanı ve "Kadın Yurttaş," in *Birkaç Arpa Boyu, 21. Yüzyıla Girerken Türkiye'de Feminist Çalışmalar Cilt 1*, ed. Serpil Sancar (İstanbul: Koç Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2011), 461.

Dilek Cindoğlu, "Modern Türk Tıbbında Bekaret Testleri ve Suni Bekaret," in *Müslüman Toplumlarda Kadın ve Cinsellik*, ed. Pınar İlkkaracan (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003), 119.

Nancy Y. Reynolds, "Salesclerks, Sexual Danger, and National Identity in Egypt, 1920s—1950s," *Journal of Women's History*, 23, 3 (2011), 72. Reynolds suggested that in the 1920s in Egypt retailstores became places where unrelated men and women mixed.

<sup>47</sup> Fatmagül Berktay, "Türkiye'de Toplumsal Değişim Sürecinde Kadın," in *75. Yılda Kadınlar ve Erkekler*, ed. Ayşe B. Hacımirzaoğlu (Istanbul: Türk Tarih Vakfı Yayınları, 1998), 1-12.

Shahla Haeri, "İran'da Geçici Evlilik ve Devlet: Kadın Cinselliği üzerine İslami bir Söylem," in *Müslüman Toplumlarda Kadın ve Cinsellik*, ed. Pınar İlkkaracan, (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003), 158.

For the Iranian experience in the second part of the 1920s: Haeri, "İran'da Geçici Evlilik ve Devlet: Kadın Cinselliği üzerine İslami bir Söylem," 167.

Mixed formal education was another tool to bring together opposites sexes together. Afsaneh Najmabadi, "Contested Veils, Veiled Contestations: Power and the Public Female," in *Women, Work and Power in the Middle East Conference* (University of

encountered the values and norms of the new setting through novels, newspaper articles, and etiquette manuals.<sup>51</sup> As a part of this formation process, women were asked to look modern, act virtuously, share public space with men, and contribute to the development of the country. Simultaneously, the same women were warned against the dangers of modernity by a "male voice."<sup>52</sup> Berktay argues that the rules and norms for women were shaped by the nation-state instead of religion or tradition.<sup>53</sup> The Republican male elite, as the embodied carriers of the nationalist and modernist project, took the liberty to articulate the norms for women.

Women in the republic were asked to exercise self-control, avoid inappropriate relationships and places, and enjoy their freedom responsibly. According to Peyami Safa, beaches or places of entertainment with a lot of alcohol are examples of inappropriate places.<sup>54</sup> Ayşe Durakbaşa claims that male intellectuals of the era tried to manage the "danger of women's moral deterioration" by excluding sexuality from their discussions.<sup>55</sup> In one of the well-known novels, *Sözde Kızlar*,<sup>56</sup> Peyami Safa told stories of *fallen* young girls who entertained themselves with men in unacceptable gatherings. He stated that these young women "do not love their religion, nation; rebel against their family and neighborhood; sell their honor and chastity."<sup>57</sup> Not only did the male authors expect properness from women due to the "national cause." Even women authors such as Sabiha Sertel warned women to dress and behave according to the necessities of "national cause."<sup>58</sup> In the early Republican period, this transformation enabled women to participate

California, Los Angeles, 12-13 April 1991. Quoted from Haeri, "İran'da Geçici Evlilik ve Devlet: Kadın Cinselliği üzerine İslami bir Söylem," 167-168.

- 52 Berktay, "Türkiye'de Toplumsal Değişim Sürecinde Kadın."
- 53 Berktay, "Batılılaşma," 278.
- Peyami Safa, "Sözde Kızlar ve Çeşitleri," Seksoloji, 49 (1953), 2.
- 55 Durakbaşa, Halide Edib: Türk Modernleşmesi ve Feminizm, 68.
- Published in 1923, but also circulated widely during the 1930s.
- Fatmagül Berktay, "Yeni kimlik arayışı, eski cinsel düalizm: Peyami Safa'nın romanlarında toplumsal cinsiyet," *Kadın Araştırmaları Dergisi*, 9 (2006), 77-90. http://www.iudergi.com/tr/index.php/kadin/article/view/337.
- 58 Sancar, Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti, 107.

Aslı Güneş, "Kemalist Modernleşmenin Adab-ı Muaşeret Romanları: Popüler Aşk Anlatıları" (MA Thesis, Bilkent Üniversitesi, 2005).

in public gatherings. However, women's appearance in public spaces also caused significant anxiety regarding the "protection of their honor and purity." Women were asked to protect their chastity above all to avoid any "social deterioration" that could be caused by the participation of women in mixed public spheres. 60

Women of the new Republic were represented as either "welcome" accompliances or "unwanted" traitors based on their behaviors in the public space regarding their sexualities. As a result of these warnings, middle-class women started to act modestly, paying special attention to decency and prudence in public spaces to overcome any accusations about being "easy" women. In other words, women tried to fulfill the role of responsible, modest, and prudent daughters of the Republic by controlling themselves, particularly their sexualities.

The male elites of the 1930s asked women to behave in a worthy manner toward their motherly duties. They asked women to participate in the modernist project for the ideological and biological reproduction of the nation. Women were objectified in the service of the "national cause" for the nationalization and modernization of the country. Because women have been designated as "mothers of the nation," Women's first priority

<sup>59</sup> Kandiyoti, "Kimlik Kavramı ve Yetersizlikleri," 149.

<sup>60</sup> Sancar, Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti, 107.

Sancar, *Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti*, 63-64. According to Tanıl Bora, nationalism defines women in a dualist position whether as passive victims or active traitor. This perception requires control of women in nation-building projects. Bora, "Analar, Bacılar, Orospular: Türk-Milliyetçi Muhafazakar Söyleminde Kadın."

<sup>62</sup> Haeri, "İran'da Geçici Evlilik ve Devlet: Kadın Cinselliği üzerine İslami bir Söylem," 166.

Kadıoğlu, "Cinselliğin İnkarı: Büyük Toplumsal Projelerin Nesnesi Olarak Türk Kadınları." According to Kadıoğlu, women were imagined as orderly and modest (*mazbut*) in nation building process. Sancar, *Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti*, 63-64. Sylvia Walby interprets this transformation as "... women have entered the public sphere, yet are subordinated there." Walby, *Theorizing Patriarchy*, 180.

<sup>64</sup> Kumari Jayawardena, Feminism and Nationalism in the Third World (London, New Jersey: Zed Book, 1989). Kandiyoti, Cariyer, Yurttaşlar, Bacılar. Nira Yuval Davis and Floya Anthias, Woman-Nation-State (London: MacMillan, 1989).

<sup>65</sup> Kadıoğlu, "Cinselliğin İnkarı: Büyük Toplumsal Projelerin Nesnesi Olarak Türk Kadınları," 90-93.

Durakbaşa, "Türk Modernleşmesinin Kamusal Alanı ve "Kadın Yurttaş," 463.

should be to protect their purity and honor. As a part of the protection process, "ideal" women were represented as "asexual and devoid of their essential femaleness" by the early Republican novelists.<sup>67</sup> Women of the early Republican period were squeezed into being modern and moderate.<sup>68</sup> On the one hand, the new women needed to avoid being *alaturca*. On the other hand, they needed to display modesty to protect their virtue and honor.<sup>69</sup> The daughters of the new Republic were considered the symbols and carriers of the inner values of Turkishness. Hence, they should be protected from the deteriorating effects of the outside world.<sup>70</sup>

As some feminist writers have argued, the new women preferred participating in public spaces as asexual beings. Deniz Kandiyoti argued that de-emphasizing feminity became a symbolic shield for the modern woman in the management of her sexuality.<sup>71</sup> Whether the concealment of female sexuality was chosen by the women of the era or enforced by the male elites, this strategy eased the participation of women in the public sphere. During the process, these rules regarding female sexuality were used as a mechanism to control and impose self-control over the mobility and actions of women.<sup>72</sup> These discussions on women and female sexuality

Kandiyoti, "Cariyeler, Fettan Kadınlar ve Yoldaşlar: Türk Romanında Kadın İmgeleri," 144-146. Müge Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality: A New Perspective on the Modernization Project in Turkey from 1931 to 1959" (PhD. Dissertation, Boğaziçi University, 2007).

<sup>68</sup> Kandiyoti, "Kimlik Kavramı ve Yetersizlikleri," 153.

<sup>69</sup> Kadıoğlu, "Cinselliğin İnkarı: Büyük Toplumsal Projelerin Nesnesi Olarak Türk Kadınları," 90-93.

<sup>70</sup> Zihnioğlu, *Kadınsız Inkilap*, 48-49. For Zihnioğlu, outside influences were mainly representing the negative parts of "western" culture.

Deniz Kandiyoti, "Modernin Cinsiyeti: Türk Modernleşmesi Üzerine Çalışmalarda Gözden Kaçırılan Yönler," in *Cariyer, Yurttaşlar, Bacılar* (İstanbul: Metis Yayınları, 1997): 202-221. Ayşe Saktanber, "Kemalist Kadın Hakları Söylemi," in *Modern Türkiye'de Siyasi Düşünce: Kemalizm cilt: 2*, ed. Murat Gültekingil and Tanıl Bora (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2001), 323-334.

İpek İlkkaracan and Gülşah Seral, "Kadının İnsan Hakkı Olarak Cinsel Haz: Türkiye'deki Bir Taban Eğitimi Programından Deneyimler," in *Müslüman Toplumlarda Kadın ve Cinsellik*, ed. İpek İlkkaracan (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003), 198. İlkkaracan ve Seral stated that advocates of modernity and women's rights worked on equality of women in the

continued throughout the Republican period. Some feminists, such as Ayşe Kadıoğlu, suggested that women's sexuality was denied until the 1980s in Turkey. She argued that women in Turkey had been perceived within the context of the traditional family, which caused the denial of their sexualities. Durakbaşa stated that prior to the 1980s, female sexuality was a subject not addressed within the public discourse. He claimed that after the 1980s, female sexuality became a popular and appropriate subject for use in the press, magazines, and women's films.

Unlike the writers mentioned above, Funda Duman proposes that at the end of the 1930s, the sexual attraction of women was brought to the readers' attention. In the popular magazines of the day, the beauty of Turkish women was vocalized and compared with the beauty of western women. Again, Elif Ekin Akşit mentioned that articles on feminity started to emerge in women's magazines to give them advice on "making themselves more beautiful." Although Duman's and Akşit's points on the concept of beauty" and its relation to sexuality deserve remarkable attention, the connection with sexuality and the visibility of sexuality in these writings were formed indirectly in the era's articles. The writers of the articles on beauty did not mention the effects of "being beautiful" on sexuality. Another argument comes from Müge Işıklar Koçak, which was based on marriage manuals. Based on her research on popular translated texts between 1931 and 1959, women's sexuality was visible in the texts. The roles of women in the era's magazines were not limited "within the family.

family, education, employment and politics. However, they occasionally left out the inequality of women in sexual life.

- 74 Durakbaşa, Halide Edib: Türk Modernleşmesi ve Feminizm, 14.
- Funda Duman, Modern ve Geleneksel Bağlamında Erken Cumhuriyet Döneminde Kadın Kimliği: Haftalık Magazin Dergisi 7 Gün ve Aylık Aile Dergisi Ana, unpublished paper, 2001, quoted from Sancar, Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti, 245.
- Flif Ekin Akşit, Kızların Sessizliği: Kız Enstitülerinin Uzun Tarihi İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2005.
- 77 Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality," 78.

Kadıoğlu, "Cinselliğin İnkârı: Büyük Toplumsal Projelerin Nesnesi Olarak Türk Kadınları," 100. Similar to Kadıoğlu, Serpil Sancar also argues that the women could be in the public space with their asexual existence. Sancar, *Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti*, 315.

the home, and society, but also within sexual life." <sup>78</sup> She mentioned that the first translated text on women's sexuality was published in Latin script in 1931. From 1931 on, both the number and the frequency of female sexuality in magazines have increased steadily.<sup>79</sup> Although her study has contributed invaluably to the literature, the physical and social difficulties of distributing and circulating these writings were relatively underestimated since her data was mainly based on the (translated) published texts. Although female sexuality started to emerge in the women's magazines and marriage manuals at the beginning of the 1930s, the sexual attributes of women were not seen – directly or indirectly – in the daily newspapers, or the Halkevleri magazines. 80 The writings of the time were primarily concerned with reproduction, while ignoring (or attempting to ignore) its links to sexuality.<sup>81</sup> However, the invisibility of female sexuality started to change in the second half of the 1940s. In the late 1940s, female sexuality transformed into a subject to discuss, publish, research, and distribute openly in Turkey and globally.

After the Second World War, people's everyday practices were considered as "fast," open to change, and controversial. Affected by the changes, the tendencies of the era were summarized as the elevation of fashion, the emergence of popular culture (in particular the effects of American culture), changes in moral understanding, and critics of the new trends. The late 1940s saw the emergence of new trends in the pages of newspapers. Topics of the newspapers such as consumption habits, luxury, women, and their changing practices became apparent in the discussions of the era's intellectuals. Alongside the new changes, subjects surrounding sexuality, such as marriage, divorce, motherhood, birth-giving, and even nudity, had become popular topics of discussion. Unlike the former decade,

78 Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality," 2-5.

<sup>79</sup> Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality," 2.

<sup>80</sup> Yurttagüler, "Social Policies on Female Body in the 1930s in Turkey."

As mentioned before several times, the role of "mothers of the nation" made women visible when and if they had children. Regarding the sexuality of women, this could be interpreted as indirect visibility.

<sup>82</sup> Cantek, Cumhuriyetin Büluğ Çağı, 16-17.

<sup>83</sup> Cantek, Cumhuriyetin Büluğ Çağı, 89-99.

sexuality was not discussed only with reproductive or medical concerns in the late 1940s.

In the 1950s, the physical "togetherness" of unrelated men and women in social spaces became familiar to the eyes of the public. However, the recently developed discussions about social and sexual relations between men and women had become something new and unfamiliar to the general public. As a symbol of change in the relationship, in newspaper and magazine articles, individuals frequently discuss what it means for men and women to be friends. The distinctive character of the 1950s lay in the emergence of the public discussion on sexuality and sexual manners of men and women, which was no longer covered under blurred narratives. The explicit and implicit existence and visibility of sexuality in the public space have grasped the attention of public figures. Before further discussing the responses and intervention attempts of public figures, it is crucial to mention the mediums through which sexuality has gained visibility.

Marriage manuals have been one of the most symbolic and value-laden tools that made female sexuality visible. Marriage manuals have been in publication and circulation since the nineteenth century. According to Porter, most of the elements of sexual knowledge were already formed in the 1950s in Britain. However, although the basics of sexual knowledge remained similar, it was enriched and disseminated widely in the 1950s. The first indigenous popular non-literary text on women's sexuality was in 1878 in the Ottoman Empire, whereas the first translated popular non-literary texts appeared in 1914. Until the 1930s, there was a silent period for the publishing of texts on women's sexuality. The first popular

Kazım Kip, "Kadın Erkek Arkadaş Olabilir mi?" *Cumhuriyet*, 03.05.1953.

Roy Porter and Lesley Hall, *The Facts of Life: the Creation of Sexual Knowledge in Britain*, 1650-1950 (New Haven and London: Yale University, 1995).

Porter and Hall, *The Facts of Life*, 271.

Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality," 79. Her research is limited with the biographies which have been searched. Koçak uses "the description of text" for the published materials in the manuel and/or book format. First translated text: "1914 Marlis Pevaru. *Yeni Kadın Mektupları*, trans. Ali Kemal (Istanbul: Muhtar Halit Külliyatı), first indigenous text in 1878, by Mehmed Emin "*Risale-i mürşid üt-talak ven-nikah ve Risale-i nuhbe-i eminiye lihukukiz-zevciye*" (Istanbul: Süleyman Efendi Matbaası).

indigenous texts on women's sexuality published in the republican period belong to Daniş Remzi Korok, who wrote twenty-three texts on women's sexuality between 1935 and 1939. Republished in 1931. The text was written by Elinor Glyn, *The Philosophy of Love*, and translated as *Aşk Dersleri: Evleneceklere ve Evlenenlere* (Lessons in Love: For Those Who Will Get Married and Are Already Married). Although the initial marriage manuals emerged quite early, the distinctive increase in the number and content of the manuals occurred in the late 1940s and the beginning of the 1950s. Koçak stated that the number of translated popular non-literary texts on women's sexuality increased steadily until the 1960s. Even though the circulation of the manuals was questionable, their constant visibility through advertisements in the newspapers could be followed in *Milliyet* and *Cumhuriyet*.

Female sexuality was not buried only in the marriage manuals. It also emerged through the pages of periodic publications such as newspapers and popular magazines. In these periodicals, the presentation of the text changed recognizably in the 1950s. The development in press technology enabled publishers to use more visual materials. Also, using more visual materials became a strategy for the publishers to reach the mass (and with a high percentage of illiteracy) public. 93 On the other hand, the content has also been affected by the changes during the 1950s. The periodicals started to include sexuality-related material on their pages in different forms, including news (reporting), interviews, opinion articles, informative scientific pieces, or simple "advised to housewife/mother" format. The periodicals held particular importance since their content occupied public

<sup>88</sup> Isıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality," 79.

<sup>89</sup> Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality," 80.

<sup>90</sup> Isıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality," 69, 80.

<sup>91</sup> Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality," 80.

<sup>92</sup> For the advertisements of Seksoloji in Milliyet and Cumhuriyet, see: Tools of Sexuality Section

<sup>93</sup> Bulut, "Hürriyet Gazetesi: 1948-1953 Döneminin Yayın Politikası," 4-5. According to Bulut, Hürriyet used photograph as the main medium to deliver news instead of using visual material as a complementary element.

discussions regularly and repetitively. As a result, even without intending to do so, the content of the periodical became visible and a part of daily discussions.

Beginning in the second half of the 1940s, journalism's approach shifted from "editorial article" journalism to news and picture-based journalism.<sup>94</sup> During the Second World War, some news, such as murder and suicide news, that could cause depression among the public was censored as a matter of state policy. After the war, in the second part of the 1940s, tabloid newspapers such as Cinayet, Hadise, and Kelepce, composed of judiciary news, increased their numbers and their sales. 95 Beginning with the publication of Hürriyet and Milliyet in 1950, crime news continued to take place – so-called "the third page" – in the newspapers. The third-page news covered subjects from murder to suicide those narrated honor and jealousy killings, 96 girl abduction (kiz kaçırma), 97 cheating husband/wife, rape, 98 and news on prostitution. 99 Majority of the crime news, unavoidably, carried a reference to sexuality or are woven around sexuality. 100 Sexuality or sexuality-related subjects, as well as visual materials such as photographs, illustrations, and pictures, became more apparent in the daily press, popular magazines, academic journals, and manuals/books in the late 1940s and the 1950s. The visual materials of the era contained pictures of

Ayşe Elif Emre Kaya, "Demokrat Parti Politikalarının Cumhuriyet Gazetesinde Ele Alınış Biçimleri 1950-1960" (PhD Diss., Ankara University, 2009), 79-80. Kaya stated that the change in the journalism occured with the beginning of the 1950s, during the Democrat Party period.

<sup>95</sup> Cantek, Cumhuriyetin Büluğ Çağı, 56.

During the first year of Milliyet, the newspaper was consisted of four pages. Therefore crime news - so called 3. page news - have taken place at the second page of the newspaper. Such as: "Bir adam karısını 17 yerinden vurdu," *Milliyet*, 07.06.1950.

<sup>97 &</sup>quot;Kız kaçıran aşıklar," *Milliyet*, 05.061950. "Bir kızı zorla kaçırıp 3 gün kapatan adam," *Milliyet*, 02.06.1950.

<sup>98 &</sup>quot;Bir bekçi tevkif edildi," *Milliyet*, 04.06.1950.

<sup>99 &</sup>quot;Genç kızları fuhşa teşvik eden iki kadın tevkif edildi," *Milliyet*, 01.06.1950.

As an exemplary case: According to Milliyet search engine, even the word "lovemaking – sexual intercourse" has taken place 1286 times between 3 May 1950 and 1 January 1960 whether in the news, stories or adverts.

couples and "beautiful" female figures, even with bikinis, and illustrations of the female body in different publications. <sup>101</sup>

The late 1940s and early 1950s witnessed an increase in the popular periodic magazines. Their specialized subjects differed from the country's daily politics (like *Akis*) to the subjects that were (supposedly) interesting to women (women's popular magazines like *Hayat* and *Aile*). In the magazines, special sections under the title of "women's column" or "health column" were reserved for informative purposes, which discussed subjects related to sexuality and marriage. <sup>102</sup> In the magazines where women were the target group, marriage, wifely duties, relations between men and women, and selfcare (beauty) became the primary subjects, besides the themes on children's care, decoration, and general health advice. Sexuality, in general, and female sexuality in particular, began to appear in magazines, whether through marriage advice or subjects related to sexual health or sexual education.

Apart from including the written material on female sexuality (and female bodies), the visual material also played an important role in presenting women in a more "feminine" way. A symbolic and visible area, which increased the visibility of sexuality in the public space, was formed by the "celebrity" sections of the newspapers and magazines. During the late 1940s and 1950s, the number of celebrity sections in newspapers and magazines increased. The celebrity sections had comprehensive content, varying from famous people's love affairs to career plans, marriages, divorces, family lives, and diets to health problems. The celebrities had diverse backgrounds, "changing from a crown prince to an exotic dancer,

See the Appendix: photos with bikinis, see: "Yaz gelince amerikada "plaj güzellik kıraliçeleri" seçilmeğe başlandı." *Milliyet*, 14.06.1950. "Sporcu yıldız : Janis Carter," *Milliyet*, 25.06.1950. "Sinema Haberleri," *Milliyet*, 23.07.1950. "Resimli hadiseler," *Milliyet*, 24.10.1951. "Resimli hadiseler," *Milliyet*, 31.10.1951. "Resimli hadiseler," *Milliyet*, 30.11.1951. "Resimli hadiseler," *Milliyet*, 04.12.1951. "Resimli hadiseler," *Milliyet*, 22.12.1951. Sedat Simavi was known the person who situated female figure in the media. For a discussion about the influence of Sedat Simavi in the changing character of Turkish press, see: Orhan Koloğlu, "Sedat Simavi: Kadın Resmini Basına Yerlestiren Gazeteci," *Tarih ve Toplum*, 231 (2003), 34.

<sup>102 &</sup>quot;Çocuklarımızın Cinsi Terbiyesi," *Akis*, 15.01.1955, 29. Dr. N.C., "Terbiye: Size düşen vazife," *Akis*, 22.01.1955, 21-22.

bringing a Swedish actress side by side with an Iranian princess."<sup>103</sup> Although Koçer claimed that the celebrity news in the women's magazines was directly taken from the American world and its counterparts, therefore focusing on American celebrities, Okur stated that particularly in *Hayat* magazine, the celebrity reports covered a more comprehensive range of territory (including Europe).<sup>104</sup>

There were special sections for celebrity news in the magazines and newspapers, predominantly formed by visual material, photographs, followed by one or two sentences of short descriptions and explanations. Among the period's high-circulation newspapers, both *Hürriyet* and *Milliyet* had special sections for celebrity news. Particularly *Hürriyet* had reserved a full page out of eight pages of the newspaper for Hollywood news on Sundays, which was supported by the interviews of Hikmet Feridun Es. Although many magazines prepared celebrity reports for their readers, *Hayat* took a prominent place among the magazines since almost one-third of the magazine consisted of celebrity news. Nocer suggested that among the studied women's magazines of the 1950s, celebrity reports accounted for 6% of all content in the magazines. The celebrity section consisted of photographs including "high society" people, royalty, movie stars from America and Europe, singers, and even politicians and their families. Their

Fatma Berrin Okur, "Conspicuous Consumption in Turkey in the 1950s: an Examination of Hayat Magazine" (MA. Thesis, Boğaziçi University, 2007), 51.

Dilara Nergishan Koçer, "Demokrat Parti Döneminde Kadın: 1950-1960 Arası Kadın Dergilerinde Kadın İmajı," (PhD. Diss., Marmara University, 2009), 121-122. Okur, "Conspicuous Consumption in Turkey," 51.

<sup>105</sup> Bulut, "Hürriyet Gazetesi: 1948-1953 Döneminin Yayın Politikası," 276.

Okur, "Conspicuous Consumption in Turkey," 51. *Yenigün, Yelpaza, İkimiz and Yeni Yıldız* were also the magazines those used celebrity reports as the crucial partof their publishing strategy.

<sup>107</sup> Koçer, "Demokrat Parti Döneminde Kadın," 120-122, 158. 577 celebrity reports in 17 woman's magazine published between the years 1950-1960. Among the 17 woman's magazines studies, 14 of them have included celebrity report in their pages. The total number of the news content was 9475 that is counted as a part of the study. Koçer, "Demokrat Parti Döneminde Kadın," 162. Koçer stated that she counted related photographs and texts. Although the percentage looked low, Koçer stated that the place covered by the celebrity sections was higher.

photojournalism especially focused on the "beautiful women" of the period. However, the photographs of the beautiful women were not limited to their daily dresses. Women were presented with their balls, ceremonies, party costumes, and even came close to nudity sometimes. Along with the photographs of the period's famous movie stars, like Sophie Lauren, "generous" female body exposure was also seen in the pages of the magazines with reports on exotic dancers, "generous striptease clubs! or scandals! of the era. The developments in printing technology and high usage of the American magazines enabled the publicists to use a high number of visual materials and celebrity news. Yet, the increase in "female body exposure" was a new strategy used by the publicists of the period compared to the 1930s. Okur explained the relatively low coverage of national celebrities in Hayat as the "cautiousness to preserve its [their] honor, and keeping celebrity faces—and more importantly bodies— out of sight." 113

Seksoloji took a significant place among the magazines due to its exposure of (female) sexuality in the 1950s. The magazine was first published in 1949. The content of the magazine will be discussed later. However, it is important to mention that the sole focus of the magazine was on sexuality, which was supported by visual materials (photos and illustrations). Koçer mentioned another magazine, Cennet, alongside Seksoloji though she defined Cennet as a male magazine with its assertive

<sup>108 &</sup>quot;Dünün Sophia Loren'i, Ev kadınının ağırlığına ve huzuruna kavuşmuş," *Hayat*, 140 (12.06.1959), 4-5.

<sup>109 &</sup>quot;Hollywood'dan Avrupa'ya Akın," *Hayat*, 148 (07.08.1959), 22-23; "Amerika'daki Türk Sanatkarları," *Hayat*, 132 (17.04.1959), 18-19.

<sup>110</sup> A serial novel by Halide Edip, "Nude Girl" was published in *Hayat*.

Arif Hanoğlu, "Ders-i İbret," *Yeni Yıldız*, 03.04.1957, 3. "Roma Rezaleti: Roma'daki rezalete bir Türk dansözün de ismi karışmıştır." *Hayat*, 111 (21.11.1958), 12. "Roma'da Son Moda: Mangal ve Nana," *Hayat*, 118 (09.01.1959), 6-7.

<sup>112</sup> Yusuf Özkır, "Hürriyet Gazetesi'nin Kimliği," *Iğdır University Journal of Social Sciences*, 3 (2013), 50. "Türkiye'ye ilk telefoto makinesini Hürriyet getirmiştir. 1952 yılında gerçekleştirilen yenilikle böylece, sadece yurt içinden değil, yurt dışından fotoğraf almanın önündeki en büyük engel de aşılmış olur. Bu teknolojinin kullanılması Hürriyet'i bir adım öne geçirtir."

Okur, "Conspicuous Consumption in Turkey," 51.

visual materials (women in bikinis on all the cover pages and almost nude female photos inside). 114 Cennet was, relatively, a short period magazine that was first published in August 1953, and its last issue came out in April 1954. 115 Besides the increase in the number, the coverage area, and topics of the periodicals, the magazine's content was also reorganized with the frequent and differentiated usage of visual materials and touching on numerous subjects. Sexuality, in particular, female sexuality, has drawn strong attention during the period. The subject was covered from a range of topics and perspectives, including anatomy of the sexual organs, norms of sexual intercourse, spouse relations, and sexual anomalies. In other words, sexuality was not only discussed in terms of health and reproductive concerns. However, as a performance, it was brought to the attention of the audience. In the narratives that contained sexuality and sexuality-related discussions, the naturalness of the act was stressed with a solid emphasis that classified sexuality as a part of a natural order. Notably, the writers highlighted the relationship between marriage and sexuality. 116 The concept of "proper and happy sexuality" within marriage became a tool for "keeping the family" together. In a translated article published by Seksoloji, the writer argued that all around the world, people wanted to veil sexuality with a tulle curtain. He stated that "although people were aware of sexuality's role in marriage and having children, people ignored sexuality and mentioned only love." According to Keller, it is necessary to recognize the power of sexuality. He continued, underlining the importance of understanding and preparing oneself to conquer "sexuality." <sup>117</sup> Keller emphasized the necessity of a healthy relationship between reproduction, marriage, and sexuality for happy individuals and society. In other words, the authors repeated the fundamental, necessary, and natural relationship between sexuality and life in popular periodicals.

<sup>114</sup> Koçer, "Demokrat Parti Döneminde Kadın," 100. "Yatar vaziyette, köpük banyosu yaparken, oyuncak hayvanlarla görülür kadınlar. Bazen kadınların üstleri çıplaktır ve bir şekilde, örneğin bir kürk ya da bir tül ile örtünmeye çalışırlar."

<sup>115</sup> Koçer, "Demokrat Parti Döneminde Kadın," 98.

The relation between marriage and sexuality will be discussed in detailed in the coming section.

<sup>117</sup> David Keller, "Cinsiyetin Kudreti," Seksoloji, 12 (1950), 33.

Literature became another genre that produced discussions on female sexuality. In the fictive stories of the era, the readers witnessed the love stories of the hero and heroine with differentiating characters. Love stories in fiction literature were not new to Turkish readers. Even before the Republic, innocent, illicit, or eternal love stories were told in literature. In the early years of the Republic, love stories began to carry more moral and regulative messages. 118 In the early Republican novels, womanhood was associated with naturalness, honor, virtue, tradition, spirituality, home, and nation. 119 In the literature, modern Turkish women are represented as modest and serious products of Turkish national culture. She was dedicated to national ideals instead of personal love, distant from the harmful effects of western culture and with an obscured sexuality. 120 Moreover, according to Irzık and Parla, the new Turkish woman was considered as an anonymous object on which male authors produced the narrative. Male writers assigned the positive or negative characteristics of Turkish women in order to provide examples for their moral messages. 121

Alongside the canonical novels of the early Republican period, popular love stories emerged with the contributions of, mainly, Kerime Nadir, Esat Mahmut Karakurt, and Muazzez Tahsin Berkand in the late 1930s. The difference and importance of these three writers lied in their focus on love affairs and their reach to the masses. These novels, according to Kerem Özkurt, described modern social relations between men and women in changing times. They have contributed to the construction of new

<sup>118</sup> Güneş, "Kemalist Modernleşmenin Adab-ı Muaşeret Romanları: Popüler Aşk Anlatıları."

Sibel Irzık and Jale Parla, "Önsöz," in *Kadınlar Dile Düşünce* (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2004), 7-9.

<sup>120</sup> Sancar, Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti, 134.

<sup>121</sup> Berktay, "Batılılaşma."

Ömer Türkeş was mentioning only Kerime Nadir and Muazzez Tahsin as popular romance writers. A. Ömer Türkes "Ask Romanlarının Unutulmaz Yazarları Ask Olsun!" *Virgül* 18 (1999), 53. However, Kerem Özkurt, in his MA thesis, added Mahmut Esat Bozkurt to the group of popular romance writers. Kerem Özkurt, "Tracing Modernity In The Popular Romances Of The Early Republican Period (1930-1945): The Novels Of Kerime Nadir, Esat Mahmut Karakurt and Muazzez Tahsin Berkand" (MA Thesis, Boğaziçi University, 2007), 4.

values and norms regarding love, marriage, and domestic life. 123 Surely, the most common theme of these novels was the modest and romantic versions of love stories. Besides, female sexuality, whether hidden or explicitly, took place as a part of the love relations between heroes and heroines. Although some of Karakurt's characters engaged in extramarital affairs, female sexuality existed with "happily ever after" for both Nadir and Berkand. 124 Even though the publishing dates of these romances went back to the end of the 1930s, their circulation continued during the 1940s and even later until the 1960s. 125 In the 1950s, popular novels widened their range and started to be published in daily newspapers and periodic magazines as serial novels. Even the well-known and respected names of the era, like Halide Edip and Refik Halit Karay published their novels as serials in the periodicals. 126 Love stories, not surprisingly, have taken a central place in the series. Interestingly, the themes of the series were like a reflection of the news. In other words, the novels told stories of "fallen girls" with excess freedom, infidelity of spouses, the problem of "losing virginity," and jealousy issues. Even in some parts of the series, the sexual interaction between men and women was touched slightly by the authors. 127

Özkurt, "Tracing Modernity In The Popular Romances Of The Early Republican Period (1930-1945)," 109-110.

For a detailed discussion and comparison on sexuality and sexual relations of the characters and novels of three authors, see: Özkurt, "Tracing Modernity In The Popular Romances Of The Early Republican Period (1930-1945)," 42-69. Özkurt stated that Karakurt was the most articulated author about (female) sexuality among these writers. He, even, described some scenes of sexual intercourse.

Özkurt mentioned several times that these novels were read during the 1960s and 1970s by, both, men and women. His chapters in the study begins with transference of conversations conducted with the individuals who read the novels during their adolescence and/or twenties.

Okur, "Conspicuous Consumption in Turkey," 17. Halide Edip has published her three novels, *Akile Hanım Sokağı* (Akile Hanım's Street), *Sallan ve Yuvarlan* (Rock and Roll) and *Cıbıl Gız* (Striptease) in *Hayat* magazine.

For an examplary series, see: Bedii Faik, "Demokrasi Gülleri," *Milliyet*. The series began at 03.05.1950 and ended at 23.06.1950. However, the story of the series was not completed. In the series, Bedii Faik narrated a story of a "fallen girl," who was carried away with the new *liberated* wave of the period.

Sexuality was not only an appealing and intriguing subject for popular publications or a part of the daily conversation. It also fascinated the academic world. The academics were preoccupied with the discussions on the sexual practices of individuals. Researchers used empiric methods (facts) with statistics, charts, and mass data to learn the sexual practices of individuals. 128 Adcock and Bevir stated that as a part of the "behavioral revolution" of the 1950s and 1960s, social sciences tried to learn from individuals and have a great interest in public opinion. 129 One of the key and symbolic attempts of the era came from an American scientist, Alfred Kinsey. The well-known Kinsey reports, "Sexual Behavior in the Human Male" in 1948 and "Sexual Behavior in the Human Female" in 1953, became a popular reference point for understanding sexuality. The reports presented the results of interviews with thousands of American men and women. The reports contained "information on the age of first intercourse, number of partners, history of premarital and extramarital sex, the incidence of homosexuality and lesbianism, and virtually every other imaginable sexual statistic." 130 Kinsey's research opened the door to discussing the sexual practices of individuals. The researchers turned the interviews (which covered the sexual practices and experiences of the individuals) into statistical data (numbers and percentages). With scientific language (terminology), the research articulated the discussions on such a *private* and shameful subject. Kinsey stated that the goal of researching human sexual behavior is to understand the realities of sex. 131 Kinsey's efforts to produce knowledge about sexuality and distribute this knowledge did not only make sexuality visible among the American public. According to Shannon, "the

<sup>128</sup> Christopher Shannon, "Sex, Science, and History," *Journal of Policy History* 12, 2 (2000), 270.

<sup>129</sup> Robert Adcock and Mark Bevir, "Political Science," in *The History of the Social Sciences since 1945*, ed. Roger E. Backhouse and Phillippe Fontaine (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2010), 76-79. Adcock and Bevir analyze the new approach in political science. However, similar approach could be seen in the social sciences and scientific research about sexuality.

Miriam G. Reuman, *American Sexual Character: Sex, Gender, and National Identity in the Kinsey Reports* (Berkeley, London, LosAngeles: University of California Press, 2005), 1.

<sup>131</sup> Alfred Kinsey et al., *Sexual Behavior in the Human Male* (Philadelphia: W.B. Saunders, 1948).

Kinsey Report sold more than two hundred thousand copies in the first two months following its release." As proof of its repercussions in the press, Shannon cited the *New York Times, which* praised and promoted the 1948-dated book for its contribution to "tolerance and understanding." Kinsey's report provoked a vast number of discussions, countless reviews, symposia, digests, and articles full of various degrees of approval, concern, and shock in the academic area and also in popular culture. Kinsey's reports were also heard and referred to in Turkey. Even the advertisements for Kinsey's research have found a place in the pages of daily newspapers, in *Milliyet* and *Cumhuriyet*. 135

Besides the research and marriage manuals, medicine has also become another area of scientific sexual knowledge. Indigenous and translated medical texts were published as informative resources, such as Wilhelm Weibel's *Kadın Hastalıkları* (*Lehrbuch der Frauenheilkunde*) translated by Ziya Üstün, and Münir Hakkı Berkmen's *Jinekoloji* (Gynecology). Medical knowledge was primarily used to produce, distribute, promote, and teach "legitimized" and "informative" sexual knowledge. The era's doctors wrote or translated articles on the scientific 137 and popular sides 138 of sexuality (and sexuality-related subjects) from scientific and popular magazines. The themes about sexuality were enriched by the involvement of various experts from different disciplines. Sexuality started to be discussed regarding its effects on legislative mechanisms such as "illegitimate children" or "adultery," medical concerns such as sexually transmitted diseases or healthy sexual practices, aesthetic discussions such as which

132 Shannon, Sex, Science, and History, 270.

<sup>133</sup> Shannon, Sex, Science, and History, 270.

<sup>134</sup> Clifford Kirkpatrick, Sheldon Stryker and Philip Buell, "An Experimental Study Of Attitudes Towards Male Sex Behavior With Reference To Kinsey Findings," *American Sociological Review* 17, 5 (1952), 580.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Kadınların Cinsi Hayatı: Kinsey Raporu," *Cumhuriyet*, 17.01.1955.

Wilhelm Weibel's *Kadın Hastalıkları* (1946), trans. lated by Ziya Üstün, and Münir Hakkı Berkmen's *Jinekoloji* (1945) quoted from: Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality," 97.

Such as: Bowen Partington, "Erkek Menisi ve Tohum Hücreleri," *Seksoloji*, 12 (1950), 34-39

<sup>138</sup> Such as: Mary B. Grossmann, "Niçin Fuhşa Sapıyorlar," Seksoloji, 15 (1950), 48-51.

woman is more beautiful or social problems such as unwed couples. In parallel to the diversified content, the discussions about sexuality reached a wider public with *easy* presentation and dissemination through popular publishing. One of the magazines satirized the frequent and broad visibility of sexuality. In the introductory article named *Seksoloji Dersleri* (Sexology Lessons), the Gazette Magazin (Gazette Magazine) stated that the readers have read many articles on various subjects about sexuality in magazines, books, and even in newspapers. The magazine gave examples of the detailed nature about sexuality discussion in the published materials with a cynic tone. The magazine insinuated that the subjects covered under sexology were supposed to be private and confidential. However, those subjects were made open to the eyes of the public, which was not very welcome by the magazine's columnist. The columnist added, "Thanks to publicly speaking, from children to the elderly, we have learned everything that we did not know, including wedding night... orgasm, virginity." <sup>139</sup>

Surrounded by such information flow, the loss of control over the exposure of sexuality caused great unease among the decision-makers of the day. Sexuality left the "private and personal" realm and became a part of the public discourse. Hannah Stone stated that "there are many people in the contemporary world who are defending the elimination of the restrictions and prohibitions on sexuality. Those people claim that the sexuality of adults is a private (*hususi*) subject; therefore, religion and society should not

<sup>&</sup>quot;Seksoloji Dersleri," *Gazete Magazin*, 17.04.1957, 1. "Son yıllarda çeşitli seksoloji konularına temas eden çeşitli dergiler, kitaplar hatta gazeteler okuduk. Fakat son günlerde bütün gazetelerin sözleşmişler gibi sütun sütun ele aldıkları tatbikatlı seksoloji konularına şimdiye kadar rastlamamıştır.....Zülküf Seher'e kaç kere yanaşmış, kaç kere orgazm olmuş, kocalık vazifesini yapmış mı yapmamış mı...Sonra bekaret zarı üzerinde derin incelemeler, raporlar, teoriler, mütehassısların çeşitli fikirleri, görüşleri... Elestikisinden tutun da dokunur dokunmaz ayrılıverilene kadar boy boy açıklamalar, incelemeler, bilgi vermeler...Ne ise bu vesile ile çoluk çocuk, yediden yetmişe, bilgimizi arttırdık, zifafın da, zifaf odasının da, orgazmdan, zardan, perdeden de bilmediğimiz ne varsa çok şükür öğrendik."

Seyla Benhabib, "Models of Public Space: Hannah Arendt, the Liberal Tradition, and Jürgen Habermas," in *Habermas and the Public Sphere*, ed. Craig Calhoun (Cambridge, Massachusetts, London: MIT Press, 1996), 92.

intervene in the choices of adults."141 Stone continued her article with a counterargument. She argued that although sexual relationships involve two people, a sexual relationship can cause social implications such as pregnancy or sexually transmitted diseases (STDs). Consequently, sexual relations are regulated to some degree in every society. 142 The experiences, concerns, and problems that were regarded as disgraceful, shameful, pornographic, or deprived started to be discussed publicly. The transformation of the private and personal (mahrem and hususi) realm caused sexuality to be talked about, to be torn up, to be researched, to be uncovered, to be told, to be shared, and to be represented in the public realm. 143 The obscurity of the private realm was fragmented, which enabled the public to discuss the sexuality of women who used to be—so-called secrets. Sexuality had been constructed as a secret by administrative, religious and even scientific texts that ignored the existence of sexuality to protect moral codes of society. 144 However, as Safa stated, concealing sexuality caused a deepening of the charm of sexuality, which was supposed to be only a "natural affair." <sup>145</sup> In a translated article by Seksoloji, Keller

Hannah Stone, "Evleninceye Kadar Cinsi Perhiz Yapmalı mı?" *Seksoloji*, 12, (1950), 28. ".... Zamanımızda cinsi yasaklar ve tahditlerin kaldırılması leyhinde bulunanların sayısı az değildir. Bunlar, yetişkin kimselerin cinsi alakalarının tamamen hususi bir mesele olduğu, dinin ve cemiyetin buna karışmaması gerektiği fikrindedirler..."

Hannah Stone, "Evleninceye Kadar Cinsi Perhiz Yapmalı mı?" *Seksoloji*, 12, (1950), 28. "Fakat cinsi rabıtaların tamamen şahsi bir mesele olmadığını kabul etmek lazımdır. Zira bir cinsi münasebette iki kişi mevcuttur ve yalnız birinin değil, öbürünün de hakları ve imtiyazları bahis mevzudur; o şahıs için de tenasüli bir hastalığa yakalanmak veya böyle bir hastalığı başkasına geçirmek, hamile kalmak ihtimalleri vardır. Yani cinsi münasebet bir kişi ile başlayıp, bir kişi ile bitmez, dolayısıyla içtimai tesirler ve neticeler doğurur. İşte hemen her cemiyette, cinsi faaliyetin şu veya bu dereceye kadar cemiyetin kontrolü altına alınmasının sebepleri bunlardır."

<sup>143</sup> Cenk Özbay, Ayşecan Terzioğlu, Yeşim Yasin, "Türkiye'de Neoliberalleşme ve Mahremiyetin Dönüşümü," in *Neoliberalizm ve Mahremiyet*, ed. Cenk Özbay, Ayşecan Terzioğlu, Yeşim Yasin (İstanbul: Metis Yayınları, 2011), 10. For the dichotomic relation between public and private (*mahrem*) Meltem Ahıska, *Radyonun Sihirli Kapısı* (İstanbul: Metis Yayınları, 2005), 283.

Anthony Giddens, *Mahremiyetin Dönüşümü*, second edition (İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları, 2010), 23.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Anketimiz - Peyami Safa," Seksoloji, 9 (1949), 5.

argued that people wanted to veil sexuality with a tulle curtain worldwide. He stated that although people are aware of sexuality's role in marriage and having children, people ignore sexuality and mention only "love." However, Keller continued that it is necessary to recognize the power of sexuality. He added that understanding and preparing [for sexuality] means conquering sexuality. Keller pointed out several subjects in his article. First of all, he underlined the need to talk openly about sexuality. Second, he mentioned educating (preparing) individuals for sexuality to have happier lives. Last but not least, he made the connection between reproduction and sexuality visible.

On the one hand, the era's experts stressed the importance of sexual knowledge for individual happiness. On the other hand, they tried to sustain the population's well-being (Life). Marriage and family were narrated as the nucleus of society. Hence, sexuality-educated individuals would not only serve their own happiness. Institutions like marriage and family would survive with happy individuals' assistance. Sexuality would be discussed for continuity of marital relations and, therefore, healthy reproductive practices. In other words, sexuality would be discussed openly for the sake of the "big" population. When the elements of private such as sexuality, womanhood, and the female body, were discussed in the public space(s), womanhood, and the female body, were discussed in the public space(s), the latest the individual and social well-being.

The visibility of sexuality had given public figures, including the journalists, researchers, academics, and decision-makers – both bureaucrats

David Keller, "Cinsiyetin Kudreti," *Seksoloji*, 12 (1950), 33. "Bütün dünyada, cinsiyet bir tülle örtülmek istenir. Gençler birbirini sever, evlenir ve çoluk çocuğa kavuşurlar. Gerçi herkes bu rabıtalarda cinsiyetin rol oynadığını bilir, ama bilmemezlikten gelip, sadece <aşk> kelimesinden bahsederler,... Fakat, mühüm olan nokta, cinsiyetin kudretini bilmemezlikten gelmemektir. Onu hassasiyetle karşılamalı ve hayatta muvaffak olmak ve saadet bulabilmek için ona hakim olmalıdır. Hazırlıklı olmak ve anlamak, fethetmektir."

<sup>147</sup> Michel Foucault, "The Confession of the Flesh," in *Michel Foucault: Power/Knowledge*, ed. Colin Gordon (Hemel Hempstead: Harvester, 1980), 215-216.

Nancy Fraser, "Rethinking the Public Sphere: A Contribution to the Critique of Actually Existing Democracy," in *Habermas and the Public Sphere*, ed. Craig Calhoun (Cambridge, Massachusetts, London: MIT Press, 1996), 109-142.

and politicians – the opportunity to ask, learn, and, eventually produce knowledge about sexuality. The process allowed them to intervene in the private domain in order to seek knowledge about sexuality. In these attempts, the elements of private (woman, female body, and sexuality) were fragmented into parts to understand them better and to require detailed knowledge about sexuality and sexual practices. Within a public narrative, they have constructed sexuality with new findings and *truths*. <sup>149</sup>

One of the fundamental statements about sexuality focused on the naturalness of its becoming. 150 The argument about "the naturalness of sexuality" provided two justifications for publicly discussing the subject. One of the justifications was related to the characteristics imputed to nature and naturalness. Nature (and naturalness) were considered to be timeless and universal. Since human beings were seen as a part of nature, the rules of nature were applied to human beings. Sexuality, as a part of nature and natural, was considered *normal* to be experienced by human beings. Writers repeatedly stated that experiencing sexuality is a natural and normal act since sexuality is a part of (human) nature. Moreover they stated that "it is not unnatural (gayritabii) to have sexual desires." 151 One of the characteristics of nature was narrated as pureness and un-touchedness. However, with a dichotomic narrative, the other side of nature was portrayed as wild and unpredictable. 152 Hence, nature should be restrained and controlled for the good of human beings. Like in nature, sexuality required control to avoid unpredictable happenings and possible dangers. Therefore, sexuality should be controlled and kept within the limits of the rational mind. 153

\_

<sup>149</sup> Foucault, The History of Sexuality, Vol. 1, 86.

For the construction of sexuality as a "natural" existence, see: Foucault, *The History of Sexuality, Vol. 1,* 57.

For describing sexuality as natural (and unnatural concept), see: İşte Evlendiniz, Mükemmel İzdivacın Şartları by Seksoloji Publications

For the construction of "nature" as a discourse, see: Donna Harraway, *Primate Visions Gender, Race and Nature in the World of Modern Science* (New York, London: Routledge, 1989). Val Plumwood, *Feminizm ve Doğaya Hükmetmek*, trans. Başak Ertür (İstanbul: Metis Yayınları, 2004).

Dr. Bülent Davran, "Bir Cinsiyet Buhranı İçinde miyiz?" *Seksoloji*, 19 (1950), 1. "O halde bizde, ... cinsiyet sevkitabiisinin frenlenmesi ön planda yer almaktadır."

The association between rationality and scientific knowledge enabled the experts to develop elaborative discussions on sexuality. <sup>154</sup> Particularly, medicine dominated the discourse on sexuality in Turkey and in the rest of the world. Hera Cook suggested that the medicalization of sexuality was an element of control over sexuality. Cook claimed that the hegemonic forces, like the state and patriarchy, were extending to sexuality and individual bodies through medical knowledge. <sup>155</sup> The medicalized discourse on sexuality provided protection against the moral concerns of talking about sexuality in public. Nevertheless, it also turned the subject into a more *technical* and *expert* topic. <sup>156</sup> In short, during the 1950s, public figures tried to produce strong justifications for publicly discussing and distributing sexuality related subjects.

However, at the same time, they tried to determine the limits of talking about sexuality in terms of its content, visibility, medians, and subjects. Particularly, male elites of the Republican, *denetleyici kuşak (monitoring* generation), as Cantek called it,<sup>157</sup> were stating boldly that "excess sexuality" could cause cultural and social deterioration.<sup>158</sup> The *monitoring* generation, principally, gave attention to the dangers of the increasing

<sup>154</sup> Stacy Leigh Pigg and Vincanne Adams, "Introduction: The Moral Object of Sex", in *Sex in Development: Science, Sexuality, and Morality in Global Perspective*, ed. Vincanne Adams and Stacy Leigh Pigg (Durham and London: Duke University Press, 2005), 22-25.

Hera Cook, "Sex and the Doctors: the Medicalization of Sexuality as a Two-way Process in Early to Mid-Twentieth-century Britain," in *Cultural Approaches to the History of Medicine*, ed. Willem de Blécourt, Cornelie Usborne (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004), 192.

For Will to truth (about science and scientification) and constructing legitimacy through science and scientific knowledge, see: Michel Foucault, "Söylemin Düzeni," in *Ders Özetleri*, trans. by Selahattin Hilav, fifth edition (İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Yayınları, 2001), 15.

According to Levent Cantek, the monitoring generation is consisted of peopled who were born at the end of the nineteenth century and at the beginning of the twentieth century. Cantek claims that the legitimacy of the monitoring generation is based on their active involvement in the foundation process of the Republic. Cantek listed names such as Peyami Safa, Mithat Cemal Kuntay, Refik Halid Karay, Vedat Nedim Tör, Yusuf Ziya Ortaç and Selim Sırrı Tarcan as a part of monitoring generation. Cantek, *Cumhuriyetin Büluğ Çağı*, 25-33.

<sup>158</sup> Cantek, Cumhuriyetin Büluğ Çağı, 89-115.

visibility of sexuality and the uncontrollable sexuality of women and men. 159 The male figures of the *monitoring* generation tried to warn the public against the possible deteriorating effects of inappropriate sexuality, which "excessive sexuality." were associated with monitoring generation could be considered as the symbol of male anxiety about the more visible and might-be-more-liberated (female) sexuality. Apart from them, articles about the unrest of increasing visibility started to emerge in the magazines and newspapers. In Gazette Magazin, the editor column stated that in society, people think that the increase in rape and murder cases was due to the increase in graphic publishing. The magazine mentioned that the lawyers are building their defense cases based on this reasoning. 160 The discussions on sexuality swayed from "being a natural, necessary, and normal subject to get information about" to "being a dangerous subject that can cause moral and social deterioration" in a circular motion. The decision-makers and intellectuals of the era became concerned about the limits of sexuality, such as how sexuality is described, what kind of sexuality is accepted, and what kind of information will be distributed. As a part of managing efforts, they tried to define the content and limits of appropriate sexuality. 161 Şekip Tunç stated in his Seksoloji article that an important field of knowledge such as sexuality can not be left unattended. 162 "Sexual manners," which was borrowed from the sexology discipline, turned into a helpful instrument to define the limits of appropriate sexuality and sexual practices. "Sexual manners" has become a regulative discourse on not only sexuality. However, it gained particular power over the acts of

<sup>159</sup> Cantek, Cumhuriyetin Büluğ Çağı, 92.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Seksüalite Dersleri," *Gazette Magazin*, 1, 17.04.1957, 1. "...Toplumda, tecavüz ve cinayet suçlarındaki artışın 'açık-saçık neşriyattan' kaynaklandığı kanaati yaygındır artık. Hatta mahkemelerde avukatların bu yönde savunma yaptığı görülmektedir."

For the discussion of "managing sexuality," see: Melissa Tyler, "Managing between the Sheets: Lifestyle Magazines and the Management of Sexuality in Everyday Life," *Sexualities* 7, 1 (2004), 81-106. Gail Hawkes, *A Sociology of Sex and Sexuality* (Milton Keynes: Open University Press, 1996).

Ord. Prof. Mustafa Şekip Tunç, "Cinsi Terbiye Kimler Tarafından Verilmelidir?" *Seksoloji*, 15 (1950), 1. "Görülüyor ki neresinden bakılsa, başı boş bırakılmış çok mühim bir bilgi sahasının bu halde devam etmesinde uzvi ve ruhi türlü fenalık ve hastalıklara meydan vermekten başka bir hayır beklenemiyeceği gün gibi aşikardır."

citizens through diagnosing and classifying practices as well as individuals.  $^{163}$ 

Sexual manners became popular in the published media, such as monthly journals and magazines, marriage manuals, and newspapers, in the late 1940s and the beginning of the 1950s. However, the history of sexology started in the former decades of the Turkish state.

In the second half of the nineteenth century, sexuality, particularly female sexuality, needed intervention of the civilizing and scientific hand. The consensus on the validity and importance of scientific knowledge was strengthened by the search for becoming "rational human beings." The anatomic and physical subjects regarding human beings were transferred from the religion and juridical realm to the scientific knowledge of psychiatry and medicine. In the nineteenth century, human nature turned into a subject of analysis for scientific knowledge. As an inseparable part of human practice, sexuality became a focal point for the scientists. The scientists, as some were defined as sexologists, tried to shape the meanings that were attributed to sex and intimacy. Their perspective and discourse on sex and sexual manners started to take place in the discussions of the public sphere. Scholar argued that increasing production in the sexuality-

<sup>163</sup> Foucault, "Söylemin Düzeni," 11. "...söylemin kendisi bir erktir."

Jackson argues that the church's influence has decreased in parallel to the increasing influence of rationalization during the nineteenth century. Stevi Jackson and Sue Scott, *Theorizing Sexuality* (Berkshire, England: Open University Press, 2010), 50-74. Debra A. Moddelmog, "Modernism and Sexology," *Literature Compass* 11, 4 (2014), 269. Particularly with the advances in medicine, the discussions on sexual matters became more popular and were legitimized in the name of "scientific" knowledge.

Veronika Fuechtner, Douglas E. Haynes, and Ryan M. Jones, "Introduction: Toward a Global History of Sexual Science: Movements, Networks, and Deployments," in *A Global History of Sexual Science*, 1880–1960, edited Veronika Fuechtner, Douglas E. Haynes, and Ryan M. Jones (Oakland, California: University of California Press, 2018), 2.

Jackson and Scott, *Theorizing Sexuality*, 51-59. The sexologists did not only give generic descriptions and discussions on sexuality. They have also tried to define and determine the features of (female) sexuality. For the discussions of "new" female sexuality, see: Jeffrey Weeks, *Making Sexual History* (Cambridge: Polity Press, 2000), vii.

<sup>167</sup> Beatrix Campbell, "A Feminist Sexual Politics: Now you see it, now you don't." *Feminist Review*, 5 (1980) 1-18.

related texts presented the need for further discussions about sexual matters. 168

Related to these attempts, a growing body of scholarship was engaged with sexuality. Sexology has emerged as a discipline that was a combination of psychiatric, scientific, and medical inquiries in the midnineteenth century in Europe. As a science, sexology served not simply as a vehicle for disseminating sexological ideas but more often as a crucial site of revision and resistance to its categories and conclusions at the beginning of the twentieth century. Besides, the science of sexology formed the limits, the acceptable, and the *outsiders* of/for sexuality.

Although different discourses on sexuality-related subjects were become prominent in different national contexts, the scientists working on sexology have built a common style of thinking and approach with the formation of national and international networks (for example through international conferences). Following their claim that sexology should be "scientific", advocates of sexology communicated directly through their social and Professional Networks and through publications those have

Porter and Hall, The Facts of Life, 177.

<sup>169</sup> For the historiography of the sexology, see: Kirsten Leng and Katie Sutton, "Histories of sexology today: Reimagining the boundaries of Scientia Sexualis," *History of the Human Sciences*, 2021 34, 1 (2021), 3–9.

Moddelmog, "Modernism and Sexology," 269. Heike Bauer, English Literary Sexology: Translations of Inversion, 1860-1930 (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009), 3-4. Fuechter, Haynes and Jones defined sexuality as a global subject starting with the end of the 19th century. Fuechtner, Haynes, and Jones, Introduction: Toward a Global History of Sexual Science: Movements, Networks, and Deployments, 2. The same period, also, witnessed the emergence of sociology and anthropology as scientific disciplines along with psychiatry. These disciplines tried to find effective solutions in understanding the "social" which was conceptualized as a domain and as a "thing" to manage. For a detailed discussion, see: Horn, Social Bodies: Science, Reproduction, and Italian Modernity.

<sup>171</sup> Moddelmog, "Modernism and Sexology," 268.

Joseph Bristow, *Sexuality* (London and New York: Routledge, 1997), 6. "Sexology was the science that sought to know the name and nature of diverse desires and sexual types and the comprehensive vocabulary it created retains its influence to this day."

<sup>173</sup> Moddelmog, "Modernism and Sexology," 269.

references to each other's works.<sup>174</sup> As a discipline, sexology has managed to create its own vocabulary and terminology (the concept of "perverse" such as homosexual, masochist, fetishist, transvestite, and sadist) which gained regular acceptance in the following years.<sup>175</sup> Consecutively, sexology as a discipline attempted to catalogue and label sexual acts as normal-abnormal and health-sick.<sup>176</sup> Hence, medicine played an significant role in "diagnosing" some sexual behaviors as expressions of diseases.<sup>177</sup> In another word, these attempts became the primary steps of medicalization of sexuality. Moreover, it discussed the limits of appropriate sexuality. Particularly for women, the sexologists have discussed and re-written the *content* of female sexuality, which emphasized the naturalness of their pleasure.<sup>179</sup> As one of the leading figures in the field, Havelock Ellis stated at early date, in 1897, that they wanted "to ascertain what is normal and what is abnormal, from the point of view of physiology and psychology."

<sup>174</sup> Fuechtner, Haynes, and Jones, *Introduction: Toward a Global History of Sexual Science: Movements, Networks, and Deployments*, 3. As Porter mentioned in its extensive study on sexuality in Britain, at the beginning of the 1950s, the narrative on sexuality with its content, limits and corrective mechanisms has reached a relative unification among the circles of the scientific world. Porter and Hall, *The Facts of Life*.

Bristow, *Sexuality*, 6. "Sexology was the science that sought to know the name and nature of diverse desires and sexual types and the comprehensive vocabulary it created retains its influence to this day"

Julia A. Ericksen (with Sally A. Stefen), *Kiss and Tell: Surveying Sex in the Twentieth Century* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1999), 4. The sexologists have claimed that their discourse was based on scientific methods.

Graham Hart and Kaye Wellings, "Sexual behavior and its medicalization: in sickness and in health," in *BMJ Clinical Research* 324, 7342 (2002), 896-900. https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC1122837/#B6 (26.11.2021)

<sup>178</sup> Lesley A. Hall, "Heroesorvillains? Reconsidering British fin de siècle sexology," in *New Sexual Agendas*, ed. Lynne Segal (London: MacMillan, 1997). Hall states although the number of the doctors who were writing on sexuality was rather limited at the second of the nineteenth century, medicalization as a social process started to influence definition and practices of sexual acts starting with its terminology.

<sup>179</sup> Jackson and Scott, *Theorizing Sexuality*, 57-59.

They wanted "to know what is naturally lawful under the various sexual chances" through "the investigation of the [actual] facts." <sup>180</sup>

Beginning with the 20th century, the discussions and knowledge (discourse) on sexuality was spread among the middle class due to the increasing number of publications (and literacy) and due to its well-built collaboration with multiple scientific disciplines such as medicine, psychology and law. Particularly during the 1920s and interwar years, the knowledge on sexuality has gained vital importance since it became the tool to raise awareness in fighting against the venereal diseases. Although the literature on sexology has increased, enriched, disseminated and discussed in the public sphere with the beginning of the 20th century, it is difficult to argue that it became the sole and/or dominant discourse on sexuality. The discourse on sexuality (including the appropriateness, the limits and the unacceptable) and sexual education was a combination and struggle of various discourses which included the nationalist discourse, legal prohibitions, social hygiene movements, racial science and eugenics movement.

Havelock Ellis, *General Preface to Studies in the Psychology of Sex*, vol. 1, third edition (Project Gutenberg e-Book, 1927) (23.07.2013) quated from Moddelmog, "Modernism and Sexology," 269.

<sup>181</sup> Moddelmog, "Modernism and Sexology," 267–278. Porter and Hall, *The Facts of Life*.

Ivan Dalley Crozier, "Introduction: Havelock Ellis, John Addington Symonds and the Construction of Sexual Inversion," *Havelock Ellis and John Addington Symonds. Sexual Inversion: A Critical Edition*, ed. Ivan Crozier (Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008), 1–86. Crozier argues that sexology as a discipline emerged as a result of "the general increase in medical interest in sexual issues that had been largely framed with regard to four issues: prostitution and venereal disease; spermatorrhoea and masturbation; the detection of sexual crimes such as rape and sodomy by forensic authorities; birth control and the separation of sexuality from reproduction."

Lisa Duggan, Sapphic Slashers: Sex, Violence, and American Modernity (Duke: Duke University Press, 2000), 177-178. Janice M. Irvine, Disorders of Desire: Sexuality and Gender in Modern American Sexology (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 2005)

<sup>184</sup> Chris Waters, "Sexology," in *Palgrave Advances in the Modern History of Sexuality*, ed. Harry G. Cocks and Matt Houlbrook (Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2006), 55.

<sup>185</sup> Christina Simmons, Making Marriage Modern: Women's Sexuality from the Progressive Era to World War II (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), 35. She argues that the sex

On the one hand, sexology as a scientific discipline produced knowledge on sexual matters. On the other hand, the scientific figures of the discipline tried to inform the decision-makers for changing the laws. As well as, they disseminated this new knowledge through several channels for the public's well-being. Sexology was the combination of discourses that aimed to reach a normative understanding of sex and sexuality. Therefore, the figures of sexology (not only the scientists but also opinion readers and the decision-makers) tried to activate regulative mechanisms by using penal, medical, and pedagogical tools to push the perception of sexuality of the subjects towards the identified *norms*.

Sexual manners emerged with the beginning of the 20th century in Turkish, whether as translated or indigenous texts. Sexology "was not recognized as a legitimate branch of science until the interwar years" globally and in Turkey. However, with the campaigns against venereal diseases in Turkey, a vocabulary regarding sexuality and sexual manners was established during the 1930s. According to Koçak's research, there were five translated texts on sexual manners and female sexuality between the 1920s and 1940s. In comparison, there were 29 indigenous texts in the same period. One of the symbolic and important sources on sexuality

education provided by the American social hygiene movement was more conservative contrary to the more liberal attitudes of sexologists such as Freud, Ellis, and Krafft-Ebing. For the empire and nationalism arguments, see: Deborah Cohler, *Citizen, Invert, Queer: Lesbianism and War in Early Twentieth-Century Britain* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2010), xvii-xviii. For a general discussion see: Lesley A. Hall, *Sex, Gender and Social Change in Britain Since 1880* (Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire, London: Macmillan, 2000).

- 186 Porter and Hall, *The Facts of Life*.
- 187 Lucy Bland and Laura Doan, "General Introduction," in *Sexology Uncensored: The Documents of Sexual Science*, ed. Lucy Bland and Laura Doan(Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1998), 1–7.
- Hulusi Behçet Bey, "Zührevi Hastalıklar Hakkında Halka Mahsus Sıhhi Terbiye," in *Sıhhi Sahifalar*, 1 (1930), 26. Ali Eşref Bey, "İçtimai Dertlerimizden Biri," in *Sıhhat Almanağı*, ed. Mazhar Osman (İstanbul: Kader Basımevi, 1933), 232.
- 189 Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality." The research through the library catalogs for this study displayed that there were more translated books from prominent and famous figures of sexology in the period than Koçak has mentioned.

before the 1940s was Marie Stope's "Married Love." "Married Love" was published first time in 1918 in London. It went through six editions and sold more than seventeen thousand copies in the first year alone. By 1955, "Married Love" was going through its twenty-eight editions. <sup>190</sup> In Turkey, publishing of "Married Love" was seen first time in 1926. <sup>191</sup> In 1940, 1942, 1944, and even 1960, İkbal Kitabevi re-published the "Married Love" (İzdivaçta Aşk). Following Stopes', books of the prominent figures in sexology were translated into Turkish with an increasing number in the 1940s. <sup>192</sup>

The indigenous texts started to emerge during the 1930s. As mentioned in the previous part, with the efforts of Daniş Remzi Korok, who was equipped with the information on sexology discipline, female sexuality has received particular attention on the subjects including sexuality of young women, <sup>193</sup> sexuality of married women, <sup>194</sup> birth control for women, <sup>195</sup> and

<sup>190</sup> Alexander C. T. Geppert, "Divine Sex, Happy Marriage, Regenerated Nation: Marie Stopes's Marital Manual Married Love and the Making of a Best-seller, 1918-1955," *Journal of the History of Sexuality* 8, 31 (1998), 396-397.

Based on my research, for the earliest version of the publication, see Atatürk Library, https://katalog.ibb.gov.tr/yordambt/yordam.php?aTumu=marie%20stopes (15.11.2021). For the 1928 version, the publishing house is unknown.

<sup>192</sup> Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality."

Remzi Korok Daniş, *Genç kızlara gizli tavsiyeler* (Istanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1935). Remzi Korok Daniş, *Genç kızlarla gizli konuşmalar* (Istanbul: Sebat Basımevi, 1936). Remzi Korok Daniş, *Genç Evli Kadınlarla Gizli Konuşmalar*, second edition (Istanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1937). Remzi Korok Daniş, *Genç kızlarda fena adetler* (Istanbul: Nümune Basımevi, 1937). Remzi Korok Daniş, *Kızlar onaltı yaşına kadar* (Istanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1937). Remzi Korok Daniş, *Kızlar onsekiz yaşına kadar* (Istanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1937). Remzi Korok Daniş, *Genç kızlarda sevişme ve muaşaka arzusu* (Istanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1937). Remzi Korok Daniş, *Genç kızlara gore izdivaç ve zifaf* (Istanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1937).

<sup>194</sup> Remzi Korok Daniş, *Erkek ve Kadında Cinsi İktidarsızlık* (Istanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1936). Remzi Korok Daniş, *Evli kadınlarla gizli konuşmalar* (Istanbul: Sebat Basımevi, 1936). Remzi Korok Daniş, *Evli Kadınlara Göre Memnu Meyva* (Istanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1937). Remzi Korok Daniş, *Evli Kadınlarda Son Gençlik ve İhtiras* (Istanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1937). Remzi Korok Daniş, *Genç Kadınlar 45 Yaşına Kadar* (Istanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1937). Remzi Korok Daniş, *Kadın nasıl erkek ister* (Istanbul: Özeniş Basımevi, 1937).

sexuality of widow. 196 The public appearance of sexuality-related discourse (and sexual manners) increased in the late 1940s. Besides the increased number of published material (such as advice and marriage manuals), the subject started to appear in more popular publications such as newspapers and magazines. In parallel, the coverage area of sexology widened and covered various topics, including female sexuality. Female sexuality turned into a discussable subject besides the reproductive concerns of the individuals.

## 2.2. Tools for Sexuality

The publishing was used as a *tool* to distribute knowledge on sexual manners. Besides the content, the medium of the "message" played a central role in reaching the public.<sup>197</sup> The medium had a crucial impact on the content and the language of the message. While "raising public awareness" on sexual manners became the central goal, the medium needed to be diversified and have a widespread reach. In the late 1940s and early 1950s, new genres emerged that attracted a broader range of readers: adventure stories, comics, magazines with romances, fashion tips, and household advice for women.<sup>198</sup> The genre and the editions (circulation) of the

<sup>195</sup> Remzi Korok Daniş, *Hamile kalmak için gizli konuşmalar. Hamile kalmamak için gizli konuşmalar* (Istanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1936).

Remzi Korok Daniş, *Çocuklu ve Çocuksuz Dullar* (Istanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1937). Remzi Korok Daniş, *Dul Kadın ve Erkeklerle Gizli Konuşmalar* (Istanbul: Bozkurt, Basımevi, 1937). Remzi Korok Daniş, *Dul Kadınlara Rağbet ve Sebepleri* (Istanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1937). Remzi Korok Daniş, *Dullarda İşkive İhtiras* (Istanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1937). Remzi Korok Daniş, *Dullarda İntiyarlık ve İzdırap* (Istanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1937). Remzi Korok Daniş, *Dullarda İzdivaç ve Neticeleri* (Istanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1937). Remzi Korok Daniş, *Dullarda Serbest Hayat ve Sefalet* (Istanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1937). Remzi Korok Daniş, *Dulluk ve Zararları* (Istanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1937).

Alison Bashford and Carolyn Strange, "Public Pedagogy: Sex Education and Mass Communication in the Mid–Twentieth Century," *Journal of the History of Sexuality* 13, 1 (2004), 71.

<sup>198</sup> Bashford and Strange, "Public Pedagogy: Sex Education and Mass Communication in the Mid-Twentieth Century," 77.

publishing increased in variety, in general, and particularly on sexuality such as newspapers, (women) magazines/journals, (marriage) manuals and popular literature. The manuals or popular literature editions were increased from a single edition to fifth, even sixth editions. Also, the newspapers' circulations reached 200.000 at the beginning of the 1950s. 199 Beginning with the 1950s, the publishing on sexual manners intended to reach the "public" with an "easy-going" discourse and with an "interesting" page layout and content.<sup>200</sup> Newspapers, journals, manuals, and popular literature texts started to use colored pictures and photographs in their pages and front-back covers to grab the attention of their readers and to enrich their messages with visual materials. Even the pricing of the popular publishing were adjusted for the purchasing power of the public.<sup>201</sup> The newspapers such as *Hürriyet* and *Milliyet* were sold around ten kurus in 1950, where the price of the 500 grams bread was 20 kurus. 202 The Seksoloji journal was monthly published and sold for 50 kurus, whereas Resimli Hayat was sold for 100 kuruş in 1953.<sup>203</sup> The manuals and popular literature had slightly higher prices compared to journals. Where the manuals published in the 1950s, such as "Mükemmel İzdivacın Sartları" (Conditions for Perfect Marriage) and "İşte Evlendiniz" (Now you are married), were sold for around 50 kuruş; their prices such as "Kudretinizi Koruyunuz" (Protect your

Bulut, "Hürriyet Gazetesi: 1948-1953 Döneminin Yayın Politikası," 87 – 88. Hürriyet, as a high-sold newspaper, reached over 200.000 in 31 December 1950.

<sup>200</sup> Bulut, "Hürriyet Gazetesi: 1948-1953 Döneminin Yayın Politikası,"

Bashford and Strange, "Public Pedagogy: Sex Education and Mass Communication in the Mid-Twentieth Century," 74. "During the first half of the twentieth century, magazines played a leading role in the transmission of sexual knowledge, for they were much more accessible to working-class people than were expensive texts."

<sup>202 &</sup>quot;Çukurova'da büyük bir ucuzluk göze çarpıyor," *Milliyet*, 18.06.1950. In May 1950, one gram of gold was 430 kuruş. "Altın fiyatlarındaki düşüklük durdu," *Milliyet*, 30.05.1950.

Around the same period, late 1940s and early 1950s, the prices of women magazines in Australia followed the similar routine. As Bashford and Strange stated an issue of a popular women magazine, *Women*, costed about the same as a loaf of bread (four pence) in order to be reached not only the comfortably well-off but the literate poor, for whom books were unaffordable luxuries. Bashford and Strange, "Public Pedagogy: Sex Education and Mass Communication in the Mid–Twentieth Century," 79.

potency) and "200 sual 200 cevap" (200 questions 200 answers) published by Seksoloji Publishing doubled to 1 lira in 1951 and 1952.

Among the publishing, newspapers and magazines/journals were the regular mediums that had a crucial place in the formation of the public opinion through their widespread circulation and low prices. <sup>204</sup> Researchers assessed newspapers as a part of public pedagogy which functioned outside of educational, military, or religious institutions yet, which became the tools of "mass" communication. <sup>205</sup> What the newspapers preferred to discuss had an enormous impact on the public discourse since the newspapers had the power as a shared, non-questioned, or accepted opinion producers. <sup>206</sup> The popularization of sexual expertise was promoted by mass communication tools – particularly newspapers. <sup>207</sup> In the late 1940s, newspapers started to create columns on social problems those put everyday discussions into their agenda. At the end of the 1940s and the beginning of the 1950s, two new – and popular – newspapers have joined the publishing life of Turkey: *Hürriyet, 1948,* and *Milliyet, 1950*. They gave place to different experts on their pages to discuss social issues. *As* a case for analysis, Milliyet has

Another tool for "public education" on sexual manners became broadcasting in some countries like Australia. Though radio broadcasts – the information and the discussions – were considerably more controversial and were ultimately restricted - less explicit information about sex and reproduction on radio -, in some countries, radio was used as a source for distributing information. Bashford and Strange, "Public Pedagogy: Sex Education and Mass Communication in the Mid–Twentieth Century," 74-75. In Turkey, the programs of the radio in Istanbul and in Ankara could be followed in Milliyet journal. In the radio program, series on medical knowledge took place every day. Some of the daily covering had the heading of the speech which took 15 minutes at most. (Istanbul radio: 14:20 – 14:30, Prof. Ziya Cemal, "Diş Sağlığı Mevzuunda Konuşmalar," *Milliyet*, 03.05.1950; Ankara radio: 21:45 – 22:00, Sağlık Saati "Büyük Salgınlar," *Milliyet*, 18.05.1950.) Through the annouced headings, none of them were related to sexual manners or sexuality. Focusing on the medical news, speeches or informative parts which were given place in the broadcast needed to be another study's research subject.

Bashford and Strange, "Public Pedagogy: Sex Education and Mass Communication in the Mid–Twentieth Century," 73.

<sup>206</sup> Anderson, Benedict. Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism, 50-51.

<sup>207</sup> Bashford and Strange, "Public Pedagogy: Sex Education and Mass Communication in the Mid–Twentieth Century," 71.

published regular columns on social problems that aimed to discuss sexuality-related subjects under an economic, social, or medical concerns. One of the columns had the heading Daily Medical Discussions (Günün Tibbi Bahisleri) covering subjects on various medical subjects such as dangers of some medicament, 208 mental diseases, 209 infertility 210 or high infant mortality.<sup>211</sup> This column was prepared mainly by medical experts. In the first part of the 1950s, the column was named Health Discussions and prepared anonymously. In 1957 and 1958, the column took its final form and was prepared by a physician, Recep Doksat. The medicine-related columns - for this case, sexuality-related texts - were displayed as the "served" information those were based on the expertise and scientific knowledge. 212 The language of medicine (science) was simplified for public outreach and transformed scientific writing into a "popular language for household use."213 The language of the texts prospered with "friendly" discourses that carried the ambiance such as "being in a conversation." <sup>214</sup> Another column was named Article (Fikra) on different social problems. In the Article column, the problems of everyday life were consideration with pro or counter-arguments. Mirror of Lesson (*İbret Aynası*), another column written by *Pence* (a nickname), covered various subjects related to everyday practices. The columns presented various subjects, including sexuality, adding the writers' perspective. On the other hand, the newspaper also contained news on everyday life, including judiciary news, cases on problematic relations between couples or in the family, and news from the world that transferred cultural and social practices in different countries. The last part, in the newspapers, those containing sexuality, couple relations, and acceptable limits of sexuality, was the literary texts published

208 Recep Doksat, "Penisilinin Tehlikeleri," *Milliyet*, 11.02.1958.

<sup>209</sup> Recep Doksat, "Akıl Hastaları ve Cemiyet," *Milliyet*, 30.09.1958.

<sup>210</sup> Recep Doksat, "Kısırlık," Milliyet, 19.09. 1957.

<sup>211 &</sup>quot;Sağlık Bahisleri: Bizde çocuk ölümleri niçin yüksektir?" *Milliyet*, 11.04.1951.

<sup>212</sup> The role of the experts in producing and distributing medical knowledge will be discussed in the following sections of this chapter.

<sup>213</sup> Geppert, "Divine Sex, Happy Marriage, Regenerated Nation," 408.

Although medical terms were used in the columns, they were explained with the commonly used vocabulary.

as serials. Sexuality and related subjects became a part of the daily discourse in the newspaper pages as a combination of columns, daily news, and serials.

Another area for the discussions on sexuality was popular magazines and journals – primarily women's and health magazines. Popular journals, in the late 1940s and the 1950s, experienced a new decade with the development in the printing technology, which widened the scope of the target reader, the layout of the magazines – enriched with photographs and illustrations – and the content of the magazines – contained translations from foreign languages, in particular, English. Among the popular journals, women's and popular health magazines included sexual manners and sexuality-related discussions in their pages. Women's magazines formed an important part of the toolbox, transmitting sexual manners among the population, particularly women. Based on the Davaz Mardin's study, there were 17 women's magazines between the years 1940 and 1950, 22 women's magazines between the years 1950 – 1960, and 16 women's magazines between the years 1960 – 1970.<sup>215</sup> There was a steady increase in the number of women's magazines published until 1960. The women magazines were named with the headings Ev-Kadın (Home-Woman), Ev-İş (Home-Work), Elişi (Handwork), Aile (Family), Kadın Dünyası (Woman's World) those associated woman with "being wife and mother" and positioned woman in the marriage and family. The journals covered generally the subjects about domestic work. Although historians did not expect to find information on sexuality in domestic and romantic writings, <sup>216</sup> subjects related to marriage, the health of the couples and even sexual education of children were taken place in the pages of the women's magazines.<sup>217</sup>

As an exemplary journal, Aile was published between 1947 and 1952 as a quarterly magazine by Yapı ve Kredi Bankası (Construction and Credit Bank). Aile contained literary texts written by the era's well-known poets,

Aslı Davaz Mardin ed., *Kadın Süreli Yayınları: Hanımlar Aleminden Roza'ya (1929-1996)* (Istanbul: K.E.K.B.M.V & T.E.T.T.V., 1998).

Bashford and Strange, "Public Pedagogy: Sex Education and Mass Communication in the Mid–Twentieth Century," 74.

For an example see, "Seksoloji Bahisleri: Çiftleşme Mevsimi," *Aydabir*, June 1955.

such as Orhan Veli, and authors such as Refik Halid Karay, and non-literary informative texts included subjects such as how to have a happy marriage, how to educate children or how to be an ideal wife. 218 Aile included both indigenous and translated texts those were implicitly mentioning the subjects related to sexuality. 219 As a successor of Aile, Resimli Hayat took a significant place in the 1950s as the predecessor of Hayat that was published by the Yapı ve Kredi Bankası. Some of these journals were formed with many photographs and illustrated materials presenting a new lifestyle and the new women. Resimli Hayat (Illustrated Life) journal, between the years 1952 – 1955, one of the most popular magazines during the era, proposed the ideal woman as a wife and as a public figure to the public of the Turkish Republic. In framing "the ideal woman," the journal also offered the roles, proper behaviors, and attitudes of the "new women." While the journal used the lives of celebrities as its primary news, the journal shaped the limits of femininity by adding comments about the celebrities. The photographs and illustrations of new woman gave the followers of the journal a sense of what the "wanted" and "sexual" shape of female body. Hayat, the follower of the Resimli Hayat, published 170.000 copies at its first issue.<sup>220</sup> Hayat offered its readers a combination of news about significant political and economic developments in Turkey, the international community, fashion and home decoration pages, pictures of "beautiful" women, information on the most recent movies and movie stars - celebrity gossip -, health news and travel memoirs.<sup>221</sup> Particularly the visual materials used in Hayat offered a "new woman" appearance that had an impact on the popular culture of the era. Another example of popular journals was covering health information, so-called popular health magazine, Sağlığımız. The journal started to be published in the late 1950s, which brought the articles on various subjects related to health and medicine together. The importance of the journal lies in its popularizing language of

<sup>218 &</sup>quot;Bayanlar Dul Kalmak İstemezseniz," Aile, 14 (1950), 79.

In some translated articles, there were notes that the article was translated from the magazines such as *Reader's Digest, Pageant, Companion, Women*.

Okur, "Conspicuous Consumption in Turkey," 11.

Okur, "Conspicuous Consumption in Turkey," 12.

medicine that addressed women, and especially, mothers.<sup>222</sup> Also, the journal had a "questions – answers" section and a "reader's letters" section that gave an idea about the popular discussions in public.

Above all these journals, *Seksoloji*, first among its own kind, took a crucial place with its symbolic appearance both for the period and for sexual manners. *Seksoloji* was started to be published in April 1949 and presented itself as a "sexual knowledge" journal. The journal was established by a 24 years old young entrepreneur, Nihat Karaveli. Akaraveli. Akaraveli. Akaraveli was supported by the journal. As his brother emphasized, Nihat Karaveli was supported by the well-known writers and doctors of the period such as Fahrettin Kerim Gökay, Mazhar Osman Uzman, Mustafa Şekip Tunç, Gıyas Korkut, Kâzım Arısan, Kemal Çağlar, Faruk Akbeğ, Erdoğan Meto ve Necdet Ecder, Peyami Safa, Nihad Sami Banarlı, Samih Nafiz Tansu, Ferit Hakkı Saymen, and Kayıhan Uraz. The journal was supported by visual materials which were drawn by Orhan Karaveli (younger brother of Nihat Karaveli) and Faruk Geç.

The distinctive character of the journal lies in its explicit reference to sexual manners and sexuality (even with its name). *Seksoloji* journal contained news from the world, mainly from the USA, related to sexuality, researches on sexuality such as Kinsey's researches, "questions-answer" sections, anatomic-informative articles, and opinion pieces (sensational articles). Almost all the articles were translated from foreign journals or parts of foreign sexology books in the initial issues. The number of indigenous articles has increased during the process. The journal was published monthly at 50 kuruş price. The issues of the journal were around 60 to 65 pages. *Seksoloji* was prepared as volumes to be collected per six

<sup>&</sup>quot;Modern Çocuk Bakımı," Sağlığımız 1, 9 (1960), 21. "Çocuklara Cisiyet Terbiyesi Nasıl Verilmeli," Sağlığımız 1, 12 (1960), 14. Recep Doksat, "Kadının Bir Aylık Süre İçinde Kısır Devresi," Sağlığımız 2, 14 (1960).

Muzaffer Aşkın wrote an editorial piece and mentioned "copying publishing" those "noticed the opportunity of profit." He was complaining about these copy journals to the readers. Although he was not mentioning the exact name, I suspect that he was referring to *Hadise Publishing*.

<sup>224</sup> Orhan Karaveli, Bir Ankara Ailesinin Hikayesi (İstanbul: Doğan Kitap, 2011), 210.

months (like an encyclopedia). The magazine was considered a reference source from the beginning of its publishing.<sup>225</sup> Moreover, *Seksoloji* published illustrations (such as sexual organs) or photographs (such as nude paintings of Renoir) to reach the public with written and visual texts.<sup>226</sup>

Fahrettin Kerim Gökay was pointed out as the "name-father" of the journal. When Seksoloji was first published, Gökay was teaching psychiatry at the Istanbul University. He started to work as the Meyer and Governor of Istanbul in October 1949. Although the name of the journal was presented as Gökay's invention, another journal with the name of *Sexology* has been published in the USA since 1933. The journals did not only share the same name. However, both journals had the same cover page layout and same design. Moreover, they shared the same editorial perspective. Both journals aimed to become an educational source of information about sex. Similar to *Seksoloji*, *Sexology* included a range of articles on topics relating to sexuality and question-answer columns. Last but not least, shared writer names such as Scott Pugh, Bowen Partington, Marc Lanval, and D.O Cauldwell appeared in both journals. Without going further with the speculations, it is fair to say that *Seksoloji* was inspired by its American version, *Sexology*.

At the end of every sixth month cycle, an index of every issue was added as an appendix at the end of every six months. There were announcements about the opportunities for purchasing previous volumes.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Oysa bizler, bilimsel "organ" çizimlerini ve Renoir gibi ünlü ressamların "nü"lerini bile korka korka basabiliyorduk! Gene de kadromuzda davaya inanmış Fahrettin Kerim Gökay'lar, Peyami Safa'lar olmasaydı İstanbul'un "zehir hafiye" savcıları bizleri herhalde hapislerde çürütürdü" Karaveli, *Bir Ankara Ailesinin Hikayesi*, 211.

Buraya seksoloji ilk sayı koy. Karaveli, *Bir Ankara Ailesinin Hikayesi*, 212.

Fahreddin Kerim Gökay worked as the meyer and governor of Istanbul between 1949 and 1957. In the November 1949 issue at the first page, Seksoloji congratulated Gökay because of his new appointment.

Jonathan A. Allan, "Circumcision Debates in Sexology Magazine (1934–1975)," *Journal of Men's Studies* 29, 3 (2021), 354.

<sup>230</sup> Allan, "Circumcision Debates in Sexology Magazine (1934–1975)," 355.

In April 1949, as a coincidence, both Pugh and Lanval wrote in Seksoloji and Sexology. We see the same names in both magazines throughout the Seksoloji and Sexology journals.

With its bold approach, it would be naïve to assume that the journal did not encounter any strong critics or judicial problems. Regarding the critics, the editorial team wrote corresponding pieces now and then to differentiate themselves from pornography. Orhan Karaveli brought an interesting clarification in his memoir regarding the judicial attempts. According to Karaveli, the Istanbul prosecutor, Hicabi Dinc, called Peyami Safa since he wrote in Seksoloji. Dinc complained to Safa about the journal due to the involvement of "immoral" pictures. 232 In another time, the same prosecutor called Fahrettin Kerim Gökay, who was the Meyer and governor of Istanbul. Dinc informed Gökay about the new legal proceeding about the journal due to "Müstehcen neşriyat" (obscene publications). Moreover, he attempted to report the journal to the governor since they used his name in the journal. Gökay shocked the prosecutor by accepting his contribution to the journal. Gökay added that he was getting copyright payment from the journal. Gökay informed the prosecutor that he was the "name father" of the journal, and would call the editorial team to account if he would see any "obscene" thing in the journal. At the end of his speech, Gökay threatened the prosecutor by rising against him with his friends if he would continue to investigate.<sup>233</sup> The journal ended its monthly magazine format in its 60th numbered March 1954 issue with a leading article written by Fahrettin Kerim Gökay. Gökay promised to contribute to the Turkish society with 3-

<sup>&</sup>quot;Bir keresinde Peyami Safa üstat, dergideki "açık" çizimler nedeniyle kendisini arayarak: –
Bu ne rezalet, Sayın Safa? Sizin de yazdığınız Seksoloji de "ayıp" resimler yayınlanıyor.
Olur mu böyle şey? Diye serzenişte bulunan İstanbul Savcısı Hicabi Dinç'le: – O "ayıp"(!)
dediğiniz şeylerden herkeste var Sayın Savcı! Bunlardan rahatsız oluyorsanız, once
sokaktaki kedilerle köpeklere don giydirin, diye düpedüz dalga geçmişti." Karaveli, *Bir Ankara Ailesinin Hikayesi*, 211.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Aynı savcı bu kez de İstanbul Vali ve Belediye Başkanı Profesör Gökay'ı bularak: – Efendim, belki haberiniz olmamıştır. "Müstehcen neşriyat"(!) nedeniyle kovuşturma başlattığımız Seksoloji dergisinde sizin adınızı kullanıyorlar, demiş, 1950'lerin, "mini mini valimiz; ne olacak halimiz?.." tekerlemesiyle ünlü Gökay da: – Hayır, benim adımı "kullanmıyorlar". Özel olarak yazdığım yazıları basıyorlar. Karşılığında telif ücretimi de (50 lira) alıyorum! Bu dergide "müstehcen" bir şey görsem, "isim babası" olarak sizden önce ben hesap sorarım kendilerinden. Gene de takibat yoluna giderseniz, unutmayın ki onlardan önce beni ve arkadaşlarımı bulursunuz karşınızda, cevabını vermişti." Karaveli, Bir Ankara Ailesinin Hikayesi, 212.

monthly almanacs and informative sex manuals.<sup>234</sup> Gökay stated that they are ending to "search for the opportunities to be beneficial more efficiently" and "reach to a wider public."<sup>235</sup> Orhan Karaveli told another story in his memoir. According to Orhan Karaveli, they ended their amateur initiative in 1955 with the hope that more professional circles – such as universities – would continue.<sup>236</sup> Looking at their introduction article of the 49<sup>th</sup> issue, the owners and editors of the magazine changed their decisions about the continuation of the magazine in a 12-months period. Although the official announcement and the Karaveli's memoir told different stories, the magazine may have face economic difficulities as can be seen from the decreasing number of pages in issues.

Some researchers classified *Seksoloji* as a man's magazine.<sup>237</sup> At first glance, the journal may look like targeting male readers as the primary purchasers due to its name, and the cultural and social atmosphere of the era.<sup>238</sup> However, magazine's editors announced that Seksoloji would become a family magazine in its 49th issue.<sup>239</sup> Moreover, the articles in the magazine also aimed at female readers.<sup>240</sup> There were female names among the contestants and winners of a competition which was organized by the

Fahrettin Kerim Gökay, "Beşinci Yılımızı Bitirirken," Seksoloji, 12, 60, (1954), 1-2.

<sup>&</sup>quot;daha geniş kütlelere hitap etmek ... ve ...daha tesirli şekilde faydalı olmak imkânlarını araştırmak" Fahrettin Kerim Gökay, "Beşinci Yılımızı Bitirirken," *Seksoloji*, 12, 60, (1954), 1-2.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Bizim, biraz amatörce başlattığımız girişimi, artık daha profesyonel çevrelerin, örneğin üniversitelerin sürdürüp geliştirmesi umuduyla yayınımıza, 1955'te noktayı koyduk." Karaveli, Bir Ankara Ailesinin Hikayesi, 211.

Fatma Berrin Okur states that Seksoloji (Sexology) is a men's magazine like Cennet (Paradise), which is another magazine of the era. Okur, Okur, "Conspicuous Consumption in Turkey," 12.

Bashford and Strange display the contra version in their article. In Australia, in the case of women's magazines "Although women's magazines were pitched to female readers (particularly as consumers), readership surveys regularly disclosed that men and children also read them, even if they did not purchase them." Bashford and Strange, "Public Pedagogy: Sex Education and Mass Communication in the Mid–Twentieth Century," 78.

<sup>239 &</sup>quot;Beşinci Yıla Girerken," Seksoloji, 49, 5 (1953), 1.

Such as: D.G. Cooley, "Evli Kadın Neler Bilmelidir?" *Seksoloji*, 9 (1949), 50. C.H. Davis, "Doğum hakkında 40 sual," *Seksoloji*, 8 (1949), 41. "Evli Kadının Cinsiyet Meselesi," *Seksoloji*, 8 (1949), 10. "Kısır Kadın Gebe Kalabilir mi?" *Seksoloji*, 7 (1949), 37.

magazine.<sup>241</sup> Besides, there were also female purchasers of the Seksoloji magazine, such as Naciye Yalçiner, the one I have purchased for my research

Besides the monthly journal, Sexuality publishing contributed to the popular discussion with its manuals on marriage and sexuality. Seksoloji prepared a series that was composed of eleven manuals and published by the Tan Company. The manuals were short texts around 50 to 100 pages with affordable prices – such as 50 kuruş. Based on the number and frequency of the editions, it could be said that the manuals became visible in a short time. *İşte Evlendiniz*, as an exemplary case, was published as the fifth edition in January 1953, which was then followed by the fourth edition in January 1952, the third edition in April 1951, the second edition in December 1950, and the first edition in September 1950. 243

Starting with the 1950s, other publishing companies have also prepared books on sex and sexual manners.<sup>244</sup> Seksoloji published a piece on

The names mentioned in the page was: Hatice Benli, Ankara and Leyla Günek, Üsküdar İstanbul. "Müsabakamızın Neticesi," *Seksoloji*, 11 (1950), 35.

Dr. Le Mon Clark, *İşte Evlendiniz*, third edition, trans. Muzaffer Aşkın (İstanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1951). Dr. Max Joseph Exner, *Mükemmel İzdivacın Şartları*, trans. Muzaffer Aşkın (Istanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1950). Dr. Rudolf von Urban, *Aşk Sanatı*, trans. Muzaffer Aşkın (Istanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1951). Jean Hoppeler, *Evlenmeden önce*, trans. Muzaffer Aşkın (Istanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1951). Prof. Dr. Heinrich Kisch, *Kadın ve Evlilik Hayatı Cilt 1*, trans. Şevket Dilmaç and Ayet Altuğ (Istanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1951). Prof. Dr. Heinrich Kisch, *Kadın ve Evlilik Hayatı Cilt 2*, trans. Şevket Dilmaç and Ayet Altuğ (Istanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1951).

Dr. Le Mon Clark, *İşte Evlendiniz*, third edition (İstanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1951), front page.

R.Y. ed., Genç kızlara tavsiyeler (Seksoloji konuları 1) (Istanbul: Beküs, 1953). H. B. edited, Evli kadınlara tavsiyeler (Seksoloji bahisleri 3) (Istanbul: Beküs, 1955). Alfred C. Kinsey, Kadınların cinsi hayatı hakkında Kinsey raporu (Seksoloji Yayınları Yeni Seri, 1), trans.N.P. (Istanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1955). Hannah and Abraham Stone, Evlilik Rehberi (Seksoloji Yayınları, Yeni Seri, 2), trans. N.P. (Istanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1955). Heinrich Kirsch, Evlilikte Cinsiyet (Yeni Seksoloji Kitapları, 2) (Istanbul: Yeni Seksoloji, 1961). Rudolph von Urban, Cinsiyette Aşk, trans.N.P. (Istanbul: Seksoloji, 1961). Theodor Hendrik van de Velde, Cinsi Münasebetler (Yeni Seksoloji Yayınları, 3), trans.N.P. (Istanbul: Yeni Seksoloji, 1961). Max Joseph Exner, Mükemmel İzdivacın Başlangıcı, trans.N.P. (Istanbul: Yeni Seksoloji, 1962). Hannah and Abraham Stone, 200 sual 200

themselves on the last page of the fourth issue of Seksoloji that was published in Son Posta written by Nusret Safa Çoşkun. He praised Seksoloji and stated that Seksoloji became popular and went for a second print. He shared that although he had pleasure in Seksoloji's success, he had been afraid of copying publications. He added that he learned two similar publications were in preparation process as he expected. He ended his article by belittling the imitators.<sup>245</sup> At the end of the decade, sexual manners as a topic was still popular in the publishings. For example, Hadise publishing company launched the "Sexology and Youth Life Series" (Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı) in 1959, which again comprised twelve texts.<sup>246</sup> The manuals were recommended and advertised in two forms in the popular magazines and the newspapers: firstly in advertisements and secondly in articles promoting the books. In *Milliyet*, the advertisements of various manuals have took taken place daily on the second page of the newspaper.<sup>247</sup> In *Cumhuriyet*, Seksoloji's advertisement came along every month with the titles of the articles which were published in that particular month, such as twelveth issue's advertisement at March 04, 1950, eleventh issue at February 02 and 20, 1950 or May 1951 issue. 248 Similar to *Milliyet*, the advertisements of Seksoloji - magazine were also taken their place in the second and third pages of Cumhuriyet. The advertisements in both

cevap (Seksoloji Yayınları), trans.N.P. (Istanbul: İtimat, 1963). Rudolph von Urban, Evlilikte Cinsi İstek (Seksoloji Yayınları), trans.N.P. (Istanbul: İtimat, 1963)

Nusret Safa Çoşkun, "İmtiyazla beraber ihtira beratı almalı," *Seksoloji*, 4 (1949), back cover.

Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality," 74, 89. "Most of the indigenous and translated text on sexuality were published by private publishing houses." Such as "Sexology and Youth" series: Genç Kızlığın En Esrarlı Tarafı: Bakirelik, Genç Kızların Cinsi Bilgisizlikleri, Kızlık Merdivenleri, Genç Kızlarda Cinsi Rüyalar, Genç Kızlarda Sevilmek Arzusu, Her Genç Kızın Gözüyle Erkek by Hadise Yayınevi Neşriyatı.

<sup>247</sup> Advertisement of "200 sual – 200 cevap" in 23.09.1955, 09.11.1958, 10.11.1958, 11.11.1958 on the second page of *Milliyet*.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Seksoloji'nin 12nci Mart Sayısı Çıktı," *Cumhuriyet*, 04.03.1950. "Seksoloji cinsi bilgiler mecmuasının 11inci Şubat sayısı çıktı.," *Cumhuriyet* , 05.02.1950. "Seksoloji 11inci ŞUBAT sayısında çok faydalı 20 makale vardır. 68 sahife 50 Krş. Seksoloji için ne diyorlar," *Cumhuriyet*, 20.02.1950. "Seksoloji, Mayıs sayısındaki bazı yazılar," *Cumhuriyet*, 13.05.1951.

newspapers gave clues about the content of the books and magazine by carrying the titles of the book chapters, such as "Is masturbation harmful?," "Sexual perversions,"<sup>249</sup> and "Extreme sexual desires among men."<sup>250</sup>

. The advertisements in the daily newspapers turned into journals and manuals, first, visible. Second, manuals and journals turned to a commodity that was "marketed and consumed in public print culture." <sup>251</sup> Karaveli stated that Seksoloji was a very profitable product for his brother. <sup>252</sup>

## 2.3. Why sexual manners?

The visibility of sexual manners in the public sphere could be followed by the increased number of publications, the variety of the content, the changing aims regarding informing the public, and its extended outreach. The amount of the sexual manners-related material increased in different formats. Sexual manners has been released as article pieces in journals and newspapers, separate journals such as Seksoloji, and or separate books such as marriage manuals, starting with the end of the 1940s and throughout the 1950s. In addition, the circulation and print numbers of sexual manners have been increased throughout the 1950s. The publishers announced the number of prints on the front pages of the manuals (such as "ikinci baskı" - second print). They gave advertisements that emphasized the number of prints to display the popularity of the published material. Under the topic of the sexual manners, the writers not only discussed biological, medical, physiological, and psychological issues. They also attended to the social aspects of sexuality, such as marriage, the roles of wives and husbands regarding and related to sexuality, and potential dangers and threats due to sexuality. Sexual manners as a topic was not only limited to the side-line literature, which stayed under the radar. To a certain extent, sexual manners found a place in the popular newspapers and magazines that turned

<sup>249 &</sup>quot;Seksoloji'nin 12nci Mart Sayısı Çıktı," Cumhuriyet, 04.03.1950.

<sup>250 &</sup>quot;Seksoloji cinsi bilgiler mecmuasının 11inci Şubat sayısı çıktı." *Cumhuriyet*, 05.02.1950.

Geppert, "Divine Sex, Happy Marriage, Regenerated Nation," 392. Bashford and Strange, "Public Pedagogy: Sex Education and Mass Communication in the Mid–Twentieth Century," 73.

<sup>252</sup> Karaveli, Bir Ankara Ailesinin Hikayesi, 212.

sexuality-related topics a part of the public discussion. Last but not least, the goals of discussing sexual manners evolved from "serving the good of the public" to "ensuring happiness for individual well-being."

Even though sexual manners (and sexuality-related subjects) frequently appeared in the publications, the editors and the writers continued insistently to explain the importance, the need, and the contribution of sexual manners to the well-being of individuals and society throughout the late 1940s to the early 1960s. They also tried to construct their self-legitimacy while opening up a private subject to public discussion. This part of the study focuses on the narrative of the public figures that connected the "importance of sexual manners" with social and individual well-being, on which they built their legitimacy as writers of "sexual manners." Throughout "sexual manners" literature, writers have touched on various subjects and produced a significant amount of literature on sexuality. This part discusses the connections between social and individual well-being and sexuality (and related subjects) that point to particular areas, starting from marriage to criminality. In the last part, the critics against the visibility of "sexual manners" are analyzed with their corresponding answers.

Seksoloji journal, with its dominance in popular sexuality literature, took the center place along with the other published materials of the era in this section. Seksoloji had symbolic importance since the writers and editors of the journal became the main figures of the literature on sexual manners. The title of the popular and reaction-raised journal of the era, Seksoloji, explained its existence and purpose in its presentation article in the magazine's first issue. The editors (Muzaffer Aşkın and Orhan Karaveli) explained their initiative, which was publishing a journal focusing on sexual manners, with their willingness to contribute to the well-being of the whole population and citizens. According to the editors, information on sexual manners and sexual matters should be produced, distributed, and taught for the betterment of the whole Turkish population. The consequences of the lack of sexual manners were enumerated as physical and psychological harm to the individuals, threats to the moral values of the society, concerns about the health of the children and adolescents and well-being of the family by the intellectuals. The lack of information on sexual matters and sexual manners was not only narrated as a danger to society. However, it has been

stated that it could cause poor consequences in the marriage life.<sup>253</sup> As it was declared in the column, the lack of sexual manners should be taken seriously in a community like Turkish society, where sexuality has been hidden for centuries. The journal aimed to discuss all the sexual problems with openness and without "fake shameful" feelings. The journal also planned to answer all the physical, psychological, and legal questions in order to overcome sexual ignorance.

The editors also added that sexual manners and sexual matters had become the topics that were examined for the common interest in the contemporary world. The link with the contemporary world was built with reference to the Kinsey report, which was introduced as a vital contribution to sexology research for the fight against ignorance in sexual matters. The editors even mentioned that Kinsey used a variety of statistical information for his research, to which they referred the scientific structure of the research. The introductory column of *Seksoloji* contained symbolic clues regarding the reasons for the increased visibility of sexual manners as a topic in the 1950s in Turkey. Also, the column briefly introduced the perception of sexuality and how the link between sexuality, citizenship, and education was structured.

According to the *Seksoloji* journal, sexual manners were presented as a critical subject to be addressed for the well-being of the entire population (public) and individuals. Raising awareness among the public about sexuality-related issues was not only linked to the population's health. However, it was also presented as a source of happiness for the individuals. On the one hand, *sexual manners* was discussed as a solution to particular social problems. In the 1950s, public figures started to diagnose new "social problems" related to sexuality for the population.<sup>254</sup> Besides venereal diseases, sexual harassment, perversion, and even divorce were diagnosed as social problems which could be harmful to the physical and moral well-

<sup>&</sup>quot;Çıkarken," Seksoloji, 1 (1949), 1. "Zamanımızda cinsel meseleler ve cinsel terbiye bütün dünyada üzerinde en fazla durulan ve incelenen davalar olmuştur. 1948 senesi zarfında Amerika'da en çok alaka uyandıran kitap, Amerikan erkeğinin cinsi hayatını geniş istatistiklere dayanarak inceleyen meşhur Kinsey raporudur. Bu eserde bilhassa belirtilmek istenen cihet, cinsi cehaletin büyük tehlikeleri ve evlilik hayatındaki kötü neticeleridir."

<sup>254</sup> Horn, Social Bodies: Science, Reproduction, and Italian Modernity.

being of the population.<sup>255</sup> The importance of the public's well-being was stressed in various articles of the *Seksoloji* magazine. The writers of sexual manners were concerned with the well-being of the population (*Life*).<sup>256</sup> Like in the introductory article, in the first and second year opening articles, the need for raising awareness on sexual manners was discussed in the framework of the public good. Besides the *Seksoloji*, the authors emphasized the need for trustworthy information on sexual manners for the physically and psychologically healthy population in the newspaper articles, which had a wider reach.<sup>257</sup>

On the other hand, the writers of sexual manners did not overlook individual well-being. As was pointed out in the introductory column, the knowledge of sexual manners was also presented as the key to individual happiness, including the psychological health and well-being of marital relations. Sexual manners was narrated as a mainstream concept that contributed to the well-being of society, the constructed institutions of society (such as marriage and family), and individuals. Thompson classified different tendencies based on the designated actors in discussing sexual matters. According to Thompson, keeping sexual matters discussions between public good and family carries both moralist and paternalist tendencies.<sup>258</sup> In her analysis, the paternalist approach discusses sexual manners (and sexuality) within the framework of the relationship between individual and public good, whereas the moralist approach discusses the subject within the framework of the state and the family. Her classification fits the discussions about sexual manners in the 1950s. Some sexual manners writers emphasized the importance of sexual manners in the individual happiness that is found in marriage. Some other writers also directly linked the well-being of society to healthy marriages and the well-

Dr. Bülent Davran, "Bir Cinsiyet Buhranı İçinde Miyiz?" Seksoloji, 19 (1950), 1-6.

<sup>256</sup> Foucault, The History of Sexuality, Vol 1.

<sup>257 &</sup>quot;Çıkarken," *Seksoloji*, 1 (1949), 1. Muzaffer Aşkın, "Anketimizin Bilançosu," *Seksoloji*, 13 (1950), 4-8. Muzaffer Aşkın, "Anketimizin Bilançosu," *Seksoloji*, 14 (1950), 4-8.

<sup>258</sup> Rachel Thompson gave America in the 1950s as an exemplary case. Rachel Thomson, "Moral Rhetoric and Public Health Pragmatism: The Recent Politics of Sex Education," *Feminist Review*, 48 (1994), 47.

being of families.<sup>259</sup> The scientific and international characteristics of sexual manners were emphasized by the introductory column of the *Seksoloji* journal. On the one hand, sexual manners was presented as an internationally emerging concern. On the other hand, the scientific community's interest was underlined by referring to a famous researcher of the era – Alfred Kinsey – and his scientific methods – statistics. The journal underlined the relationship between scientific knowledge and sexual manners.

Seksoloji argued that it has the competence to provide information regarding sexual matters and sexual manners. The journal advertised itself as "a competent guide in sexual manners" on the magazine's front page in every issue and used it as a motto for every issue and its manuals. Competence, authority, and scientificization were three dominant discourses that were used to legitimize the content of Seksoloji and the general discourse surrounding sexual manners in other published material. The journal has put great effort into proving that they have more than enough competence to provide information on sexuality. The editorial team also used the scientific character of the journal to differentiate itself from any other disreputable and obscene material. In addition, the journal's name referred to the scientific discipline, which specialized in sexual matters and sexual manners. The journal's name and presentation could be read as an attempt to strengthen the legitimization of the publication, which was leaned on scientific knowledge.

The journal and other resources published on sexual manners and sexual matters have claimed that they are serving the "truth" about sex. Notably, the empirical research, which collected data from the field, has gained a reputation and respectability for obtaining the "truth" of the subject in the era. In other words, they argued that the "right" information on sexual

Muzaffer Aşkın, "Anketimizin Bilançosu," *Seksoloji*, 13 (1950), 4-8. Muzaffer Aşkın, "Anketimizin Bilançosu," *Seksoloji*, 14 (1950), 4-8.

<sup>260 &</sup>quot;cinsi terbiyede salahiyetli bir rehber"

The need of the editors to differentiate themselves and their published materials from the disreputable ones was seen in the introductory articles along with the warnings against this kind of publishings frequently during the era. This will be discussed in the "Actors of Sexual Manners" part.

manners could be obtained from research on sexual matters. <sup>262</sup> The reference to Kinsey in the introductory column of the *Seksoloji* journal was not only to emphasize the journal's ability to follow recent and up-to-date information. However, it was also meant to underline the source of the knowledge used in the magazine, which happened to be the results of the most recent empirical research. <sup>263</sup> Articles on sexual manners and sexual matters were not only published in *the Seksoloji* journal. Other published materials have also addressed sexual behavior. In all these articles or manuals, sexual manners was represented as a theme approached with scientific content and methods. To prove the scientific character of the content, the writers frequently referred to studies with known researchers. In some cases, the writers contained a general reference to research without elaborating by whom or where it was conducted. <sup>264</sup>

All in all, the writers on sexuality had a consensus that the subject should be discussed with a scientific approach. Scientific knowledge turned into a shield and a framework that enabled the writers to talk about sexual matters with reference to a powerful authority. The authors of sexual manners frequently claimed that they used the most accurate and up-to-date information on sexual manners. On the one hand, the scientific shield has enabled the writers to discuss sexuality without being constrained by cultural boundaries defined by the concepts of shameful and taboo. On the other hand, these writings aimed to display the "truths" of sexuality, to "clean" this area from superstitions, and to make people understand how sexuality functions. Experts on *sexual manners* invited people to behave

For a detailed discussion in the sexuality research, see: Ericksen, *Kiss and Tell: Surveying Sex in the Twentieth Century*.

Veronika Fuechtner, Douglas E. Haynes, and Ryan M. Jones, "Introduction: Toward a Global History of Sexual Science: Movements, Networks, and Deployments," in *A Global History of Sexual Science*, 1880–1960, ed. Veronika Fuechtner, Douglas E. Haynes, and Ryan M. Jones (Oakland, California: University of California Press, 2018), 4-5.

For a detailed discussions, see "Actors of Sexual Manners" section.

<sup>265</sup> Criticism from Recep Doksat about considering sexuality as a shameful subject, see: Recep Doksat, "Günün Tıbbi Bahisleri: Cinsi Terbiye," *Milliyet*, 28.01.1958.

<sup>266</sup> Margaret Jackson, ""Facts of Life" or the Eroticization of Women's Oppression? Sexology and the Social Construction of Heterosexuality," in *The Cultural Construction of Sexuality*, ed. Pat Caplan (London: Tavistock, 1987), 55. Jackson discusses the development in

according to the rules, norms, and assumptions that were formed in parallel to these "truths" for the well-being of individuals and the general public.

### 2.3.1. Educating citizens for sexual manners

In Milliyet, Recep Doksat criticized the public's ignorance regarding sexual matters.<sup>267</sup> Ferit Saymen stated that the public's ignorance of sexuality could create various social and personal problems.<sup>268</sup> According to Faruk Akbeğ, the country (memleket) was in the dark about sexual manners due to ignorance.<sup>269</sup> The writers underlined the need to teach the public sexual manners while sexuality was becoming a more visible discussion. "Educating the ignorant public" has become the key solution to social and personal problems. There was a popular request in Turkey in the 1950s to educate our children and young people about sexual manners.270 The country's young citizens were defined as the unfortunate individuals who had been kept in the dark for centuries. Citizens should be educated about sexual manners to contribute to the development and well-being of the country. The public figures of the era have repeatedly pointed out young people as the primary target group to be educated about sexual manners.<sup>271</sup> Although young people were seen *naturally* as the first target group since they were candidates for future marriages, an analogy between young citizens and young people was also hidden in the narratives formed by the public figures.

Education was seen as the primary tool to deal with the ignorant public by the Republican elite. Since the establishment of the Republic, educating

producing knowledge on sexuality from prejudice to natural and normal knowledge. She uses the texts of Havelock Ellis and Margaret Sanger, translated to Turkish during the 1950s numerous times and advertised by newspapers such as Milliyet and magazines such as *Seksoloji*.

- 267 Recep Doksat, "Günün Tıbbi Bahisleri: Cinsi Terbiye," *Milliyet*, 28.01.1958.
- 268 "Anketimiz Ferit Saymen," Seksoloji, 10 (1950), 7.
- Faruk Akbeğ, "Seksoloji 4 yaşına girerken," *Seksoloji*, 37 (1952), 1. "... bizde halledilmesi gereken bir cinsiyet meselesi mevcut..."
- Ord. Prof. Mustafa Şekip Tunç, "Cinsi Terbiye Kimler Tarafından Verilmelidir?" *Seksoloji*, 15 (1950), 1-4.
- 271 "Anketimiz Fahrettin Kerim Gökay," Seksoloji, 2 (1949), 6-7.

the *ignorant* public on different issues has been the main goal of the decision-makers of the country.<sup>272</sup> The opinion leaders of the era frequently mentioned the inadequate education of the citizens since it was considered the main reason for the country's backwardness. This goal had its roots in creating "new citizens" of the new Republic. As a part of the education campaigns, the Republican elite started compulsory public education for children along with public awareness activities for adults which included providing basic knowledge about hygiene, epidemics, and common rules for public life (etiquette). Not only did the children become the focal point for providing proper training. However, every citizen of the Republic was considered a candidate to be trained according to the needs of a modern and developed country.

Teaching manners covered a variety of subjects. As mentioned in the introduction chapter, educating the public about "democracy manners" (demokrasi terbiyesi) referred to the proper behaviors in a democratic system. It extended to the etiquette rules (görgü kuralları) that should be followed in the public sphere by the citizens of the Republic. Cumhuriyet announced the "manners meetings of the Teacher's Union" (Muallimler Birliği'nin Etiket Toplantıları) on July 16, 1949 in the education council (maarif şurası). According to Cumhuriyet, Halide Edip will give a speech on "democracy and manners," Mümtaz Turhan on "Fundamentals of Democracy Manners," Refia Şemin "On Manners," and Tevfik Remzi Kazancıgil on "Sexual Manners in School." 273 The monitoring generation (denetlevici kuşak) aimed to educate the new subjects of the republic according to the modern necessities of the new era. In another way, they tried to guide the new citizens according to the needs of a developed country. Moreover, they encouraged the young citizens of the country to teach themselves all the new conduct, including the democracy manners, etiquette rules, and sexual manners, and to regulate their behaviors according to these new rules.<sup>274</sup> The *monitoring* generation aimed

<sup>272</sup> Üstel, "Makbul Vatandaş"ın Peşinde.

<sup>273 &</sup>quot;Muallimler Birliğinin terbiye toplantıları," Cumhuriyet, 16.07.1949

Dr. Bülent Davran, "Bir Cinsiyet Buhranı İçinde miyiz?" *Seksoloji*, 19 (1950), 4. "Cinsi arzulara aklen hakimiyet, küçük yaştan başlayan bir terbiye ile ancak mümkündür."

to embed a culture of *manners* in every part of life, which would accompany the formation and development of the country. According to them, these manners would protect the Turkish people from the excesses of any subject, which could damage the harmony in society and deteriorate the Turkish culture. One of the early and symbolic discussions regarding moral manners (moral education) was the Moral Manners Congress (*Ahlak Terbiyesi Kongresi*), which was organized by the National Union of the Turkey Teacher Associations Union (*Turkiye Öğretmen Dernekleri Milli Birliği*) in Ankara University, Language, History and Geography Faculty on April 23, 1951. The main objective of the congress was to establish moral manners among the children and young people of society who will be future citizens. Teachers in the congress emphasized the importance of teaching moral manners that aimed to create modern, progressive, nationalist, and patriotic citizens.<sup>275</sup>

Sexual subject gained attention manners as the of the *monitoring* generation. In one era article, sexuality was described as the primary force affecting our lives since our creation depends on sexuality. The writer suggested that such a power can erase everything, including common sense, social and religous values if it is not appropriately controlled.<sup>276</sup> As mentioned in the previous section, the name father of Seksoloji journal was Fahrettin Kerim Gökay, who was one of the prominent figures of the *monitoring* generation. In the journal, there was a separate column called Anketimiz. Anketimiz aimed to collect endorsements about its content and its existence from public figures that could be counted as a part of the *monitoring* generation. Through Anketimiz, Seksoloji shared the approval of the *monitoring* generation with the public.<sup>277</sup> Seksoloji's engagement with the *monitoring* generation could be considered as an effort to prove its legitimacy. The journal tried to receive periodic contributions

<sup>275</sup> Ahlak Terbiyesi Kongresi 23 Nisan 1951, Türkiye Öğretmen Dernekleri Milli Birliği (TÖDMB) (Ankara: Milli Eğitim Basımevi, 1951) quoted from Tunay Kamer and Ramazan Alabaş, "Ahlâk Terbiyesi Kongresi ve Basına Yansımaları," Kastamonu Eğitim Dergisi 25, 2 (2017): 821-848.

<sup>276</sup> David Keller, "Cinsiyetin Kudreti," Seksoloji, 12 (1950), 32.

<sup>277</sup> Ezgi Sarıtaş, "Seksoloji: 1945-1955 arası Türkiye'de Cinsel Terbiye," *Fe Dergi* 4, 2 (2012), 60.

from the well-known figures of the *monitoring* generation such as Peyami Safa. In the introduction article of the fourtieth issue, the managing editor of the journal, Muzaffer Taşkın, thanked the public for their trust, the legal authorities and members of the national education for their mature understanding (*olgun anlayış*). He thanked the scientists (*ilim adamlarımız*) by name including Fahrettin Kerim Gökay, Mustafa Şekip Tunç, Kazım İsmail Gürkan, Ferit Hakkı Saymen, Rasim Adasal, Şinasi Hakkı Erel, Necmettin Rifat Yarar, Bülent Davran, Peyami Safa and Selim Sırrı Tarcan for their trust and support by listing them name by name.<sup>278</sup>

During the 1930s, sexuality was only considered as a part of the "creating a healthy generation" discourse along with the warnings against STDs. Campaigns and public warnings against STDs (such as syphilis and gonorrhea)<sup>279</sup> have been only a part of the "healthy reproduction" and "healthy population" projects. Although the efforts to prevent STDs have continued during the 1950s, the discourse about sexuality has expanded its concerns beyond having a "healthy generation" (reproduction). Knowledge on sexual manners was distributed in the 1950s to inform and educate citizens about their sexuality. The *monitoring* generation, as the leading educators of the country, has taken part in this process by making sexuality visible in the public discourse and also legitimizing the topic in the eyes of the citizens. They tried to popularize knowledge on sexual manners, which, in return, would help the citizens develop proper sexual acts. In other words, they promoted sexual etiquette among the general public to guide individuals on how to act sexually.<sup>280</sup>

Sexual manners and sexual matters were not excluded from the modernizing attempts of the monitoring generation. The fight against ignorance was assessed as a "civilizing" and "modernization process" of

<sup>278</sup> Muzaffer Aşkın, "Cinsiyet Hakkında Sıhhatli ve Doğru Bir Anlayışa Sahib Olmalıyız," *Seksoloji*, 40 (1952), 1-2.

<sup>279</sup> Arpacı, "Hastalık, Ulus ve Felaket: Türkiye'de Frengi ile Mücadele (1920-1950)," 59-86.

Gwendolyn Audrey Foster, *Troping the Body: Gender, Etiquette, and Performance* (Carbondale and Edwardsville: Southern Illinois University Press, 2000), vii. Foster discusses in etiquette rules in general. Yet, in this context, there are important similarities in sexual manners manuals and etiquette books.

sexuality.<sup>281</sup> In his first article in *Seksoloji*, Kemal Çağlar declared that he joined this enthusiastic scientific community to raise the country to the level of the most perfect countries.<sup>282</sup> According to the public figures of the era, ignorance could only be dealt with by educating the citizens of the public. Discussing sexuality-related issues in public as a part of educating the citizens makes the subject plain and understandable. However, as Peyami Safa mentioned, that due to embarrassment among the public, sexuality stayed as a "forbidden area" for a long time. He added, "Although the topic is the source of the human being's biological life and is talked about in private circles and conversations. However, even, intellectuals have limited ideas and knowledge about the subject."<sup>283</sup> According to Selim Sırrı Tarcan, speaking of sexuality was considered shameful starting from his childhood to his adulthood years.<sup>284</sup> In another work of Peyami Safa, he mentioned that openness is better than oppression in sexual manners.<sup>285</sup>

Recep Doksat stated that human beings and animals were dominated by two basic instincts: hunger instinct and sexual instincts. Individuals should discipline, tame, and regulate sexual instincts like hunger instinct. According to Doksat, if sexual manners would not regulate sexual desires [instincts], it would be impossible to raise healthy generations. Doksat added that oppressed desires [instincts] could harm the inner world (*iç dünyası*) of individuals and cause various illnesses.<sup>286</sup> Bülent Davran also mentioned the power of sexual instincts. Davran underlined the importance of sexual manners (which referred to educating children) in controlling their instincts. Moreover, he stated that civilization means renouncing basic sexual pleasure and regulating basic instincts with mind. He concluded that

<sup>281</sup> Jackson and Scott, *Theorizing Sexuality*, 50.

Kemal Çağlar, "Cinsi Terbiyenin Önemi," *Seksoloji*, 14 (1950), 1. "Elinde ilim ve fen meşaleler ile cemiyetimizi en mütekamil cemiyetler seviyesine yükseltmek üzere aşk ve hevesle yürüyen bu heyecanlı gruba ben de katıldım..."

<sup>283 &</sup>quot;Anketimiz – Peyami Safa," Seksoloji, 9 (1949), 4.

<sup>284 &</sup>quot;Anketimiz – Selim Sırrı Tarcan," Seksoloji, 11 (1950), 8.

Peyami Safa, "Çıplaklık Müstehcen midir?" *Milliyet*, 21.09.1956. "Cinsi terbiyede "açıklık", istibdattan iyidir." Here, Safa used the concept of openness also for refering nudity.

Recep Doksat, "Günün Tıbbi Bahisleri: Cinsi terbiye," *Milliyet*, 28.01.1958.

it is necessary to deal with sexual instincts with a (rational) mind to adapt to western civilization.<sup>287</sup> The relationship that was built between being civility and openness of sexuality was relatively new for the public discourse.<sup>288</sup> Unlike the discourse produced in the 1930s on modernity which did not include sexual innuendos,<sup>289</sup> in the 1950s, the public figures have linked the necessities of modernity and civility with the more comprehensive, visible, open, and regulated public knowledge on sexuality.

Public figures argued that knowing about sexual manners was a way to be protected and fight against the possible corruptive effects of excessive sexuality. The monitoring generation dealt with the increasing visibility of sexuality among the public while trying to protect the citizens from the "spoiling" effects of sexuality. The importance and need for sexual manners were stated through the discourse, which underlined possible disasters due to the lack (scarcity) of sexual knowledge (cinsi terbiye kıtlığı), spoiling effects of excessive sexuality, and loss of moral values.<sup>290</sup> The monitoring generation aimed to describe the sphere of sexuality and determine proper sexual acts through sexual manners discourse.<sup>291</sup> These efforts could be read as an attempt to regulate the citizens' bodies, pleasures, and behaviors by the monitoring generation. However, in this regulative attempt, the strategy lay in teaching the citizens appropriate sexual acts to encourage them for regulating their own behaviors. Nuri Kodamanoğlu, the chief principle of Adana High School, stated that sexuality was exempt from societal regulation. According to him, citizens can develop "individual inspection" (ferdi murakabe) by learning sexual manners.<sup>292</sup> Citizens of the Republic could internalize sexual manners, which was built on scientific rules and

<sup>287</sup> Dr. Bülent Davran, "Bir Cinsiyet Buhranı İçinde miyiz?" Seksoloji, 19 (1950), 1.

<sup>288</sup> Haluk Durukal prepared, "Cumhuriyetin Anketi: Çocuklarımızı İyi Yetiştirebiliyor muyuz?" *Cumhuriyet*, 19.04.1956. "Daha medeni bir cemiyetin nüvesi için çocuklara cinsi terbiyenin verilmesi faydalıdır."

For the similar discussions regarding the relation between sexuality and modern in Iran, see: Haeri, "İran'da Geçici Evlilik ve Devlet: Kadın Cinselliği üzerine İslami bir Söylem," 159.

<sup>290</sup> Doç. Dr. Nurullah Kunter, "Hukuki Meseleler: Irza Geçme Suçları," *Cumhuriyet*, 01.06.1954.

<sup>291</sup> Sarıtaş, "Seksoloji: 1945-1955 arası Türkiye'de Cinsel Terbiye," 59.

<sup>292</sup> M. Nuri Kodamanoğlu, "Cinsiyet Meselesi ve Eğitim," Seksoloji, 27 (1951), 13.

cultural norms, and choose to act accordingly. In that way, sexual manners can turn into a discourse that enables citizens to discipline and regulate their own sexual practices.<sup>293</sup> In other words, the public figures aimed to contribute to creating self-regulating citizens regarding their sexuality with sexual manners.

#### 2.3.2. Sexual manners for the public good

The goal of spreading sexual knowledge was justified by the desire to protect the nation from the effects of *harmful* sexuality and raise healthy generations.<sup>294</sup> The danger was defined as sexual illnesses and abnormalities under the title of perversions.<sup>295</sup> Public figures used sexual manners to install a medical and moral discourse.<sup>296</sup> They assumed that knowledge on sexual manners would avoid the risks and ensure public health's improvement while protecting individuals' moral values.

Sexual Manners for Public Health: Illnesses, Perversion, and Criminality

Public figures emphasize the vitality of the physical and psychological health of public in parallel to its moral well-being. According to Muzaffer Aşkın, psychological (spiritual-*ruhi*) and physical (corporeal-*bedeni*) health is possible only with the correct management of sexual instinct. Aşkın added teaching sexual manners would contribute to the physical and psychological health of the individuals.<sup>297</sup> The narrative in the Seksoloji's advertisements announced boltly that sexual manners is a necessity for

Luther H. Martin, Huck Gutman and Patrick H. Hutton ed., *Technologies of the Self: A Seminar with Michel Foucault* (London: Tavistock Publications, 1988).

<sup>294</sup> Recep Doksat, "Günün Tıbbi Bahisleri: Cinsi Terbiye," *Milliyet*, 28.01.1958.

<sup>295</sup> Faruk Akbeğ, "Seksoloji 4 Yaşına Girerken," Seksoloji, 37 (1952), 3.

Thomson, "Moral Rhetoric and Public Health Pragmatism," 46.

<sup>297</sup> Muzaffer Aşkın, "Cinsiyet Hakkında Sıhhatli ve Doğru bir Anlayışa Sahib Olmalıyız," Seksoloji, 40 (1952), 5. "Ruhi ve bedeni sağlık, ancak cinsi insiyakın doğru bir şekilde idaresiyle kabildir."

having a *normal*, *healthy*, and *happy* life and marriage.<sup>298</sup> Hence, the efforts to describe proper characteristics of "healthy sexuality" were imperative in the writings of "sexual manners." Whereas some articles focused solely on the required characteristics of healthy ones, some writers have defined sexuality with a diachotomic mind.<sup>299</sup> Referring to this mindset, where some states and practices of sexuality were defined as normalcy, naturalness, and healthiness, some were diagnosed as, oppositely, illness, abnormality, and deviance (perversion). Recep Doksat provided a list of sexual perversion (cinsel sapıklıklar) in his "Sağlık Ansiklopedisi" (Health Encyclopedia) column, which included homosexuality, transvestitism and incest. 300 In order to define "proper" sexuality, the opposite states and practices were also commonly used as exemplary cases to display the "desirable" (wanted) and "undesirable" (unwanted) ones. 301 Not surprisingly, sexology as a science was also constituted in normalizing and pathologizing discourses.<sup>302</sup> Healthy and normal sexuality was not only considered a necessity for individuals. It was also considered an imperative for a healthy and civilized (medeni) population (society). Moreover, healthy and normal sexuality, along with healthy reproductive practices, were seen as a prerequisite for healthy generations.

The first target to be eliminated through sexual manners was venereal diseases. Even before the establishment of the Republic, venereal diseases were a vital concern of the governing mechanisms.<sup>303</sup> Among the sexual diseases, gonorrhea and syphilis received special attention and were

Dr. Jean Hoppeler, Evlenmeden Önce, trans. Muzaffer Aşkın (İstanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1951), 60. "Cinsi hayatımız, bütün yaşayışımıza tesir etmektedir; evlilik hayatında da mesut ve bedbaht olmamız, cinsiyet meselesini normal ve tabii bir şekilde halletmemize bağlıdır." Seksoloji published advertisements of its manuals at the front and last pages of montly issues and publications. Seksoloji repeated this narrative not only in its publications. However, the journal used this narrative also in the newspapers' advertisements. Hence, they repeated this motto frequently.

<sup>299</sup> For the discussion about dichotomic mind: Plumwood, Feminism ve Doğaya Hükmetmek. Grosz, Volatile Bodies: Toward a Corporeal Feminism.

Recep Doksat, "Sağlık ansiklopedisi: Cinsi sapıklıklar (devam)," Milliyet, 20.3.1958.

<sup>301</sup> Foucault, The History of Sexuality, Vol 1, 89.

<sup>302</sup> Moddelmog, "Modernism and Sexology," 269.

<sup>303</sup> Arpacı, "Hastalık, Ulus ve Felaket: Türkiye'de Frengi ile Mücadele (1920-1950)," 62-81.

frequently discussed in public and parliament.<sup>304</sup> At a radio speech, Hulusi Behçet defined syphilis as "genetic (*nesli*), familial, progeny (*soysal*) causing disasters."<sup>305</sup> Because syphillis was a sexually transmitted disease, and can pass from generation to generation, it was seen as one of the vital threats to the moral and physical health of both the individual and the public.<sup>306</sup> In the 1930s and 1940s, discussions about gonorrhea and syphilis emphasized the relation between the spread of venereal diseases and uncontrolled sexuality.<sup>307</sup> During the 1930s, state mechanisms with the leading role of the Ministry of Health prepared info packages on venereal diseases both for health professionals and for the public, conducted national seminars and conferences, established new institutions with a particular focus on treatment and research, and introduced new laws to prevent and control the contagion of venereal diseases.<sup>308</sup>

In the 1950s, the concerns regarding venereal diseases were extended from public to individual health. In the 1930s, the sexual and reproductive

For the early Republican discussions in the parliament and state-run commissions, see: Mehmet Pınar, "Fuhuş ve Zührevi Hastalıkların (Frengi) TBMM'de Tartışılması ve Resmi Raporlara Yansımaları (1920-1932)," *Van Yüzüncü Yıl Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi, Salgın Hastalıklar Özel Sayısı* 1, 6 (2020), 15-42. For examplary parliamentarian discussions in the 1940s about treatment of syphilis and, see: *TBMM Zabıt Ceridesi*, Term: 3, Session: 63, Vol. 25 (26.05.1942), 300-301. *TBMM Zabıt Ceridesi*, Term: 6, Session: 57 Vol. 18 (27.05.1941), 200-205.

Nuray Demirci and Çağatay Üstün, "Monograph: Prof. Dr. Hulusi Behçet'in (1889-1948) frengi akkındaki bir radyo konuşması," *Lokman Hekim Journal* 3, 1 (2013), 56. "Frengi, basit geçici bir hastalık kadrosundan çıkmış, kelimenin hakiki manasıyla, soysal, ailevi, nesli, felaketler doğuran, her bir organımıza yerleşebilen, bir hastalık şekline girmiştir." Demirci and Üstün transcripted Behçet's speech at Istanbul radio in 1935. Hulusi Behçet, "Frengi Niçin Ayıp Görülür? Frengiyi Neden Gizli Tutmak Adet Olmuştur? Tabiatta Ayıp Denen Hastalık Var mıdır?" *İstanbul Radyosunda Verilen Konferans* (İstanbul: İstanbul Halkevi, 1935).

Nuray Demirci and Çağatay Üstün, "Monograph: Prof. Dr. Hulusi Behçet'in (1889-1948) frengi akkındaki bir radyo konuşması," *Lokman Hekim Journal* 3, 1 (2013), 56-58.

<sup>307</sup> Similar concerns were seen in various countries such as Germany, England and the USA from the beginning of the century. For England, see: Porter and Hall, *The Facts of Life*. For similar concerns in the Post-Second World War era in Germany, see: Atina Grossman, *Reforming Sex: The German Movement for Birth Control and Abortion Reform, 1920-1950* (New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995), 191-193.

Arpacı, "Hastalık, Ulus ve Felaket: Türkiye'de Frengi ile Mücadele (1920-1950)," 67-81.

health of individuals was bound up with the "future of the country." In the 1950s, the focus shifted to the individuals. Kodamanoğlu stated that the well-being of societies depends on the healthy regulation of births. Hence, individuals should regulate their behaviors according to their sexual manners to ensure the well-being of the population now and in the future.<sup>309</sup> Sexuality was described as a need and a natural urge of human beings. Yet, it should be managed and regulated if the person does not want to face dangerous and undesirable consequences.<sup>310</sup> Venereal diseases were mentioned often with the concept of danger. In a 1953 dated article, Ata Tokgöz talked about the dangers of syphilis in Istanbul. He stated that a syphilis or gonorrhea-infected person without knowledge of his condition or the treatment is not a danger to himself or the people around him. Instead, he was clearly a source of danger and disaster for the whole city, even the country.311 The necessity and essentiality of being informative on sexual manners were explained by concerns of protecting young people from suffering diseases or psychological problems.<sup>312</sup> Young people as the target group became central for two overlapping reasons. One, they would be sexually engaged through marriage in a short term of period. Therefore, their inexperience and lack of knowledge were seen as a risk for being

<sup>309</sup> Nuri Kodamanoğlu, "Cinsiyet Meselesi ve Eğitim," Seksoloji, 27 (1951), 12.

For an article from 1952 about consequences, see: "Irsi Frengi," *Seksoloji*, 34 (1952), 46-48. For a general discussion, see: Jean Carabine, ""Constructing Women": Women's Sexuality and Social Policy," *Critical Social Policy* 34, 1 (1992), 25.

Ata Tokgöz, "İstanbul Zührevi Hastalıklarla Nasıl Mücadele Ediyor," *Seksoloji*, (1953), 23. "Günlük hayatın ve münasebetlerin çok kesif olduğu böyle bir şehirin sokaklarında tedavisiz, kendini bilmeden dolaşacak bir frengilinin, bir gonorelinin yalnız kendisi ve etrafındakiler için değil, fakat bütün bir şehir hattâ memleket için nasıl bir hastalık ve felâket kaynağı olacağı bellidir."

Fahrettin Kerim Gökay, "Anketimiz," *Seksoloji*, no.2 (1949), 6-7. Doksat argued that oppressed desires may leave deep reflections in the inner world of an individual and cause various illnesses. He added that many sexual abnormalities may happen due to a lack and mistakes of sexual manners. (Baskı altında tutulan arzular, ferdin iç dünyasında derin akisler bırakarak, çeşitli hastalıklara da yol açar....ahlakın ayıpladığı bir çok cinsi anormallikler de, cinsi terbiye eksikliğinin ve hatalarının neticesidir.) Recep Doksat, "Günün Tıbbi Bahisleri: Cinsi Terbiye," *Milliyet*, 28.01.1958.

vulnerable to venereal diseases.<sup>313</sup> Second, they will be the future biological parents of a new generation. Therefore, the infection of young people may affect future generations.

Venereal diseases were frequently associated with prostitution in the popular and academic press.<sup>314</sup> Lack of sexual manners education was presented as the primary cause of the rise in prostitution.<sup>315</sup> The result of failing cultural, moral, and religious manners caused an increase in extramarital relations and, consequently, an increase in prostitution, which led to the spread of venereal diseases and degeneration in society. 316 Karcal and Uraz explained the higher prevalence of venereal diseases in the big cities compared to villages and among students and merchants compared to workers and soldiers, referring to Krafft-Ebing tests. They claimed that advanced cultures prepare the ground for unrestrained sexual desires (concupiscence).<sup>317</sup> Prostitution was not only diagnosed as the main reason for social degeneration and the spread of venereal diseases. However, it was also defined as a criminal act. Although criminalizing prostitution was viewed as a precaution to create a disincentive, developing sexual manners among the citizens was seen as a more effective tool to fight against prostitution.318

Apart from prostitution and venereal diseases, Faruk Akbeğ claimed that a lack of sexual manners causes sex offenses such as sexual harassment, abuse, molestation, and assault. From the news of molestation to the murder of Sarıyer, a wide range of sexual assault activities were linked to a lack of sexual manners.<sup>319</sup> They were both defined as an abnormality or sickness and as a crime. Although sexual assault was criminalized and corresponded

<sup>313</sup> Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 2: Genç Erkekte Cinsiyet Fırtınası (İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959), 9-10, 26. Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 12: Fuhuş ve Fahişeler. (İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959), 10.

<sup>314 &</sup>quot;Zührevi hastalıkların artmasına mani olunmalıdır." Milliyet, 20.10.1950.

<sup>315 &</sup>quot;Fuhuş nedeni," *Cumhuriyet*, 21.05.1963.

<sup>316</sup> Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 12: Fuhuş ve Fahişeler. (İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959), 5-6, 22-25.

<sup>317</sup> Selçuk Karçal ve Kayıhan Uraz "Tenasülî hastalıklarla mücadele meselesi" *Seksoloji*, 53 (1953), 49. "...ileri kültürler'in denetimsiz cinsel arzular için zemin hazırlar..."

<sup>318</sup> For a similar solution, see, Porter and Hall, *The Facts of Life*.

Faruk Akbeğ, "Sarıyer Cinayeti ve Sadist Psikopatlar," Seksoloji, 44 (1952), 11-15.

with penal sanctions, educating the public about sexual manners was seen as the "true solution." Educating sexual manners was also considered a way to manage other (so-called) abnormalities, such as homosexuality and travestite. 321

Even the categories of *love murders* and *passion murders* were explained with a lack of sexual manners. Particularly, writers discussed "being jealous of one's husband and wife" vehemently since they cannot decide whether it is a result of a lack of sexual manners or a part of the natural ingredient of love. In one of the articles, Akbeğ claims that the reason for most of the murders that occurred between July 1944 and 1945 was sexual. He grounded his claim on the data taken from Istanbul University's Turkish Criminology Institute. He stated that sexual manners education should be provided to children starting at a young age to prevent these crimes. Lack of sexual manners leads the individual and the society not only to sickness and immorality. But it can also cause crime and perversion. 324

The authors working on sexual manners have blended different types of cases that were seen as social problems and dangers, such as venereal diseases, sexual assaults, and abnormalities in their narratives. They have defined a case as a sickness, whereas, in another article, they have referred to it as deviance and crime. In another way of saying, lack of sexual knowledge was presented as a security problem,<sup>325</sup> which was intermingled

<sup>320</sup> Doç.Dr.Nurullah Kunter, "Hukuki Meseleler: Irza Geçme Suçları," *Cumhuriyet*, 01.06.1954.

Doksat mentions the danger that is waiting for young boys without proper sexual manners is in the cities. Recep Doksat, "Günün Tıbbi Bahisleri: Cinsi Terbiye," *Milliyet*, 28.01.1958. Recep Doksat, "Günün Tıbbi Bahisleri: Erkeğin Kadın, Kadının Erkek Kılığına Girmeyi Sevmesi: Travestimus," *Milliyet*, 29.04.1958. According to Doksat, homosexuality was an abnormality. However, he described travestite as an illness.

<sup>322</sup> Peyami Safa, "Cinsiyet ve Cinayet," Seksoloji, 37 (1952): 16-18.

For the discussion about sexual assault and lack of sexual manners, see: Faruk Akbeğ, "Okullarda cinsiyet eğitimi: Maarif şurası üyelerinin dikkatine sunulur" *Seksoloji*, 42 (1952), 2-3.

Ferit H. Saymen "Sarkıntılık" *Seksoloji*, 26 (1951): 1. Karçal ve Uraz, "Türkiyede fuhuş meselesi," 47.

<sup>325</sup> Sancar, Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti, 262.

with a medical problem. Ultimately, the authors were trying to find solutions to incidents that could cause a danger to the well-being of society and future generations. Therefore, these incidents were considered vital political problems in need of urgent action,<sup>326</sup> whether assessed as a crime, deviance, or illness. The decision-makers were urged to give proper attention to solving the problems with the help of the experts. The list of possible solutions widens from punitive measures to confinement, medication, or therapy. However, the main suggestion which could regulate the public sphere and reach the mass population was presented as a dissemination of knowledge on sexual manners.<sup>327</sup>

Danger and threat are the two most frequently used concepts during the era when sexuality was discussed in public. All the situations which entailed the possibility of disrupting social order, corrupting public decency, or deteriorating public health were considered dangerous or threatening to society. Turkish society was considered in need of protection from these possible threats and dangers. As discussed above, venereal diseases, sexual perversions, and criminal acts were seen as future threats to the morals of Turkish society. In some cases, this threat or danger was embodied in a person, such as being a criminal, pervert, or a person with an STD disease. In other cases, the threat or danger was associated with a vague condition or development and left in an unknown gray area. Whether the threat (danger) is definitive or uncertain, the decision-makers aimed to analyze the reasons and anticipate the risks, particularly at the beginning of the 20th century. Risk assessment became one of the processes that was used in the governing population. 329

<sup>326</sup> Foucault, The History of Sexuality, Vol. 1, 89.

Dr. Nurullah Kunter, "Umumi Adab ve Ahlak Aleyhinde Suçlar," Cumhuriyet, 16.11.1953.

In some cases, criminality and pervesion/abnormality overlapped in the narratives. "İranlıyı öldürenlerden biri Suriyeye kaçmış." *Milliyet*, 29.05.1954. "Bir müddet once Beyoğlunda Bursa sokağında bir cinayet işlenmiş. Ali Ekber adında İranlı bir kahveci, *Kadir ve Yılmaz adında iki homoseksüel genç* tarafından öldürülmüştü." (italic mine) "Cinsi sapık yankesici dün tevfik edildi," *Milliyet*, 02.05.1958. "Bir cinsi sapık diğer bir sapığı bıçakla öldürdü," *Milliyet*, 11.05.1961, "Gülhane parkında bir ihtiyarı döverek parasını aldılar," *Milliyet*, 27.01.1954. "Dolmabahçe cinayetinin katilleri," *Milliyet*, 23.10.1952. "60 homoseksüelin 18i frengili çıktı," *Milliyet*, 13.06.1957.

<sup>329</sup> Horn, Social Bodies: Science, Reproduction, and Italian Modernity.

In the case of sexuality, physiological and psychological illnesses were diagnosed as the reasons that cause crucial risks to the well-being of society. Prevention of these illnesses was seen as the first intervention step to eliminate these risks. According to the experts, the reasons for these illnesses varied from biological to cognitive. 330 They have even mentioned that "poor moral values" could cause corruption, which enables the environment conducive to psychological illnesses. Lack of sexual manners was considered one of the main reasons for "poor moral values" since it was caused by an ignorant or misinformed public. "Poor moral values" were sometimes linked to communism, which was considered one of the other major threats. Communism, which was defined as the root cause (and also, at the same time, the outcome) of the corrupted values, was seen as a danger to the moral values of public regarding sexuality.<sup>331</sup> In several articles, communists were accused of being immoral in sexual matters. In an article published in Milliyet, Russians, who were equated to communists, were portrayed as sexually immoral and irresponsible people. The article narrated a story from a hospital in Russia, in which single mothers were receiving special care. In the article, it was stated that out-of-wedlock births were not a stain (leke) in Russia. 332 Communism and communist threat was portrayed as a threat against the Turkish family, Turkish values and political system of Turkey. Moreover, this accusation was not only limited to the public discourse in Turkey. It also appeared in countries such as the United States and Australia, where the Turkish press looked and translated pieces from.<sup>333</sup> The Soviet Russia was named as the first and foremost country from which communist influences spread to the rest of the world. Inner threats of

For a detailed discussion about conceptualizing of "sexual illnesses," see: "3.5. Presentation, content, and forms of *sexual manners*"

May, *Homeward Bound*, 13, 91-93, 111. May discusses the relationship which was linked sexuality and communism by the anti-communists views in the USA during the Cold World War. May stated that communism was associated with "being immoral" and "pervert." Moreover, communism was considered as a threat to the values of the American society.

<sup>332 &</sup>quot;Demirperde gerisinde hayat," *Milliyet*, 05.08.1951. "birlik reisi, annemin bu sualine cevap olarak gayri meşru doğumun, rusyada bir *leke* sayılmadığı... izahatını vermişti." (italic mine)

<sup>333</sup> May, Homeward Bound.

communism were listed of being immoral, even pervert.<sup>334</sup> On *Kara Dayı*, an anticommunist magazine, reported that some fiftythree fools and perverts communists tried to establish a part stealthily.<sup>335</sup> Yıldırmaz suggested that the "fool and pervert" label was meant to display communists as unskillful, ill-minded, and immoral in order to disempower them with humiliation.<sup>336</sup> Additionally, "pervert" attribution defined communists as subjects who are "not-normal." Hence, they can not be included in a *normal* society due to their sexual attitudes and acts. Similar to other problems, providing *sexual manners* to the public was suggested as the fundamental solution to protect the moral values of individuals. Moreover, this suggestion has also appeared in other countries as a part of communism discussions.<sup>337</sup>

## 2.3.3. Sexual Manners for Individual Purposes

According to Edward Podolsky, a well-knowm American psychologist, sexuality is an essential component of physical and psychological health of individuals.<sup>338</sup> Therefore, sexuality and sexual manners - a collection of

Fethi Tevetoğlu, *Faşist Yok, Komünist Var* (İstanbul: Komünizmle Mücadele Yayınları, 1962), 17. Quoted from Aylin Özman and Aslı Yazıcı Yakın, "Anti-Komünist Fantaziler: Doğa, Toplum, Cinsellik," in *Türk Sağı: Mitler, Fetişler, Düşman İmgeleri*, ed. İnci Özkan Kerestecioğlu and Güven Gürkan Öztan (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2012), 109. "Komünistlerin geçmişleri araştırılınca görülür ki, ya türlü ahlaksızlık yüzünden okuldan kovulmuştur... Cinsi sapıktır, sevdiğinin, ailenin ve toplumun reddine uğramıştır." David Hilliard, "Church, family and sexuality in Australia in the 1950s'," *Australian Historical Studies* 27, 109 (1997), 133-134, 142, 144.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Komünist partisi kuracaklarmış," *Kara Dayı*, 07.04.1948. Quoted from Sinan Yıldırmaz, "Nefretin ve Korkunun Rengi: "Kızıl,"" in *Türk Sağı: Mitler, Fetişler, Düşman İmgeleri*, ed. İnci Özkan Kerestecioğlu and Güven Gürkan Öztan (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2012), 69. "İstanbul'da sayısı elli üçü bulan bazı salak ve *sapıklar* el altından bir komonist partisi kurmaya kalkmışlardı." (italic mine)

<sup>336</sup> Yıldırmaz, "Nefretin ve Korkunun Rengi: "Kızıl,"" 69.

Hilliard, "Church, family and sexuality in Australia in the 1950s'," 133. In Australia, "lack of sexual education was seen as a source for the effects of communism that could corrupt our young people. They can cause deterioration in the morale of their young people."

Dr. Edward Podolsky, "Tenasüli Hayatın Mekanizması," *Seksoloji*, 13 (1950), 37. "Cinsiyet meselesi, insanın ruhen ve bedenen huzur içinde olması, bilhassa evlilik hayatını

knowledge, manners, and skills – were tied to the well-being and happiness of individuals. Sargent, the writer of a marriage manual, stated that he wrote the book to help future spouses. Also, he wanted to bring happiness to the marriage life of the current spouses.339 Marriage was presented as an institution that should be protected not only for the good of individuals. However, the intactness of marriage was defined as a prominent requisition for the public good. In an article, parents were warned about the possible dangers of lacking "marriage manners" (izdivaç terbiyesi) for the happiness of their children. The writer stated that the rise in divorce cases in Europe and America proved that marriage is no longer a binding force. He asked the parents to guide their children to prevent this social tragedy. The writer shared his observations about the efforts of parents to prepare their children for a particular profession by providing them with a proper education. He added that, unfortunately, parents did not put sufficient efforts to prepare their children for a successful marriage life.<sup>340</sup> The writer held the parents responsible for the future well-being of society by asking them to prepare their children for their individual happiness and to prevent divorces – a social tragedy. In the coming paragraphs, he listed particular topics such as the realities of married life, the role and duties of the spouses, economic management of the household, and the sexual manners of the spouses that the parents should teach to ensure a happy marriage for their children. He

muvaffakiyetle yürütebilmesinin başlıca amillerinden biridir. Bu sebeple erkek ve kadınların bu hususta gerekli bilgileri edinmiş olmaları lüzumlu ve zaruridir."

W.E. Sargent, Evlilik Hayatında Daha Bahtiyar Olmanın Yolları, trans. Ömer Rıza Doğrul (Istanbul: Arif Bolat Kitabevi, 1942), 7. "Bu kitabı evlenmeyi düşünenlere yardım etmek; evlenmiş olanlara evlilik hayatını bahtiyarlığa kavuşturmak için, bu işi dürüst bir kafa ile kavramak ve ona dair bilinmesi gereken herşeyi öğrenmek icap ettiğini belirtmek için yazıyorum."

F.W. Rawland, "İzdivaç Terviyesi," *Seksoloji*, 32 (1951), 1. "... Avrupa ve Amerikada boşanma nisbetinin çok yükselmesi, evliliğin artık bağlayıcı bir kuvvet olmaktan çıktığını gösteriyor. Bu büyük sosyal trajedya, bütün ana babalara çocuklarına daha akıllıca yol göstermeye çalışmalarını ihtar etse gerektirir. ....eğer ana babalar, çocuklarını şu veya bu mesleğe hazırlamak için gayret sarfettikleri kadar, muvaffakkıyetli bir izdivaç hayatının icaplarını onlara öğretmek ve aşılamak hususunda da emek sarfetseler, gençlerimizin daha mesut ve istikrarlı bir hayat yaşamlarına da hizmet etmiş olurlardı."

added that the reluctance of parents to provide sexual manners (education) to their children causes the termination of their children's marriages.<sup>341</sup>

Different from the 1930s, marriage and sexuality were promoted not only for the reproduction of future generations. However, sexuality in marriage was encouraged for healthy marriages during the 1950s. One of the early marriage manuals stated that "the primary purpose of marriage is not only procreation. It is also enriching for their personalities, which is only possible when they love each other physically and spiritually." In Turkey, public preoccupation with the well-being of marriage became a relatively new phenomenon in the late 1940s and 1950s. Koçak stated that marital sexuality emerged in the 1930s in the publication. However, the 1950s witnessed the widespread distribution of sexual manners for marriage due to its periodic appearance in popular publishing.

Naşid Erez referred to Article 35 of the constitution that defines the family as the fundamental unit that requires marriage as the prerequisite step.<sup>345</sup> Accordingly, Irmak and many other writers referred to marriage as

F.W. Rawland, "İzdivaç Terviyesi," *Seksoloji*, 32 (1951), 3. "Bugün cinsiyet hakkındaki bilgisizliği müsamaha ile karşılama devri de geçmiştir. Artık cinsi sahadaki cehalet yüzünden bir çok evliliklerin yıkılıp perişan olmasına göz yumulmamalıdır. Fakat buna ragmen yine de çocuklarına hayatın ve evliliğin bu tarafı hakkında sıhhatlı bir terbiye ve bilgi veren ana babaların sayısı çok azdır."

W.E. Sargent, *Evlilik Hayatında Daha Bahtiyar Olmanın Yolları*, trans. Ömer Rıza Doğrul (Istanbul: Arif Bolat Kitabevi, 1942), 47. "Cinsi münasebetin hedefi yalnız yavrulamak mıdır? Evlenen erkek ve kadının ilk hedefi yalnız çocuk sahibi olmak değildir. Birbirlerini maddeten ve manen sevmek dolayısıyla, karı kocanın şahsiyetlerini de zenginleştirmeleridir"

Although it was a popular subject during the 1920s in Britain and the United States, see: Porter and Hall, *The Facts of Life*, 208-211. Nancy F. Cott, "1920'lerin Modern Kadını, Amerikan Tarzı," in *Kadınların Tarihi: Yirminci Yüzyılda Kültürel bir Kimliğe Doğru*, *Vol. V*, ed. Georges Duby and Michelle Perrot (Istanbul: Türkiye İş Bankası Yayınları, 2005), 80-93.

<sup>344</sup> Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality," 215-217.

Naşid Erez, "Sosyal ve Biyolojik Açılardan Flirt: Endişeye Lüzum Yok," *Milliyet*, 06.01.1963. The same article was also published as: Naşid Erez, "Sosyal ve Biyolojik Açılardan Tahlil: Flört Faydalıdır," in *Türkiye'de Cinsiyet Problemi*, ed. Turhan Aytul (İstanbul: Varlık Yayınevi, 1964). 62.

the primary regulating institution for sexuality.<sup>346</sup> In return, sexuality was discussed as an essential aspect of married life.<sup>347</sup> Making sexual life more satisfactory for spouses, particularly for women<sup>348</sup> turned into a strategy to preserve the critical regulative tool - *marriage*.<sup>349</sup> In this way, sexuality was practiced, taught, and kept in a controlled institution where proper roles and behaviors were defined for individuals.

Marriage manuals contained information about the functioning of sexuality and the roles of spouses. <sup>350</sup> On the one hand, marriage manuals provided detailed information and descriptions regarding the sexuality between the spouses. Sargent stated in an early marriage manual in 1942 that "acquiring information about sexual intercourse, which is the most significant part of marriages, strengthens the happiness and harmony of the family."<sup>351</sup> In another article, the reason for marital fights was diagnosed as a lack of sexual harmony between the spouses.<sup>352</sup> A writer of *Seksoloji* stated that individuals need sexual manners and correct sexual knowledge to

Ezgi Sarıtaş and Serpil Sancar argued that there was an effort to regulate families in the 1950s. Sarıtaş has even argued that Seksoloji came into being as an intervention tool to regulate families. Sarıtaş, "Seksoloji: 1945-1955 arası Türkiye'de Cinsel Terbiye," 59. Sancar, *Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti*, 234. However, it is important to note that during the same time period, there was an attempt to differentiate procreation from sexuality. In other words, unlike in the former period, sexuality was seen as a part of marriage without the prerequisite of reproduction. In the articles in Seksoloji and in the marriage manuals, when writers talked about informing spouses about sexuality, the word "marriage" was used instead of "family." For manuals: *Mükemmel İzdivacın Şartları* (1950) and *İşte Evlendiniz* (1950).

<sup>347</sup> Michael Gordon and Penelope J. Shankweiler, "Different Equals Less: Female Sexuality in Recent Marriage Manuals," *Journal of Marriage and Family Sexism in Family Studies* 33, 3 (1971), 460.

<sup>348</sup> Christina Simmons, *Making Marriage Modern: Women's Sexuality from the Progressive Era to World War II* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2009), 190.

<sup>349</sup> Foucault, The History of Sexuality, Vol. 1, 83-85.

<sup>350</sup> Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality."

W.E. Sargent, *Evlilik Hayatında Daha Bahtiyar Olmanın Yolları*, trans. Ömer Rıza Doğrul (Istanbul: Arif Bolat Kitabevi, 1942), 94. "Evlilik hayatının en mühim fiili olan cinsi mukarenet hakkında bilgi sahibi olmak, ailenin saadetini sağlamlar ve aile hayatının âhengini kuvvetlendirir." Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality," 215.

<sup>352</sup> Clifford R. Adams, "Niçin Kavga ediyoruz?," Seksoloji, (1951), 50.

build a solid family. Otherwise, there would be anti-social and psychopathological consequences.<sup>353</sup>

"Sexual manners" was presented as an informative tool to increase the sexual pleasure of spouses in marriage. Popular magazines included recommendations to increase the quality of sexuality in marriage. Shadin Gazetesi translated an article that announced a new course on marriage and sexuality given by Dr. Keys at California University. Although it can be considered a detail, the news displayed the increasing popularity of the content, even in the academic world. The articles stated that sexual satisfaction is essential and expected by the spouses in a marriage. Doğan Özbay stated that both parties - husband and wife - should enjoy sexual satisfaction for a happy marriage.

Satisfactory sexuality was connected with the high physical attraction between the spouses. Moreover, physical attraction was considered a need and necessity for happy marriages.<sup>358</sup> In an article published in Milliyet, the unhappiness of American women was seen as a result of the physiological incompatibility between wife and husband. According to Abraham Stone, a well-known sexologist at the Margaret Sanger Institute, more than six million women in the United States find the physiological functions of married life repulsive, which is reflected in the rising number of divorce cases.<sup>359</sup> An improving step toward female pleasure was considered as informing wives and husbands about the functioning of sexuality.

<sup>353</sup> Faruk Akbeğ "Seksoloji Dört Yaşına Girerken," *Seksoloji*, 37 (1952), 3. "Sağlam bir aile kurmak için bireylerin cinsel terbiyeye, doğru cinsel bilgiye ihtiyaçları vardır, aksi takdirde anti-sosyal ve psikopatolojik sonuçlar doğacaktır."

<sup>354</sup> Dr. Edward Podolsky, "Karı Koca Arasında Cinsel Uygunluk," Seksoloji, 14 (1950), 14-17.

<sup>355</sup> *Kadın Gazetesi*, 348 (1953), 7. Quoted from Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality," 161.

<sup>356 &</sup>quot;Aşkı Yaşatın," İkimiz, 4, 01.02.1955, 34.

Doğan Özbay, "Evlilikte Aşkı Muhafaza," İkimiz, 3, 03.01.1955, 25.

Ericksen, Kiss and Tell: Surveying Sex in the Twentieth Century, 3. "Saadette Cinsi Münasebetin Rolü," Kadın Dünyası 1, 2 (1958), 6. "Sevişme Sanatı," Kadın Dünyası 1, 2 (1958), 10. "Samimiyet," Kadın Ansiklopedisi, 10 (1961), 156.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Amerikan kadını bedbaht mıdır?," *Milliyet*, 17.05.1950. "... hiç şüphe yok ki, Amerikan kadını iyi yiyor, iyi giyiniyor, oturduğu yer rahattır. Dünyanın en paralı ve rahat kadınıdır. Buna rağmen, mesut değildir. Binlerce kadın, ruh doktorlarına akın etmektedirler. Bu

Sexual manners does not only define the limits of sexuality.<sup>360</sup> Because sexuality was regarded as a fundamental aspect of individuals, <sup>361</sup> sexual manners defined the abstract characteristics of feminity and masculinity.<sup>362</sup> Proper roles for husband and wife were described by the articles about sexual manners. The magazines and manuals contained articles, lists, and interviews that described the proper characteristics of a husband and a wife. Moreover, they provided information about the nature of the relationship between the spouses.<sup>363</sup> The descriptions of the proper feminity and masculinity contained the proper sexual acts, which were assigned based on their sexes. The sexual behavior for man and woman was differentiated<sup>364</sup> and constructed in a gendered form.<sup>365</sup> Sexual manners as a discourse re-conceptualized the sexual differences among women and men based on their sexual acts.<sup>366</sup> Re-conceptualizing feminity was a critical intervention to regulate womanhood as their lives and roles changed following WWII.<sup>367</sup> Sexual attitudes during the 1950s were in a state of

bedbahtlığın başı, karı ile koca arasında, fizyolojik anlaşmazlıktır. Margaret Sanger enstitüsünün tetkiklerine bakılırsa, Amerikan kadınlarının dörtte biri soğuktur. Doktor Abraham stone'a göre bunun manası şudur: 6 milyondan fazla Amerikan kadını evlilik hayatının gerektirdiği fizyolojik fonksiyonları tiksinti ile karşılamaktadır. Boşanma davalarında bu vaziyet apaçık meydana çıkmıştır."

- Katie Sutton and Kirsten Leng, "Forum Introduction: Rethinking the Gendered History of Sexology," *Gender & History* 31, 2 (2019), 256–265.
- 361 Brooke Wagner, "Becoming a Sexual Being: Overcoming Constraints on Female Sexuality," *Sexualities* 12, 3 (2009), 292.
- 362 Hanne Blank, *Bekaretin El Değmemiş Tarihi*, trans. Emek Ergün (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2007), 355.
- 363 See the "Chapter 4: Marriage" for a detailed discussion.
- Angela McRobbie, "More! New Sexualities in Girls' and Women's Magazines," in *In the Culture Society: Art, Fashion and Popular Music* (London: Routledge, 1999). McRobbie argues that sexual representations in (lifestyle) magazines differentiated from the past. The sexual acts those have been considered appropriate for women have breached the limits which, in return, have influenced the perception of gendered sexuality. Melissa Tyler, "Managing between the Sheets: Lifestyle Magazines and the Management of Sexuality in Everyday Life," *Sexualities* 7 (2004), 92.
- 365 Ericksen, *Kiss and Tell: Surveying Sex in the Twentieth Century*, 4. Thomson, "Moral Rhetoric and Public Health Pragmatism," 45.
- 366 Jackson and Scott, *Theorizing Sexuality*, 50.
- 367 Betty Friedan, *The Feminine Mystique* (New York: Norton, 1963).

transition, particularly for women. Proper womanhood and female sexuality were portrayed in the written materials.

One of the most vital threats to the existence and sustainability of a *good* marriage was seen as divorce. Divorce was not only discussed on an individual level and as a relationship between a wife and a husband. It was seen as a threat to the general public, which was underlined with analogies such as disasters and epidemics.<sup>368</sup> Therefore, taking steps to keep marriages from ending in divorce has become a necessary step for the well-being of both individuals and the public.

Sexual intimacy was regarded as the primary bond for a good marriage in marriage manuals.<sup>369</sup> Therefore, pleasure and mutually satisfying sexual practice was seen as a base for happy marriages and as a solution for divorce.<sup>370</sup> In a series about different countries around the world, the writer stated that the malfunction in sexual life was one of the reasons for marital conflict.<sup>371</sup> In the first issue of the Gazete Magazin, the editorial piece stated that the magazine aimed to inform the public about sexuality. Sexual knowledge provided by the magazine and prepared by the international authorities (doctors), would not only prepare individuals for the family institution. That knowledge would also prevent individuals from divorce.<sup>372</sup> Unhappy marriages, which were described with the phrases such as "the

<sup>&</sup>quot;Sinema yıldızları arasında boşanma salgını," Milliyet, 13.11.1954. "Almanya'da Kadınlar Karnavalı ve Türkler: Karnavaldan sonra her yerde boşanma salgını başgösteriyor," Milliyet, 20.02.1964.

Christina Simmons, Making Marriage Modern: Women's Sexuality: from the Progressive Era to World War II (New York: Oxford University Press, 2009, 190. Dr. Le Mon Clark, İşte Evlendiniz, trans. by Muzaffer Aşkın, third edition (İstanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1951), 65. "Evlilik her şeyden önce bir cinsi bağlılıktır."

<sup>370</sup> Lawrence Gould, "Kocanızı Mesud Edebiliyor musunuz?" Seksoloji, (1950), 18. Gordon and Shankweiler, "Different Equals Less: Female Sexuality in Recent Marriage Manuals," 461-462.

John Upton, "Baştanbaşa bütün dünya, amerikada her isteği temin edilen kadın," *Milliyet*, 01.09.1950. "cinsi hayatın aksaklığı geçimsizlik nedenlerinden birisidir."

<sup>372</sup> Koçer, "Demokrat Parti Döneminde Kadın," 109. Dilara Nergishan Koçer stated that Gazete Magazin explained the reasons about publishing sexual information in their pages in its editorial piece of first issue. According to Koçer, Gazete Magazin did provide sexual knowledge to its readers not only to contribute to the family formation process. But also, the magazine aimed to prevent divorce.

husbands, who were busted with their mistresses or wives who left their husbands and run away," were narrated as a result of unsatisfied sexual pleasures in marriage.<sup>373</sup>

The lack of harmony in sexuality and marriages between the spouses was mainly grounded in ignorance about sexuality. In one article published by Kadın Gazetesi, Dr. Hafız Cemal argued that the increase in divorce is due to a lack of knowledge about sexual life. He added that there had been discussions on sexuality in Britain and America for an extended period, whereas in Turkey there had not been any developments on this matter.<sup>374</sup> Karçal and Uraz stated that the changes in our traditions, social life, and ideas would also influence our sexual life. Importance of sexual manners was underlined in order to promote and *sustain* marriages.<sup>375</sup> It was thought that sexual manners could prevent the incompatibility between spouses in sexual life, which was given as one of the reasons for divorce. Informed spouses were considered a solution to sexual disharmony and, consequently, for divorce.<sup>376</sup> Notably, ignorance about sexual manners among wives was designated as a thread against the marriage. 377 Besides sexual harmony, monotony in marriage was counted as a factor that could lead the spouses to seek change outside of marriage life.<sup>378</sup> It was recommended that sexual acts should not be turned into a duty to avoid monotony in marriage.<sup>379</sup> To

111

<sup>373 &</sup>quot;Mesut Olmak İster misiniz?" Gazete Magazin, 7 (1957), 3.

<sup>374</sup> Dr. Hafiz Cemal, *Kadın Gazetesi*, 309 (1953), 6.

<sup>375</sup> Selçuk Karçal and Kayıhan Uraz "Türkiye'de cinsiyet meselesi XII: Boşanmalar," *Seksoloji*, 47 (1953): 46-48. "geleneklerimizde, sosyal hayatımızda da ve düşüncelerimizde vuku bulan tahavvüllerin seksüel hayatımızda da derin tesirler icra edeceği muhakkak olduğundan evliliği idame ve evlenmeyi teşvik bakımından cinsi terbiyenin önemi kendiğinden belirmektedir."

<sup>376 &</sup>quot;Karı Koca Anlaşmazlıkları ve Bunu Önleyecek Çareler," *Milliyet*, 06.11.1951. "birçok boşanma davalarının sebebini teşkil etmiş olan cinsi anlaşmazlığın kanunda yeri olmazda da, buna mani olmanın en iyi çaresi cinsi terbiyedir."

For similar discussion in the 1920s and 1930s, see: Christina Simmons, *Making Marriage Modern: Women's Sexuality: from the Progressive Era to World War II* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2009), 144. For other reasons such as frigidity, see, 121.

Doğan Özbay, "Evlilikte Aşkı Muhafaza," *İkimiz*, 3, 03.01.1955, 25. "Yeknesak bir evlilik hayatında bu hal karı-kocayı evlilik dışında değişiklik aramaya sevketmektedir."

<sup>379 &</sup>quot;Aşkı Yaşatın," İkimiz, 4, 01.02.1955, 34.

address the problem caused by appalling sexuality, the books defined new roles for husband and wife in marriage, which were enriched with suggestions to improve their sexual experiences.

Sexual manners for conception, but also contraception ...

"Sexual manners" provided information about the reproduction process, from insemination and pregnancy to giving birth, to educate the public about healthy reproduction. Healthy reproduction was assessed with reference to the health of the offspring, which should be protected from STDs and hereditary diseases.<sup>380</sup> Particularly, couples became the target audience to inform about the operating system of the reproductive organs either for promoting or prohibiting births. Information to ease and expedite impregnation was more often published in sexual manners articles and manuals, whereas birth control methods were discussed more subtly at the beginning of the 1950s.<sup>381</sup> The well-known Marie Stope's book, Art of Love, was already published and in circulation during the 1950s, which covered subjects about birth control alongside women's sexuality. Seksoloji publishing published eleven manuals about sexuality, procreation, and impregnation. Three of eleven manuals<sup>382</sup> contributed to public knowledge about birth control. 200 Sual 200 Cevap (200 Question 200 Answer), İşte Evlendiniz (Now You have Got Married), and Doğumu Tanzim (Regulating Birth) contained detailed information about birth control methods.383

Prof. Dr. Ferit Hakkı Saymen, "Kanunen Evlenmeye Mani olan Hastalıklar," *Seksoloji*, 5 (1949), 27. "Ailenin sıhhatini korumak ve zayıf, mariz, dejenere nesillerin üremesine mani olmak ve neticede ferdin, ailenin ve cemiyetin saadetini sağlamak düşüncesile birtakım bedeni ve akli arızalara müptela olanların evlenmelerini yasak etmek düşünülmüştür."

Dr. Burhan Öncel, "Niçin çocuğunuz olmuyor?" *Seksoloji*, 11 (1950), 28-31. "Gebelik Hıfzısıhhası," *Seksoloji*, 6 (1949), 25-28. Dr. C. H. Davis, "Doğum Hakkında 40 Sual," *Seksoloji*, 8 (1949), 41-46. Prof. Dr. E.P. Pantin, "Çocuk nasıl doğar?" *Seksoloji*, 9 (1950), 16-19.

<sup>382 &</sup>quot;Kudretinizi Koruyunuz," "Mükemmel İzdivaç," "Aşk Sanatı," "Evlenmeden Önce" and "Kadın Evlilik"

For contraception, see: Le Mon Clark, *İşte Evlendiniz* (İstanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1950), 54-64.

Among these manuals, "Doğumu Tanzim" (Regulating Birth) has a particular place, which was published by Seksoloji Publishing in August 1952.<sup>384</sup> Muzaffer Aşkın stated in the preface that "Doğumu Tanzim" (Regulating Birth) aims to "enlighten the public scientifically about procreation and infertility." <sup>385</sup> He clearly stated that they did not intend to inform the physicians about the diagnosis and treatment of infertility. Instead, they "aimed to instruct the public about the ways of protecting themselves from infertility and about the possibilities of self-treatment."386 The text provides information about male and female reproductive organs, the reasons and treatments for infertility, methods for impregnation, and calendars for women to follow their ovulation and possible insemination periods. "Doğumu Tanzim" (Regulating Birth) was advertised as a reference book that can help to regulate a couple's sexual life if they do not prefer to have a child, whether they are "newly married" or if they already have children.<sup>387</sup> The manual and its advertisements stated out loud that this manual aimed to inform couples about a birth control method – the calendar method. Between 1948 and 1952, more than twenty articles in the magazine Seksoloji discussed controlling births. In these articles or manuals, the

N.P., *Doğumu Tanzim*, trans. Muzaffer Aşkın (İstanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1952). The manual has not stated a writer name at the front page. However, the names of the books were sıralanmış at the first page of the manual. *Doğumu Tanzim* is a collection and edition of three known books of the era. The text was edited from Fertility in Men, Robert Sherman Hoskiss; A marriage manual Abraham Stone, La Procreation Volontaire Dr. De Mars and Yves De Kerlan. Unfortunately, there is not a clear statement which part was taken from which book.

<sup>385</sup> Muzaffer Aşkın, "Giriş," in *Doğumu Tanzim*, trans. Muzaffer Aşkın (İstanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1952), 6.

<sup>386</sup> Muzaffer Aşkın, "Giriş," in *Doğumu Tanzim*, trans. Muzaffer Aşkın (İstanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1952), 7.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Doğumu Tanzim," *Seksoloji*, 42 (1952). "Belki yeni evlendiniz ve birbirinize iyice alışabilmek, evlliğin ilk buhranlarını rahatça atlatabilmek için hiç olmazsa bir yıl çocuk yapmak istemiyorsunuz. Yahut 6-7 yıldır evlisiniz ve şimdiye kadar 2 çocuğunuz oldu. Onlara kafi derecede bakım gösterebilmek için 4-5 sene başka çocuk yapmayı istemiyorsunuz." (Maybe you are newly married. In order to get along with eachother and to pass the obstacles of the marriage easily, you do not want to make child at least for one year. Or you are married for 6-7 years and you have already 2 children. In order to care them sufficiently, you do not want to make any other child for another 4-5 years.)

content about contraception was justified with the reason of protecting the joy and well-being of happiness through avoiding any unwanted pregnancies due to legitimate reasons such as untimely, early or unprepared pregnancies or economic insufficiencies of the couples.

Additionally, *Seksoloji* published parts of Abraham and Hannah Stone's well-known book, "*A marriage manual*," in 1953.<sup>388</sup> In the series (which will be discussed in the "birth control chapter"), Abraham and Hannah Stone covered the practice of reproduction, from the conception process to the possible conception methods. Even though it was against the Public Hygiene Law of 1930 to disseminate knowledge about contraception, detailed information about birth control was given under the topic of sexual manners.

At the beginning of the 1960s, sexual manners was introduced as a necessary tool to manage individuals' reproductive capacities, particularly for young people and couples with bold letters. In 1962, Nașit Erez conducted a study with 1857 high-school graduates who came to apply to Istanbul University. The questionnaire was applied to 558 female and 1289 male students. He formed the questionnaire under three titles: "How is a child produced," "How does the birth of a child happen" and "how does a female produce an egg?" According to Erez, the survey results displayed that these young people did not have average knowledge about the reproductive process. According to Erez, the lack of knowledge among young people resulted from a lack of sexual manners. In concluding remarks, he noted that "it is necessary to provide sex education starting, at least, with high school if we want to control births and do not want to have children accidentally."389 In the first issue of Milliyet Anketi on male and female sexuality, sexual education was presented as a tool for controlling births.

.

Dr. Hannah and Abraham Stone, "Evlilik Rehberi: VI-Doğumu Tanzim ve Ailenin Planlanması," trans. Muzaffer Aşkın, *Seksoloji*, 55 (1953): 8-12. First chapter was at the 55th issue. It ended at the 59th issue.

<sup>389 &</sup>quot;Üniversite öğrencileri arasında yapılan: bir cinsel anketin neticeleri açıklandı." *Milliyet*, 15.06.1962. "tesadüfen çocuk sahibi olmak istemiyorsak, doğumları herhangi şekilde kontrol etmek istiyorsak, en az lisede başlayan bir cinsel eğitime yer vermeliyiz."

In 1963, *Resimli Seksoloji Ansiklopedisi* (Illustrated Sexology Encyclopedia) was prepared by Naşit Erez, Sadi Irmak, Mansur Sayın and Kemal Çağlar and published by Arkın Kitabevi. In the book's preface, Naşit Erez explains the book's aim as "to expand the limits on reproductive knowledge in Turkey." The encyclopedia provided necessary knowledge on sexuality and reproduction, saving readers from having to consult a doctor. It was created as an educational and self-help book that demonstrates how to regulate sexuality and, also, reproductive practices.

The relationship between sexual manners and reproduction evolved and became more visible in the late 1950s and early 1960s. Sexual manners covered more boldly information about birth control in the 1960s. Citizens were asked to *control their sexualities*, regulate their reproductive practices and *control their births* with the help of knowledge on sexual manners. Interestingly enough, the actors who create sexual knowledge have been at the frontline of the birth control movement both in Turkey and worldwide. The translated manuals and articles by authors such as Marie Stopes, Hannah, and Abraham Stone aimed to contribute to the "sexual manners" discourse that became visible with the emergence of birth control discussions during the 1960s. Naşid Erez, again from Turkey, who brought the importance of "sexual manners" to the public's attention, became one of the leading figures in the birth control struggle during the first part of the 1960s.

# 2.3.3. "We are not dirty."

The writers of sexual manners continued their efforts to produce and disseminate knowledge about sexuality. However, throughout the process, they tried to walk a tightrope between making sexual manners accessible and not crossing the line towards obscene publication (*müstehcen neşriyat*). On the one hand, they defended sexual openness for the sake of individuals'

115

Naşit Erez, "Önsöz," in *Resimli Seksoloji Ansiklopedisi*, ed. Naşit Erez, Sadi Irmak, Mansur Sayın, Çevik Alp, Kemal Çağlar, Turgut Metiner, Naci Berkay (İstanbul: Arkın Kitabevi, 1963).

<sup>391 &</sup>quot;Türker Acaroğlu, Yeni Yayınlar: Arkın Yayınları," *Milliyet*, 27.11.1963.

and the public's well-being.<sup>392</sup> On the other hand, they tried to avoid being a part of "dirty publishing." The writers and editors of Seksoloji tried to display their differences from obscene literature. Akbeğ defined the journal as a scientific, serious, and objective publication. In parallel, he assessed other journals as publications that incited young people's feelings to sell more copies.<sup>393</sup> Erdoğan Meto stated that the primary concern of obscene publication was commercial. According to Meto, individuals with ill intentions can use obscene publications to make a profit. They would even provoke animalistic (behimi) feelings to earn more money. 394 Gökay emphasized the importance of determining the proper limits between obscene publications (müstehcen neşriyat) and scientific publishing. He defined pornography as the publication of methods of satisfying sexual needs.<sup>395</sup> The writers of *Seksoloji* were particularly cruel towards obscene literature and pornography. One of the crucial concerns of the writers and publishers working on sexual manners was being not-distinguishable enough from dirty publishing. They were pretty worried about being confused by pornographic publishing. According to Cocks, the literature on sexual manners reached its readers through similar channels to those used by pornography.<sup>396</sup> Hence, the writers of Seksoloji tried to highlight the differences in their articles.

In the first volume of the second album, the editorial team of *Seksoloji* shared their startup story with the readers. They stated that their friends and acquaintances became worried and hesitated due to their decision to publish a sexology magazine since they are *clean* people.<sup>397</sup> In the following

392 "Anketimiz - Peyami Safa," Seksoloji. no. 9 (1949), 5.

<sup>393</sup> Faruk Akbeğ, "Zararlı Cinsi Neşriyat," Seksoloji, 55 (1953), 14.

<sup>394</sup> Erdoğan Meto, "Müstehcen Nedir?" Seksoloji, 18 (1950), 17.

<sup>395</sup> Fahrettin Kerim Gökay, "Cinsi Terbiye Pornografi Değildir," Seksoloji, 4 (1949), 8.

Harry G. Cocks, "Saucy Stories: Pornography, Sexology and the Marketing of Sexual Knowledge in Britain, c.1918-70," *Social History* 29, 4 (2004): 465-484. Cocks particularly underlined that at the beginning of the century, pornography and sexology were using same channels.

<sup>397 &</sup>quot;İkinci Cildimize Başlarken," *Seksoloji*, 7 (1949), 1. "Bizi; temiz kalmayı ve yurt hizmetinde çalışmayı gaye edinmiş insanlar olarak tanıyan dostlarımız; aşinalarımız; bir gün bir cinsî bilgiler mecmuası çıkarmaya karar verdiğimizi işittikleri zaman ya üzüldüler veya şüpheye düştüler."

sentence, the publishers added that they understood their hesitation since there were publications misusing the subject (sexology). <sup>398</sup> The publishers associated pornographic literature with dirtiness, while they identified themselves with cleanness. Since the first publication of Seksoloji, the publishers have used various tools to emphasize their differences from pornographic literature. They have not only used their editor's column to explain themselves. But they have also taken the opinions of the public figures through which they underlined the differences between them and "the other" literature. They took the support of the era's opinion leaders with the Anketimiz column. In the Anketimiz columns, the publishers of Seksoloji have given space to the public figures where the experts underlined the journal's contribution to society. On the other hand, they have constantly warned publishers to avoid similarities between their journals and pornographic materials. The opinion leaders also asked the editorial team to be alert about any slippage toward an obscene publication in terms of language or content.<sup>399</sup>

Despite their efforts, critics on sexual manners literature came from different parts of the political spectrum. <sup>400</sup> In *Büyük Doğu*, the literature on sex education was blamed for "teaching prostitution." For a sexual manners book cover, it was stated that "the ones who are curious about how to conduct prostitution under the mask of alleged scientific knowledge, please,

<sup>398 &</sup>quot;İkinci Cildimize Başlarken," *Seksoloji*, 7 (1949), 1. "Üzülmelerine; şüphelenmelerine hak verdik: çünkü bu mevzuun bütün istismar imkânlarını son hudutlarına kadar denemiş ve denemekte olan çeşitli neşriyat ortada duruyordu; bizim de aynı sahaya el atmamız zihinlerde haklı olarak bir istifham [soru] uyandıracak ve teşebbüsümüzde şüpheli motifler arayacaklardı."

<sup>&</sup>quot;Anketimiz - Fahrettin Kerim Gökay," Seksoloji, 2 (1949), 6. "Anketimiz - Şekip Tunç,"
Seksoloji, 3 (1949), 10-11. "Anketimiz - Necmettin Rıfat Yarar," Seksoloji, 4 (1949), 6-7.
"Anketimiz - Kazım İsmail Gürkan," Seksoloji, 5 (1949), 4-5. "Anketimiz - Şinasi Hakkı
Erel," Seksoloji, 6 (1949), 6-7.

Janice M. Irvine, *Disorders of Desire: Sexuality and Gender in Modern American Sexology* (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 2005), 237. Cocks mentions that even in some cases, the sexology writers were prosecuted and penalized by the authorities. Harry G. Cocks, "Saucy stories: pornography, sexology and the marketing of sexual knowledge in Britain, c.1918-70," *Social History* 29, 4 (2004), 465-484.

welcome!"<sup>401</sup> At a relatively later date, Hamdi Varoğlu criticized the explicit language on sexuality in the newspapers. He stated that the children could have easy access, which could harm their manners.<sup>402</sup> The efforts to distinguish themselves from dirty publishing did not end with the Seksoloji journal. Another journal of the era, *Gazete Magazin*, announced that they would be providing sexual knowledge to their readers, but without any illustrations or pictures of being provocative.<sup>403</sup> Since the communication of sexuality was held by images (pictures and illustrations) since the beginning of the 20th century,<sup>404</sup> their preference of not-using pictures could be seen as a precaution to differentiate themselves from pornographic publishing.

Critics regarding the dissemination of sexual knowledge have targeted not only journals focusing on sexual manners, sexual knowledge, or illustrative content. They have even reached a popular newspaper of the era, *Milliyet*, to prepare a survey. At a relatively late date, in March 1962, *Milliyet* announced that they aimed to organize a survey "to understand the sexual behaviors of Turkish society so that they could provide an enlightening report to the decision-makers about the specifics of the lives of women and men." *Milliyet* published a detailed questionnaire to understand the sexual practices of women and men. According to the *Milliyet* writers, the questionnaire attracted a lot of attention. Hence, *Milliyet* published the questionnaire a second time with an instructive text one week after the first publication. Abdi İpekçi, the editor of *Milliyet*, stated that they "identifying individuals' sexual practices because sexuality is one of

401 "Sözüm ona ilim ve fenni bilgi maskesi altında fuhuş edebiyatının nasıl yapılabileceğini merak eden buyursun!" *Büyük Doğu*, 02.01.1948, 3.

<sup>402</sup> Hamdi Varoğlu, "Cinsi Terbiye," Cumhuriyet, 21.09.1962.

<sup>403 &</sup>quot;Aşk Dersleri," *Gazete Magazin* 2, 1 (1957), 2

<sup>404</sup> Lisa Z. Sigel, "Filth in the Wrong People's Hands: Postcards and the Expansion of Pornography in Britain and the Atlantic World, 1880—1914," *Journal of Social History* 33, 4 (2000), 859.

Turhan Aytul, "Türkiye'de Kadın – Erkek: 7 milyon erkek ve 7 milyon kadının cinsel davranışını tesbit ediyoruz." *Milliyet*, 28.03.1962. "... Bu suretle Türk Cemiyetinin cinsel davranışını tesbite çalışacak ve Cemiyet yöneticilerimize bazı sosyal meselelerin hallinde bir ışık tutmuş olacağız."

Turhan Aytul, "Türkiyede kadın erkek: Türkiyede ilk defa yapılan bu teşebbüs, her yerde alaka ile takip ediliyor." *Milliyet*, 01.04.1962.

the most serious problems in our social life. So that we can examine the characteristics of the sexual practices of our society under the light of science, and we can understand the reasons for various miseries and malfunctions to develop certain measures."407 He also gave three examples of those miseries with the help of the reader's letters. He mentioned how much sorrow they (but particularly Turhan Aytul) felt because of a woman who was beaten by her drunk husband, and forced her to have sex, and eventually cheated on her; because a young person who had feelings for his same-sex friend and attempted suicide; and because of a young girl who has fallen in love with her 15-years older teacher. 408 He added that they hesitated due to the nature of sexual manners and the hardship of discussing sexuality openly in a newspaper due to the traditions that consider discussing sexuality shameful and immoral.<sup>409</sup> Although a few family heads reacted to their attempt and asked how they could bring such a newspaper to their homes, he stated that their initiative was welcomed with appreciation and congratulations from the circles of universities to the citizens in small towns. 410 Hence, they realized that their initiative was taken very seriously

Abdi İpekçi, "Milliyetten Mektup," *Milliyet*, 02.04.1962. "Gerçi milyonlarca insanın maddi ve manevi ıztıraplarına sebep olan, sosyal hayatımızın en büyük problemlerinden birini teşkil eden cinsi davranışlarımızı tesbit etmenin faydasına inaniyorduk. Bu suretle toplulumumuzun cinsi münasebetlerine hakim olan özelliklerin ilim ışığı altında incelenmesiyle çeşitli ıztırıapların, aksaklıkların sebebi anlaşılabilecek, tedbirleri bulunabilecekti."

Abdi İpekçi, "Milliyetten Mektup," *Milliyet*, 02.04.1962. "Geceleri eve sarhoş gelip kendisini döve döve, küfür ede ede yatağa sürükleten bir adamın karısının bu ıztıraplı hayattan kaçmak için nasıl ihanete mecbur kaldığını, hemcinslerine karşı önüne geçilmez hisler duyan bir gencin bu yüzden geçirdiği buhranlar sonunda intihara kalkıştığını, kendisinden 15 yaş büyük öğretmenine aşık olan bir ortaokul talebesinin çektiği üzüntüyü ve daha bunlara benzer yüzlerce vakayı...."

<sup>409</sup> Abdi İpekçi, "Milliyetten Mektup," *Milliyet*, 02.04.1962. "Buna rağmen tereddüt ediyorduk. Cinsi konuları gazetelerin sütunlarında açıkça ele almak kolay değildi. Memleketimizde öteden beri yerleşen ananeler, cinsi meselelerin tartışılmasını ayıplayacak, bir ahlaksızlık addedecek mahiyetteydi."

<sup>410</sup> Abdi İpekçi, "Milliyetten Mektup," *Milliyet*, 02.04.1962. "Gerçi bazı aile babaları beklediğimiz gibi itiraz etmişler, bu gibi sualleri yayınlayan bir gazeteyi evlerine nasıl götüreceklerini sormuşlardır. Fakat üniversite çevrelerinden kasabalı vatandaşlara kadar büyük çoğunluk, teşebbüsümüzü takdir ve tebrikle karşılamış, içlerini dertlerini dökmek

by the already answered questionnaires, and they decided to republish the questionnaire.

Abdi İpekçi's editorial piece carried almost all the arguments stated by the opinion leaders who supported the dissemination of sexual knowledge. İpekçi defended explicitness of sexual manners among the public throughout the 1950s. However, the same day, a concerned parliamentarian brought his worries regarding the explicitness and spread of sexual knowledge among the public to the parliament with a speech. The Kocaeli parliamentarian of the Justice Party (Adalet Partisi) gave a one-minute speech to share his contempt and sorrow in the name of the public. After he read some questions from the survey, he pronounced his contempt and sorrow for himself and the name of the parliament. 411 He believed that Turkish mothers who gave birth to Mehmed (a symbolic name used for an anonymous Turkish soldier) and Turkish fathers who made Mehmed would not answer such questions. 412 In between, he also accused the newspaper of having an evil ideology. At the end of his speech, he addressed the government and, particularly, the Ministry of Education, since the survey included individuals starting at 15 years old and asked what they were doing regarding this ugly and dreary publication.<sup>413</sup> In the name of the government, Ahmet Topaloğlu (minister of interior affairs) stated that this

firsatını bulduklarından dolayı sevinçlerini belirtmişlerdir, anketin sonucunu merakla bekleyeceklerini bildirmişlerdir."

- 411 *TBMM Zabit Tutanak*, Term: 1, Session: 68, Vol. 4 (02.04.1962), 198. Süreyya Sofuoğlu: "....Meclisi Âlinin de düşüncelerini katarak teessüf ve teessürlerimi bildirmek isterim"
- 412 *TBMM Zabıt Tutanak*, Term: 1, Session: 68, Vol. 4 (02.04.1962), 198. Süreyya Sofuoğlu: "Ve inanıyorum ki, bir milleti millet yapan, bilhassa aziz Türk Millettinin şehametlerinde ifadesini bulan, kahramanlık destanları yazdıran, Mehmed'i doğuran Türk anasi'na, Mehmed'i yapan Türk babasına böyle sualler sorulamaz, zaten, o da cevap vermez."
- TBMM Zabıt Tutanak, Term: 1, Session: 68, Vol. 4 (02.04.1962), 198. Süreyya Sofuoğlu: "Şimdi, çok sayın Hükümetten soruyorum bu çirkin ve acı tablo karşısında Hükümet olarak, 15 yaşından yukarı kız ve erkeği içine alması hasebiyle, Maarif Vekâleti olarak, hattâ bu neşriyat münasebeti ile söz almamdan istifade edip büyük Türk matbuatının büyük bir kısmını tenzih ederek, zaman zaman bâzı gazetelerde çöreklenmiş menfi ideoloji sahiplerini işaret edip Dahiliye Vekilinden soruyorum; cemiyet nereye götürülmek isteniyor? (Bravo, sesleri) Bu çirkin ve hazin neşriyatın toplum üzerindeki menfi tesirleri üzerinde durmalıyız. duyduğum infial hepinizin infiali oldu. Hepinizi hürmetle selâmlarım. (Alkışlar)"

publication has also attracted the attention of the government and communicated with the Ministry of Justice to labor the subject. 414

The following day, Milliyet devoted almost half of its front page in order to replying to the accusations of "being immoral and indecent," ensure its credibility with the testimonies and comments of the well-known scientists about the survey, and question the intentions and credibility of Sofuoğlu with providing information about his past financial and political trials. 415 In an editorial article, Milliyet asked for proof of Sofuoğlu's accusation of "having an evil ideology." The editorial team stated that the prosecution had already investigated the survey and questionnaire. Based on the comments of a scientific board from the university, the prosecution decided that there was no need for further investigation. 416 The newspaper has also received comments from scientists from different fields. The scientist stated that this questionnaire was a scientific study similar to those conducted in the western countries and the Unites States. Last but not least, the newspaper has also taken views of the Minister of Education who confirmed scientific content of the survey. 417 Ultimately, Milliyet covered all the corners to reply to the accusations. The results of the survey were published almost one year later, in January 1963, as a series. 418 The series ended shortly and did not cover some subjects which were addressed in the questions, though there were no apparent public or parliamentarian reactions against the results of the survey.

The survey was published as an edited book, "Türkiye'de Cinsiyet Problemi" (Sexuality Problem in Turkey) in 1964. The book consisted of the results of the survey and the articles written by the scientists. According to Aytul, the book was the result of a three-year study. The topics covered in the book were a combination of two surveys. The first survey was

<sup>414</sup> *TBMM Zabit Tutanak*, Term: 1, Session: 68, Vol. 4 (02.04.1962), 198. Ahmet Topaloğlu (Minister of Interior Affairs): "Çok muhterem arkadaşlarım, bu neşriyat Hükümetinizin de dikkatini çekmiştir. Dahiliye Vekâleti olarak, Adliye Vekâletiyle temas halindeyiz; üzerinde durulmaktadır, arz ederim. (Bravo, sesleri, alkışlar)"

<sup>415 &</sup>quot;Kim bu adam? Sofuoğlu'nun siyasi geçmişi," Milliyet, 03.04.1962.

<sup>416 &</sup>quot;Bu ithamın isbatını bekliyoruz." *Milliyet*, 03.04.1962.

<sup>417 &</sup>quot;Bu ithamın isbatını bekliyoruz." *Milliyet*, 03.04.1962.

<sup>418 &</sup>quot;Cinsel ve sosyal davranışlarıyla kadın," *Milliyet*, 06.01.1963.

"Türkiye'de Cinsel ve Sosyal Davranışlarıyla Kadın Araştırması" (Sexual and Social Behaviours of Women in Turkey), which was first started as a private examination (özel soruşturma). However, according to Aytul, since that method progressed very slowly, the survey team cooperated with Milliyet. Milliyet published the questionnaire set of the survey to conduct the research. The second survey was "Türkiye'de evlilik" (Marriage in Turkey), which was prepared in 1962 and published in Milliyet.

The ones who raised their voices against the explicitness and dissemination of sexual knowledge have brought arguments under several titles. These concerns were intertwined and supported each other. One of the biggest and consensual concerns was linked with the values of Turkish society. Their voices came from different parts of society. As mentioned, a parliamentarian found the explicitness of sexual knowledge to insult the mothers and fathers of Turkish youth. Some writers argued that such explicitness was inappropriate for the values of Turkishness. More extremes claimed that the ones who are providing such knowledge under the name of science have evil intentions against the Turkish nation since these discussions could spoil the core of Turkishness, namely, the Turkish family. They argued that over-permissiveness (aşırı serbestlik) resulted from the Communist mind. The communists were trying to destroy Turkish society by corrupting the inner values and the core unit – namely – the family. 420 Hence, over-permissiveness of sexuality can harm familial values. Also, "inclination toward sexuality could strengthen communism." 421 objections were raised with the moral concerns and rejected the dissemination of sexual knowledge. 422 Some writers reserved partial

<sup>419</sup> Turhan Aytul ed., Türkiye'de Cinsiyet Problemi (İstanbul: Varlık Yayınevi, 1964), 3, 13.

<sup>420</sup> Reşat Feyzi Yüzüncü, "Komünizma Öncüleri," *Büyük Doğu*, 19.03.1948, 15.

Reşat Feyzi Yüzüncü, "Komünizma Öncüleri," *Büyük Doğu*, 19.03.1948, 15. "Fuhuş türkiyemizde almış yürümüştür. Fuhşa karşı olan temayüllerin artması, komünizmayı kuvvetlendirir. Eski terbiye sisteminden kurtulan nesiller, bugün şaşırmış haldedirler." In Australia, Peter Scales mentioned that the publishers of sexual knowledge were accused of "Communist-influenced destroyers of the family." Peter Scales, "Sex Education in the '70s and '80s: Accomplishments, Obstacles and Emerging Issues," *Family Relations* 30, 4 (1981), 557.

Scales, "Sex Education in the '70s and '80s: Accomplishments, Obstacles and Emerging Issues," 557.

reservations against the free dissemination of sexual knowledge. Although they did not object to the idea of sexual knowledge, they warned the writers about the limits of the content and the ways of the dissemination. Since sexual manners was a delicate subject, the responsible individuals were warned about the dangers when/if sexual education was not transferred by knowledgeable and competent individuals. Accordingly, the credibility and competence of the publishers and published materials became a debated issue when and if the covered topic was seen as not-fit into the proper limits.

The rise of visibility in sexuality-related subjects accompanied the rise of the sexual manners discourse. Sexual manners was instrumentalized to inform the public about sexuality, which helped determine the content and limits of sexuality. The publishers and advocators of sexual manners constructed its content on scientific language, which also legitimized dissemination of the sexuality-related subjects. Sexual manners was presented as a necessity and contribution to the well-being of society and individuals. Therefore, the content of sexual manners entailed various subjects such as venereal diseases, "good marriages," spousal roles, sexuality's relation with crime, knowledge on conception, sexual anatomy, and even contraception. However, more than anything, the importance of teaching and disseminating sexual manners was explained in relation to selfregulation. The opinion leaders of the era wanted to gain sexual manners from the citizens so that they could regulate their behaviors. The supporters of sexual manners did not only promote the content on sexuality. They constructed sexuality discursively through the channels of sexual manners.

The following subsection discusses the introduction of sexual manners as a term, providing clues regarding its relations to the etymology of discipline (disciplining).

<sup>423</sup> The discussions regarding the agents – who would be responsible of producing and distributing of sexual manners will be discussed in the "Experts" section of this chapter. Scales was discussing the same problem for the sexual education during the 1970s and the 1980s. Scales, "Sex Education in the '70s and '80s: Accomplishments, Obstacles and Emerging Issues," 557

## 2.4. Presentation, content, and forms of *sexual manners*

During the 1950s, as the number of publications increased, the content on sexual manners was enriched and diversified. The writers of *sexual manners* (scientists, public figures, and policymakers) tried to cover various topics related to sexuality. They produced knowledge about different topics, such as physical attributes, mating patterns, abnormalities, healthy marriage activities, pedagogy of sexuality, sexual hygiene, and legal issues. Sexual manners was mainstreamed in almost every aspect of life. <sup>424</sup> This section lays out a map of the topics covered, how they relate to sexuality, the types of text used to reach the public, and the sources that were used.

## 2.4.1. From tenasül terbiyesi to cinsi terbiye

The terms *sexual knowledge* and *sexual education* were used in popular and academic written material. <sup>425</sup> *Sexual conduct* was also another term used by academics regarding sexual matters and sexuality. <sup>426</sup> *Marriage advice* or *conjugal advice* were used as alternative concepts in the popular

For mainstreaming sexuality, see: Feona Attwood ed., *Mainstreaming Sex: The Sexualisation of Western Culture* (New York: I.B. Tauris, 2009). For a critical contribution to the everydayness and mainstreaming of sexuality, see: Richard Parker, "Sexuality, culture and society: shifting paradigms in sexuality research," *Culture, Health and Sexuality* 11, 3 (2009), 251-266. For the "everydayness" of sexuality, Ken Plummer used the concept "daily practices of doing sex," which referred to a local and unique experience. Plummer also underlines the importance of deconstructing "the universal and essential conceptualization" of sexuality by focusing on the daily performative practices, see: Ken Plummer, "Studying Sexualities for a Better World? Ten Years of Sexualities," *Sexualities* 11, 1-2 (2008), 7-22.

Roy Porter and Lesley Hall use all of these terms to analyze development of sexual knowledge in the United Kingdom at the end of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Even the book's name includes the concept of "sexual knowledge." Porter and Hall, *The Facts of Life*, for *sexual conduct* see, 228, for *alternative names*, see the chapter "the makings of popular sexual knowledges," 247, for *marriage advice* see, 215 and for *sex advice* see, 216.

Ezgi Sarıtaş uses "sexual conduct" in the summary of her article to refer sexual knowledge and sexual education. Sarıtaş, "Seksoloji: 1945-1955 arası Türkiye'de Cinsel Terbiye."

marriage manuals of the 1950s for sexuality-related subjects. Last but not least, sex advice was used to describe knowledge about sexuality, particularly in magazines and manuals. The majority of the academic literature on sexual knowledge has been produced based on the literature written primarily in English. Secondary literature scholars use the same terminology in their analyses and discussions as primary literature writers. In Turkish literature, the writers of/on sexuality used derivatives for sexual knowledge, like in literature in English. The terminology surrounding sexuality transformed, particularly between the 1940s and 1960s.

Tenasül (reproductive) was seen in the texts regarding sexuality until the mid-1940s. Fritz Kahn's book, which was one of the famous books of the period, was translated into Turkish as "Tenasül Hayatımız: Herkes ve Aile için bir Rehber" (Our Reproductive Life: A Guide for Everybody and the Family) in 1940, although the original name of the book started with "our sex life." Tenasül was used to refer to the reproductive system and organs as well as sexuality. In the late 1940s, two phrases, cinsi terbiye (sexual manners) and tenasül terbiyesi (reproductive manners), were used simultaneously in texts about sexuality. The interchangeable use of tenasül and cinsi could be followed in the articles. Tenasül as a concept was limited

In the manuals, which were prepared for married individuals and marriage life, *marriage* advice or conjugal advice was used. See: İşte Evlendiniz, Mükemmel İzdivaçın Şartları.

Fritz Kahn, *Tenasul Hayatımız: Herkes ve aile için bir rehber*, trans. Cemil Cahit Cem (İstanbul: TürkiyeYayınevi, 1940). The book was published with the title "Unser Geschlechtsleben: Ein Führer und Berater für Jedermann" (Our Sex Life: A Guide and Advice for Everybody) in 1935. However it was translated to Türkish as "Tenasül Hayatımız: Herkes ve Aile için bir Rehber" (Our Reproductive Life: A guide for everybody and family).

Tevfik Remzi Kazancıgil, a gynecologist of the period, used both *cinsi* (sexual) and tenasül (reproductive) in the same sentence. "Buguin artık cinsiyet ve tenasul işlerini hakiki bilgilere dayanarak biyoloji ve sosyoloji cephelerinden karşılamak mumkundur." Tevfik Remzi Kazancıgil, "Eser hakkında bir (Takriz-beğenti)," in *Tenasul Hayatımız: Herkes ve aile için bir rehber*, written by Fritz Kahn, trans. Cemil Cahit Cem (İstanbul: TurkiyeYayınevi, 1940).

to medical issues, focusing on reproductive organs or replaced with *cinsi* when it came to the sexual intercourse in the writings.<sup>430</sup>

Cinsi Terbiye (sexual manners) was the most commonly used term for sexual knowledge in Turkish popular and academic writings. 431 Terbiye as a term includes the meanings (concepts) of educating someone, understanding and appreciating the "common" rules, following the norm(s), trying to fit in the proper limits, and controlling himself/herself. In parallel to the first meaning of terbiye, learning and teaching about sexuality was the forthcoming aspect in sexual manners discussions. The second aspect of terbiye was related to asking someone to adjust his/her attitude and behaviours according to "common" or "acceptable" norms. In one of the translated articles, the writers suggested that the readers hold the reins of their sexuality and control it properly, which can bring joy and happiness to their lives. 432 Therefore, when the writers used cinsi terbiye in their narratives, sexual education alone does not correspond to the meaning of the concept. It rests somewhere between education and discipline where individuals exert physically and mentally to change their behaviors and attitude. Else, education can be approached as broader than its institutional sense. Education could be considered as the advice, the instruction, the communication, and, eventually, the etiquette of sexuality. 433 In the 1950s,

An article from *Kadın Gazetesi*, translated by Nuri Arun and from Beatrice Green Taines was titled "Tenasül Bahsinde Yeni ve Enteresan Bir Etud," *Kadın Gazetesi*, 1947/23, 9. The article was giving information about the usage of thermometer to determine best time to get pregnant. Another one from a later date about cancer, *Tenasül ve İdrar Yolları Kanseri*, trans. Vehbi Müderrisoğlu (Ankara: Canser Research and Fight Institution, 1958).

Cinsi Terbiye (sexual manners) as a term is consisted of two words and defined as "sexual education" in the Ottoman dictionary. While *cinsi* means "belonging to a kind, to a generation, to a descendance" or "related to a kind, to a generation, to a descendance",431 *terbiye* has four different meanings as feeding and growing; education; manners and training. Although the exact translation of the concept means "providing information and/or education about sexes," the Turkish version covered "giving information about sexual and reproductive processes." Ferit Devellioğlu, *Osmanlıca – Türkçe Ansiklopedik Lugat*, 22. edition (İstanbul: Aydın Kitabevi, 2005).

David Keller, "Cinsiyetin Kudreti," *Seksoloji*, 12 (Mart 1950), 33.

Bashford and Strange, "Public Pedagogy: Sex Education and Mass Communication in the Mid–Twentieth Century," 73.

the words terbiye and bilgi (knowledge /information) were used together. Starting with the 1960s, the phrase was vastly replaced by cinsel bilgiler (sexual knowledge). Although seksoloji was used as a complementary concept in the discussions, seksi bilgiler and seksi terbiye were not very welcome coverings in texts. Not only has the wording of the concept changed to cinsel bilgiler. 434 However, the perception and content of the concept shifted from informing the public about the etiquette of sexuality to providing medical knowledge about sexual matters. In Turkish, bilgi was or generally used for scientific science-related discourses. whereas terbiye referred to information about proper social conduct. At first, cinsi terbiye was used for educating public about proper sexuality and sexual practices. Within fifteen years, it was replaced with in cinsel bilgiler, which insinuated scientific knowledge.

Seksoloji (sexology) was another term used during the period that refers to a scientific discipline and its expertise. As mentioned before, during the publication process, the writers of the journal, Seksoloji, tried to prove and remind the public that their journal contains original and scientific content, not popular and pornographic material. The journal tried to change the perception of sexuality from a daily, secretive, and mundane subject to a scientific, universal, and explainable fact. The contingency of sexuality and sex was seen in the change of terminology (wording) of sexuality along with its territory and content, even in 30 years, from the first translated and published marriage manual in 1931 to the 1960s.<sup>435</sup>

The increasing number of visual materials went hand in hand with the use of anatomical knowledge in magazines and manuals. Medical language gained dominance by using terminology, particularly in the anatomical and functional descriptions of the organs. The dominant usage of the medical language in the articles caused the intertwining of these articles with

Naşit Erez, Sadi Irmak, Mansur Sayın, Çevik Alp, Kemal Çağlar, Turgut Metiner, Naci Berkay ed., *Resimli Seksoloji Ansiklopedisi* (İstanbul: Arkın Kitabevi, 1963).

Müge Işıklar Koçak stated that the first Latin-letters manual was published in 1931. Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality," 2. For the "contingency of sexuality," see, M.E. Bailey, "Foucauldian Feminism: Contesting Bodies, Sexuality and Identity," in *Up Against Foucault*, ed. Caroline Ramazanoğlu (London: Routledge, 1993), 107.

medical columns.<sup>436</sup> Sexuality was narrated as a medical and physiological subject with medical language. Because the terminology was primarily borrowed from the field of medicine, the medical mind became the dominant source for defining and describing sexuality. The medicalization of sexuality was not limited to the textual content alone. By modifying the language, sexuality was transformed into a medical topic. The changing language of sexuality was a hint of the transformation in the way that the body and sexuality was seen.<sup>437</sup>

In the texts about sexual manners and sexual matters, the writers, translators, or editorial team did not have a consistent strategy for using of medical terms. The medical terms were, in some cases, written in Turkish. Consensual terms used by authors were *ilk adet* (for first menstruation), 438 *yumurtalık* (for ovary), 439 *soğukluk* (for frigidity), 440 and *çiftleşme* (for copulation). 441 In some cases, Ottoman Turkish was used for the naming. *Gudde* (for gland), 442 *husye sancısı* (for menstruation pains), 443 *tenasül uzvu* (for sexual organ), 444 *hayız* (for menstruation), 445 *mukaretinden çekinmek* 

Bashford and Strange, "Public Pedagogy: Sex Education and Mass Communication in the Mid–Twentieth Century," 86.

<sup>437</sup> Lisa Z. Sigel, "Name Your Pleasure: The Transformation of Sexual Language in Nineteenth Century British Pornography," *Journal of the History of Sexuality* 9, no.4 (2000), 395.

<sup>438</sup> Alaettin Orhon, *Kadın Sağlığı: Doğuştan Adet Kesilmesine Kadar* (Ankara: Ankara Üniversitesi Tıp Fakültesi Yayınları, 1962), 12. Octawe Beliard, "Vakitsiz Adetten Kesilme," *Seksoloji*, 25 (1951), 29.

<sup>439</sup> Fred McMauldin, *Her Nişanlı Genç Kız Neler Bilmelidir? Yarın Evleneceksin*, trans. Selim Yetkili (Istanbul: Hadise Yayınevi, 1956), 60.

W.E. Sargent, *Evlilik Hayatında Daha Bahtiyar Olmanın Yolları*, trans. Ömer Rıza Doğrul (Istanbul: Arif Bolat Kitabevi, 1942), 23-39.

<sup>441</sup> Sargent, Evlilik Hayatında Daha Bahtiyar Olmanın Yolları, 40-68.

<sup>442</sup> McMauldin, Her Nişanlı Genç Kız Neler Bilmelidir? Yarın Evleneceksin, 60. Octawe Beliard, "Vakitsiz Adetten Kesilme," Seksoloji, 25 (1951), 28.

<sup>443</sup> McMauldin, Her Nişanlı Genç Kız Neler Bilmelidir? Yarın Evleneceksin, 22.

McMauldin, Her Nişanlı Genç Kız Neler Bilmelidir? Yarın Evleneceksin, 22. For tenasül: Burdet Wylie, "Tenasül Hastalıkları," Seksoloji, 25 (1951), 46.

<sup>445</sup> *Kadınlar Niçin İhanet Ederler?* (İstanbul: Hadise Publishing, 1956), 8. W.E. Sargent, *Evlilik Hayatında Daha Bahtiyar Olmanın Yolları*, trans. Ömer Rıza Doğrul (İstanbul: Arif Bolat Kitabevi, 1942), 33.

(for abstinence), 446 cinsi münasebet (for coitus), istimna (for masturbation) and meni (for sperm) 447 were some examples of the use. In other cases, the English equivalents were used as they are either pronounced or written originally such as jenital organlar (for genital organs), 448 orgasm (oragazm in some texts), 449 seksüel hayat (for sexual life), 450 sex, 451 coitus, 452 nymphomaniak (for nymphomaniac and/or nymphomanie), 453 klitoris (clitoris), 454 impotence, 455 vaginism, 456 and vagina. 457 In some cases, the term was written in English version and supported with a Turkish term in parentheses. Terms used in this sense could be listed as püberte-büluğ (puberty), 458 patolojik-maraz hali (patological), 459 kadın cinsiyet hormone – estrogen (estrogen), 460 tiroid guddesi (thyroid gland), 461 frijit - cinsel

446 Sargent, Evlilik Hayatında Daha Bahtiyar Olmanın Yolları, 47, 83.

<sup>447</sup> Rudolph von Urban, *Aşk Sanatı*, trans. Muzaffer Aşkın (Istanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1950), 12 – 13. Max Huhner, "Sancılı Cinsel Münasebet," *Seksoloji*, 25 (1951), 38.

<sup>448</sup> Alaettin Orhon, Kadın Sağlığı: Doğuştan Adet Kesilmesine Kadar, 13.

<sup>449</sup> McMauldin, Her Nişanlı Genç Kız Neler Bilmelidir? Yarın Evleneceksin, 26. Kadınlar Niçin İhanet Ederler? (İstanbul, Hadise Publishing, 1956), 53. Rudolph von Urban, Aşk Sanatı, trans. Muzaffer Aşkın (Istanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1950), 99.

<sup>450</sup> McMauldin, Her Nişanlı Genç Kız Neler Bilmelidir? Yarın Evleneceksin, 42.

<sup>451</sup> McMauldin, Her Nişanlı Genç Kız Neler Bilmelidir? Yarın Evleneceksin, 4.

<sup>452</sup> McMauldin, Her Nişanlı Genç Kız Neler Bilmelidir? Yarın Evleneceksin, 25.

<sup>453</sup> McMauldin, Her Nişanlı Genç Kız Neler Bilmelidir? Yarın Evleneceksin, 84. N.P., 200 sual 200 cevap (İstanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1952), 6 (edited from the books of Hannah Stone and Abraham Stone and Edward Podolsky, editor unknown).

<sup>454</sup> Kadınlar Niçin İhanet Ederler? (İstanbul: Hadise Publishing, 1956), 86.

<sup>455</sup> Kadınlar Niçin İhanet Ederler? (İstanbul: Hadise Publishing, 1956), 88.

<sup>456</sup> Max Huhner, "Cinsi Münasebet Esnasında Sancı Duyan Kadın," Seksoloji, 26 (1951), 28.

<sup>457</sup> Rudolph von Urban, *Aşk Sanatı*, trans. Muzaffer Aşkın (Istanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1950), 11. *Doğumu Tanzim* (İstanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1952), 9.

<sup>458</sup> Orhon, Kadın Sağlığı: Doğuştan Adet Kesilmesine Kadar, 8.

Orhon, Kadın Sağlığı: Doğuştan Adet Kesilmesine Kadar, 13. For "Cinsi hayatta marazi haller," Aydın Uluyazman, "Cinsi Hayatta Marazi Haller," Seksoloji, 39 (1952), 35.

<sup>460</sup> McMauldin, İnsan Hayatı Serisi, No: 5, Her Nişanlı Genç Kız Neler Bilmelidir? Yarın Evleneceksin, 59.

<sup>461</sup> McMauldin, İnsan Hayatı Serisi, No: 5, Her Nişanlı Genç Kız Neler Bilmelidir? Yarın Evleneceksin, 62.

soğukluk (frigid or sexually cold),<sup>462</sup> menopause - adet kesimi devresi (menopause or the period of permanent cessation of menstruation).<sup>463</sup> Even in some cases, the terms were used interchangeably in the same text such as bikir (hymen) and kızlık zarı (hymen),<sup>464</sup> yumurtalıklar (ovaries) and overler (ovaries)<sup>465</sup> or kadın tenasül organları (female genital organs) and kadın iç jenital (tenasül) organları (female inner genital organs).<sup>466</sup>

The terminology was in a transformation process along with the subject. 467 Publishers needed a suitable terminology to communicate sexual manners as the subject became more visible in public debates. The topic of sexual manners was in the construction process in public discourse along with the construction of the medical disciplines focusing on sexuality-related subjects such as gynecology. Therefore, a new terminology needed to be invented or borrowed from other languages. Muzaffer Aşkın, as the translator of "İşte Evlendiniz" (Now You Got Married) provided a glossary at the beginning of the manual. He gave the definitions of penis, vagina, orgazm, inzal (release), spermatozoe (sperm), klitoris (clitoris), and vulva. The glossary was not a part of the original text. Aşkın added the dictionary to turn the text into a more understandable text. Besides, no centered strategy for structuring the terminology existed, although these texts were published after the language planning activities in Turkey during

462 McMauldin, İnsan Hayatı Serisi, No: 5, Her Nişanlı Genç Kız Neler Bilmelidir? Yarın Evleneceksin, 51.

<sup>463</sup> McMauldin, İnsan Hayatı Serisi, No: 5, Her Nişanlı Genç Kız Neler Bilmelidir? Yarın Evleneceksin, 83.

<sup>464</sup> McMauldin, İnsan Hayatı Serisi, No: 5, Her Nişanlı Genç Kız Neler Bilmelidir? Yarın Evleneceksin, 86 for bikir and 25 for kızlık zarı.

<sup>465</sup> Orhon, Kadın Sağlığı: Doğuştan Adet Kesilmesine Kadar, 167 for overler.

Orhon, Kadın Sağlığı: Doğuştan Adet Kesilmesine Kadar, for kadın tenasül organları, 15 and for kadın iç jenital (tenasül) organları, 17.

<sup>467</sup> Peyami Safa, "Objektif: İlmi terimler ve halk dili," *Milliyet*, 07.01.1958.

The gynecology departments in the universities were in the formation process. See, Günal, "Health and Citizenship in Republican Turkey."

Dr. Le Mon Clark, *İşte Evlendiniz*, trans. Muzaffer Aşkın, third edition (İstanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1951), 6.

the 1940s and 1950s.<sup>470</sup> The vocabulary was highly dependent on the choice of the writers, translators, or editorial board of the publishing. Particularly private publishing houses had a significant role in shaping cultural repertoire in Turkey between 1923 and 1960. They shaped the public discourse and intervened in the content of the public discussion.<sup>471</sup> They tried to bring Turkish terminology into different publishing formats (including the magazines and books), whether creating new words or borrowing from Ottoman. They have employed English versions of the terms since their main source was from foreign languages both for the sexual manners and medicine.

## 2.4.2. Anatomy: Description of Organs

One of the prominent subjects covered under the *sexual manners* was the description, physiology, and functions of sexually ascribed organs in relation to the reproductive practices of the individuals. The texts also covered the physiology and functions of the organs during the coital process. Almost in every *Seksoloji* issue, a certain part was reserved for the explanations regarding the sexual organs. These parts were narrated either as a separate article or in an article dealing with an illness related to this particular organ. Generally, the description of the sexual organs took up the first chapters of manuals since the rest of the material was discussed by referring to this particular chapter. Interestingly, the articles were supported by visual materials - illustrations and photographs -.<sup>472</sup> Even the functions of

<sup>470</sup> Şehnaz Tahir-Gürçağlar, The Politics and Poetics of Translation in Turkey 1923-1960, Ph.D. Diss. (Boğaziçi University, 2001). http://www.transint.boun.edu.tr/html/tezler/SehnazTahir Gurcaglar.pdf. Şehnaz Tahir-Gürçağlar, "Tercüme Bürosu Nasıl Doğdu. Birinci Türk Neşriyat Kongresi ve Çeviri Planlaması," in Çeviriyi Düşünenler, ed. M. Rıfat (Istanbul: Dünya Yayıncılık, 2003), 48-58. The Translation Bureau (1940-1960), which was founded under the Ministry of Education have translated and published considerable amount of canonized literary works during the period.

<sup>471</sup> It is particularly important for this study since the translations on women's sexuality were conducted by private publishing houses. Şehnaz Tahir-Gürçağlar, *The Politics and Poetics of Translation in Turkey 1923-1960*, 62.

<sup>472</sup> According to Balsoy, Besim Ömer also used visual materials in his books. Gülhan Erkaya Balsoy, Kahraman Doktor İhtiyar Acuzeye Karşı: Geç Osmanlı Doğum Politikaları

the anatomical organs were explained on the visual materials with the help of diagrams and notes.<sup>473</sup>

These visual materials displayed the "anomalies" alongside the *average* appearances. The "anomalies" were defined as abnormal, not-natural or illnesses by the writers. Also, the symptomatic effects of the illnesses on the sexual organs have been used to warn the readers against the dangers of "illicit behaviors." The illustrations of sexual organs with abscesses or ulcers were tools to deter readers from "unwanted sexuality."

The illustrations contained the inner parts of the sexual organs, which could only be known by experts. The visual and textual descriptions were indicators to display and persuade the readers about the experts' broad knowledge regarding the sexual organs by presenting them from inside to outside in detail. The illustrations provided information about the inner positions and functions of the sexual organs. They also revealed the parts of the sexual organs that the human eye could not see. On the other hand, the newspapers were lacking regarding the visual presentations. According to Selda Bulut and Leven Cantek, the frequent usage of illustrations and photographs were a result of developments in publishing technology. The developments in publishing technology enabled the publishers to use numerous visual materials. Regarding era's publications, one different

(İstanbul: Can Yayınları, 2015), 41-42. It is important to note that unlike Besim Ömer's books, which contained "academic" knowledge for experts, S*eksoloji* was a popular journal that aimed to reach the general public.

- 473 Dr. Jean Hoppeler, "Kadında Adet Görme ve Yumurtlama," Seksoloji, 23 (1951), 15.
- Dr. Turgut Uran, "Kadın Tenasül Uzuvlarında Kusurlu Yaradılışlar," *Seksoloji*, 37 (1952),
- 475 Ironically, the writers described human beings as a part of nature while labeling some of them as "not natural" due to their proximity to the *average*. Anomaly olarak tanımlamasını ekle.
- 476 *Gençlik Hayatı, no. 1: Genç Kızlığın En Esrarlı Tarafı: Bakirelik* (İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959), 2. "...püberte çağındaki gençler ise gittikçe kabaran bu hislerini etraflıca izah edecek, aydınlatacak, bilgili bir kimse bulamazlar. ... arkadaşlarından duyduğu yanlış malumatla... nevrozlu ferdler ve anormal seksüel hayatları olur..."
- 477 Foucault, The Birth of The Clinic.
- 478 Bulut, "Hürriyet Gazetesi: 1948-1953 Döneminin Yayın Politikası," 89-91. Cantek, *Cumhuriyetin Büluğ Çağı*. Şenol-Cantek, "Ellili Yıllar Türkiye'sinde Basın."

approach appeared in preferences of newspapers. Although textual descriptions of sexual organs appeared in the newspapers, unlike manuals and magazines (journals), visual material on sexual organs was not used as part of newspapers' articles.

#### 2.4.3. Marital and Sexual Relations

Sexual relations between partners were another prominent subject in the sexuality-related texts. The functioning of sexuality, relations between partners (spouses), and the limits of sexuality were constructed discursively in the sexual manners texts. This discourse was supported and justified by the exemplary and, mostly, fictive cases. The content of sexual manners was based on the assumption that sexuality would occur in the marriage and a "legitimate" format, particularly for women. Therefore, sexuality out-ofconjugial bond was whether not touched or set as an abnormal or illhappening. 479 Conjugial bond was taken as a process that started before the union (marriage) and continued with the duties of the spouses. Namely, the period before the marriage, including the meeting with the partner, flirting, and engagement, was covered in the manuals along with the discussions regarding marriage. 480 Sexuality between spouses was discussed in detail from the "first night" to "pleasure in marriage." The functions of the spouses in sexual relations were also defined thoroughly. Particularly, men were instructed about the effective ways of "art of love" to make their wives

For a detailed discussion about the "out-of-marriage" sexuality, see the "Appropriate Sexuality" chapter.

See for the steps of a marital process, Max J. Exner, *Mükemmel İzdivacın Şartları*, trans. Muzaffer Aşkın, 3rd edition (İstanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1951). The chapters of the manual: 1) Beginning (Başlangıç) 2) The marriage ideal (evlilik ideali) 3) Choosing the spouse (Eşin Seçilmesi) 4) Engagement (Nişanlılık) 5) Preparation for Marriage (Evlenmeye Hazırlanış) 6) Getting Information (Bilgi Edinmek) 7) Ways of controlling births (Gebeliğe mani olma usulleri). See first chapter of W.E. Sargent, *Evlilik Hayatında Daha Bahtiyar Olmanın Yolları*, trans. Ömer Rıza Doğrul (İstanbul: Arif Bolat Kitabevi, 1942). "Birinci Fasıl Sevginin Tarifi: İki çeşit genç; İlk sevgiler; Eş nasıl seçilir, İlk bakışta sevişmeler; Aşk ve cinsiyet; Yanılmak mümkündür, fakat." (Part One: Definition of Love: Two types of young people, How to choose a spouse? Love at first sight, İt'is possible to make a mistake but.).

happy and sustain their happy marriages.<sup>481</sup> Besides the skills of husbands in sexuality, the manuals touched upon the subjects such as sexual life in marriage, sexual harmony between the spouses, sexuality of married women, harmful effects of sexual dissatisfaction in marriage.<sup>482</sup>

The texts were a combination of various disciplines, including psychology, law, and even anthropology. Articles about the codes of marriage, the legal status of married couples, and custody of children could be given as examples for legal subjects. For psychology, the list of the articles is longer with the subjects particularly defining illnesses and perversions casued by sexual abnormalities. Articles about sexuality in other cultures were mainly fed by the anthropology discipline, which informed readers about the sexual, reproductive and marital traditions. Along with the texts related to marriage, the article and manuals also covered subjects related to family life, starting from the legal aspects of marriage and family to the advice about the daily activities such as child care and home care.

The articles were anchored with discussions about the roles and duties of the spouses. 486 One of the objectives of the texts on sexual manners was to embed the norms of a "good spouse." The magazines and manuals included texts and visuals that portrayed the "desired" characteristics of good spouses. The descriptive and encouraging texts focused more on the roles and duties of women as *good wives* and *mothers* than men as husbands. 487 Women's desired features were defined in detail as they have

For first night and "how to make your wife happy," see: Dr. Le Mon Clark, *İşte Evlendiniz*, trans. Muzaffer Aşkın, third edition (İstanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1951).

John Anthony, "Evlilik ve Cinsiyet," Seksoloji, 10 (1950), 1-3.

Ferit H. Saymen, "Evlilikte Eşitlik," *Seksoloji*, 37 (1952). Ferit Hakkı Saymen, "Evlenme yaşı," *Seksoloji*, 12 (1950), 8-9.

<sup>484 &</sup>quot;Dünyada Cinsi Hayat: Yeni Guinea," Seksoloji, 39 (1952), 49-52.

W.E. Sargent, *Evlilik Hayatında Daha Bahtiyar Olmanın Yolları*, trans. Ömer Rıza Doğrul (Istanbul: Arif Bolat Kitabevi, 1942), see: section seven. Section Seven: Family Life, Manners for harmony, Intervals between births, Jealousy among children, Encouraging children's development, A child is a sacred trust, The effect of discord on children, Rebellious children, A happy home.

<sup>486</sup> F.W. Rawland, "İzdivaç Terbiyesi," Seksoloji, 32 (1951), 2-3.

<sup>487 &</sup>quot;Kabahat Yalnız Kocanızda mı?" *Seksoloji*, 32 (1951), 15-17. Recep Doksat, "Çocuğun en önemli gıdası anne şefkati," *Milliyet*, 25.02.1958.

been seen as a part of their sex. Giving birth and child-rearing practices were discussed, along with the devotion and honor of women. Being crisp was discussed under the subject of "keeping marriage and husband happy," which would prevent husbands from searching for "an alternative happiness" outside of home. Besides articles decorated with visual materials, the texts were presented in the format of researches and informative articles, interviews, short stories, and surveys.

Comparative cases among different cultures in different times were given a place in the texts on sexual manners. Culturally differentiating sexual practices were used as exemplary cases to explain a particular subject such as virginity, engagement or marriage rituals in different cultures. Also, culture or country-based comparisons were important to inform their readers that sexuality was experienced differently in different cultures and at different times. The popular discussions of the day were matched with the Seksoloji-related texts. During the Korean War, Seksoloji published a series about sexuality in Korea and Japon, "Kore ve Japonya'da Cinsiyet ve Evlilik Hayatt" (Sex and Marriage Life in Korea and Japon), which was prepared by the first chief physician of Turkey's brigade, doctor major Seyfettin Asu. 491

The historical side of sexuality was also taken place in the articles. Like the cultural differences, the historical side of sexuality was whether used in the articles to present the background of a subject or stated solely to give information about a particular period.

The historical references covered a wide range of periods from Roman times to the nineteenth century. On the one hand, they have narrated a

<sup>488</sup> Louis E. Bisch, "Kadınlık Güç bir Sanattır," Seksoloji Yıllığı, 2 (1953), 94.

John Green, "Erkekler Niçin Evden Kaçarlar," Seksoloji, 23 (1951), 40-41.

<sup>490</sup> Pierre Gordon, "5 kıt'ada zifaf gecesi adetleri," *Seksoloji Yıllığı*, 4 (1955): 169-176. The article focused on the marriage and first-night rituals in Asia, Afrika, America (including Polynesia), Europe and Australia.

<sup>491</sup> Seyfettin Asu, "Kore ve Japonya'da Cinsiyet ve Evlilik Hayatı," *Seksoloji*, 31 (1951): 31-36. Seyfettin Asu, "Kore ve Japonya'da Cinsiyet ve Evlilik Hayatı," *Seksoloji*, 32 (1951): 18-23. Seyfettin Asu, "Kore ve Japonya'da Cinsiyet ve Evlilik Hayatı," *Seksoloji*, 33 (1951): 32-35. Seyfettin Asu, "Kore ve Japonya'da Cinsiyet ve Evlilik Hayatı," *Seksoloji*, 35 (1952): 22-26.

development story regarding sexual truths. On the other hand, they told stories about the customs of the old civilizations. Among the historical texts, a series of articles was particularly interesting. Seksoloji magazine published in twelve articles as a series with the title "Türklerde Cinsellik" (Sexuality of Turks). The interesting part was related to the historical references to Turkishness. The series followed the cultures of Sumerians, Hitits, Middle Asian Turks (Orta Asya Türkleri), Islam, Seljuks and Ottoman Empire under the Turkishness. In the series, Karçal and Uraz covered subjects such as marriage rituels and child rearing practices since they were seen as related to sexuality. On the one hand, the series constructed a Turkishness identity that reached Sumerler. On the other hand, contemporary sexual practices were rooted to the historical sexual practices. In other words, the series helped to justify sexual manners of the day with their Turkish (cultural) origins.

### 2.4.4. Articles about Sexual Illnesses, Abnormalities, Deviance and Health

As discussed in the "why sexual manners" section, opinion leaders of the period supported the necessity of learning and teaching sexual manners to have a healthy society. They tried to define and provide information about the characteristics of "healthy" sexuality. Meanwhile, they diagnosed and classified the sexual practices, which were considered as illnesses, abnormalities, and deviances (perversions). The articles with the themes such as sexual illnesses, abnormalities, and deviances (perversions) were frequently seen under the title sexual manners the Seksoloji publishings, in the marriage manuals, and even in the newspapers. 494 In the five years long life of Seksoloji magazine, the editors published at least one article in every issue about sexual illnesses, their

<sup>492</sup> P.T. Acharya, "Tarih Boyunca Fuhuş: Japonya'da Cinsi Adetler," *Seksoloji*, 18 (1950), 10-13.

<sup>493</sup> Selçuk Karçal and Kayhan Uraz, "Türkiye'de Cinsiyet Meselesi," *Seksoloji*, 37 (1952), 54-57. The series was published in 12 sections montly. In the first 6 issue, the series focused on the sexual practices of the Turkic communities. They described communities such as Sumerians, Hitits and Seljuks as ancestories of contemporary Turkey.

<sup>494 &</sup>quot;Zührevi Hastalıklar," *Milliyet*, 20.10.1950.

implications on the human body and sexuality, sexual abnormalities, sexual deviances (perversions), or their social or criminal consequences.<sup>495</sup>

The opinion leaders pointed out venereal diseases as the most concerning subject for the individual and public health. In writings about sexual manners, information about syphilis and gonorrhea took an extensive place. As discussed in the previous part, the Republic had a history of fighting against venereal diseases. The writers shared their accumulated knowledge on the diseases such as syphilis and gonorrhea. They have translated and referred to international experts in their articles. 496 The content included information about the causes, their prevalence, ways of infection, symptoms after infection, and treatment opportunities and methods for venereal diseases in detail.<sup>497</sup> These articles were decorated with visual materials. While in some cases, these visuals helped to identify the ways of contamination, in other cases, the illustrations have demonstrated the visible physical symptoms of the disease on the human body. These illustrations have created additional interest in the audience since they are easier to follow than plain texts. Some illustrations displayed organs, including faces and genitals with open wounds. It was expected that the visible symptoms would have a deterrent and intimidating effect on the individuals. Additionally, the illustrations were intended to inform and guide individuals in self-checking. Although the illustrations were not perfect-shape, the authors were asking the readers to check themselves accordingly, and seek a physician's expert view as if they would have found any similarities with the displayed symptoms. As a reply to reader's

<sup>495</sup> Examplary Articles such as: Faruk Akbeğ, "Hırsızlık yapmaktan cinsi haz duyanlar," *Seksoloji*, 45 (1952), 30-31. Aydın Uluyazman, "Bir cinsi sapıklık: Pedofili "Çocuklarla Sevişme,"" *Seksoloji*, 54 (1953), 17-20.

For the accumulated knowledge and international (global) dissemination of sexology and sexual mannners, see: Chiara Beccalossi, "Latin Eugenics and Sexual Knowledge in Italy, Spain, and Argentina: International Networks across the Atlantic," in *A Global History of Sexual Science*, 1880–1960, ed. Veronika Fuechtner, Douglas E. Haynes, and Ryan M. Jones (Oakland, California: University of California Press, 2018), 305-307.

<sup>497</sup> Dr. Kemal Çağlar, "Belsoğukluğunun Akibeti," *Seksoloji*, 36 (1952), 27-29. Çağlar explains in detail how he did treat a patient who was diagnosed with gonorrhea. Dr. Kemal Çağlar, "Belsoğukluğu ve Modern Tedavisi," *Seksoloji*, 28 (1951), 37-41.

questions, the editorial team of Seksoloji assessed the described symptoms and encouraged the readers to consult a doctor.<sup>498</sup>

Aside from the venereal disesases, states that ended as a sexual malfunction were touched upon separetely although in most cases they were also classified under the category of sexual illness. Cases such as impotence (iktidarsızlık - erken bel verme), infertility (kısırlık), and frigidity (for women) were discussed under the title of sexual illnesses. 499 Although some of the uncontagious states were defined as sexual illnesses, in some cases, they were refered to as abnormality, which has stretched out its naming to deviance (perversion) in some of the articles. 500 As stated above, some sexual illnesses were described through their contagious character. Another indicator to designate a situation or a case as an illness was mainly related to its compatibility with the average, which was determined by the experts in the field. In order to describe a situation or a person as an abnormal, the experts used the comparison with the average numbers or cases. Abnormalities regarding sexual matters were divided mainly into physical and psychological abnormalities. Physical features and functions of the sexual organs became the forthcoming comparison tools to assess the normality of the individuals (and situations). Although no explicit reference to a particular research or study existed in most of the texts, with a vague reference to average, anatomical features which do not fit into the range of average were described as an abnormality such as double uterus, double hymen or more than two breasts or nipples.<sup>501</sup> In the articles, the anatomical abnormalities were presented in detail through the illustrations and

<sup>498 &</sup>quot;Sual ve Cevaplar – 5 Frengi Tedavisi," *Seksoloji*, 1 (1949), 62. "Böyle bir hastalığa yakalanmış olanların ilk yapmaları gereken şey kendilerini bir mütehassısa göstermektir."

<sup>499</sup> Faruk Akbeğ, "Ruhi Tedavi ile İyileşen Bir İktidarsızlık Vakası," *Seksoloji*, 31 (1951), 24-28. Marie C. Stopes, "İstimna İktidarsızlığa Neden Olur mu?" *Seksoloji*, 30 (1951), 37-40. Kemal Çağlar, "İktidarsızlığın Çeşitli Sebepleri," *Seksoloji*, 29 (1951), 35-39. Muzaffer Sezer, "Sağlık Bahisleri: Erkek ve Kadınlarda Kısırlık," *Milliyet*, 26.10.1953.

Dr. Bowen Partington, "Cinsi Hayatın Garip Tarafları," *Seksoloji*, 21 (1950), 46. "Umumi bazı cinsi sapıklıklar vardır ki, …" Charles Branchard, "Bestialite Hakkında," *Seksoloji*, 24 (1951): 19-21. "Sual ve Cevaplar – 204," *Seksoloji*, 24 (1951), 57. "Sual ve Cevaplar – 204: Homoseksüeller Evlebilir mi? …. Cevap: Homoseksüellik bir cinsi sapıklık ve hastalıktır…"

<sup>501</sup> Dr. Augustine Cabanes, "Garip Cinsi Hadieseler," Seksoloji, 13 (1950), 42-49.

photographs. In one of the articles written by Dr. David Caulwell, incompetence was explained through the anatomical abnormalities.<sup>502</sup> The writer defined the average penis in detail while comparing it with those diagnosed or associated with the incompetence. At the end of the article, the writer assured the readers that incompetence could be treated with a corrective operation.<sup>503</sup>

The newspapers and magazines of the era often allocated a place for anatomical abnormalities. Not only limited to the subjects related to sexual matters, anatomical abnormalities took in the pages of the publishing frequently in news format. 504 In Seksoloji and also in the newspapers, the topics associated with abnormalities were considered intriguing and appealing since the quantity and frequency of the news reporting abnormalities are markable and narrated like magazine news. Gender reassignments surgery was presented as a solution for an anatomical anomaly, hermaphrodite. 505 Gender reassignment was considered as a result of anatomical necessity. It was not assessed as a perversion or abnormality since it was considered due to a necessity of underdeveloped sexual organs. 506 The news on anatomical anomalies was represented, on the one hand, as keys to unknown mysteries and wonders of the human body. On the other hand, they were also used to define the normalcy while displaying

Dr. David Caulwell, "Tenasül Uzuvlarında Ameliyatı İcabettiren Haller," *Seksoloji*, 14 (1950), 52-53.

<sup>503</sup> Dr. David Caulwell, "Tenasül Uzuvlarında Ameliyatı İcabettiren Haller," *Seksoloji*, 14 (1950), 54.

N.P. "Hilkat Garibeleri," *Seksoloji*, 52 (1953), 43-46. The article was presented with visual materials that displayed Siamese twins.

Robert Wood, "Cinsiyet Değiştirenler," *Seksoloji Yıllığı*, 4 (1955), 103-108. It was noted that the article was translated from Sexology magazine.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Sual ve Cevaplar - 89" Seksoloji, 13 (1950), 62. Question 89 asked for a detailed information about gender reassignment surgeries. "89-Cinsiyet Değiştirmek: T.R. Çankırı – Bazı kadınların ameliyatla erkek bazı erkeklerin de kadın olduğuna gazete havadislerinde sık sık rastlanmaktadır. Cerrahi müdahale ile bütün insanların cinsiyetlerini değiştirmek kabil olabiliyor mu? Cevap – Cinsiyet uzuvları tam olarak teşekkül etmiş bir kadının ameliyat neticesinde erkek ve erkeğin de kadın olmasına imkan yoktur. Buna dair gazetelerdeki havadisler hakiki cinsiyeti taayyün etmemiş, gizli kalmış, ne tam erkek, ne tam kadın diyebileceğimiz kimselerin ameliyatla hakiki cinsiyetlerinin meydana çıkmasına ait olanlardır."

the *anomalies*. 507 Psychological abnormalities were taken into consideration solely. They were almost always matched and explained with physical conditions. In other words, the visible symptoms of an abnormality (as defined by the era's experts) were associated with psychological conditions. Also, psychological abnormalities blurred the line between sickness and deviance (perversion). Abnormalities were used interchangeably for psychological disorders and, also, for the perversions. <sup>508</sup> In the texts where certain behaviors were defined as abnormalities, the people who are performing these activities were referred to as abnormal or anormal. In other parts of the same texts, they were referred to as deviants (perverts).

Deviancy was discussed from two perspectives in the academic literature. The first is the positivist approach, which considers deviance a real phenomenon. According to this approach, deviance "exists in the objective experience of the people who commit deviant acts and those who respond to them." 509 In this approach, deviance could be defined as behavior without considering its contextual forming.<sup>510</sup> Therefore, positivists search for causes of deviance in physiology or the psyche. They see the source of the deviant behavior as the anomaly of the natural development of the human body or psyche. On the other hand, the interactionist approach sees deviance as a socially constructed concept that is relative to actors, context, and historical time. Hence, morality and deviance are socially constructed, certain actors in society, based on their particular interests, values, and views, create the limits and borders between normal and deviant. "In consequence, deviance becomes actions or conditions that are defined as inappropriate to or in violation of certain powerful groups' conventions."511 According to the interactionist approach, deviancy is not a lack of people's

.

<sup>507</sup> Conrad and Schneider, Deviance and Medicalization: From Badness to Sickness.

Fahrettin Kerim Gökay, "İnsan Hayatında Cinsi Kudretin Rolü," *Seksoloji*, 3 (1949): 5-9. Gökay uses all the concepts (abnormality, pscychological disorder and pervert) in the same article. Prof. Dr. Wilhelm Stekel, "Ruh Hastalıklarınınn Cinsi Sebepleri," *Seksoloji*, 48 (1953), 22-26.

<sup>509</sup> Conrad and Schneider, Deviance and Medicalization: From Badness to Sickness, 1-2.

<sup>510</sup> Conrad and Schneider, Deviance and Medicalization: From Badness to Sickness, 2.

<sup>511</sup> Conrad and Schneider, Deviance and Medicalization: From Badness to Sickness, 2.

free will. "Rather, the behaviors called deviant are by and large voluntary and that people exercise some degree of "free will" in their lives." Therefore, interactionist research focuses on studying "how such definitions are constructed, how deviant labels are attached to particular people, and what the consequences are both for those labeled and the authors of such attributions." The interactionist approach has special importance not only for discussing the concept of deviance from a critical perspective. It also underlines the changing definition of the concept. Although deviance as a concept is universal, the form of deviance changes from one society and time to another. In other words, every society defines a particular act as deviance. However, what is labeled as a deviant act is relative and depends on the context – on society, subculture, time, place, who is involved, and who is offended. 513

In parallel to the interactionist approach, this study also takes deviance as a social definition that is formed by the power-holders and decision-makers of the society. This study aims to assess the concept of deviance within the conditions of the 1950s and Turkey. It is not only limited to deviancy but also aims to discuss individuals' sexual and reproductive acts while examining their proximity to the established norms. The literature on deviant acts was a mix of authentic and translated text in the 1950s. <sup>514</sup> In the era's literature, deviance was discussed with a positivist approach. As the producers of the texts were connected through the translated literature or academic formation, their approach became pretty unified. The reasons for deviant acts were sought in the human physiology or psyche. As a result of this reasoning, deviant acts were whether classified as an illness or a delinquency. However, the academic literature on deviancy was still in the forming process with a *scientific* approach.

The outcome of this changing process is seen in the narratives of deviance. The narratives on deviancy tend to explain the reasons within a historical background. When talking about a deviant act, they have taken action as a phenomenon that was seen as abnormal behavior at all times and

512 Conrad and Schneider, Deviance and Medicalization: From Badness to Sickness, 2.

<sup>513</sup> Conrad and Schneider, Deviance and Medicalization: From Badness to Sickness, 5-7.

The discussion about the translated text is in the next section of this chapter.

in all societies. In some texts, the acts that were assessed as a deviant behavior in the 1950s were labeled as a sin or as contempt. Although the labeling and the reasons for deviant acts differentiate from religious to scientific, the intervention stayed firm as a correction method, whether in the forms of medical or penal ones. In one of the articles, voyeurism was defined as deviance. In another article, a well-known physician Recep Doksat, who wrote medical advice in Milliyet, stated that voyeurism is a new medical term entering the medical literature thanks to voyeur patients. He mentioned that voyeurism as a subject has the worth legal and medical examination. The medical or legal experts aimed to develop corrective methods based on their examinations. The destination of the correction method – whether medical or penal – depends on the judgment of the experts – in this case, mostly the doctors. S17

In the column "Hadiseler arasında felek," Burhan Felek discussed a recent striking murder case after the murderer was released from prison and placed in a mental institution. Felek started the story with the sentence, "The gardener who cut his wife was crazy." According to newspapers, as Felek stated, the gardener had syphilis and stopped treatment a while ago. The prosecutor and doctors decided that the gardener did not have liability due to the syphilis. Throughout the piece, Felek questioned doctors and reminded them of their liability regarding diagnosis and treatment of syphilis, and also of their decision to release the gardener. Doctors were announced as the ultimate decision-makers of the correction methods used on the individuals. Their decision depends on the mental capability and capacity of the individuals to decide freely. In other words, the physicians became experts of scientific knowledge and had the power to decide whether the deviant acts of the individuals were a result of their physiological or psychological illness or their *free* choices. If they decide

<sup>515</sup> Dr. Edward Podolsky, "Gözetleme Hastaları," Seksoloji, 43 (1952), 32-36.

Recep Doksat, "Günün Tıbbi Bahisleri: Gözetleme Hastaları Röntgenci veya Dikizci Denen Cinsi Sapıklar," *Milliyet*, 20.08.1957. "Tıp edebiyatımızda röntgencilik gibi yeni bir tabr kazandıran (!) bu gözetleme hastaları, hukuki ve tıbbi bakımdan incelemeğe değer bir konu teşkil etmektedir."

<sup>517</sup> Conrad and Schneider, Deviance and Medicalization: From Badness to Sickness.

Burhan Felek, "Hadiseler arasında Felek: Deli imiş ...," *Cumhuriyet*, 03.04.1948.

that the individual could not use his/her free will due to any physiological or psychological reason, then the physicians diagnose (or at least try to diagnose) an illness which frees the individual from legal responsibilities and sanctions. The diagnosis became more possible and assured if the physicians could specify and explain the condition for biomedical reasons. When the condition was diagnosed, the individual became open to the interventions of the physicians. In other words, physicians claim that they have the right to decide how the situation and/or the conditions should be handled. If the individual was assessed as a person who functioned with free will and consciousness, then the corrective responsibility of his/her actions was left in the hands of the legal authorities. The individual is announced as a competent person with criminal capacity. The consequences of his/her actions were responded with criminal code. Felek was skeptical about the doctor's decision to release the murderer. Also, he was critical of the previous services of doctors that he reflected on in this cynical narrative.

Although the act could be the same, the decision and definition of the act, *deviance*, whether it is a crime or an illness, was left in the hands of the experts, namely, the physicians. <sup>520</sup> Physicians turned into the ultimate actors to have the final word on the lives of individuals. So, physicians have almost the most important role since they, at the end, decide about the intervention methods and actors. The importance of the physician's role lies in the roots of their legitimacy. Although they claim that their knowledge depends on science and medicine per se, scientific knowledge is not neutral. The norms of medical assessment were structured with the moral codes of the scientists and physicians. <sup>521</sup> In other words, the medical assessment of the physical well-being of the individuals was based on the interpretation of the physicians that is, a combination of "scientific findings" and physician's analysis. A physician's analysis is not only the outcome of his/her academic

Gary Gutting, "Foucault and History of Madness," in *The Cambridge Companion to Foucault*, ed. Gary Gutting (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005), 47-67.

<sup>520</sup> Conrad and Schneider, Deviance and Medicalization: From Badness to Sickness.

Vernon A. Rosario, *Homosexuality and Science: A Guide to Debates* (Santa Barbara, Denver and Oxford: ABC-CLIO, 2002), 205. Robert D. Truog, "Patients and Doctors — The Evolution of a Relationship," *The New England Journal Of Medicine* 366, 7 (2012), 582.

building. However, it is also limited by his/her perception and perspective of life. Besides, the academic findings, which formed maily his/her academic building, were also loaded with the premises and presupposes of the scientists. Consequently, physician's assessment whether the individual has an illness or not depends on his/her perception of what is considered within the limits of norms. Due to the changing character of the era and the effects of personal moral values, some sexual acts lingered in the gray area. Physicians could not decide about some sexual acts, whether they are deviant acts or an illness. They sometimes even used cultural or religious moral values to negate the act.

The more profound and obvious case that displays the grayness between sickness and criminality was the discourse on homosexuality. The narrative in the magazines and newspapers assessed homosexual acts as a deviancy caused by physical abnormalities such as lack of testosterone hormones. A reader asked Seksoloji two questions consequently. One question was about his homosexual tendencies. The reader from Istanbul stated that he is a 19years old boy and had homosexual tendencies and practices since his childhood. Following question was about his sexual organs, which are small like a child. He wanted to know whether this situation could be fixed. To the reader's letter, the editorial team stated that his underdeveloped sexual organs are the reason of his deviancy. According to Seksoloji, his situation can be fixed with hormone treatment. Therefore, a urologist can treat him. 523 In some cases, homosexual acts were seen due to the psychological abuse experienced during the childhood. Apart from taking homosexuality as an outcome of an illness, homosexual acts were also seen as a result of hedonistic pursuits. The authors blamed the individuals with same-sex experience as "pleasure-seeking deviants." 524 In those cases, they were

For a detailed discussion about the role of the scientist, see the Chapter 2.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Sual ve Cevaplar – Sual 141," *Seksoloji*, 18 (1950), 58. "Z.A. Istanbul – 19 yaşında bir erkek çocuğuyum. Küçük yaşımdan beri kendimde homoseksüellik temayülleri duydum ve bir müddet sonar bu cinsi sapıklığa kendimi kaptırdım. Bundan nasıl kurtulabilirim? Tenasül uzuvlarım, bir çocuğunki gibi küçüktür. Bu halim düzeltilebilir mi?"

<sup>524</sup> Recep Doksat argued that homosexuality happens out of pervert sexual acts. With reference to Alfred Kinsey, he stated that homosexual acts are not due to an illness or hormonal abnormality. Rather, he stated that homosexuality happens when young body *abnormal* 

considered a threat to the moral codes of the public. In the narratives, where homosexuality was seen as a result of free will, it was considered a punishable crime to dissuade homosexuals from the act and protect the public by displaying the punished examples of the wrong choices. Particularly, laws and examples from the USA and England were used in the narratives of the newspapers, such as "29 homosexuals were arrested in one day," Perversion cases increase day by day in England," Prostitution and homosexuality will be prevented in England," Iiquidation in the US foreign affairs," Sex perverts in the UK: a committee to investigate homosexuals and prostitution."

Homosexual acts were not read as the behaviors of an individual for a particular time. Instead, homosexuality was turned into a concept that defined their identities.<sup>530</sup> They named the individuals such as homosexuals and fetishes, under the big title of deviants (or perverts). All in all, the writers felt certain that homosexuality was an abnormality. However, they could not decide how to classify the individuals. The most ambiguous discussions came out of the examples where same-sex sexual activities were conducted by women. For women, homosexuality was considered as a result of their sexual underdevelopment (*tam inkişaf edememiş kimselerdir*).<sup>531</sup>

As for the intervention methods, practices differed radically from treatment suggestions to penal sanctions. Some writers, like in the USA, suggested punishing homosexual individuals with fines or imprisonment. On the other hand, some writers invited physicians to intervene and cure homosexual individuals. Some suggested psychiatric treatments, while

sexuality. Recep Doksat, "Günün Tıbbi Bahisleri: Cinsi Terbiye," *Milliyet*, 28.01.1958. Recep Doksat, "Sağlık Bahisleri: Kalb ameliyatları tekamül ettiriliyor," *Milliyet*, 14.08.1951.

- 525 "Bir günde 29 homoseksüel yakalandı." *Milliyet*, 18.05.1957
- 526 "İngilterede cinsi sapıklıklar günden güne çoğalıyor," Milliyet, 21.05.1954
- 527 "İngilterede fahişelik ve homoseksüellik önlenecek," Milliyet, 17.12.1955
- 528 "Amerikan dışişlerindeki tasfiyeler," Milliyet, 14.04.1953
- 529 "İngilterede cinsi sapıklar: Homoseksüeller ve fuhuş hakkında tahkikat yapmak için bir komite," *Milliyet*, 30.04.1954
- Judith Butler, *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity* (New York and London: Routledge, 1999), vii-xxvii.
- 531 "Kadın Homoseksüeller," Seksoloji, 39 (1952), 54.

145

others suggested hormonal treatments since the source of homosexuality was seen in the hormones. 532 Last but not least, "homosexual" individuals were asked to find ways to correct themselves. A reader from Nazilli asked Seksoloji journal what he should do to save himself. Nazilli letter stated that he is a 27 years old young man, who is "full of disgusting emotions and miserable feelings; and trying to get rid of this terrible, dark world alone."533 The reply letter tried to soothe the young man by stating that his situation is not his fault. Rather, it could be an outcome of his family's sexual bigotory or his hormonal insufficiency. Therefore, the editorial team suggested consulting a doctor to examine his hormones. The editorial team encouraged the young man to use his will to overcome this situation. Moreover, they (he) asked the young man to seek refuge in God. Last but not least, the editorial team requested from the young man to change his friend circle with using his will. Additionally, the reply insisted young man to "work on feeling normal manly feelings toward women and girls." The reply ended with a promise about spiritual pleasures.<sup>534</sup> Whether the situation was considered as an illness or as a deviancy from a criminal perspective, any abnormality was treated as a threat to the well-being of the population.<sup>535</sup> Abnormalities should be controlled and intervened with medical or corrective methods to protect the population's physiological, psychological, or moral well-being. When the illnesses and abnormalities were explained and discussed in detail, the writers also covered treatment options for the diseases. They provided provided elaborative lists of the treatment methods such as in Nazilli reply. Treatment methods were shared not only to inform public. They were used to show the path to attaining the *norm-normal*.

For an assessment of the period's treatment, see, Donald Webster Cory, "Homoseksüellik Tedavi Edilebilir mi?" *Seksoloji Yıllığı*, 4 (1955): 177-183.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Sual ve Cevaplar, Sual 26," *Seksoloji*, 3 (1949), 61. "…iğrenç duygulara, perişan hislere garkolmuş, bu korkunç, karanlık alemden tek başıma kurtulmağa çabalıyorum."

<sup>&</sup>quot;Sual ve Cevaplar, Sual 26," *Seksoloji*, 3 (1949), 61. "Şuna emin olunuz ki, bir kadınla bir erkeğin birlikte duydukları sade cismani değil, manevi zevkler de hiç bir şeyle değiştirilmeyecek kadar yüksek ve kıymetlidir. Bunları neden siz tatmıyasınız?"

<sup>535</sup> Sancar, *Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti*, 262. Sancar stated that male homosexuality was narrated as a sexual deviancy in the daily newspapers during the 1950s which became a part of criminal investigations regarding orginary crimes and/or homicides.

Furthermore, treatment methods were narrated as new inventions and as a part of the modern world. Recep Doksat introduced new treatment methods for various illnesses to the readers of Milliyet frequently.<sup>536</sup>

The writers discussed the illnesses and abnormalities with their opposites: the ways of being healthy. The articles on "being healthy" did not only include the treatment methods for the illnesses. Instead, they offered information about how to prevent illnesses and how to better or protect one's health. In the magazines, there were articles about improving sexual health, such as "cinsiyet ve uyku" (sexuality and sleep). Seksoloji announced that they decided to publish an article about general health topics in every issue. The common understanding of the authors was underlining that the normal condition was "being healthy." They frequently referred to medical standards of being healthy and defined "being sick" as an anomaly. The medical narrative strengthened its place in the public discourse with its frequent appearance. Günlük Tibbi Bahisler (Daily Medical Subjects) was one of the columns which were published daily in Milliyet.

# 2.4.5. Public surveys, advice columns, and question-answers columns

Recep Doksat, "Sağlık Bahisleri: Prostat Ameliyatında Yeni Bir Usul Tatbik Ediliyor."
Milliyet, 22.05.1950. Recep Doksat, "Sağlık bahisleri: vereme karşı yeni tedbirler,"
Milliyet, 12.09.1950.

Marie C. Stopes, "Cinsi Münasebet ve Uyku," *Seksoloji*, 50 (1953), 32-35. L.E. Eubanks, "Cinsi tatminsizliğin sebep olduğu uykusuzluk," *Seksoloji*, 2 (1949), 29-31.

In the introduction column which was written by the editorial board of the Seksoloji journal. "Ailede Sağlık: Yarım baş ağrısı," *Seksoloji*, 49 (1953), 41. "Sıhhat, saadetin temel şartıdır. Ailede saadetin yollarını göstermeyi başlıca gaye edinen mecmuamız, işte bu sebeple bundan sonra her sayısına umumi sağlık bahisleriyle ilgili bir makale koymaya karar vermiştir."

Recept Doksat and Ercüment Baktır prepared daily columns about different subject on health related issues during the 1950s. For providing health advice to women during the 1950s, see: Kaitlynn Mendes, "Reading Chatelaine: Dr. Marion Hilliard and 1950s Women's Health Advice," *Canadian Journal of Communication* 35 (2010), 515-531. Rachel Ritchie, "The Housewife and the Modern: The Home And Appearance in Women's Magazines, 1954 – 1969" (Ph.D. Dissertation, the University of Manchester, 2010), 189-220

There were two areas in which the readers were involved directly instead of being passive recipients of the magazines. The first area was the *public surveys*, while the second area was the question-answer columns. *Public surveys were one of the places where readers' reactions or input were reflected on the pages of published materials*. The types of surveys were differentiated based on their aims and what they wanted to achieve. The publishers divide the public surveys into two categories: scientific surveys and opinion-collecting surveys.

The opinion-collecting surveys were mainly formed as interviews and presented with summaries and quotes from the interviewers. The questions were prepared by the editorial team of the magazine and newspaper. In some cases, the questions were listed separately in a box to allow the readers to follow the questions. The questions were mostly formed around the topics of sexuality. The opinion-collecting surveys could also be divided into two categories. The first category consisted of the interviews, which were conducted with well-known figures. Anketimiz (Our Survey), as mentioned before, was the most symbolic example of such surveys. Anketimiz consisted of ten parts and was published as a series. The interviews were conducted with well-known academics from different disciplines. Anketimiz was presented as "an opinion survey with expert scientists."<sup>540</sup> The survey consisted of two questions. The first question was, "What do you think about the importance of sexual manners?" The second question was, "What do you think about our journal?" Seksoloji published every single interview separately for each issue. In the last issue, Muzaffer Aşkın, the journal editor, summarized the answers to present a general view.<sup>541</sup> Anketimiz was prepared, essentially, to gain legitimacy in the public eye. The journal interviewed well-known figures to show their support and confirm its reputation. Nevertheless, Anketimiz was one of the good examples of opinion surveys in the 1950s. The opinion surveys were not only conducted with well-known figures from Turkey. Famous names from

Fahrettin Kerim Gökay in May 1949, Şekip Tunç in June 1949, Necmettin Rıfat Yarar in July 49, Kazım İsmail Gürkan in August 1949, Şinasi Hakkı Erel in September 1949, Sadi Irmak in November 1949, Peyami Safa in December 1949, Ferit Saymen in January 1950 and Selim Sırrı Tarcan in February 1950.

<sup>541</sup> Muzaffer Aşkın, "Anketimizin Bilançosu," Seksoloji, 13 (1950), 4-8.

Hollywood have also taken part in the Seksoloji journal with their interviews on different subjects such as marriage, flirting, or the definition of a good wife.<sup>542</sup>

Opinion surveys were also conducted with "regular folk." In the Seksoloji Almanac, the editors selected common professions such as housewife (as defined as a profession), a captain, a butcher, and a businessman to ask their opinion about sexual manners. The answers of the participants were represented as "what does the folk (halk) say?" In the survey, Karçal and Uraz tried to receive the assessments of the participants about the level of sexual manners in Turkey and whether they wanted to teach sexual manners to their children. With the opinion surveys, the journal aimed to display the popular view of the citizens.

The second type of public survey was presented as scientific surveys. The presentation of the scientific surveys was opened by introducing the names of the researchers and the institutions. This form of the survey could be conducted in another country and shared through translation with the readers in Turkey. The most well-known example of this kind of survey was the Kinsey research, which was conducted in the United States to understand the sexual practices of individuals. Kinsey was presented as "one

<sup>&</sup>quot;Karımı neden severim," *Seksoloji*, (1951). Virginia Mayo, "Hollywood ne düşünüyor? Erkeğin kalbini kazanmak için," *Seksoloji Yıllığı*, 1 (1952): 82-88. The article shared the views of Gene Tierney, Gregory Peck, Erol Flynn, Esther Williams, Hedy Lamar, Tony Curtis, Marilyn Monroe and Clark Gable about marriage, flirting and love.

<sup>543</sup> Selçuk Karçal and Kayıhan Uraz, "Seksolojinin Yıllığının Büyük Anketi: Halk Ne Diyor?" Seksoloji Yıllığı, 4 (1955), 132.

Selçuk Karçal and Kayıhan Uraz, "Seksolojinin Yıllığının Büyük Anketi: Halk Ne Diyor?" *Seksoloji Yıllığı*, 4 (1955), 133. "Anketimizin Sualleri: 1-Türkiyede cinsi ahlak bakımından bir düşüklük var mıdır, varsa sebebi ne olabilir. 2-Siz cinsi terbiye aldınız mı? 3-Çocuklarınıza cinsi terbiye vermek istiyor musunuz? Istiyorsanız bunun ne şekilde olmasına taraftarsınız? 4-Çocuklarınızın görücü usulü ile mi yoksa tanışıp anlaşarak mı evlenmelerini istersiniz ? 5-Çocuklarınızın öbür cinsten gençlerle arkadaşlık ederken işleyebilecekleri hataların mesuliyetini kime yüklersiniz?" (Questions of Our Survey: 1-Is there a low level of sexual morality in Turkey, if so, what could be the reason? 2-Did you receive sexual manners? 3-Do you want to teach sexual manners to your children? If so, how would you like it to be? 4-Do you want our children to get married by an arranged method or by meeting and agreeing? 5-Who do you blame for the mistakes your children may commit while befriending [flirting] young people of the other sex?)

of the professors of Indiana University."545 The surveys could be presented directly by the researchers or by another author who summarizes the research to introduce it to the public. Muzaffer Aşkın presented the Kinsey research "on the sexual practices of women which was published last month [September 1953] in America."<sup>546</sup> Aşkın first described the scientific discipline, sexology. He informed the readers about the methods of conducting research on sexual practices. Askin stated that "...sexology is an empirical science."547 Askın's identification of sexology as an empiric science matched with the scientific trends of the 1950s. Empirical research was heavily promoted in the 1950s due to the effort and curiosity to learn about the actual behaviors of individuals.<sup>548</sup> Aşkn discussed the difficulties of researching sexual practices and put a strong emphasis on the number of the interviewees to display the large sample and, consequently, comprehensive coverage of the survey. Aşkın stated that Kinsey and his friends conducted interviews with more than 15.000 individuals in the last 15 years for two researches. His first book was about the sexual behaviors of men in 1948, while [this] publication was about the sexual practices of women in 1953. According to Askın, Kinsey interviewed more than 6000 women.<sup>549</sup> The Kinsey Report on female sexuality was translated to Turkish by the Seksoloji publications in January 1955. The advertisements for the translated book were published in Cumhuriyet and Milliyet. 550 Apart from the complete translations, summaries and parts of his researches were published in Seksoloji to inform the Turkish readers about different sexual subjects.551

Katherine Allen, "Büyük Seksologlar: Alfred Kinsey," Seksoloji, 14 (1950), 9.

<sup>546</sup> Muzaffer Aşkın, "Kadının Cinsi Davranışları," Seksoloji, 55 (1953), 1.

<sup>547</sup> Muzaffer Aşkın, "Kadının Cinsi Davranışları," *Seksoloji*, 55 (1953), 1."... seksoloji tamamen tecrübi bir ilimdir."

For a detailed discussion about the sexual researches in the 1950s, see: Ericksen, *Kiss and Tell: Surveying Sex in the Twentieth Century*. For the effects of the empirical research in the 1950s in Turkey, see: Örnek, "1950'li yıllarda ABD ile buluşma".

<sup>549</sup> Muzaffer Aşkın, "Kadının Cinsi Davranışları," Seksoloji, 55 (1953), 2, 4.

<sup>550 &</sup>quot;Kinsey raporu yarın çıkıyor.," *Milliyet*, 17.01.1955. "Kinsey Raporu," *Milliyet*, 18.01.1955. "Kinsey Raporu," *Cumhuriyet*, 18.01.1955.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Dünya Hadiseleri: Dünyada atom bombası kadar dehşet, korku ve alaka uyandıran kitap," *Cumhuriyet*, 28.08.1953.

As introduced in the "Chapter 3: Sexuality" chapter and discussed regarding the reactions, another interesting survey attempt was actualized relatively late, in 1962, by Milliyet. The "Woman – Man with their sexual and social behaviors" survey launched its questionnaires on the pages of Milliyet in 1962. The results of the survey were shared with the audience in January 1963. The newspaper presented the survey as "the first and most comprehensive of its kind."552 The survey questionnaire was a – shorter – replica of the Kinsey research. It asked open-ended questions, leaving room for the audience to respond rather than the predetermined options. The survey began with basic demographic questions about gender, age, and income. It continued with the question to understand how much knowledge the subject entails about sexual manners, such as "when did you recognize yourself sexually?" and "are you providing sexual education (sexual manners) for your child?" The survey also included questions about the love lives of the subjects, such as "how many times did you fall in love?"; "how many individuals did you love?"; and "did you flirt?" Another area of the survey was related to the sexual desires and experiences of the subjects. In the questionnaire, it was asked whether the subject had sexual dreams, whether he/she had a premarital sexual experience, whether they received sexual pleasure from their intercourse or not, and whether they ever experienced an out-of-marriage sexual experience. The survey aimed to investigate the sexual practices of the Turkish population.<sup>553</sup> The questionnaire was answered by 2089 men and 85 women, for a total of 2940 individuals. Fifty-seven answered questionnaires were not assessed since they had been found as gayri ciddi (not serious). The survey was conducted with 640 men and 227 women. Also, the survey used 421 private letters sent by the readers. All the answers were categorized and assessed from a scientific perspective and with the help of a science committee, which was formed by three academics in medicine—Ord. Prof. Nașit Erez, Prof. Necmettin Polvan, and Doç. Dr. Metin Özek -. The newspaper, in the first

<sup>552 &</sup>quot;Türkiyede Kadın Erkek," *Milliyet*, 28.03.1962. "Türkiyede Kadın Erkek, anketi memleketimizde yapılan bu nevi ilk teşebbüstür."

<sup>553 &</sup>quot;Türkiye'de Kadın Erkek," *Milliyet*, 28.03.1962. "Bu suretle Türk Cemiyetinin cinsel davranısının tesbite çalışacak…"

issue of the series, has published a brief background of the academics, with a particular emphasis on their scientific skills and achievements. The newspaper attempted to fortify its position as scientific and respectful publishing by underlining and assuring its readers about the scientific nature of the coming publication beforehand. The answers were divided into men and women and assessed regarding their sex. The survey was started by displaying the sexual and social behaviors of women. 554 Both for men and women, the analysis also contained a demographic description, which demonstrated that the survey had received answers from different economic and educational backgrounds.<sup>555</sup> The series has started with the analysis of women in Turkey. It displayed the pre-marriage relationship patterns, including flirting and marriage patterns. Besides the analysis of the particular subject, every issue was supported by a piece on a particular subject written by an academic. In the first issue, Naşid Erez wrote a piece on flirting. 556 In the surveys, the authors were mainly concerned with the proper usage of scientific methods. In the Milliyet survey, when they published the questionnaire a second time, they asked their readers "not-tosend their answers a second time" in order to protect the accuracy of the survey.<sup>557</sup> In one of the articles, Aytul mentioned the importance of the sample and discussed the presentation capacity of the current sample of the survey.<sup>558</sup>

Their endless aim to display the validity of their scientific methods was part of their strategy to claim their accuracy in the information of

<sup>&</sup>quot;Cinsel ve Sosyal Davranışlarıyla Kadın," *Milliyet*, 06.01.1963.

According to Milliyet, among the women who have participated in the survey, attended schools as: 438 primary school, 320 middle school and institute, 240 highschool and institute, 57 college and university. Regarding their economic background: 242 of the interviees with an income lower than 500 Turkish Lira, 113 with an income between 500-750 Turkish Lira, 510 with an income between 750-1000 Turkish Lira, 250 with an income between 1000-1500 Turkish Lira, 47 with an income of 1500 and above. "Bu anket nüfusu 100 veya 50 binin üstündeki şehirlerde oturan orta veya lise eğitimli geliri 750-1500 arasında olan kız ve kadınların cinsel ve sosyal davranışlarını açıklamaktadır."

Nașid Erez, "Endişeye Lüzum Yok," Milliyet, 06.01.1963.

Turhan Aytul, "Türkiyede Kadın Erkek," *Milliyet*, 01.04.1962. Aytul published the questions second time.

Turhan Aytul ed., *Türkiye'de Cinsiyet Problemi* (İstanbul: Varlık Yayınevi, 1964).

individuals' sexual behaviors 559 and defend themselves against the countless critics regarding the open display of "shameful" sexual stopics Starting in the 1940s, the writers popularized the use of scientific methods with the help of surveys. Moreover, they convinced the individuals to contribute as active participants with their answers, letters, and interviews to their scientific studies. They have turned the private information of the individuals into public knowledge and, furthermore, into facts. Additionally, with the authority of science, they displayed these controversial facts openly. That narrative was also supported by the search for "the norm" in and for society. Scientists started to develop methods and conduct research to learn from individuals' experiences and behaviors while developing appropriate methods that would help collect and conduct field knowledge. The facts, which were the outcome of these empiric studies and based on scientific methods, became the true information about the sexual behaviors of individuals.<sup>560</sup> They were turned into political tools to define normal (sexual) behavior.<sup>561</sup> Science was seen as a tool for progress since it could bring professionalism (scientism) in management and clarity in understanding the "real" experiences and needs of individuals. 562

Another section that provided advice to the readers was the "sual and cevaplar" (question and answers) section in Seksoloji. 563 In the first and

<sup>559</sup> Ericksen, Kiss and Tell: Surveying Sex in the Twentieth Century, 2.

<sup>560</sup> Ericksen, Kiss and Tell: Surveying Sex in the Twentieth Century, 14-67.

<sup>561</sup> Ericksen, Kiss and Tell: Surveying Sex in the Twentieth Century, 2.

Andrew Jewett, *Science, Democracy and the American University: From the Civil War to the Cold War* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012), 1-21. See the chapter that discusses the relation between science and the democracy.

Seksoloji was not the only magazine with a question and answer column about sexual matters. Sağlığımız (our health) also prepared a separate section for the sexuality-related questions. However, unlike the Seksoloji journal, the questions were presented without names (or letters of the names) and location. Besides, the form of the question differed from "first-person singular" to a neutral tone such as "third-person singular," such as "bir çocuğumuz olacağını tahmin ediyoruz. Karım son defa olarak ekimin 16sında adet gördü.." (we guessed that we would have a child. My wife had her last period on the sixteenth of the October...) or "Kısırlığın tedavisi mümkün müdür? Nasıl tedavi edilir?" (Is treatment of infertility possible? How could it be treated? Again, the answers to the question were significantly different. In the column "Cinsiyet Mevzuunda Sual ve Cevaplar" (Question and answers on the sexuality subject), the answers provided detailed information about the

second issues of the journal, the editors informed their readers that they would prepare a "question and answer column." In the first issue, the editors presented the content and style of the "question and answers column. With this column, the editors wanted to provide a space for the readers to write aboute their problems without hesitation and benefit from the answer. The editorial team assured the readers that every single question would be genuine cases that would be interesting, noteworthy, and beneficial to read. <sup>564</sup> They promised the readers to analyze their problems from different perspectives. They also added that competent (salahiyetli) experts will answer these questions. Last but not least, they promised the readers to keep the names and addresses confidential. 565 In the second issue, the editorial team expanded their presentation and explanations regarding the question and answer column. They stated that they would publish questions and answers selectively. They will publish letters from which the general public can benefit. They decided to answer the rest of the letters privately. Therefore, the editorial team asked for a clear signature and address to provide a reply. 566 In the third volume, the question and answers column started to publish the original readers' questions. In the introduction of the third volume, the editorial team stated that they had received numerous letters from their readers, which had proved the need for speaking frankly in the country. Moreover, such a demand was an indicator of "people's need to seek real solutions for their sexual problems without having a fake shame feeling."567 The question-answer column continued until the end of the magazine (sixtieth issue).

question in a detailed manner with full sentences and proper references to the academic literature without addressing the owner of the question. In other words, Sağlığımız had a more academic tone compared to the Seksoloji magazine in its answers, which ignored the personal relationship with the question owner. "Cinsiyet Mevzuunda Sual ve Cevaplar," Sağlığımız, 2 (1959), 30-31.

- "Sual ve Cevaplar," *Seksoloji*, 2 (1949), 60-64. "Muhakkak ki bunlardan her biri ibret ve istifadeyle okunacak hakiki vakalardır."
- 565 "Sual ve Cevaplar", Seksoloji, 1 (1949), 59-64.
- 566 "Sual ve Cevaplar," Seksoloji, 2 (1949), 60-64.
- 567 "Sual ve Cevaplar," *Seksoloji*, 3 (1949), 58-63. "Sadece bu vaziyet bile, memleketimizde cinsi meselelerden açıkça konuşmanın, cinsi dertlerin hakiki çarelerini sahte bir hicap duymadan aramanın ne büyük bir ihtiyaç olduğunu göstermeğe kafidir."

The column took around four-pages place in around sixty pages per issue. Questions and answers were presented with the capital letters of the names, like L.B.K and with the town and/or city from where the letter was sent, such as Havza.<sup>568</sup> Some of the cities and towns which were mentioned in the Question-Answers columns were Alaşehir, Bursa, İstanbul, Erzincan, Iğdır, Nazilli, İzmir, Sivas, 569 Ankara, Kırşehir, Erzurum, Kırıkkale, Eskisehir, Pasabahçe (Istanbul);<sup>570</sup> Cankırı, Besiktas (İstanbul), Edirne.<sup>571</sup> The collection of cities demonstrated that the magazine's reach was not limited to major cities such as Istanbul, Ankara, or İzmir. 572 In the questionand-answer in women's magazines, the column was structured around subjects such as dating techniques, love interests, domestic management, and child-rearing.<sup>573</sup> Different than the women's magazines of the era, in Seksoloji, the column was structured more around sexuality and sexualityrelated problems of individuals. Therefore, the questions that appeared in the Seksoloji journal varied among different topics, with titles such as "infertility," "male impotence," "mutual satisfaction and harmony," 574 "pregnancy, menses, and infertility," and "gonorrhea malfunctions, infertility."575

The questions in the column were formed as personal narratives. More openly, the question's author inquired about a personal problem based on his or her own experience. Some of the individuals who posed the questions

568 "Sual ve Cevaplar," Seksoloji, 11 (1950), 60.

<sup>569 &</sup>quot;Sual ve Cevaplar," Seksoloji, 11, (1950), 60-64.

<sup>570 &</sup>quot;Sual ve Cevaplar," Seksoloji, 12 (1950), 55-58.

<sup>571 &</sup>quot;Sual ve Cevaplar," *Seksoloji*, 13 (1950), 61-64.

<sup>572</sup> Since the authenticity of the letters could not be confirmed, the outreach of the magazine could be questioned. However, in this case, the editorial team aimed to present itself as a publication that was not only consumed by a limited number of people. Instead, they aimed to demonstrate that they can connect with "ordinary" people from different parts of the country.

Koçer, "Demokrat Parti Döneminde Kadın," 151. Bashford and Strange, "Public Pedagogy: Sex Education and Mass Communication in the Mid–Twentieth Century," 84.

<sup>574 &</sup>quot;Sual ve Cevaplar," *Seksoloji*, 7 (1949), 59-60. "46-İktidarsızlık," "48-Erkeğin Kısırlığı," "49- müsterek tatmin ve ahenk"

<sup>575 &</sup>quot;Sual ve Cevaplar," *Seksoloji*, 8 (1949), 60, 63. "gebelik, aybaşı ve kısırlık," and "belsoğukluğu arızaları, kısırlık"

stated that they were afraid, ashamed or worried about their problem.<sup>576</sup> They stated that they were seeking answers to the problems in Seksoloji.<sup>577</sup> A 28-year-old man stated in a letter from Istanbul that he is hesitant to see a doctor.<sup>578</sup> In some letters, they said that they did not want to see a doctor and ask for a medical opinion or a pharmaceutical solution. In these cases, the editorial team often hesitated to suggest a diagnosis or a remedy. The editorial team refused to reply to a question from Bandrma. They stated that it would be best for him to be examined by a urologist.<sup>579</sup> To another letter, the editorial replied that they could not suggest a medicine from a distance. 580 The reason for the readers' hesitation regarding going to a doctor is a gray area. Whether due to the nature of their problem – sexual problems – or due to the lack of medical services, readers sought answers in Seksoloji. Sometimes, the letters asked the question in generic terms and avoided pointing out the actor who experienced a related problem if the topic was a shameful subject. A question about homosexuality was formed as an ordinary curious letter. The person criticized the publication's limited interest in homosexuality and asked whether a homosexual man could marry and be happy.<sup>581</sup>

In some cases, the questions were published at the same length as the letters, whereas in other cases, they were shortened by the editorial team.

<sup>576 &</sup>quot;Sual ve Cevaplar," *Seksoloji*, 27 (1951), 59. "İktidarsız olup olmadığımı nasıl anlayabilirim? Son derece üzülüyorum. Yaşama arzumu bile kaybettim. Bana yardım etmenizi rica ediyorum." (How can I tell if I am impotent? I am extremely sorry. I even lost my will to live. I beg you to help me.)

<sup>577 &</sup>quot;Sual ve Cevaplar," *Seksoloji*, 37 (1952), 59. "429-Belsoğukluğu Arızası: .... Beni bu dertten kurtarmanızı ve bir yol göstermenizi rica ederim."

<sup>578 &</sup>quot;Sual ve Cevaplar," *Seksoloji*, 38 (1952), 59. "449-Kendine Güvensizlik: ..... Doktora gitmeye çekiniyorum..."

<sup>579 &</sup>quot;Sual ve Cevaplar," *Seksoloji*, 39 (1952), 61. "453-Bekarlıkta cinsi hayat: .... C.D.R.K Bandırma – Bir ürolog tarafından muayene olmanız lazımdır. Vaziyetinizi yakından görmeden bir tavsiyede bulunmamız, ne bizim için kabil, ne de sizin için faydalıdır."

<sup>580 &</sup>quot;Sual ve Cevaplar," *Seksoloji*, 39 (1952), 61. "453-Bekarlıkta cinsi hayat: M. Gü. Sivas – Biz uzaktam bir ilaç tavsiye edemeyiz, mutlaka bir doktora gitmelisiniz."

<sup>&</sup>quot;Sual ve Cevaplar," *Seksoloji*, 24 (1951), 57. "204-Homosekseüeller evlenebilir mi: S.K. İstanbul – Homosekseüeller hakkında çok az yazı neşrediyorsunuz, bu gibileri daha fazla aydınlatsanız olmaz mı?..."

The questions, which were published with their original length and narrative, gave clues about the demographic information of the owner, such as age, class, and living settings, and also characteristics of the individual as she or he described herself or himself.<sup>582</sup> In these columns, the answers formed an individual piece since they were allegedly based on personal problems. The repliers addressed their readers with personal intimacy, which occasionally incorporated advice or reflections into the answer.<sup>583</sup> In an answer, the editorial team began its reply with "it is natural not to be interested in prostitutes for an enlightened young man like you."584 The editors seemed to focus on a particular individual, the question-owner, to find a solution. However, the editors used the questions in order to inform the general public with their answers. The narrative in the columns was a combination of addressing individuals or the general public. The editorial not only responded to the particular reader. However, they added "pedagogical" discourse into their answers to educate the public.<sup>585</sup> Regardless, this column "linked the expert not only to individual readerpatients but to mass audiences." 586 They used the questions of readers who were seeking personal sex advice as an opportunity to instruct the general readership.<sup>587</sup> In another way of saying this, the editorial team has created a platform to reach the mass audience with the language of an expert that inserted medical terminology into the answers.

The questions in "the question and answers column" were presented as authentic letters. Undeniably, the authenticity of the questions from the

authentic letters. Undeniably, the authenticity of the questions from the

<sup>582</sup> Sual ve Cevaplar," *Seksoloji*, 24 (1951), 55. "199-Kadında Akıntı: A.R. İstanbul: 23 yaşında bir kızım..." "175-Verem ve Evlilik: 26 yaşında, halen ciğerlerine hava verilen, yeni evli ve bir çocuk sahibi bir gencim..."

Bashford and Strange, "Public Pedagogy: Sex Education and Mass Communication in the Mid–Twentieth Century," 85.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Sual ve Cevaplar," *Seksoloji*, 39 (1952), 59. "Cevap- Sizin gibi münevver bir gencin, umumi kadınlara karşı bir istek duymaması kadar tabii bir şey yoktur..."

Bashford and Strange, "Public Pedagogy: Sex Education and Mass Communication in the Mid–Twentieth Century," 92.

Bashford and Strange, "Public Pedagogy: Sex Education and Mass Communication in the Mid–Twentieth Century," 87.

Bashford and Strange, "Public Pedagogy: Sex Education and Mass Communication in the Mid–Twentieth Century," 85.

readers was questionable. They could also be fabricated by the editorial team to discuss particular topics on their agenda. Regardless of the authenticity or fabrication of the questions, the question-answers column "rendered the most private of personal problems and their solutions into a public commodity" for the consumption of its readers for both their pleasure and instruction. Furthermore, the identity of the answering part is another debatable subject. The journal stated repeatedly that the answers would be provided by experts. Moreover, readers were encouraged to share their sexuality-related (intimate) problems with experts to find a solution. Although it was displayed as a personal relationship between the expert (physician) and patient, the identity of the expert (journalist) was not known. The readers did not have any idea or knowledge of who had given the advice.

The question and answer format did not only appear in the magazines. The question and answer format was also chosen for other "sexual manners" manuals. "200 sual 200 cevap" (200 question 200 answer) was presented as "a manual that would answer the most frequently asked questions about sex life." <sup>589</sup> 200 sual 200 cevap was an edited book which was a combination of Hannah and Abraham Stone's well-known "A Marriage Manual" and Edward Podolsky's "Modern Sex Manual." Obviously, the question-answer format had the power to personalize the topics. It also simplified and popularized answers to reach a mass audience. Question and answer columns provide "true" knowledge to readers. They had the authority of medicine and answered the question – allegedly – from a scientific framework. However, they have left the rest—whether to correct their behaviors or not—to the question owners.

### 2.4.6. Translations as the Main Source for Sexuality

Bashford and Strange, "Public Pedagogy: Sex Education and Mass Communication in the Mid–Twentieth Century," 90.

<sup>589 200</sup> Sual 200 Cevap, trans. N.P. (İstanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1952), 1. Translator and editor of the manual was not stated in the publication. However, Seksoloji published parts of "A Marriage Manual" in 1953. While publishing the parts, the journal stated that Muzaffer Aşkın is the translator and editor of the articles.

Texts on sexual manners can be classified into two types according to the source of the materials: indigenous texts and translated texts. The indigenous texts were produced by the public figures and local experts. The content of the translated texts needed a closer look to understand the intervention to shape public discourse on sexual manners and female sexuality. The effect of translated texts on shaping the discourse was quite significant since they formed the majority of the content. More than half of the articles in the sexual manners and women's magazines related to gender roles, marriage, sexual manners, and sexuality were translated from foreign languages. According to Koçak's study, between the years 1931 and 1960, "translations accounted for around 60% of the entire body of non-literary popular texts on women's sexuality." Especially after the 1950s, the dominant language of the translated texts on marriage, family life, and female sexuality was English, which was followed by German and

According to Fuechter, the formation and development of sexology was based on the circulation and multidirectional movement of the ideas of sexual science. She stated that experts from different parts of the world contributed to the knowledge of sexology through their exchanges with each other (such as visiting each other, travelling, producing internationally and disseminating internationally). Veronika Fuechtner, Douglas E. Haynes, and Ryan M. Jones, "Introduction: Toward a Global History of Sexual Science: Movements, Networks, and Deployments," in *A Global History of Sexual Science*, 1880–1960, ed. Veronika Fuechtner, Douglas E. Haynes, and Ryan M. Jones (Oakland, California: University of California Press, 2018), 3.

<sup>591</sup> For the effects of the translated material on sexology in different contexts, see: Heike Bauer, Sexology and Translation: Cultural and Scientific Encounters across the Modern World, 1880–1930 (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 2015). Howard Hsueh-Hao Chiang, "Double Alterity and the Global Historiography of Sexuality: China, Europe, and the Emergence of Sexuality as a Global Possibility," E-pisteme 2, 1 (2009): 33-52.

<sup>592</sup> Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality," 9. For the importance of translation in distributing information/knowledge on sexology, see: Heike Bauer, English Literary Sexology: Translations of Inversion, 1860-1930 (Londra: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009), 15. Koçer, "Demokrat Parti Döneminde Kadın," 7. Koçak mentioned this observation for the women's magazines during the period.

French.<sup>593</sup> "Anglo-American culture was preferred as the source culture as far as sexuality is concerned." <sup>594</sup>

The translated texts in marriage manuals were divided into three categories. As Koçak mentioned, some texts were original translations that were translated word for a word. 595 Some texts were adapted with or without mentioning the editions, such as Youth Series of Hadise Publishing.<sup>596</sup> In some cases, the translation was adapted to Turkey through working on the original (source) text. The original titles of the sourcebook were changed along with the minor and major adaptations in the content. Some subjects were extracted while, in some cases, some comments were added to the translated texts without leaving a note about the changes. According to Koçak's study, in the marriage manuals, the translators omitted subjects such as fear of incest or the Christian pronouncements about marriage and divorce, which were considered unnecessary and unsuitable for Turkish readers. In the same text, a new chapter was written with the title of "The Place of Religion in the Family Life," which produced Islamic discourse. Besides, a chapter was added to the manual titled "Practical Advice," which summarized all the previous topics, provided two lists of questions for women and men to make them realize the critical factors for happy marriages, and inserted the local expectations on marriage and social life.<sup>597</sup> The adaptations in the marriage manual were presented as an effort of the translator to *localize* the discussions on sexuality, couple relations, marriage

<sup>593</sup> Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality," 87. According to Koçak, there were also texts on female sexuality translated from Arabic, Spanish, Russian, and Japanese.

Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality," 89. According to her research, fourteen out of thirty-three texts on female sexuality were translated from American writers between 1931 and 1960. Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality,"100.

For authentic translation discussion in sexual manners' publications, see: Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality."

<sup>596</sup> See: Youth Life Series from Hadise Publications

<sup>597</sup> Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality," 207-208, 217-218. Koçak mentions the book written by W.E. Sargent and translated by Ömer Rıza Doğrul. W.E. Sargent, Evlilik Hayatında Daha Bahtiyar Olmanın Yolları, trans. Trans. Ömer Rıza Doğrul (Istanbul: Arif Bolat Kitabevi, 1942).

and family. In some cases, responsible publishing houses preferred to adapt, omit or add to the texts based on the cultural necessities of Turkey based on their perception. However, it is necessary to note that it is unknown whether the adaptations were conducted by the translators and the editors of the publishing houses. In some cases, the responsibles of the publishing house -including the translators- decided that the content was not suitable for the readers in Turkey. Through the adaptation process, the translators and editing houses changed the content and the targeted readers of the texts with their touches. Some adaptations were presented as individual texts, whereas some were as edited manuals which turned out to be a collection of different parts of various books (booklets).

The third category was "looking like" translations. Koçak called them pseudo-translations. She stated that the pseudotranslations were published under the name of a foreign author and presented as a translated work although there is no corresponding source text<sup>600</sup> or author. During the period, pseudo translations were not limited to the literature regarding (female) sexuality. Particularly in the detective genre, Semih Yazıcıoğlu was one of the writers of Mike Hammer's Pseudotranslations, while Oğuz Alplaçin was known for his pseudo translations of Mikey Spillane during the 1950s.<sup>601</sup> Gürçağlar displayed that, even, Kemal Tahir has produced a

<sup>&</sup>quot;Aile, milli müesseselerin en mühimidir ve milli ruhun bütün hususiyetlerini taşımakla temayüz edenidir. Bu yüzden aile hayatı ile ve aile hayatının her safhasıyle meşgul olan bir eserin milli bir eser olması icap eder. Okurlarım, bu noktaya ne kadar ehemmiyet verdiğimi, eserde yadırgayacakları bir tek cümle bulmamakla göreceklerdir. Eserin Türk okuruna müfti olması için bu noktaya ehemmiyet verdikten başka tamamile milli mahiyeti haiz olması lazım gelen bahislerini ya tamamile yeniledim, yahut milli görüş süzgecinden geçirmek için azami dikkat gösterdim." W.E. Sargent, Evlilik Hayatında Daha Bahtiyar Olmanın Yolları, trans. Ömer Rıza Doğrul (İstanbul: Arif Bolat Kitabevi, 1942). Quoted from İşıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality," 199-200.

Şehnaz Tahir-Gürçağlar, "The Politics and Poetics of Translation in Turkey 1923-1960"(PhD. Diss., Boğaziçi University, 2001), 473.

<sup>600</sup> Gideon Toury, "The Notion of 'Assumed Translation' - An Invitation to a New Discussion," in *Letterlijkheid, Woordelijheid / Literality, Verbality*, ed. Henri Bloemen, Erik Hertog and Winibert Segers (Antwerpen, Harmelen: Fantom, 1995), 40.

<sup>601</sup> Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality," 93, 105. Elif Berköz, "Capkın Hafiyenin Türkiye Serüveni," *Milliyet*, 02.04.2005.

pseudotranslations titled *Ecel Saati* (Deadly Watch) in 1954 as a part of detective literature. <sup>602</sup>

Hadise publishings launched a manual series (12 manuals), "İnsan Hayatı Serisi" (Human Life Series) in 1956, which included books on female sexuality. All the translated texts of the series were pseudotranslations. On female sexuality, pseudotranslations played two crucial roles. On the one hand, they have provided secrecy and invisibility to discuss the "spicy" subjects. They have provided the anonymity for the writer to introduce sexual subjects to the readers without arousing too much antagonism in society. Onsidering the possible reactions to talking about female sexuality, pseudotranslations provided a safe side for the writers

Tahir-Gürçağlar, "The Politics and Poetics of Translation in Turkey 1923-1960," 447.

<sup>603</sup> Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality," 109. Roch Bess, Evli Kadınlar için Metres Tehlikesi Nedir? İnsan Hayatı Dizisi, 9, trans. Selim Yetkili (Istanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1956). Louis E. Bisch, Kadınlar Niçin İhanet Ederler, İnsan Hayatı Dizisi, 7, trans. Selim Yetkili (İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1956). W. Holliday, Kimseye Söyleyemiyorum, İnsan Hayatı Dizisi, 2, trans. C. Arhan (Istanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1956). Fenande Isambert, Evliliğin İlk Basamağında Neler Bilmelidir, İnsan Hayatı Dizisi, 6, trans. Selim Yetkili (Istanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1956). Fred McMauldin, Buluğ Çağında Bir Kız Neler Bilmelidir, trans. Selim Yetkili (Istanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1956). Fred McMauldin, Her Nişanlı Genç Kız Neler Bilmelidir, İnsan Hayatı Dizisi, 5. Fred McMauldin, Kızıma Nasıl Söyliyeyim: Her genç kız neler bilmelidir, İnsan Hayatı Dizisi, 1, trans. Selim Yetkili (Istanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1956). Betty Whiting, Her Dul Kadın Neler Bilmelidir, İnsan Hayatı Serisi, 4, trans. Selim Yetkili (Istanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1956). Maurice Chickedel, Bekarlarda Cinsi Hayat, trans. Semih Yazıcıoğlu (Istanbul: N.P., 1952). Maurice Chickedel, Nişanlılarda Cinsi Hayat, trans. Semih Yazıcıoğlu (Istanbul: N.P., 1952). Maurice Chickedel, Evlilikte Cinsi Hayat, trans. Semih Yazıcıoğlu (Istanbul: N.P., 1953) quoted from Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality," 362-363.

<sup>604</sup> Toury, The Notion of 'Assumed Translation', 41.

Even Alfred Kinsey has received strong reactions after publishing his research on female sexuality, while his research on male sexuality has received well responses. One of the harshly critical book reviews was written by Hans Zeisel, a Professor of Law and Sociology, University of Chicago, right after the publishing of the Kinsey's study on female sexuality. In the review, Zeisel criticized Kinsey regarding its methods, interviewees and analysis to devalue his study. Hans Zeisel, Book Review on "Sexual Behavior in the Human Female by Alfred C. Kinsey," *The University Of Chicago Law Review*, 21 (1954), 517-525.

and publishers by disguising their identity and, also pretending to be a foreign-American expert. To be seen as an expert on the issue in the public sphere if the writer did not carry any acceptable (referred) academic title could also ease discussing the subjects on female sexuality. On the other hand, pseudotranslations were a part of the publishing's house strategy for marketing. Foreign, particularly American, writers were accepted as experts until the 1960s as far as texts on women's sexuality are concerned. Their works were considered more prestigious or important, which is a sign of subordination to foreign, in this case, American 'scientific' circles. 606 Hence, texts with the names of foreign authors had more credibility among the public, which increased the selling numbers. One of the owners of Cağlayan Kitabevi, 607 which is the same publishing house for Mike Hammer's, Refik Erduran transferred a story from Ertem Eğilmez. 608 Ertem Eğilmez<sup>609</sup> has narrated in his memoirs that he met with the publisher Arif Bolat after finishing his military service. They decided to publish something. He said that he wrote a book titled 10 Derste Cinsiyet (Sex in 10 Lessons) by collecting from here and there. 610 Eğilmez realized that 50.000 copies were sold immediately and the profit was high. He immediately started the second book.<sup>611</sup> Regardless of the authenticity of the texts, pseudotranslations became a part of public discussion on female sexuality. The translated texts were seen as a part of manuals and magazines. The translated manuals were, mostly, presented with an author's name though the name of the translater was not always included. 612

<sup>606</sup> Toury, The Notion of 'Assumed Translation', 42.

<sup>607</sup> Cağlayan publishing house was owned by Refik Erduran, Ertem Eğilmez and Haldun Sel.

Refik Erduran, İblisler, Azizler, Kadınlar (Istanbul: Dünya Kitapları, 2005), 313.

Ertem Eğilmez is one of the owners of the Çağlayan Kitabevi. Besides, he is also a well-known director of Turkish film industry after 1967.

Based on my researches, there is a book: Laurent Chavernac, *On Derste Cinsiyet*, trans. A. Kahraman (Istanbul: Çağlayan Yayınevi, 1957) (Second Edition 1958, Third Edition 1960, Fourth Edition 1965, Fifth Edition 1969) Since he did not mentioned the details in his memoirs, it would be an educated guess to assume that one as same book he mentioned.

<sup>611 &</sup>quot;Oradan buradan toplayıp 10 Derste Cinsiyet diye bir kitap yazdım. Satış müthiş oldu. 50 bin tane hemen tükendi. Baktım tatlı kâr, hemen ikincisi." Erduran, İblisler, Azizler, Kadınlar, 313.

<sup>612</sup> Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality."

Translations had an important place in the magazines. Seksoloji magazine borrowed its name and design, including the front page, from the same-named magazine (Sexology) published by Hugo Gernsback between 1933 and the late 1960s in the United States. Seksoloji translated numerous articles and used visual materials from that magazine, Sexology. 613 Beside the American magazine, Seksoloji has taken articles and visual materials from the European women and marriage magazines, popular marriage and sexology manuals such as Medicine, Elle, Pageant, Votre Sante, Selection. 614 The translated texts in the magazine, in some cases, were presented with the original writer's name. Even in Seksoloji, a short presentation paragraph was added under the title with a different font and right before the beginning of the original article. In some cases, the name of the original magazine, from which the text was translated, was stated under the main title (figure.x).<sup>615</sup> However in some cases, some articles, although translated from foreign magazines, were not signed with the author's name or magazine's name.

The names of the characters such as Giny or Kenneth, the names of the countries and cities such as "Amerikanın Missouri eyaletinde Claytan'da" (in Claytan in Missouri state of America)<sup>616</sup> or universities such as Cornell Üniversitesi (University)<sup>617</sup> indicated that the texts were a translation. Also, there are other types of articles and writings such as checklists such as "how

During the 1950s, seksoloji was not the only one which has borrowed its name, content and design from a US magazine. Besides *Seksoloji*, *Hayat* has borrowed *Life* whereas *Aile* from the *Reader's Digest*.

Examples from Seksoloji: From Medicine: "Şehvet Hastaları," Seksoloji, 37 (1952), 45-47. From Elle: "Karımı Niçin Seviyorum," Seksoloji, 38 (1952), 8-12. From Pageant: "Sağır bir erkekle evlendim," Seksoloji, 38 (1952), 24-28. From Votre Sante: "Mesane Hastalıkları," Seksoloji, 39 (1952), 45-48. From Selection: "Evlilik Şakaya Gelmez," Seksoloji, 41 (1952), 15-18. Also, in women's magazines, Parent's Magazine, Women's Home Companion, Better Homes, Ladies Home, Woman's Day, Everybody's Digest, Collier, Changing Times, Christian Herald, Life Can Be Beatiful were the magazines from which the translations were conducted. Koçer, "Demokrat Parti Döneminde Kadın," 116.

Dr. Bowen Partington, "Kadınlarda Batıl Cinsi İtikatlar," Seksoloji, 7 (1949), 42.

<sup>616 &</sup>quot;Buluğ Çapındaki Çocuklara Nasıl Muamele Etmeli?" Seksoloji, 58 (1954), 3,5.

<sup>617</sup> Lorenzo Chicco, "Cinsiyet ve Koku," Seksoloji, 2 (1949), 43.

to be a good wife or mother" or "how to be a good husband," 618 and short stories without mentioning the name of the writer which hides clues of translation. Different than the magazines and manuals, in the newspapers, whether the articles were not defined as translated or almost not any known translated texts were included. With the translated texts, readers were exposed to various new themes such as adultery, the sexual norms of other societies, the female body, frigidity, reproduction, sexual diseases, sexual fears, different sexual preferences, sexual illnesses and fidelity.

The translated texts were not only carrying the subjects to the eyes of the Turkish public. They have also brought women's (sexual) experiences in foreign countries, primarily the United Stated of America. The ties with the United States undoubtedly enabled the publishing houses to translate from American resources. During the 1950s, United States was a model country and culture to imitate. Therefore, the content produced in the USA was also preferred and welcome by the publishing houses, since the consumers of the magazines, mostly middle/upper-middle class women of Turkey, preferred to encounter the experiences of foreign, American, women.<sup>619</sup> Female sexuality was also used to transmit the background information. The incidents were presented in a short story and in a case that also provided the context. These texts narrated the life stories of women in their home cultures, which was, in most cases, the USA. Since the language and culture were chosen as English and American literature, particularly for sexual matters, the American woman and her experiences became the figure and the subject to be discussed and transmitted. They carried main elements of the culture, American, from which language, English in this case, the translation was conducted. 620 In other words, the translations have strengthened the image of a woman in marriage and society, which was

<sup>618 &</sup>quot;İyi Bir Eş Olabilir misiniz?" Seksoloji, 26 (1951), 8-9.

Ahmet Oktay, *Türkiye'de Popüler Kültür* (İstanbul: YKY Yayınevi, 1997), 78. Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality."

Erskine Caldwell, "Balayı," trans. Azize Erten, *Seksoloji*, 58 (1954), 54-57. "İstasyonda peynir ekmek yiyen *zencilerden* başka kimse ortalıkta gözükmez." (Nobody could be seen in the station except the *blacks* eating cheese and bread.) "Kasabadan on *mil* kadar uzaklaştıktan sonra Claude'un evi önünde durdular." (After about ten *miles* from town, they stopped in front of Claude's house.)

exported from, mainly, the USA.<sup>621</sup> As Elizabeth Povinelli and George Chauncey described, global sexual science brought traffic in cultural representations, people, and capital of the people's social life around the world.<sup>622</sup>

Visual material was not limited to the medical (anatomical) discussions. It was also used for displaying appropriate woman and family. The pictures and illustrations borrowed from foreign magazines were also used in the magazines. Particularly, illustrations and photographs on fashion, cosmetics, and magazines have carried the signs of their foreign resources. The pictures and illustrations covered a wide range of variety. In the same magazines, it was possible to find a "core" family photograph with two children, a mother, and a father. But also, a couple of pages later it could be found an illustration of a vagina with a detailed description as mentioned before. The photographs of the core family and women in a context such as in the kitchen became symbolic and exemplary visuals for the properness such as how the "proper" core family, woman, man, relation and even house were needed to look.

During the 1950s, the quantity of the published materials increased along with their covered subjects and outreach, which turned sexual manners into a discussion topic in the public sphere and helped reach a wider reader group. The visual materials caused easy consumption for groups with limited literacy skills. Since sexuality is a part of daily life, the literature on sexual manners touched, slightly or deeply, on various subjects. Sexual manners (sexual science) and its experts defined, codified and catalogued sexual interactions "from the scale of the kiss or caress, to

For the image of American women in the popular magazine in Turkey during the 1950s, see: Umut Yıldırım, "The Representation and the Perception of the United States" (MA Thesis, Boğaziçi University, 2002), 50-54.

Elizabeth A. Povinelli and George Chauncey, "Thinking Sexuality Transnationally: An Introduction," *Gay and Lesbian Quarterly* 5 (1999), 442. For the transnational character of sexuality and presentations of different cultures, see: Margot Canaday, "Thinking Sex in the Transnational Turn: An Introduction," *American Historical Review* 114, 5 (2009), 1250–57. Inderpal Grewal and Caren Kaplan, "Global Identities: Theorizing Transnational Studies of Sexuality," *Gay and Lesbian Quarterly* 7 (2001), 663–79; Leila J. Rupp, "Toward a Global History of Same-Sex Sexuality," *Journal of the History of Sexuality* 10 (2001), 287–302.

perceived "perversities" found among social groups, to the impact of disease, prostitution, and population control on regional, national, and global scales." The producers of the content in the publishing determined the pedagogical tone and the "moral" limits of sexual manners. The consumers, who read the publications, were tried to be enlightened, moreover, to be "educated." The next part of this study focused on the actors who produced the content on sexual manners and who consumed the publishing: actors of sexual manners.

## 2.5. "Who to Teach" – "Whom To Teach"

The discussions on "sexual manners" were not limited to its necessity, benefits to the public, and content. The actors of sexual manners, who would give and receive sexual education, had as much significance as the content. As the writers of sexual manners pointed out, the complexity of the content, the language (terminology) of the texts, the approach to transferring the content (pedagogy), and the mediums (the tools) should be shaped according to the perception level and ability of the receiver. Moreover, the content of "sexual manners" was mostly defined as a delicate subject that required an "expert's hand" and "professional touch." 624 Additionally, the content of sexual manners was heavily dependent on the knowledge and perspective of the writer. Hence, this part of the study aims to highlight the actors of sexual manners who were both providers and receivers of the content. The previous sections mentioned the identities of receivers and providers (of sexual education) throughout the cases, whether implicitly between the lines or explicitly through addressing directly. This section focused on the persona of the targeted groups and examines the reasons for the designated audience. Also, it focused on the actors who had been considered eligible figures to provide knowledge about sexual manners.

Veronika Fuechtner, Douglas E. Haynes, and Ryan M. Jones, "Introduction: Toward a Global History of Sexual Science: Movements, Networks, and Deployments," in *A Global History of Sexual Science*, 1880–1960, edited Veronika Fuechtner, Douglas E. Haynes, and Ryan M. Jones (Oakland, California: University of California Press, 2018), 4-5.

<sup>624 &</sup>quot;Anketimiz - Prof. Dr. Ferit H. Saymen," Seksoloji, 10 (1950), 1.

On the surface, sexual manners (*education*) was presented almost in all articles – whether in magazines or newspapers – as a subject that should be taught to the whole population. As discussed in the previous sections, the "ignorant" public needed sexual education for having happy lives and marriages and, consequently, for having a healthy, peaceful, and harmonious society. Although the "whole" population was targeted on the discursive level, the strategy for disseminating knowledge about sexual manners was based mainly on written materials, which were published by the magazines and newspapers at the beginning of the 1950s. Except for *Seksoloji* journal and its manuals, the explanatory visual materials were few or in more moderate forms in publications. Therefore, the readers who could learn from the written text were restricted to the literate population, which was composed of around 30% of the whole population. 626

As mentioned in the "Tools for Sexual Manners" section, sexual manners as a subject had found a place in the daily national newspapers and monthly magazines, which have had a relatively fair distribution scope—at least in the cities and towns. Also, Seksoloji mentioned the names of local newspapers and reprinted quotes that praised the new magazine from the same newspapers from all around the country. Based on the written text and geographical outreach, literature on sexual manners could reach the literate population living in urban settings. However, in 1950, around 70% of Turkey's population was still living in the villages, and therefore, their access to discussions on sexual manners was highly questionable.

Although the general public, "all the citizens of the young Republic," were aimed to be educated on sexual manners, some groups were prioritized to reach and inform about sexual matters. The prioritization could be followed through articles that specifically addressed a particular audience. The articles' audience could be distinguished, either by its title or greeting. In the titles, the writers put forward a particular problem that could be

Nuri Kodamanoğlu, "Batı Memleketlerinde Cinsi Eğitim," Seksoloji, 41 (1953), 2.

Türkiye İstatistik Kurumu, *İstatistik Göstergeler 1923-2009* (Ankara: Türkiye İstatistik Kurumu, 2010), 18. For the population above 15 years old.

<sup>627</sup> Both in the "question and answer chapter" and in the last pages of the magazine, different cities and towns were mentioned. The details were discussed in the "Tools for Sexual Manners section."

experienced by children, young women, young couples, even seniors, such as "Kadında cinsi soğukluk" (Woman's Frigidity), "Kızlarda Gebelik" (Pregnancy at Young Girls) or "Çocuklara cinsiyetten nasıl bahsetmeli?" (How should we inform children about sexuality?). These articles aimed to inform the designated group about specific needs and problems associated with particular characteristics such as age or sex. In some articles, writers directly refered to certain groups, such as "sexual advise for engaged people," or "do not hurt your husband's feelings." Hence, the designated audience became clear from the title and introduction of the article.

## 2.5.1. For Children

Children among the targeted audience came forward to be mentioned in the articles about sexual manners. Obviously, the articles addressed adults (parents, specially mothers or educators).<sup>631</sup> Yet, the articles with the titles "how to educate children on sexual manners" appeared numerous times in newspapers such as *Milliyet* and *Cumhuriyet* and in magazines such as

There are a very limited number of articles or manuals about the sexuality of middle-aged and/or senior individuals. One of the rare example, see: 40ından sonra Cinsi Hayat (İstanbul: İstanbul Klinik Dersleri Yayınevi, 1960). I could not reach the original book. However, I noticed an advertisement in the Sağlığımız magazine. In the advertisement, the book were presented as: "A book that will be read by every middle age woman and man with pleasure." Some of the topics of the book was mentioned as: "aging at man and woman; menopause; sexual displeasure of women; conjugal life; sexual intercourse after 40; cancer at woman and man; prostate disease at men." "Advertisements," Sağlığımız, 3 (1960), cover page.

<sup>629</sup> Dr. R. Von Urban, "Nişanlılara Tavsiyeler," Seksoloji, 17 (1950), 42-43.

Dane Turner, "Kocanızın Gururunu İncitmeyiniz," Seksoloji, 21 (1950), 15-18.

Josephine May, "Secrets and Lies: Sex Education and Gendered Memories of Childhood's End in an Australian Provincial City, 1930s–1950s," Sex Education 6, 1 (2006), 4. May argued that primarily, efforts to implement sex education focused mainly on adults in Australia with the growing preoccupations with racial purity and sexual hygiene in the 1930s. For Turkey, the literature on sexual education was limited to a couple of "marriage manuals" which were left on the side. Hence, in the 1950s, educating children on sexual matters became one of the forthcoming concerns which have carried similar weight to adults.

*Seksoloji* and, even, *Akis*. <sup>632</sup> Only in Seksoloji, 15 articles were published in 60 issues with the titles referring to children's education on sexuality, which equalled almost one article in every fourth issue. Even the first article of the journal was on sexual manners for children, which was entitled "How we should talk about sexuality with children?" and written by Howard Whitman for Cosmopolitan magazine. <sup>633</sup>

Sexual manners for children as a subject was not only a discussion preferred by the editors of the newspapers and magazines. The subject has also received positive feedback from the readers. Right after Seksoloji started to be published, the editorial team decided to organize a competition among their readers in its third volume. Seksoloji asked its readers to select the most liked and beneficial article among the first six issues, which would create the magazine's first volume. The readers also needed to explain their reasons in a maximum of 150 words. The jury would select the first thirty readers, who would be awarded monetary and subscription awards. The readers could participate with a "competition coupon," which was published as a part of the last page of the journal in the third issue. Along with the names of the first thirty readers, the letters of the winners (the first five contestants), which explained the reasons for their choices, were also published with the general result of the competition. Howard Whitman's article was selected as the winner of the competition. The answers touched upon the significance of educating children on sexual manners to develop social cohesion through educating youth, protect children and young people from perversions and illnesses, provide a healthy family and environment while growing up, overcome the ignorance of parents and children, and inform young minds based on scientific knowledge. 634 All winners strongly

Recep Ferdi, "Günün Meseleleri: Çocuklarda Cinsi Terbiye Nasıl Olmalıdır?" *Milliyet*, 11.05.1953. Recep Doksat, "Günün Tıbbi Bahisleri: Cinsi Terbiye," *Milliyet*, 28.01.1958. Dr. N.C., "Çocuklarımızın Cinsi Terbiyesi," *Akis*, 15.01.1955, 29. Dr. N.C., "Terbiye: Size düşen vazife," *Akis*, 22.01.1955, 21-22.

Howard Whitman "Çocuklara cinsiyetten nasıl bahsetmeli?" *Seksoloji*, 1 (1949), 1-6. Translator of the article was not mentioned in the magazine.

The answers were listed by Şinasi Ataman, Ankara, Elementary Education Inspector; Ekmel Özoğul, Kırıkkale, Painter in the Kırıkkale Rifle Factory; Mehmet Ulucan, Yeniağa (Bolu), Mobile Head-Teacher, Hüseyin Gösterişli, Hasankale, Erzurum Soldier Post; Ömer

underlined the ignorance of and lack of sexual education in the country due to the labeling of sexuality and sexual education as shameful subjects. The writers and readers argued implicitly that sexual manners could help children manage, regulate, and discipline themselves to avoid personal and social dangers and risks if they had sufficient information on sexuality.

The discussion on educating children on sexual manners focused on the content, method, and source of information. The content and the method of sexual manners for children became a debatable issue even among the experts, who were supporting sexual education. Şekip Tunç stated that while "calling sexual manners as sexology is a new subject for our century," there are still discussions about the content and method of sexual education for children in scientific circles. 635 The discussion, particularly, was centered on the pedagogical appropriateness of the content and language when teaching children of different ages. A critique of the pedagogical necessities and limits of sexual education for children has taken part, even in Cumhuriyet. Burhan Öncel wrote an article about the question of "whether it is suitable to talk about sexual matters with our children." While he gave a positive answer and encouraged the parents to provide information about sexual matters, he criticized Howard William and W. Scot Pugh by name for suggesting detailed and explicit content for younger children. He concluded his articles by saying that "we should not neglect to educate our children about sexual manners. However, we should be conscious about its dosage and timing."636 The articles of the writers whom Öncel mentioned had been published by Seksoloji recently. 637 Although he did not mention the journal's name, he made an implicit reference to the articles and the journal

Erman, Çatalca, Subaşı village teacher. "Müsabakamızın neticesi," *Seksoloji*, 11 (1950), 32-35.

<sup>635</sup> Şekip Tunç, "Cinsi Terbiye," Seksoloji, 12 (1950), 1-2.

Dr. Burhan Öncel, "Terbiye Bahisleri: Çocuklara Cinsi Hadiselerden Bahsetmek Doğru Olur Mu?" *Cumhuriyet*, 27.10.1950.

William's article was published second after it was selected as the most beneficial content, see: Howard Whitman "Çocuklara cinsiyetten nasıl bahsetmeli?" *Seksoloji*, 11 (1950), 43-48. Pugh's articles were published in April 1950 and in July 1950. Dr. W. Scott Pugh, "Çocuğuma cinsiyetten nasıl bahsedeyim?" *Seksoloji*, 13 (1950), 53-58. W. Scott Pugh, "Çocuğuma cinsiyetten nasıl bahsedeyim?" *Seksoloji*, 16 (1950), 7-9. Öncel also started to contribute to Seksoloji with his articles in the same year.

by mentioning the writers' names. Additionally, he did not hesitate to make the subject visible and public by writing his criticisms in a newspaper with a broader outreach and a more heterogeneous audience than the magazine. Öncel developed his discussion in comparison to the arguments of contemporaries (the studies of William and Pugh), who, appareantly, he was aware and knowledgeable of. Last but not least, his conclusion invited parents (and the public) to be cautious about "the harmful outcomes of excess in the sexual manners' agenda."<sup>638</sup>

In the editorial piece of the 40<sup>th</sup> issue of the Seksoloji magazine, the chief editor, Muzaffer Askın wrote an editorial to reply to the critics and negative comments on sexual manners. Part of his argument was based on the necessity of accurate sexual knowledge among the general public, particularly children. Askın classified the source of sexual manners into four categories for children to learn about "where the baby comes from" and "how to regulate and cooperate in their relations with the opposite sex." 639 According to Aşkın, children can learn from the street and friends, mothers and fathers, and school and sexological publishing. While he discussed every source separately, he vehemently stated that children could not get accurate and complete information on the street.<sup>640</sup> Apart from Aşkın, Şekip Tunc also warned his readers that sexual manners is considered a dirty subject that would be learned on the streets. 641 Both used the word street to refer to spaces that were outside of the household and to the settings where parents' gaze and control were limited or even did not exist. Aşkın also named the friends on the streets who taught sexual manners as "cinsiyet

<sup>&</sup>quot;Cinsel terbiye davasında ifrata varmanın zararlı neticeler de verebileceğini söylemiştim." Dr. Burhan Öncel, "Terbiye Bahisleri: Çocuklara Cinsi Hadiselerden Bahsetmek Doğru Olur Mu?" *Cumhuriyet*, 27.10.1950.

<sup>639 &</sup>quot;... karşı cinsten olanlarla münasebetlerini nasıl tanzim ve nihayet fiilen iştirak edecekleri.." Muzaffer Aşkın, "Cinsiyet Hakkında Sıhhatli ve Doğru Bir Anlayışa Sahip Olmalıyız," *Seksoloji*, 40 (1952), 4.

Apart from Aşkın, many writers argued that children and young people tried to learn sexual manners from their friends, who gave them inaccurate or problematic knowledge. Such as Münir Türkent, "Cinsi hayat ve Gençlik," in *Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 1: Genç Kızlığın En Esrarlı Tarafı: Bakirelik* (İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959), 2. "Ancak arkadaşlarından duyduğu çok defa yanlış malumatla yetinmek zorunda kalırlar."

<sup>541</sup> Şekip Tunç, "Cinsi Terbiye," Seksoloji, 12 (1950), 1.

palavracıları" (sexuality braggarts/loudmouths) in the article mentioned above.

The primary concern regarding the source of sexual knowledge was related to the accuracy of the information. The authors of sexual manners repeatedly underlined the importance of correct information and proper methods to share sexual information. While they have attributed scientific knowledge – in this case, primarily medical knowledge<sup>642</sup> – as the most accurate and reliable source for sexuality, they have also pointed out the risks and drawbacks of untrustworthy information for physical and psychological health. Aşkın stated in the same piece that "the result of oppression, inaccurate knowledge, and belief in sexual life, unavoidably, could not be other than various perversions and neurosis."<sup>643</sup>

Kemal Cağlar, a urology doctor, warned the families about protecting their sons from homosexuality, which he diagnosed as an illness. His suggestion to families was "providing sexual education (manners) to their children."644 In the piece, he brought up his experience with an 18-years-old young boy from a good family who was his patient. The young boy was "addicted to this hideous sexual relationship." The young patient came to the doctor with tears in his eyes and sobbing. He was asking Çağlar to save him from the hideous habitat he had had since his childhood. This young boy had several attempts to experience his hideous habit. Finally, "he reached an agreement with a man only through leering" in a train station and did hideous things for five months. At the end of the article, Çağlar stated that "we should protect our sons - whom we grew with hardships and diligence - from the hideous devilish and snake-like degenerations which occur in society. You need to know how to preserve your children until they turn 18 years old." He added that "a normal child with a good character and morals would never degrade." Yet, if our children have a slightly weak

<sup>542</sup> Şekip Tunç, "Cinsi Terbiye," *Seksoloji*, 12 (1950), 4. Tunç argued that sexual manners should be taught whether by the mothers or by the doctors.

<sup>643</sup> Muzaffer Aşkın, "Cinsiyet Hakkında Sıhhatli ve Doğru Bir Anlayışa Sahip Olmalıyız," *Seksoloji*, 40 (1952), 5. "Cinsi hayattaki baskılar, yanlı bilgi ve inanışların sonu, kaçınılmaz şekilde çeşitli sapıklıklar ve nevrozlardan başka bir şey olamaz."

<sup>644</sup> Kemal Çağlar, "Çocuklarınızı Cinsi Sapıklığa Düşmekten Koruyunuz," *Seksoloji*, 26 (1951), 25-27.

character, "protecting our children is protecting the honor of the family." <sup>645</sup> In his story, Çağlar underlined the importance of sexual manners (sexual education). According to Çağlar, a child who knows about proper sexuality could not act according to his hideous desires. The child can correct his behavior by himself if he has adequate education on sexuality.

The writers about sexual manners reached almost a consensus about providing sex education to children to avoid the harmful effects of learning sexuality from the *streets* or their friends. Some addressed parents as the responsible actor for their children's education. However, some writers argued that numerous parents were also not well-informed on sexual matters and, consequently, helpless (*acizdir*) like the rest of society. Teachers (and schools) were regarded as the most trustworthy actors when it came to sharing sexuality knowledge with their students. Moreover, teachers were asked to educate parents about sexuality. In line with the experts' emphasis on teachers, presence of teachers could be followed in the pages of *Seksoloji*. The journal published letters, commentaries, and articles written by their readers (*teachers*), with their names and schools listed in various issues. First of all, their open presence in a sexuality-related journal could

<sup>&</sup>quot;Binbir müşkülat ve ihtimamla yetiştirdiğimiz erkek yavrularımızı cemiyet içinde bir şeytan ve bir yılan gibi mevcut olan bu iğrenç dejenerelerden korumamız lazımdır. 18 yaşına gelinceye kadar yavrularınızı muhafaza etmesini biliniz. Filhakika, ahlaklı, kuvvetli karakter sahibi, normal bir çocuk asla sukut etmez. Fenalıklardan sıyrılmasını bilir. Fakat pek az dahi olsa ruhen zayıfça evlatlarımızı korumakla ailenin şerefini korumuş oluruz." Kemal Çağlar, "Çocuklarınızı Cinsi Sapıklığa Düşmekten Koruyunuz," Seksoloji, 26 (1951), 27.

Nuri Kodamanoğlu, "Batı Memleketlerinde Cinsi Eğitim," *Seksoloji*, 41 (1953), 2. Faruk Akbeğ, "Okullarda cinsiyet eğitimi: Maarif şurası üyelerinin dikkatine sunulur," *Seksoloji*, 42 (1952), 3. "Okulda eğitim tezini tutanlara göre, ana babaların çoğu görevlerini yapmaktana acizdir."

Ord. Prof. Mustafa Şekip Tunç, "Cinsi Terbiye Kimler Tarafından Verilmelidir?" Seksoloji, 15 (1950), 2. Nuri Kodamanoğlu, "Batı Memleketlerinde Cinsi Eğitim," Seksoloji, 41 (1953), 2. Kodamanoğlu was giving examples from "western civilizations" (garp medeniyetleri). However, he was also presenting "educating parents" as an option and an argument for Turkey.

Nuri Kodamanoğlu from Adana Highschool, müsabakımızı kazanalarda isimleri olan öğretmenler; Ö. Faruk Aydan, "Orta Okullara Seksoloji Dersi Konmalıdır." *Seksoloji*, 12 (1950), 30-31. Faruk Aydan is the principal of the Şerefli Koçhisar Highschool.

be an indicator of teachers' efforts in following discussions and literature on sexual manners. Secondly, their names were published openly at the top of their articles. Hence, they were not ashamed to be associated with *Seksoloji*.

As a part of teachers' options, schools (public education) were proposed as the primary medium for providing sexual education to children and young people as part of the official curriculum. <sup>649</sup> The actors who proposed adding sexual education into the curriculum underlined the state's responsibility in educating Turkish citizens about sexual manners. 650 They emphasized the need for sexual education for the moral and physical wellbeing of the citizens. Ferit Saymen stated that according to Civil Law, both the family and state are responsible of children's terbiye (manners). He stated that terbiye covers the educational, occupational, general (umumi) and religious terbiye of children. Saymen reminded the articles of Public Hygiene Law (Umumi Hıfzısıhha Kanunu) which were about protection of children. He claimed that the foundation has already existed for building the structure of sexual manners structure (cinsi terbiye binasi), if only state practiced its duty with with fortitude and courage. 651 Faruk Akbeğ wrote an article in Seksoloji that directly addressed Maarif Surasi (Education Congress) right before the Education Council gathered. He stated that "çocuklarımızın cinsi terbiyesinin devletçe ele alınmasının zamanı gelmistir" (It is time that the [Turkish] state deals with the education of children). 652 Akbeğ reminded the state's responsility and obligation regarding providing every aspect of education to the children. Kodamanoğlu stated that school is the place where children can get their manners. Therefore, every course in the school curriculum was designed to correspond to a particular manners (terbiye) area. Although other courses can nourish several areas of manners and provide education, the sexual

<sup>649</sup> Similar discussions arose simultaneously in different countries, see: Thomson, "Moral Rhetoric and Public Health Pragmatism," 47.

<sup>650</sup> Faruk Akbeğ, "Okullarda cinsiyet eğitimi: Maarif şurası üyelerinin dikkatine sunulur," *Seksoloji*, 42 (1952), 1-8.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Anketimiz - Ferit H. Saymen," Seksoloji, 10 (1950), 9.

Faruk Akbeğ, "Okullarda cinsiyet eğitimi: Maarif şurası üyelerinin dikkatine sunulur," Seksoloji, 42 (1952), 1.

education part was lacking.653 Various writers, composed of doctors and teachers, proposed inserting sexual manners related content into the school curriculum. Because all children attend school, incorporating "sexual manners" classes into the curriculum could be a solution to coping with a lack of sexual manners knowledge. 654 Some of the opinion leaders were arguing for starting sexual education as early as possible by referring to Sigmund Freud and his ideas. One of them, Münir Türkent, who was a specialist in obstetrics and gynecology, advocated introducing sexual education to primary schools. According to Türkent, this could provide an opportunity for every citizen to be informed about proper and scientific sexual knowledge. 655 Another aspect of adding sexual education to the school curriculum was related to the content of the knowledge about sexual manners. Some writers mentioned only the scientific character of the information that could be provided by the schools. Some writers stated that the sexual knowledge in the school curriculum could be developed and uniformed by the Ministry of Education. Hence, actors in the ministry would have the opportunity to control the kind of sexual information that would be disseminated.

Faruk Akbeğ argued that sexuality as a subject should be included in the national education curriculum. He examined the science and health school textbooks for primary and secondary education for this article. According to his research, the fourth and fifth grade books included information about the digestive system, respiratory organs, five senses, circulation, blood, the human skeleton, and muscles. However, although "all the organs were mentioned in the book, reproductive organs were discussed, even mentioned"<sup>656</sup> In the middle school textbooks, the anatomy and functions of

Nuri Kodamanoğlu, "Cinsiyet Meselesi ve Eğitim," Seksoloji, 27 (1951), 13-14.

Ord. Prof. Mustafa Şekip Tunç, "Cinsi Terbiye Kimler Tarafından Verilmelidir?" *Seksoloji*, 15 (1950), 2.

<sup>655</sup> Münir Türkent, "Cinsi hayat ve Gençlik," in *Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 1: Genç kızlığın en esrarlı tarafı: Bakirelik* (İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959), 2.

<sup>656</sup> Faruk Akbeğ, "Okullarda cinsiyet eğitimi: Maarif şurası üyelerinin dikkatine sunulur," Seksoloji, 42 (1952), 4. "4 ve 5inci sınıflar için Nimet Çalapala, Emin Rona, Suphi Süha Doğukan ve Mehmet Doğanay'ın ayrı ayrı yazdıkları tabiat bilgisi kitaplarında da, insanın

the organs were explained, except for the reproductive organs. Akbeğ added that in the high school textbooks, sexuality and reproduction were mentioned for the first time in relation to hormones in the biology textbook that was prepared for junior class of highschool (lise 1) by biologist Aliye Seren, biologist Nezih Alsaç and doctor Suat Seren. However, the anatomy and functions of human sexual organs and human reproductive process were not explained in any of the biology textbooks. 657 Akbeğ also examined the school textbooks on health, prepared by Aliye Seren and Suat Seren in 1951.<sup>658</sup> Akbeğ stated that the authors explained the means of transmission and the symptoms of gonorrhea, venereal diseases, and syphilis. Although Akbeğ appreciated the inclusion of information about STDs, he criticized the lack of information about sexuality-related issues. 659 Various writers offered different solutions to including sex education in the school curriculum. Faruk Aydan, a teacher from Şerefli Koçhisar, offered to add a sexology (Seksoloji dersi) course to the school curriculum for middle schools.<sup>660</sup> On the other hand, Tunç proposed only covering venereal diseases and leaving sexual manners to parents and doctors.661 His suggestion was closely connected with the efforts of the governing bodies that focused on educating the citizens about the symptoms, contamination, and outcomes of venereal diseases.

Akbeğ supported his argument with examples from other countries that inserted sexual education into their curriculums.<sup>662</sup> He tried to display the place of sex education in the curriculums of the modern states in order to

bütün organları hakkında bilgi verilirken üreme organları sanki vücudumuzda hiç mevcut değilmiş gibi adı bile anılmamaktadır."

<sup>657</sup> Faruk Akbeğ, "Okullarda cinsiyet eğitimi: Maarif şurası üyelerinin dikkatine sunulur," *Seksoloji*, 42 (1952), 5.

Aliye Seren and Suat Seren were also the authors of the natural knowledge (*tabiat bilgisi*) school textbooks.

<sup>659</sup> Faruk Akbeğ, "Okullarda cinsiyet eğitimi: Maarif şurası üyelerinin dikkatine sunulur," Seksoloji, 42 (1952), 6-8

<sup>660</sup> Faruk Aydan, "Orta Okullarda Seksoloji Dersi," *Seksoloji*, 12 (1950), 30-31.

<sup>661</sup> Şekip Tunç, "Cinsi Terbiye," *Seksoloji*, 12 (1950), 4. Ord. Prof. Mustafa Şekip Tunç, "Cinsi Terbiye Kimler Tarafından Verilmelidir?" *Seksoloji*, 15 (1950), 2.

<sup>662</sup> Faruk Akbeğ, "Okullarda cinsiyet eğitimi: Maarif şurası üyelerinin dikkatine sunulur," *Seksoloji*, 42 (1952), 3

prepare and educate their citizens. He implicitly pointed out that Turkey, as a country on a path to becoming modern, needed to follow the necessities of scientific knowledge and the path of modern countries to fulfill its duties as a state toward its citizens. However, sex education was not provided without problems in other countries, as Akbeğ has assumed. Kodamanoğlu, unlike Akbeğ, was aware of the controversial discussions in other countries. Kodamanoğlu informed the readers about the current situation in Switzerland, France, England, and the USA. Kodamanoğlu stated that sex education in schools has been provided in Switzerland since 1942, as a pilot program in France, in two out of tree schools in England, and was forbidden in some states in the USA. Buck in the same year, who was complaining about the insufficiency of sex education in the schools in the USA. Buck claimed that the teachers in schools had primitive knowledge as far as sexual education was concerned. 664

In some countries, such as some regions of the USA, sexual manners was offered to be taught in health education courses, <sup>665</sup> whereas in others, science courses, particularly biology, were viewed as the appropriate place to teach sexual education. <sup>666</sup> In England, "despite widespread public concerns about the nation's sexual and moral health, it was not until 1943 that the British Board of Education officially addressed sex education in the secondary curriculum." <sup>667</sup> In Ireland, sexual health and education had

Nuri Kodamanoğlu, "Batı Memleketlerinde Cinsi Eğitim," Seksoloji, 41 (1953), 3.

Pearl S. Buck, "Cinsi Terbiye," trans. Bedia Çobanoğlu, *Kadın Gazetesi* 290 (1952) 6. "Memleketimizi ziyarete gelen ecnebilerden sık sık şu suali işitiriz: "Niye büyükler, sizin memleketinizde seksle bu kadar meşgul oluyorlar?" Bunun cevabı meydandadır: "Çünkü seks hakkında pek az şey biliriz." Buna rağmen, sırf cehaletimiz yüzünden, alakamız seksin fiziki cephesinden öteye gitmez ve onun insanı meftun edici kompleksi ve mühim cephelerini hakikaten bilmeyiz. Bir mektep müdürüne, çocuklara seks hakkında neler öğretildiği sorulsa, bize en iptidai şeraitini söyler."

Thomson, "Moral Rhetoric and Public Health Pragmatism," 45.

About the strong counter arguments in the schools, in USA, see: Scales, "Sex Education in the '70s and '80s: Accomplishments, Obstacles and Emerging Issues," 558.

Thomson, "Moral Rhetoric and Public Health Pragmatism," 45.

become major controversial political issues.<sup>668</sup> Again, in Australia, although some activists promoted sex education for adolescents during Second World War, opponents offered strong counter-arguments against including sex education in the school curriculum.<sup>669</sup> In France, although health education was a part of the curriculum in 1950, reproduction and sexuality were limited to plants and animals.<sup>670</sup>

Akbeğ was quite aware of the ones who were rejecting teaching sexual education in the schools. Although the method – educating the citizens – and the content – particularly the venereal diseases – were closely related to the sexual education, adding sexual manners as a course to the school curriculum had met with strong reactions. Akbeğ thought that the rejection came from those perceiving sexuality as a shameful and unmannerly subject. However, he states clearly that sexuality should no longer be considered taboo in education. Another rejection argument was related to the concerns regarding young people. They argued that informing young people about sexuality could or would encourage them to experience their sexuality. Even one of the writers of Seksoloji, Bülent Davran, warned public about the downsides of learning sexuality earlier than the "proper age." In other words, information on sexual matters can promote sexual activity instead of controlling it. Some have also argued against sex education in schools based on the poor knowledge and attitude of the

Lisa Smyth, "The Cultural Politics of Sexuality and Reproduction in Northern Ireland," *Sociology*, 40 (2006), 664. Recep Doksat was also questioning the possibility of teaching sexual manners in the schools. He offered biology as the proper course for teaching sexuality. Recep Doksat, "Günün Tıbbi Bahisleri: Cinsi Terbiye," *Milliyet*, 28.01.1958.

Josephine May, "Secrets and Lies," 2.

<sup>670</sup> Sandie Bernard and Pierre Clement, "Teaching Human Reproduction and Sexuality: A Historical Approach in France since 1950," unpublished paper.

Faruk Akbeğ, "Okullarda cinsiyet eğitimi: Maarif şurası üyelerinin dikkatine sunulur," *Seksoloji*, 42 (1952), 1-8.

Dr. Bülent Davran, "Bir Cinsiyet Buhranı İçinde miyiz?" *Seksoloji*, 19 (1950), 5. "Cinsi olgunluğa yeni erişmiş bir genç için "Seksoloji"nin aydınlatıcı yazıları bilgi kaynağı değil, sadece bir cinsi tahrik vasitasıdır."

Thomson, "Moral Rhetoric and Public Health Pragmatism," 46.

teachers. The important barriers to sex education were related to the uncertainty of its effects.<sup>674</sup>

Despite the calls for the inclusion of sex education in the curriculum of high schools becoming visible during the early 1950s, it was not offered by the Ministry of Education during the 1950s.<sup>675</sup> The ones who were in favor of "home-education" of sexual manners have gained the debate, apparently since no sexual education courses were added to the school curriculum during the 1950s and the 1960s. Yet, even the visibility of this debate in the media brought an important discussion to the eyes of the public. The discussion on sex education in schools could be considered as the political front line between the public and the personal.<sup>676</sup> Although sexual manners as a subject was seen in publications, Turkish Republic avoided involving and disseminating such an *intimate* subject in the schools formally. In the 1950s, in Turkey, educating children on sexual manners was left to the hands of the parents.

## 2.5.2. Mothers as the educators

Some writers brought their concerns about the capability of the parents and the adequacy of their knowledge of sexual manners.<sup>677</sup> Besides teachers and schools, Şekip Tunç suggested to include the education (terbiye) and sociology branches of Public Houses (Halk Evleri) to disseminate sexual manners among parents.<sup>678</sup> Eventhough there were concerns regarding the parents' knowledge on sexual manners, parents were, still, addressed as the resource and educator for children. In *Sağlığımız*, parents were asked to

Scales, "Sex Education in the '70s and '80s: Accomplishments, Obstacles and Emerging Issues," 558.

<sup>675</sup> Similar discussion about teaching sexuality in schools have been seen in various countries. For example, in Australia, although "sex education in schools" became a part of public discussion, sex education was not integrated to school circulum. Josephine May, "Secrets and Lies," 6.

Thomson, "Moral Rhetoric and Public Health Pragmatism," 45.

Recep Doksat, "Günün Tıbbi Bahisleri: Cinsi Terbiye," *Milliyet*, 28.01.1958. "Ayrıca, pek az aile bu terbiye için hazırlıklı ve ehliyetli olabilir."

Ord. Prof. Mustafa Şekip Tunç, "Cinsi Terbiye Kimler Tarafından Verilmelidir?" *Seksoloji*, 15 (1950), 3.

provide the most accurate information without meandering or hesitating about sexual subjects.<sup>679</sup> Kemal Çağlar stated that children are not and should not be learning sexual manners themselves and addressed his article to the parents. 680 The writers have emphasized the importance of educating parents about the content and also a proper way (pedagogical method) of transferring the knowledge on sexual manners.<sup>681</sup> Some of them insisted that sexual manners should be thought about at home instead of on the streets or even in school since it is a private subject. 682 Kemal Saraçoğlu, a doctor, argued that sexual manners should be taught to our children and young people on the condition that sexual manners should be provided in their "aile muhiti" (family circle). 683 However, looking closely, mothers became the main agents who were held responsible for educating their children. Sexual manners as a topic was considered as a part of care activities in which women, and mothers, were held responsible. Mothers were held responsible for disciplining and educating the children in every aspect of life. Since sexuality is and/or will be an important part of everyday life, mothers were asked to start sexual education with their children at a young age at home.<sup>684</sup> In different mediums, such as women's magazines, newspapers, or manuals, women were asked to prepare themselves to teach their children during the 1950s.<sup>685</sup>

As early as 1939, adults, particularly, women were held responsible for providing proper education and support to children on sexual manners.<sup>686</sup> In other words, raising the proper citizens of the Republic, including on sexual

<sup>&</sup>quot;Cocuklara Cinsiyet Terbiyesi Nasıl Verilmelidir?" Sağlığımız, 12 (1960), 15.

<sup>680</sup> Kemal Çağlar, "Cinsi Terbiyenin Önemi," Seksoloji, 14 (1950), 1-3.

<sup>681</sup> Dr. N.C., "Çocuklarımızın Cinsi Terbiyesi," *Akis*, 15.01.1955, 29. Dr. N.C., "Terbiye: Size düşen vazife," *Akis*, 22.01.1955, 21-22.

<sup>682</sup> Kemal Çağlar, "Cinsi Terbiyenin Önemi," Seksoloji, 14 (1950), 1-3.

Kemal Saraçoğlu, "Gençlik ve Seksoloji Bilgisi," in *Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 1: Gençkızlığın en esrarlı tarafı: Bakirelik* (İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959), 3.

Dr. N.C., "Cocuklarımızın Cinsi Terbiyesi," Akis, 15.01.1955, 29.

<sup>685</sup> Koçer, "Demokrat Parti Döneminde Kadın," 117.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Çocukların Terbiyesi," *Ana*, 14 (1939), 19. "Çocuğumuzun cinsi tezahürlerini ele almak ve onu zamanında münasip bir şekilde terbiye ve takviye etmek ana ve babaların, hatta öğretmenlerin en mukaddes vazifesi olmalıdır.

matters, was kept in the family.<sup>687</sup> Repeatedly, mothers are asked to learn and develop their own sexual manners since it was assumed that only educated mothers could raise educated children.<sup>688</sup> Hence, mothers-women were encouraged to learn about sexuality for the well-being and education of their children due their role as educators in the household.<sup>689</sup> Besides, they were encouraged to follow the proper pedagogical course to transfer this knowledge to their children.<sup>690</sup> The writers addressed the readers as "the mothers" in the articles, which aimed to alert the audience about the children's education on sexual manners or sexual hygiene and inform mothers about the content.<sup>691</sup> Writers preferred to inform a role – mothers – which contained a different emphasis than the articles and marriage manuals about sexuality, which targeted women (wives) and young women (candidates to be married). The advice focused mostly on the well-being and proper-raising of children about their sexuality.<sup>692</sup>

While the writers asked women to educate their children, they were cautious about the content of the knowledge that could be used and transferred to the daughters and sons. Faruk Akbeğ argued that when the subject comes to sexuality, women were considered ignorant, innocent, and

<sup>687</sup> Sancar, Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti, 209.

Ord. Prof. Mustafa Şekip Tunç, "Cinsi Terbiye Kimler Tarafından Verilmelidir?" *Seksoloji*, 15 (1950), 2. "Anaları henüz aydınlanmamış köy çocukları..."

Ord. Prof. Mustafa Şekip Tunç, "Cinsi Terbiye Kimler Tarafından Verilmelidir?" *Seksoloji*, 15 (1950), 3.

Dr. W. Scott Pugh, "Çocuğuma Cinsiyetten Nasıl Bahsedeyim?" Seksoloji, 13 (1950): 53 The article provides questions and answers. Parents were asked to repeat the same content.

<sup>691</sup> *Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 7: Gençkızlarda Cinsi Rüyalar* (İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959), 30. "Geleceğin annesinin bilmesi gereken gerçekler..."

fpek İlkkaracan and Gülşah Seral, "Kadının İnsan Hakkı Olarak Cinsel Haz: Türkiye'deki Bir Taban Eğitimi Programından Deneyimler", in *Müslüman Toplumlarda Kadın ve Cinsellik*, ed. Pınar İlkkaracan (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003), 201. İlkkaracan and Seral suggested that even today, residues of this understanding could be seen in the empowerment workshops with women. They stated when women started to talk about sexuality in the empowerment studies, they have the tendency to lead the conversation towards the subjects such as sexual hygiene and/or sexuality of their children instead of talking about their own experiences.

even naive like children. 693 Hence, women, as wives and as the mothers of the nation, should be educated about sexual manners for the sake of their marriages and for the healthy moral, psychological, and physical well-being of their children. The biggest part of the writer's concerns was based on the sources that will provide information on sexual manners to women, and, consequently, mothers. In "Gençkızlığın En Esrarlı Tarafı: Bakirelik" (The Mysteries Side of Being Young Girl/Maiden: Virginity), it was argued that young girls learned issues regarding sexuality from other women.<sup>694</sup> According to the findings of the Milliyet survey conducted by Aytul, 247 out of 417 women learned about sexuality from other women or books.<sup>695</sup> However, except for mothers, who were strongly encouraged and held responsible for educating their daughters about sexuality, "learning from peers" was harshly criticized by the experts due to their concerns regarding the content of the sexual knowledge. Women were accused of transferring myths about the female body or kocakarı information to other women, particularly young women.<sup>696</sup> One of the frequent topics in the sexuality related publications was "fear of the first night." While one reason of young women's fear was stated as ignorance, another was the suggestions (telkinler) of other people.<sup>697</sup>

The writers asked women to seek knowledge in the experts' expertise instead of the experience of other women, which is full of incorrect information. Burhan Öncel, a gynecologist, criticized women because they learn about sexuality from their friends and/or neighbors (konu komşu) which is full of lies (yalan yanlış bilgi). In an article in Cumhuriyet, Burhan Öncel, shared one of his experiences to state the terrible outcomes of ignorance and lack of sexual knowledge when he was working as a

Faruk Akbeğ, "Memlekette Seksoloji," *Seksoloji*, 33 (1951), 1. *Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı*, no. 3: *Gençkızların Cinsi Bilgisizlikleri* (İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959), 6.

<sup>694</sup> Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 1: Gençkızlığın En Esrarlı Tarafı: Bakirelik, (İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959), 6.

Turhan Aytul ed., *Türkiye'de Cinsiyet Problemi* (İstanbul: Varlık Yayınevi, 1964), 76.

<sup>696</sup> Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 1: Gençkızlığın En Esrarlı Tarafı: Bakirelik (İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959), 6.

<sup>697</sup> Faruk Akbeğ, "İlk Gecenin verdiği acı ve korku," Seksoloji, 20 (1950), 17.

<sup>698</sup> Porter and Hall, The Facts of Life.

gynecologist in Anatolia. A military physician friend called Öncel for his wife's birth giving. His wife was trying to bear their child for three days. Although Öncel's friend was an educated man, he was withheld by the women of the village. When Öncel was on the way to the village, birth happened eventually. However, as he narrated, while he was talking to his friend after his arrival, he learned that *kocakarı* (old woman, hag, traditional midwife<sup>699</sup>) of the village who acted as a knowledgeable midwife forced the young pregnant woman to drink water from his husband's shoe. This old woman and other women of the village believed that this birth-giving process was prolonged as a punishment to the wife due to her wrong-doing towards her husband. In the conclusion of his article, Öncel stated that these "non-sense, inaccurate, lacking, and backward" beliefs about sexuality, pregnancy, and birth cause significant harm to women, and women should seek information from educated sources.<sup>700</sup> While women's knowledge was trivialized due to its lack of scientific content, the accurate source for defining female sexuality was also designated, again, as the scientist. Yet, Öncel's suggestion could not be implemented during the 1950s in Turkey due to the insufficient numbers of medical personnel. There were 3020 doctors, and 1285 certified midwives in 1950, 7077 doctors, and 2001 certified midwives in 1955 and 8214 doctors, and 3219 certified midwives in 1960.<sup>701</sup> Hence, traditional midwives had an important role in the areas where women were in need of assistance for giving birth, as well as in learning about sexuality-related subjects. 702

Here traditional midwife is used for the women who are practicing midwifery without formal education and license. For further discussions about the history of division and differences between traditional and formal midwifery in the Ottoman Empire and Turkey, see: Erkaya Balsoy, *Kahraman Doktor İhtiyar Acuzeye Karşı: Geç Osmanlı Doğum Politikaları*. Beyinli, *Elleri Tılsımlı: Modern Türkiye'de Ebelik*.

Burhan Öncel, "Cinsi terbiye lüzumlu mudur?," *Cumhuriyet*, 12.10.1950.

<sup>701</sup> Türkiye İstatistik Kurumu, İstatistik Göstergeler 1923-2009 (Ankara: Türkiye İstatistik Kurumu, 2010), 55.

For the power dynamics between doctors and traditional midwives, for Ottoman Empire period, see: Erkaya Balsoy, *Kahraman Doktor İhtiyar Acuzeye Karşı: Geç Osmanlı Doğum Politikaları*. For the early Republican Turkey, see, Beyinli, *Elleri Tılsımlı: Modern Türkiye'de Ebelik*. Pınar İlkkaracan, "Giriş: Müslüman toplumlarda kadın ve cinsellik," in

Moreover, other women (peers) did not only transfer their knowledge on sexuality based on their experiences. In that way, women also became the agents of their own life stories, knowledge, and ways of thinking. Yet, the suggestions regarding seeking expertise and knowledge cause the replacement of the female voice on their bodies and their experiences with the voice of science. Besides the content of sexual knowledge, medical terminology was also imposed as the language of transmission for sexual knowledge instead of women's language. The actor who was defining appropriate sexual experiences and practices for women became the scientist while the interaction among women regarding the content and method of their sexuality was discredited. Women were pushed to use and produce a male discourse within the framework of medical and pedagogical terminology which, in return, caused them to lose their words, stories, and power in their bodies and experiences.

## 2.5.3. Young people

Some groups were considered more vulnerable to the dangers of a lack of sexual education. Among these groups, young people were pointed out as the most vulnerable due to their physiological and psychological transitions where they met and recognized their sexual beings. The scientific discourse has reached a consensus about the adolescent period. During adolescence,

Müslüman toplumlarda kadın ve cinsellik, ed. Pınar İlkkaracan, (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003), 19.

Frkaya Balsoy, *Kahraman Doktor İhtiyar Acuzeye Karşı: Geç Osmanlı Doğum Politikaları*, 41. Balsoy stated that the knowledge of the traditional midwives on pregnancy and birth giving was replaced by the "scientific" knowledge that was produced by Besim Ömer. According to Balsoy, the scientific knowledge turned to a canonical narrative and replicated by the following doctors who were working on gynecology. In this canonical narrative, while the perspective and practice of male doctors were praised, the knowledge and experience of traditional midwives were ignored or degraded.

Pınar İlkkaracan, "Giriş: Müslüman toplumlarda kadın ve cinsellik," in *Müslüman Toplumlarda Kadın ve Cinsellik*, ed. Pınar İlkkaracan (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003), 19. İlkkaracan stated that women lost their methods and power positions due to the discredition (and loss) of certain areas such as oral tranference (fairy tales – *masal*, folk songs – *türkü*) or traditional midwifery.

young people realize that their bodies are changing. Moreover, they start to be aware of their sexuality.<sup>705</sup> The sexual development of girls and boys at puberty was addressed in articles.<sup>706</sup> Also, their close age towards marriage turned them into potential targets to be educated about sexuality, so that they could start their married and sexual life with proper knowledge.

Similar to children and women, peers (friends or acquaintances) took first place among the questionable sources. 707 In the articles, friends were pointed out as the most common source from which young people learn about sexuality. In the Sağlığımız, parents were encouraged to educate their adolescent children about sexuality, which prevented them from seeking sexual knowledge and learning by themselves. Accordingly, they would ignore obscene talk (müstehcen konuşmalar) and say to themselves, "This is none of my business. My parents have informed me sufficiently."<sup>708</sup> Adults were held responsible for helping "young ignorant people" deal with their transaction process. Young boys and young girls and their families were warned against the potential danger of the adolescent period since sexual organs and feelings are developed at those ages. 709 Therefore, young people without guidance were a danger to themselves and to the moral health of society.<sup>710</sup> The dangers that could be faced by young people were ranked from "losing virginity" to "sexually transmitted diseases," and even widened to "sexual assaults," "perversion such as homosexuality," or "abnormal

Dr. Talha Yapça, "Gençliğe Doğru Yolu Gösterme Ümidi," in *Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 3: Gençkızların Cinsi Bilgisizlikleri* (İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959), 2. Dr. Kemal Çağlar, "Gençlik Artık Yürüdüğü Yolu Biliyor!" in *Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 3: Gençkızların Cinsi Bilgisizlikleri* (İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959), 3. For Australian case, see: Josephine May, "Secrets and Lies," 5.

<sup>706</sup> Dr. Bowen Partington, "Cinsi Münasebet sıhhat için zaruri midir?" *Seksoloji*, 20 (1950): 56-60.

<sup>707</sup> Münir Türkent, "Cinsi hayat ve Gençlik," in *Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 1:* Gençkizliğin en esrarlı tarafı: Bakirelik (İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959), 2.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Buluğ çağında cinsiyet terbiyesi" *Sağlığımız* (1960), 10-11. Howard Whitman, "Çocuklara Cinsiyetten Nasıl Bahsetmeli?" *Seksoloji*, 1 (1949), 6. "Beni alakadar etmez, bu hususta annem, babam beni lüzumlu olduğu kadar tenvir ettiler."

N.P., Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 3: Gençkızların Cinsi Bilgisizlikleri (İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959), 14.

<sup>710</sup> For a similar discussion, see: Josephine May, "Secrets and Lies," 5.

sexuality."<sup>711</sup> With sexual manners (sex education), it was aimed to inform young people about "the healthier ways of life."<sup>712</sup>

In a series published by Hadise Publishing, "Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı" (Sexology and Youth Life), in particular, young people and their families were aimed at as readers. Different from the other texts about sexual manners and sexual matters, the series came out with colorful illustrations and, dominantly, visual material. The publication came out as a 12-volume series in 1959, edited by anonymous editors. The volumes covered subjects such as virginity, sexual ignorance among young girls, sexual development of young boys and young girls. The volume has given advertisements to one of the popular newspapers, Milliyet, which described the series in detail. The series was presented as a beneficial and mature, "which was expected by hundreds of thousands of young people." In the series, *danger* and *threat* were mainstreaming concepts along with *ignorance* and *misery*. Future mothers and fathers were urged to

<sup>711</sup> Münir Türkent, "Cinsi hayat ve Gençlik," in *Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 1:* Gençkızlığın en esrarlı tarafı: Bakirelik (İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959), 2.

N.P., Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 3: Gençkızların Cinsi Bilgisizlikleri (İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959), 15. "Sağlığın ve saadetin temeli..." Thomson, "Moral Rhetoric and Public Health Pragmatism," 48.

The volumes of the series: in order: Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 1: Genç Kızlığın En Esrarlı Tarafı: Bakirelik. Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 2: Genç erkekte cinsiyet fırtınası. Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 3: Genç Kızların Cinsi Bilgisizlikleri. Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 4: Genç erkeğin tehlikeli evreleri. Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 5: Kızlık Merdivenleri. Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 6: Genç erkeklerde rüya kadınları. Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 7: Genç Kızlarda Cinsi Rüyalar. Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 8: Genç erkeklerde aşk korkusu. Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 9: Genç Kızlarda Sevilmek Arzusu. Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 10: Her genç erkeğin gözüyle kadın. Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 11: Her Genç Kızın Gözüyle Erkek. Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 12: Fuhuş ve Fahişeler. The manuals in the series had reading parts which were edited by the Publishing House from various authors from Dr. Edwin Hirsch, Dr. Van de Velde, Dr. Mazhar Osman, Dr. Ferit H. Saymen to Dr. Fahrettin Kerim Gökay. The list of the authors were provided at the beginning of the book. However, it is not possible to distinguish belonged to which author.

<sup>714 &</sup>quot;İlan," *Milliyet*, 17.11.1959. "İlan," *Milliyet*, 18.11.1959.

<sup>715 &</sup>quot;İlan," *Milliyet*, 17.11.1959. "yüzbinlerce gencin beklediği faydalı, olgun ve ciddi seri kitaplar hazinesi"

learn about their sexual lives in order to live a healthy, fit, and knowledgeable sexual life and avoid the dark, bad, and harmful ways that ignorance can cause.<sup>716</sup> These young people were considered the future spouses of future marriages. They were seen as the candidates for near-future marriages. For both parties, the general concern was summarized under the title "adults of our society in the future."<sup>717</sup>

Along with adolescent sexuality, themes such as flirting, choosing and meeting with a potential spouse, and the engagement process were included as topics in their texts. While marriage preparation included a variety of gaining skills for both parties such as responsibility, household management, and maturity, an important part of the process is becoming aware of their own sexualities before getting married. "Happy and harmonious marriages" are seen as the solution to some fundamental social and individual problems. Therefore, young people were taken into consideration with more caution regarding their sexuality. Young people were addressed as if they would marry soon and use this information in marriage life.

Young women were particularly mentioned in the advice columns. Young women were portrayed as "innocent beings" when the subject came to sexuality.<sup>718</sup> The contradictory attitude of the writers was worth mentioning. On the one hand, the naivety of young girls was equalized to being "virtuous" women. On the other hand, due to their ignorance, young women were treated as "not-developed" beings.<sup>719</sup> In the narratives, young

<sup>&</sup>quot;Yarının babası, yarının annesi! Gençlik çağınızın başından itibaren cinsi hayatınızın seyrinden bir şey biliyor musunuz? Çünkü bu hayatın sıhhatli, zinde, bilgili geçmesi şarttır. Bilgisizlik sizi karanlık, kötü, zararlı yollara götürür."

N.P., Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 4: Genç erkeğin tehlikeli evreleri (İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959), 23. "Doğacak çocukları daha gençlik çağında düşünmelidir..." N.P., Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 1: Genç Kızlığın En Esrarlı Tarafı: Bakirelik (İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959), 1. "Gençlere cinsiyet meseleleri hakkında bilgi vermek ve bu meselelerde muhafaza edilen sükutu ortadan kaldırmakla cemiyetin durumunu düzeltmek için bir adım atmış oluruz."

Ord. Prof. Mustafa Şekip Tunç, "Cinsi Terbiye Kimler Tarafından Verilmelidir?" *Seksoloji*, 15 (1950), 3.

<sup>719</sup> Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no: 3: Gençkızların Cinsi Bilgisizlikleri (İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959). Josephine May, "Secrets and Lies," 2.

women were asked to learn about sexuality first for the happiness of themselves and their husbands.<sup>720</sup>

Since these young women will be future wives, the writers strongly encouraged young women to get informed and learn about sexuality before they become sexually active in order to keep themselves and their husbands happy. Second, it was frequently mentioned that they would be mothers one day and would need to teach their children sexual manners. Therefore, they need to be informed about sexuality in general. Different from previous decades, sexuality was not only narrated to young women (people) as a part of their reproductive duty or as an anatomical subject that was a part of biological discussions. Rather, young women were given the opportunity to seek their own sexual happiness with the guidance of their husbands in marriage. Sexuality writings gave young women the opportunity to learn about and enjoy their sexuality. Yet, this suggestion also brought to the young women the responsibility of "controlling themselves." The writers were also emphasizing the need and necessity of "control of their own sexuality," which was starting to be left in the hands of women. Regarding educating young women, menstruation was particularly mentioned by the writers. Lack of information about menstruation was frequently given as an example of young women's ignorance on sexual issues.<sup>721</sup> Recep Doksat gave examples of terrified young women, when they experienced their menstruation first time.<sup>722</sup> Mothers were particularly warned about how to teach their daughters about menstruation delicately so that young women would not be shocked and be devastated psychologically. Sağlığımız suggested explaining menstruation as a natural process in order to prevent the perception of menstruation as an illness and/or abnormality.<sup>723</sup>

The sexuality of women will be discussed in the coming section. However, for not leaving room for a misunderstanding, it is important to mention that the pleasure of women was still assigned to (young) men in these texts. However, with this knowledge, (young) women were expected to welcome sexual practice as a part of joyful event in marriage.

May was giving the same example for Australia for the same period. Josephine May, "Secrets and Lies," 7.

<sup>722</sup> Recep Doksat, "Günün Tıbbi Bahisleri: Cinsi Terbiye," Milliyet, 28.01.1958.

<sup>723 &</sup>quot;Buluğ çağında cinsiyet terbiyesi" Sağlığımız (1960), 11.

The experts were referred to as the most influential and trustable group to learn about sexuality and sexual manners. They were assigned two roles. The first one was being a researcher and producing knowledge about sexuality. The second role was the disseminator of sexual manners. As the researcher and the producer, experts addressed the final source to learn from. As the disseminator, experts were considered both the source and also the beneficiary of the up-to-date information provided by the other experts who were professionalized in different disciplines of sexology. Whether it was a basic subject like "how to inform your children about sexuality," or a complicated subject such as "the symptoms of venereal diseases," experts were pointed to for consultation, to learn from, to get a diagnosis, or to learn about the treatment methods. "Ask your doctor" or "consult a doctor," if they can, was not only stated in the article or in the marriage manuals. In the "questions and answers" section of Seksoloji, readers were told clearly to see a doctor. Experts have turned into the ultimate and final source of sexual knowledge.

The expert pool of the era on sexuality was formed by the various actors, including the academics, the authors of the marriage manuals, the writers of the newspapers and magazines, and opinion leaders of the era (*denetleyici kuşak*). Serpil Sancar defined them as the actors who have the legitimacy to speak in the public sphere.<sup>724</sup> Because sexuality had a place in all aspects of life, experts from various fields appeared in the magazines and manuals to provide advice and suggestions on a variety of topics ranging from "health of sexual organs," "sexual pleasure," "love and marriage," and "infertility."<sup>725</sup> Academics such as professors took the first place among the experts, coming from various disciplines such as medicine, law, social sciences (sociology), psychology, and, finally, anthropology.<sup>726</sup> From the

<sup>724</sup> Sancar, Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti, 83.

For the topics, see "Presentation, Content and Forms of *Sexual Manners*" chapter.

For the interdisciplinary formation of the sexology on the international level, see: Veronika Fuechtner, Douglas E. Haynes, and Ryan M. Jones, "Introduction: Toward a Global History of Sexual Science: Movements, Networks, and Deployments," in *A Global History of Sexual Science*, 1880–1960, ed. Veronika Fuechtner, Douglas E. Haynes, and Ryan M.

beginning of the twentieth-century on, sexuality gradually became a subject to be handled in academia. Academics from different disciplines have fought to receive recognition for sexology in universities and academic circles.<sup>727</sup> As a result of this struggle, experts with scientific certification started to emerge with a particular focus on sexual matters. In the 1950s, expertise on sexuality was mostly certified with the association of a university and/or with an academic title.<sup>728</sup>

The authors of the marriage manuals or articles on sexual manners were presented by the publishing houses as the experts in the field. For example, Seksoloji journal used the well-known academics of the era to prove its scientific, eligible, and serious approach while providing sexual manners. In the magazines and manuals that were published by publishing houses by Seksoloji and Hadise, the articles and manuals were introduced to the readers with a presentation text. These introduction texts not only summarized the aim and the importance of the article or manual. But they underlined the significance of the author, narrated their accomplishments elaborately, and their contribution to the sexology literature and the scientific community. Names of the authors were written at the beginning of the articles or on the cover page of the books with their academic titles such as Dr. Jean Cherbolie, Dr. Aydın Uluyazman, Dr. Wilbur or Prof. Dr. Necmettin Yarar. The achievements and reputation of the experts were used to advertise the material and gain legitimacy for the content and publication. In the advertisements which were published in the daily newspapers, in the periodic magazines, or in the Seksoloji or Hadise Publishing books, the titles of the authors were written with bold letters and, in some, even with

-

Jones (Oakland, California: University of California Press, 2018), 5. Fuechter added also psychoanalysis, endocrinology, ethnography, biotypology, anthropology, criminology, and physiology and also "knowledge produced in literature, art, folk practices, and social activism."

<sup>727</sup> Fuechtner, Haynes, and Jones, Introduction: Toward a Global History of Sexual Science.

It should be noted that in the 1950s, the view and legitimacy of the experts does not only overcome any other kind of sources of information on sexuality. In almost every subject, an expert's view became a prominent reliable source. Marcel C. LaFollette, "A Survey of Science Content in U.S. Television Broadcasting, 1940s through 1950s: The Exploratory Years," *Science Communication*, 24, 1 (2002): 34–71.

bigger letters than their names. In sum, the publishers conducted the marketing of sexual expertise to non-expert audiences.<sup>729</sup>

Another group was the writers (and activists), who were often selfproclaimed experts.<sup>730</sup> These experts did not have academic titles or any other affiliation with a university. However, they were presented as "wellknown" or "famous" figures in sexology and sexual manners publishing. 731 Whether academic or self-claimed (including the opinion leaders), texts on sexual manners were a combination of indigenous and translated texts, as mentioned in the "Content of the Sexual Manners" section. Foreign experts had an important role in proving the contemporary, modern, and up-to-date characteristics of the magazine. First of all, the editors of the magazines and marriage manuals were connected with the world of sexology publishing. Second, foreign experts were respected and found reliable by the readers. In particular, American experts were presented with more enthusiasm. In one of the introductions, an American expert was presented as the "Değerli Amerikan hekimi ve seksoloğu Winfield Scott" (Distinguished American physician and sexologist Winfield Scott). 732 Apart from the eminence of the foreign experts, their frequent appearance in the magazines could be a sign for the global circulation of the ideas on sexual science, which started to circulate heavily with the beginning of the 1930s. 733 Yet, their frequent appearance in Turkey was unique for the 1950s, which also indicated the newly developed and strengthened connections of the Turkish Republic with the dominant scientific and publishing communities of the world. Last but

Bashford and Strange, "Public Pedagogy: Sex Education and Mass Communication in the Mid–Twentieth Century," 74.

Gordon and Shankweiler, "Different Equals Less: Female Sexuality in Recent Marriage Manuals," 459. Porter and Hall, *The Facts of Life*.

<sup>731</sup> Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality."

<sup>732</sup> Dr. Winfield Scott, "Erkek Husyeleri," Seksoloji, 4 (1949), 13.

Veronika Fuechtner, Douglas E. Haynes, and Ryan M. Jones, "Toward a Global History of Sexual Science: Movements, Networks, and Deployments," in A Global History of Sexual Science, 1880–1960, trans. Micheal T. Taylor, ed. Veronika Fuechtner, Douglas E. Haynes, Ryan M. Jones (Oakland, California: University of California Press, 2018), 1-25. Rainer Herrn, "Magnus Hirschfield's Onnagata," in A Global History of Sexual Science, 1880–1960, trans. Micheal T. Taylor, ed. Veronika Fuechtner, Douglas E. Haynes, Ryan M. Jones (Oakland, California: University of California Press, 2018), 398.

not least, translators were also involved in the production of the texts on female sexuality, even if they would not be considered experts.<sup>734</sup>

Another thing that the majority of the experts who wrote about sexual manners had in common was their gender. Majority of the authors, editors, and owners of newspapers, magazines, and publishing houses are male.<sup>735</sup> Parallel to authors, translation of the articles was also actualized by a majority of male translators. Translators such as Selim Yetkili, Muzaffer Aşkın, Semih Yazıcıoğlu and Ömer Rıza Doğrul were the known translators on women's sexuality, who were employed by the publishing houses as the main or permanent translators. 736 Selim Yetkili, for example, translated the majority of the texts published by Hadise publishing house, whereas Ömer Riza Doğrul and Muzaffer Askın primarily worked for Tan publishing house.<sup>737</sup> The knowledge of sexual manners, which was produced by the experts, was promoted and distributed with the help of magazines and manuals. Women were asked and expected to read the articles which were written by male authors to educate themselves. Putting aside the discussion of how women did use this information, women were imagined in the receiver role as readers of this male-led production process. 738

The domination of male discourse has two important and related consequences. Firstly, the male experts did not have experience with the processes of the female life cycle personally. In a limited sense, they could

<sup>734</sup> Şehnaz Tahir-Gürçağlar, The Politics and Poetics of Translation in Turkey 1923-1960, Ph.D. Diss. (Boğaziçi University, 2001), 62. Şehnaz Tahir-Gürçağlar approaches translators as agents who shape systems.

Names of the authors can be followed through the sources of this study.

Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality," 92. According to Koçak's study, between the years 1878 – 1990, "there are around 60 female translators and 210 male translators in my database and 170 female authors and 400 male authors. Therefore, it might seem that male translators were the main agents who were active in constructing a discourse on women's sexuality."

<sup>737</sup> Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality," 92 – 93.

For a critical discussions about women's passive receiver role, see: Erkaya Balsoy, Kahraman Doktor İhtiyar Acuzeye Karşı: Geç Osmanlı Doğum Politikaları, 70. Gökçen Beyinli did not particularly focus on the role of science. Rather she developed this discussion based on the relation between modern midwife and pregnant woman. Beyinli, Elleri Tılsımlı: Modern Türkiye'de Ebelik, 73.

cover the functions of the female body since they had started to use surveys to gather and process information from the "subject." However, on the process of female sexuality, the analyses were based on male experience and imagination, even though, in some cases, they conducted field research with female subjects. Second, the boundaries of female sexuality were formed by the opinions and advice of male experts, which have reflected the interests of a male-dominated society. <sup>740</sup> Their perspective on sexual matters was shaped by the male gaze, which was in parallel to the cultural norms of the era. Hence, the attempts to explain sexuality in general and female sexuality, in particular, turned into a dialogue among men. Male experts established the rules and norms for sexual behavior based on the legitimacy of scientific knowledge. Hence, male experts became the agents of the narrative about sexuality.<sup>741</sup> In this way, sexual manners publishing remained a male domain in which male experts produced and distributed sexuality knowledge. Simultaneously, women were assigned the role of the followers.

Medicine as a field and doctors as its practitioners have become the most influential experts regarding sexual manners and sexual matters in Turkey and worldwide. The greatest number of experts who wrote on sexuality in the magazines and the manuals came from medical field. The medical profession established the "jurisdictional mandate" over the sexuality of individuals, which was aimed to be classified from normal to abnormal or from healthy to illness.<sup>742</sup> Primarily, sexuality was narrated as an anatomical and physiological process. As stated in the "Content of the Sexuality"

<sup>739</sup> Ericksen, Kiss and Tell: Surveying Sex in the Twentieth Century.

<sup>740</sup> Gordon and Shankweiler, "Different Equals Less: Female Sexuality in Recent Marriage Manuals," 459.

Erkaya Balsoy, *Kahraman Doktor İhtiyar Acuzeye Karşı: Geç Osmanlı Doğum Politikaları*, 44. Balsoy discusses a similar development (male perspective and male mind) for the history-writing of birth and birth-givings. "doğumun tarihini yazarken, odağa erkek doktorları koyan akıl, erkek doktorların aklıdır ki, bu akıl tarihin kurucu öznesi olarak kendilerini yerleştirirler."

Peter Conrad, "Medicalization and Social Control," *Annual Review of Sociology* 18 (1992): 209–232.

chapter, the physiology of sexuality, including the anatomy and functions of the organs, was the primary step to be explained in detail.

The preliminary research on sexuality focused on the functioning of sexual organs and the occurrence of sexuality. 743 Susan Bordo discusses how science became the dominant authority in explaining the roles and functions of corporeal parts, including genital organs. 744 Yet, following this, the research on sexuality was based on the narratives of the individuals who articulated their experiences regarding sexuality. Hence, the research focused on studying the narratives.<sup>745</sup> Based on the combination of the anatomical findings and narrative analysis, the experts (mostly medical experts) come up with particular outcomes, which also aim to set the norms of sexuality and spread the standards for normal. With its methods and construction, research and discourse on sexuality were assumed to be neutral and objective which refer to scientific standards. However, the analyses, definitions, and meanings of the narratives of the individuals mainly depended on the perception and previous experiences of the researcher. Hence, what was presented as a neutral-objective was highly subjective in the hands of the researcher/expert. Moreover, the observed person's subjectivity was ignored due to a lack of contextualization of his or her experience. The neutral-objective assumption of medicine (science) was presented alongside the accuracy and

<sup>743</sup> Ericksen, Kiss and Tell: Surveying Sex in the Twentieth Century, 39-40.

Susan Bordo, "Feminism, Foucault and the Politics of the Body," in *Up Against Foucault*, ed. Caroline Ramazanoğlu (London: Routledge, 1993), 183. Bordo mentiones that she was inspired by Marcuse's "One Dimensional Man" and Foucault's "History of Sexuality."

Leonore Tiefer, "New Perspective on Sexuality: from rigor (motris) to richness," *The Journal of Sexuality* 28, 4 (1991), 600.

<sup>746</sup> Tiefer, "New Perspective on Sexuality: from rigor (motris) to richness," 597-598.

As a part of scientification process, "medicine implemented a science-based process of rationalization." Emily Martion, "Grafting Together Medical Anthropology, Feminism, and Technoscience," ed. Marcia C. Inhorn and Emily A. Wentzell, in *Medical Anthropology at the Intersections: Histories, Activisms, and Futures*, (Durham and London: Duke University Press, 2021), 33.

Kurt Danziger, "A question of identity: Who participated in psychological experiments?" in *The rise of experimentation in American psychology*, ed. Jill G. Morawski (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1988), 35–52.

certainty of scientific knowledge in the writings on sexual manners. Particularly for the consultee, the neutral tone of medicine helped to overcome the concerns of being shameful and/or immoral, which frequently surfaced during sexuality-related discussions. Sexuality, which was considered as a private subject, became an open discussion area under the protection of medicine.

Simultaneously, medical terminology became the language to articulate sexuality and sexual practices. The language of sexuality was replaced and powered by medical knowledge and literature. As discussed in the "Content" chapter, a new terminology was invented or replaced instead of the traditional forms of expression. Medical language on sexuality (and accordingly human body and organs) was normalized and overpowered other forms (articulations) of expressing the subject.<sup>749</sup> The change in the language also brought a change in the mentality, which turned the space of sexuality into a medicalized, in other words, a scientific realm. Bordo diagnosed such a change in articulating, explaining, and distributing knowledge about sexuality as the scientification of sexuality. <sup>750</sup> The scientification and medicalization of sexuality could be seen as a part of process, which happened for almost every discourse about the human body and mind. Individuals were introduced to medical advice texts on human diet, sleeping practices, various illnesses, mother and child health, and physical training with medical terminology. Moreover, these texts aimed to educate individuals to take care of themselves according to (medical) scientific suggestions. Besides publishing popular health journals such as Sağlığımız (Our Health), special columns such as Tıbbi Bahisler (Medical Subjects) were allocated in the newspapers to inform the readers about illnesses.<sup>751</sup> Popular magazines provided places for special columns where they answered their readers' questions about their health issues, including their sexuality, by using medical vocabulary.

Lynn M. Appleton, "Rethinking Medicalization: Alcoholism and Anomalies," in *Images of Issues*, ed. Joel Best (New York: Aldine de Gruyter, 1995), 59–80.

Susan Bordo, "Feminism, Foucault and the Politics of the Body," in *Up Against Foucault*, ed. Caroline Ramazanoğlu (London: Routledge, 1993), 183.

<sup>751</sup> In the "Content" chapter, numerous articles were given as examples in the footnotes.

Another function of medicine was related to its potential to bring solutions to social problems. Individual health and health of society were considered above all as an unquestionable good. As a result, medical experts were increasingly reliant on the health of society, which boosted the authority of scientific discourse. Talking openly about sexuality often faces legitimacy problems in public discussions. Therefore, open discussions on sexuality were linked with a functional approach. It was legitimized as bringing solutions to public problems. In this sense, medicine became one of the most useful and trustworthy disciplines since it brought solutions to fight against the social problems such as venereal diseases and regulating reproduction. Accordingly, doctors became the authorities on sexual knowledge. Female bodies and female sexuality became open to the male gaze and intervention, which was legitimized by scientific knowledge and by the dominance of medical experts (male doctors).

Apart from academics and self-claimed experts, technicians such as practicing doctors, psychologists <sup>753</sup> and teachers <sup>754</sup> were presented as the sources for providing accurate information to the public. Therefore, education for technicians became a subject, although it was not mentioned as frequently as "educating citizens." They were pointed out by the experts to provide them with the most up-to-date and accurate information. Apparently, teachers were also after the up-to-date information regarding sexuality. In 1949, *Cumhuriyet* announced news about a conference to be

<sup>752</sup> Irving Kenneth Zola, "Medicine as an institution of social control," *Social Review* 20, 4 (1972): 487-504.

Example of referring to doctors and psychologists: "Doktorlar ve bilhassa psikologlar, izahatın etraflıca ve hiçbir şey gizlenmeden verilmesini, doğru bulmaktadır." (Doctors and especially psycologists think that the explanations should be provided in detail and without keeping anything secret." "Buluğ çağında cinsiyet terbiyesi," *Sağlığımız* (1960), 11.

According to Frey's study in Turkey, teachers were the most well-known and reliable actor in the villages. For Frey's study: F. Frey, *The Turkish Political Elite* (Cambridge: MIT Press, 1965). Quoted from Ferhunde Özbay, "Nüfus Hareketleri ve Devlet Politikaları", in *Dünden Bugüne Aile, Kent ve Nüfus* (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2015), 217. As a result, teachers could be very effective actors in disseminating sexual manners information. Also Ziyaeddin Fahri Fındıkoğlu stated that the education of children is primarily teachers' responsibility. Ziyaeddin Fahri Fındıkoğlu, "Hadiseler-Düşünceler: Çocuk Yılı," *Cumhuriyet*, 23.04.1948.

given by Tevfik Remzi Kazancıgil, a well-known gynecologist, to teachers at the Teachers' Union meeting. Faruk Aydan underlined the difficulty of teaching sexuality in a classroom. He mentioned the importance of providing to teachers the most accurate, current and scientific knowledge on sexual manners. Second, he suggested giving this responsibility to experienced and influential teachers. The second of the suggested giving the responsibility to experienced and influential teachers.

"I thank your journal" was one of the common phrases, which was articulated frequently by the well-known figures of the era. 757 Another common praise was "your journal is very much appreciated due to its efforts in handling the subject, sexual manners."<sup>758</sup> Journals such as Seksoloji were pointed out as scientific sources for the readers to learn proper sexual manners. The articles in various magazines and the marriage (sexual) manuals turned into spaces in which different sources and experts were brought together. The experts were encouraging the public to learn from journals. Women were particularly targeted for education and equipping with up-to-date information about sexual manners because they were considered the primary caregivers for children and also for maintaining better marriages.<sup>759</sup> However, it is important to note that reading involves the interplay between the reader and text. Therefore, the diversity of readers may cause a diversity of interpretations of the same text. <sup>760</sup> Consequently, limited information is available on how individuals interpreted and used these texts on sexual matters.

Contrary to the whole "necessity of the scientific knowledge on sexuality" discourse of the 1950s, the majority of people likely found out

Tevfik Remzi Kazancıgil gave a speech on "sexual manners in school" in the 1949 dated Education Council. "Muallimler Birliğinin terbiye toplantıları," *Cumhuriyet*, 16.07.1949

<sup>756</sup> Ö. Faruk Aydan, "Orta Okullara Seksoloji Dersi Konmalıdır." *Seksoloji*, 12 (1950), 31.

<sup>757</sup> See the introduction column of *Anketimiz* in Seksoloji, and reader's letters in "Sual ve Cevaplar Column" for the messages those appreciated *Seksoloji* journal and knowledge on sexual manners.

<sup>758</sup> Münir Türkent, "Cinsi Hayat ve Gençlik," in *Genç Kızlığın En Esrarlı Tarafı: Bakirelik*, *Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 1* (İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959), 2.

<sup>759</sup> Muzaffer Aşkın, "Cinsiyet Hakkında Sıhhatli ve Doğru Bir Anlayışa Sahip Olmalıyız," *Seksoloji*, 40 (1952), 4. Aşkın targeted whole public. However, he also emhasized women as the one the most important reader's group due to their "educator" role to her children.

Louise M. Rosenblatt, *Literature as Exploration*, 5th edition (New York: MLA, 1995), 89.

about sex from non-scientific sources. The knowledge provided by the sexologists could not satisfy the widespread curiosity.<sup>761</sup> Ideas and arguments related to sexuality were filtered through popular forms of entertainment and news. 762 According to Lisa Z. Sigel, magazines, popular fiction and popular science along with sexology create "a reservoir of ideas, metaphors, and narratives about sexuality and gender that allowed people to make sense of the world."<sup>763</sup> Popular culture products became a powerful disseminator of proper sexual behaviors and gender roles through stories in both the United Kingdom and the United States.<sup>764</sup> In Turkey, popular literature (stories and novels) and magazines occupied an important place in popular culture during the 1950s. 765 The journals and newspapers printed both translated (mostly from American sources) and indigenous stories and novels. Seksoloji started to publish short stories after its fourth year, which were, mostly, translated from American magazines. 766 Popular novels of the era were distributed as serials (tefrika) in newspapers such as Milliyet and women's magazines such as *Hayat*. Novels in the form of series were a part of everyday publishing, along with the news of the day and the opinion and informing articles in newspapers or magazines. The fictive stories of the novels were mixed with the daily happenings in the pages of the newspapers. Nurdan Gürbilek argues that novels are one of the best sources for women to learn about love and life. Although sexuality was not

<sup>761</sup> Sharon R. Ullman, *Sex Seen: The Emergence of Modern Sexuality in America* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997).

Moddelmog, "Modernism and Sexology," 272-273.

Lisa Z. Sigel, *Making Modern Love: Sexual Narratives and Identities in Interwar Britain* (Philadelphia: Temple UP, 2012).

<sup>764</sup> Sigel, Making Modern Love: Sexual Narratives and Identities in Interwar Britain. Ullman, Sex Seen: The Emergence of Modern Sexuality in America.

<sup>765</sup> Bilge Ercilasun, "Türk Edebiyatında Popülerlik Kavramı ve Başlıca Eserler," *Yeni Türk Edebiyatı Üzerine İncelemeler 1* (Ankara: Akçağ Yayınları, 1997), 441. Ömer Türkeş, "Romana Yazılan Tarih," *Toplum ve Bilim*, 91 (2002): 166- 212.

Such as: Erskine Caldwell, "Balayı," *Seksoloji*, 58 (1954), 54-57. The story was translated by Azize Erten, a woman. Guy de Moupossauf, "İşaret," *Seksoloji*, 57 (1953), 54-58. The story was translated by Orhan Azizoğlu.

mentioned by Gürbilek, literature was a source for women to get acquainted with relations between man and woman.<sup>767</sup>

Popular novels defined gender roles and appropriate behaviors for men and women in various contexts. Aslı Güneş called the popular novels as "adab-ı muaşeret romanları" (novels of manners), where proper and wanted behaviors of men and women were circulated in the public sphere. Test According to Güneş, novels of manners carried the proper norms for womanhood, marriage, and even sexuality to the public sphere starting with the 1930s due to their high circulation and outreach. Novels present the legitimate (accepted) and also the adulterous ways of building romantic relations between lovers. However, different than articles in Seksoloji or texts in marriage manuals, sexuality was neither narrated in detail nor with a scientific language in the novels. Where, in some novels, sexuality was even not mentioned, whereas in others, it was embedded in the love experienced between a man and a woman. The codes of proper sexuality were drawn through the female characters of the era and their love adventures with men. The limits of appropriate sexuality were narrated through the undesirable

Nurdan Gürbilek, "Erkek Yazar Kadın Okur," in *Kadınlar Dile Düşünce*, ed. Sibel Irzık and Jale Parla, (Istanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2004). Nurdan Gürbilek, "Kadınlaşma Endişesi: Efemine erkekler, hadım oğullar, kadın adamlar," in *Kör Ayna, Kayıp Şark* (İstanbul: Metis Yayınları, 2004), 51-74. Gürbilek argues that in the early Republican period, women learned love, life and revenge from novels. Gürbilek's argument can be repeated for the 1950s.

<sup>768</sup> Güneş, "Kemalist Modernleşmenin Adab-ı Muaşeret Romanları: Popüler Aşk Anlatıları,"3.

For a detailed discussion about the novels of manners of the early Republican Period, see: Güneş, "Kemalist Modernleşmenin Adab-ı Muaşeret Romanları: Popüler Aşk Anlatıları," 43. For the circulation and outreach of the novels of manners, see: Yalçın Alemdar, Siyasal ve Sosyal Değişmeler Açısından Cumhuriyet Dönemi Türk Romanı, (Ankara: Akçağ Yayınları, 2002), 223.

In Kerem Özkurt's study, Özkurt points out place of sexuality and its intersection with love in popular novels written by Kerime Nadir, Esat Mahmut Karakurt and Muazzez Tahsin Berkand between the years 1930 and 1945. Özkurt, "Tracing Modernity In The Popular Romances Of The Early Republican Period (1930-1945)," 44-51, 57, 62-63.

consequences that happened, mostly to women, due to their immoral sexual behaviors.<sup>771</sup>

At the end, the stories portrayed a life in which the characters were rewarded or punished based on their choices regarding sexuality. The stories and their characters were used to construct the ideal woman and her attitude and behavior. Every kind of sexuality and sexual desire other than the legitimate one was pushed to the "prohibited area" in popular novels. They stories and novels which were printed alongside scientific knowledge on sexuality, served a supplementary role to visualize other's lives. They displayed the potential consequences of the *excessive* sexual behaviors, from which individuals may learn, take lessons from and adapt their future behaviors accordingly.

# 2.6. Appropriate Sexuality

"Sexual manners" aimed to define the boundaries of appropriate sexuality. From the reasons regarding "why people need to learn sexual manners" to the various topics covered under the sexual manners title, sexual manners focuses on regulating individuals' sexual acts, which become visible through people's everyday practices. During this process, sexual manners functions in dual ways. On the one hand, it defines the proper sexual acts for a *healthy* and *normal* individual, describes the norms for appropriate sexuality, and determines the proper outcome of sexuality. On the other hand, it defines unwanted (undesirable) sexual behaviors,

Toplumsal Cinsiyet," *Kadınlar Dile Düşünce*, ed. Sibel Irzık and Jale Parla (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2004), 169. Adak states that the female sexuality was narrated by a male character and/or narrator which easens writing about sexuality for female authors. At the end, female sexuality was narrated from a male perspective in the novels, which muted the female voice about her own body and had similarities with the narrative of the scientific knowledge regarding the perspective.

Ömer Türkeş, "Cinsel Özgürlük Neden Masum Değildir?" Milliyet Sanat (2004), 83.
Quoted from Güneş, "Kemalist Modernleşmenin Adab-ı Muaşeret Romanları: Popüler Aşk Anlatıları."

which draws the borders and provides a framework for individuals to regulate their actions.

The limits of normality could be assessed easily with the ones standing on the margins of the era. The lines drawn by scientific knowledge, medicine per se, and criminal law were more explicit to differentiate the proper sexual acts from the inappropriate ones, the individuals who were diagnosed as sick from the healthy ones, or the individuals who were treated like criminals from the innocent ones. Therefore, regulation and control mechanisms for those standing on the margins were more clearly defined, whether as medical intervention or penal sanctions. As discussed in the "Content" section, deviants and criminals were recognized more clearly with certain norms determined by science and handled mainly by two actors: physicians and juridical bodies. From a binary perspective, where one side was accepted as appropriate, the other side was left out as negated sexualities since the line between them and appropriate sexualities was drawn boldly. Hence, while one type of sexuality (and a group of sexual acts) was regarded as *norm-al* and healthy, the ones assumed to not comply were considered a-normal, unhealthy, and inappropriate.

However, the efforts to define appropriate sexuality have shortcomings due to the particular, unique, and private character of human sexuality. First and foremost, sexuality is an act that is experienced in private. Therefore, scientists encountered obstacles in collecting information to make generalizations, form and enforce universal norms about sexuality. According to Kinsey, he tried to fill in the *large gaps in precise knowledge* about human sexual behavior. Also, the uniqueness of human beings and how they experience sexuality aggravated the difficulty of setting universal norms that could be measurable and verifiable for every individual. Last but not least, the universal (and scientific in this context) norm as a concept was a creation of scientists. One can not correspond entirely to the universal norms since, particularly for sexuality, every single

773 Ericksen, Kiss and Tell: Surveying Sex in the Twentieth Century.

Donna J. Drucker, *The Classification of Sex: Alfred Kinsey and the Organization of Knowledge* (Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 2014), 116.

<sup>775</sup> Ericksen, Kiss and Tell: Surveying Sex in the Twentieth Century.

individual has his or her own unique qualifications and living arrangements, which differ according to their history, culture, and class. Also, the norms of sexuality are not fixed or frozen since they are also dynamic according to different variables such as time, geography, and culture. 776 Compliance with universal norms was an illusion in and of itself. Therefore, at best, one can approximate the norms that the scientists set regarding sexuality.<sup>777</sup> The power holders—physicians and decision-makers—tried to assert certain norms and rules for appropriate sexuality. They aimed to install an understanding which, at least, enforced (to try) the individuals to behave according to those norms and rules. In another way, those norms turn into indicators for those individuals who are not standing on the margins to check themselves. Sexology was recognized as a scientific discipline that did not only diagnose the abnormal. However, it also discussed and set the norms for appropriate sexual acts for regular (average) individuals. The norms, rules, and standards that were developed by the sexology discipline were not only presented for the use of the experts. They aimed to communicate with regular individuals so that they could control and regulate their sexual acts.

Freud became the leading figure in explaining human sexuality, particularly in the 1950s. Kirsten Leng and Katie Sutton stated that "Freudian psychoanalysis began to dominate mainstream US psychiatry" during the 1950s, when Alfred Kinsey's empirical sex research was on the rise.<sup>778</sup> Considering the influence of American scientific discourse in Turkey's social sciences, Freud became the reference point to explain and

<sup>776</sup> For the uniqueness of sexuality, see: Hera Cook, "Sex and the Doctors: the Medicalization of Sexuality as a Two-way Process in Early to Mid-Twentieth-century Britain," in *Cultural Approaches to the History of Medicine*, ed. Willem de Blécourt and Cornelie Usborne (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004). Judith Butler, *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity* (New York and London: Routledge, 1999), 117.

<sup>777</sup> Linda Rae Bennett, *Single Women, Sexuality and Reproductive Health in Contemporary Indonesia* (London and New York: Routledge, 2005), 2. Bennett discusses female sexuality in particular. However, her discussions could be applied to sexuality and sexual roles in general. Bennett argues that "normative behaviour does not necessarily coincide with hegemonic ideals" of sex and sexuality.

<sup>778</sup> Kirsten Leng and Katie Sutton, "Histories of Sexology Today: Reimagining the Boundaries of Scientia Sexualis," *History of the Human Sciences* 34, 1 (2021), 7.

justify the writers' arguments both in the translated and original texts. 779 As a male scientist, he did not only form a discourse with a heterosexual male perspective. But he also narrated female sexuality as a half, incomplete and wounded occurrence.<sup>780</sup> Second, sexuality was explained by instincts with the influence of Freud and other biology-related scientists.<sup>781</sup> Therefore, sexuality was narrated with reference to nature. The laws of nature were explained as constant and permanent, which, in return, assigned specific essential roles and behaviors to individuals (bodies) without considering the context individual differences. Reproduction-oriented heteronormativity were argued as the prominent characteristics of sexuality since they were considered a part of the rule of nature. As a part of heteronormativity, these norms have brought different standards for the behaviors and attitudes of man and woman. However, as Grosz argued, bodies are produced "within a network of socio-historical relations instead of being tied to a fixed essence."<sup>782</sup>

Defining appropriate sexuality with the help of *sexual manners* mostly serves the aim of controlling and regulating sexuality in the 1950s. Three characteristics of sexuality mainstreamed the (re)emerging and (re)invented sexuality discourse: heterosexuality, in marriage sexuality, and reproductive purposes.<sup>783</sup> These three characteristics are linked and interdependent with each other. Since reproduction and sexuality were affecting each other, the discourse on sexuality was structured to regulate, mainly, this mutual relationship.

For a Freud-based discussion, see: Dr. Hippocrates, "Freud ve Cinsiyet Araştırmaları," Seksoloji 7 (1949), 18-21. Faruk Akbeğ, "Seksoloji 4 Yaşına Girerken Seksoloji," Seksoloji, 37 (1952), 2. Ord. Prof. Mustafa Şekip Tunç, "Rüyalar ve Rüyaların Dili," Seksoloji, 13 (1950), 10.

For a discussion of Freud's arguments about female sexuality, see: Judith Butler, *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity* (New York and London: Routledge, 1999), 36-37, 59-60.

Hera Cook, *The Long Sexual Revolution: English Women, Sex, and Contraception 1800-1975* (Oxford, New York: Oxford University Press, 2004), 223-224.

Feminism and the Body 2, 5 (1987), 1.

<sup>783</sup> Christine L. Williams and Arlene Stein, "Introduction," in *Sexuality and Gender*, ed. Christine L. Williams and Arlene Stein (Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 2002), 1-2.

## 2.6.1. Norms for Appropriate Sexuality

## Heterosexual Sexuality

The appropriate sexuality, which was typically used interchangeably with the concept of "normal sexuality," was narrated as a heteronormative act. From the written documents to the visual illustrations and photographs, sexuality was presented as an act that occurs between a man and a woman. In the discussions about sexual manners, heterosexuality was presented as a normal and natural experience for individuals<sup>784</sup> that was related to procreative activity. Related to procreative aims, writers refer to nature and the "rules of nature" to justify and strengthen their arguments on heteronormative sexuality. In explaining sexuality, nature became one of the most potent and irrefutable sources. Writers frequently pointed to nature to understand sexuality and set the norms. "As it occurred in nature...." became one of the most used introduction phrases to start explaining "the nature of sexuality." The mindset behind this explanation was quite circular. They claimed that sexuality is natural. Then, they set and proved the norms of sexuality by pointing the nature. Yet, like sexuality, what they referred to as nature, was also constructed discursively. In another way of saying, they have created a nature with a selective perspective to build their narrative.<sup>785</sup>

The power of this discourse bound two features of sexuality as "being natural" and "heterosexual" and defined that kind of sexuality as appropriate and normal.<sup>786</sup> While heterosexuality was defined as normal and natural, non-heterosexual acts were not ignored or made invisible. Instead, homosexual acts were pointed out by various actors, predominantly physicians. Homosexual acts and homosexuality were defined categorically,

<sup>784</sup> In numerous articles, homosexuality was defined as gayri tabii (unnatural). See, "Homoseksüellik tedavi edilebilir bir hastalıktır." *Seksoloji*, 21 (1950), 40. "Bununla beraber ehemmiyetli rolü aile hayatı, çocukluk intibaları oynar. Şayet bu intibalar *gayrı tabii* ise o insan ekseriya homoseksüelliğe temayül eder." (italic mine)

For a discussion about the construction of Nature, see Chapter 2.

Jonathan Ned Katz, Vidal Gore and Lisa Duggan, *The Invention of Heterosexuality* (New York: Dutton, 1995).

not only unnatural and abnormal. But they were also diagnosed as an illness. The concepts such as unnatural, abnormality, and illness were used interchangeably and intermingling where homosexuality was explained to the readers. Where homosexuality was diagnosed as a treatable illness, psychiatry, among the other medical branches, was designated as a field to heal and regulate individuals according to the accepted norms. Doctors, particularly psychiatrists, were invited to treat, regulate and normalize the excessive, abnormal, or sick sexual behaviors of the individuals for the good of the individuals and the well-being of society. Beside the "morally good" part, the privileged position of heterosexuality was also related to *normalizing* reproduction as the desired outcome of sexuality. <sup>788</sup>

### Reproduction as a norm for appropriate sexuality

As mentioned before, sexuality was recognized as a natural and normal process in the 1950s. Eventhough sexuality was expected to be experienced by individuals not solely for reproductive reasons, reproduction was listed as one of their ultimate goals to fulfill their lives. In other words, sexuality was considered as a means to an end.<sup>789</sup> Therefore, one of the characteristics of appropriate sexuality was set as procreation. The relationship between sexuality and reproduction was narrated as a part of the *natural flow*. The life cycles of the individuals were narrated as "individuals are born, grow

For the effect of the norms of a society, see: "Homoseksüellik tedavi edilebilir bir hastalıktır." *Seksoloji*, 21 (1950), 38. "Bir insanın cinsi hayatı üzerinde cemiyetin büyük tesiri vardır. Zira bu tesir olmazsa bir çok cinsi sapıklıklar kendini gösterebilir.... Şayet bir insan içinde bulunduğu cemiyetin bir azası olmaktan çıkıp onun tesirlerinden kurtulursa cinsi hayatı bir çocuğunki kadar serbest ve fantezi olur." For the assessment of similar discussions in the literature, see: Judd Marmor, "Homosexuality and Cultural Value Systems," *American Journal of Psychiatry*, 130 (1973), 1208-1209 quoted from Conrad and Schneider, *Deviance and Medicalization: From Badness to Sickness*, 207.

Bryan S. Turner, "Citizenship, Reproduction and the State: International Marriage and Human Rights," *Citizenship Studies* 12, 1 (2008), 49. Turner defines the reproduction as an outcome of marriage. However, marriage was considered as the appropriate insitution for sexuality. Hence, I preferred to use "sexuality."

<sup>789</sup> John Anthony, "Evlilik ve Cinsiyet," *Seksoloji*, 13 (1950), 2.

up, reproduce, get old, and die."<sup>790</sup> Here again, nature became the justification point to argue the vital importance of reproduction and the fixity of the mindset about the relationship between sexuality and reproduction. In this narrative, procreation has the importance of fulfilling one's life and transmitting one's self to the future. Procreation was particularly narrated as a breaking point in the female life-cycle. Therefore, sexuality of women was bound more strongly with reproductive practices. Hence, female sexuality was narrated based on a woman's reproductive cycle, which became heavily visible in the discussions regarding menopause.<sup>791</sup>

Sexual experiences which excluded reproduction were negated in the narrative. For once, masturbation was associated with negated sexualities. Masturbation was described as a useless and, if excessive, harmful activity regarding procreation.<sup>792</sup> On the one hand, masturbation was narrated as an aimless activity since it could not lead to procreation. Sometimes, it was not even considered a sexual activity since no intercourse occurs during masturbation. This narrative contained a paradoxical narrative since sexual pleasure was set as one of the goals for physical and psychological individual well-being. On the other hand, some writers were quite aware of the pleasure part of masturbation. Therefore, some argued that masturbation could not give equal pleasure that could be received from sexual intercourse. 793 Another problematic issue about masturbation was related to its negative effects on semen. A reader from Istanbul was concerned about his frequent masturbation habit and was asking whether it might cause any harmful effects on his manhood (erkeklik). The answer soothed the reader by mentioning that masturbation may be experienced during abstinence. Yet, the reader was warned that if "you masturbate a lot, you can have temporary impotency."794

<sup>790</sup> Ord.Prof.M.Şekip Tunç, "Cinsi Olgunluğun Evlilikteki Kıymeti," *Seksoloji*, 11 (1950), 1. "Cinsi hayatın bütün hazırlık ve deneme safhaları günün birinde nesil üreten ve bunun için bir eş seçme safhasına kendiliğinden girer."

<sup>791</sup> Dr. Andre Binet, "Yaşlı Kadın ve Cinsiyet," Seksoloji, 32 (1951), 38-39.

<sup>792</sup> Recep Doksat, "Günün Tıbbi Bahisleri: Cinsi Terbiye," Milliyet, 28.01.1958.

<sup>793 &</sup>quot;Kadınlarda Kendi Kendini Tatmin," Seksoloji, 13 (1950), 60.

<sup>794 &</sup>quot;Sual ve Cevaplar, Sual 96," Seksoloji, 14 (1950), 62.

Another type of negated sexuality came with the strong disapproval of practices that could taint and endanger healthy reproduction. Besides the STDs, alcohol<sup>795</sup> and drug<sup>796</sup> use have been identified as harmful and irresponsible habits. They were chosen not only due to their unhealthy effect on individuals. However, they were also diagnosed as the potential reasons for the unhealthy generation. Faruk Akbeğ argued that alcohol harms sperm. According to Akbeğ, although this semen can fertilize, the child out of this semen is a candidate for degeneration. Akbeğ stated that alcohol addiction was considered a reason for having children with epilepsy and other mental disorders. Hence, he blamed alcoholic fathers for creating unhealthy generations and transferring health problems hereditarily. The problems hereditarily.

#### In marriage

Regarding the appropriateness, texts on sexuality do not only provide prescriptions for the end goal of the sexual act and description of the licit and legitimate partner. However, also, the experts aimed to describe the proper period and institution in which individuals should experience sexuality in their life spans. Marriage emerges as the forthcoming form when sexuality is discussed in publications. As mentioned in the previous sections, marriage was recognized as the sole prerequisite and legitimate form for experiencing sexuality. Even the content regarding sexuality

<sup>795</sup> Dr. Partington, "Alkolün Cinsiyete Tesiri," *Seksoloji*, 10 (1950), 57.

Faruk Akbeğ, "Uyuşturucu Maddeler ve Cinsiyet," *Seksoloji*, 49 (1953), 37-40. "*Fert ve cemiyet sağlığı bakımından* çok korkunç neticeleri bulunan uyuşturucu maddelerin cinsiyetle alakası aşağıdaki yazıda etraflı bir şekilde incelenmektedir." In this article, the emphasis on the individual and public's well-being was in line with the general emphasis of sexual manners. (italik mine). A note regarding the reference: the name of the author was not written in front of the article. However, it was stated in the index section.

<sup>797</sup> Faruk Akbeğ, "Alkollü İçkilerin Cinsiyete Tesiri," Seksoloji, 12 (1950), 13-14. ("... her ne kadar telkih kabiliyetini haiz isler de husule gelen çocuk, dejenere olmaya namzettir.")

<sup>798</sup> Seksoloji also answered to the questions related to alcohol and potential hereditary problems. Such as: "Sual ve Cevaplar," *Seksoloji*, 4 (1949), 62. "35-Alkolün Cİnsi Münasebete Tesiri-..... alkoliklerin çocukları arasındaysa akıl zaafı gösterenler ve aptallar büyük bir yer tutar." "Sual ve Cevaplar," *Seksoloji*, 13 (1950), 63-64. "92-Alkol ve Irsiyet: N.A. Edirne"

addressed whether married individuals or candidates for marriage, such as "İşte Evlendiniz" (Here, You Got Married). The narrative about the relationships between man and woman underlined the importance of "finding the significant other." Any romantic relationship between man and woman was considered a state of progress that would, fortunately, and preferably, end with a marriage. Marriage was seen as a transformative experience because finding a true mate was considered the ultimate aim of individuals in their lives. Finding the *true* mate is narrated as the law of nature. Hence, as mentioned above, individuals were born, grown, reproduced, and die, marriage (instead of experiencing sexuality) was seen as a roof for actualizing *reproduction part*. According to Davit Mace, "sexuality should be the servant of love, parenting and family life." Since sexuality could only be seen legitimate in marriage, marriage was considered as the first step toward one's true purpose.

Marriage was also considered a state of love that could tame the sexual instincts of individuals. In a translated text from a doctor (Florance Picard), sexuality was defined as an organic need that was shared with animals as a part of basic instincts. However, love can tame this animalistic instinct that separates humans from animals. <sup>802</sup> In both narratives, human life was narrated in a linear and progressive-oriented mind. As a part of the human life cycle, individuals pass to adulthood through marriage and reach a mature state. In the second justification, human beings evolved and differentiated from animals through taming their instincts. Marriage as a concept and institution was narrated at the ultimate intersection point for biological, psychological, and social maturity. The narratives that discussed the effects of marriage from the perspective of physical and psychological evolvement focused more on personal development. Although the intimate

.

<sup>799</sup> Dr. Le Mon Clark, *İşte Evlendiniz (Seksoloji Yayınları.2)*, trans. Muzaffer Aşkın, third edition (İstanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1951).

<sup>800</sup> Dr. Max Joseph Exner, *Mükemmel İzdivacın Şartları (Seksoloji Yayınları.1)*, trans. Muzaffer Aşkın (Istanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1950).

Dr. Davit R. Mace, "İffetin Modası Geçmiş midir?," *Seksoloji*, 10 (1950), 6. "*Cinsiyet*, aşkın ana ve babalığın, aile hayatının hizmetkarı olmalıdır."

<sup>802 &</sup>quot;Gençkızlığın en esrarlı tarafı: Bakirelik," in *Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı*, no. 1, *Gençkızlığın En Esrarlı Tarafı: Bakirelik* (İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959), 24.

sexual activity of adults was regarded in law as a private matter, the Turkish Republic has taken a strong interest in the moral conditions for lawful union and for the reproductive consequences of lawful and unlawful sexual activity.803 The 1926 legislation, which regulated marital relations and still operative in the 1950s, interferes sexual activity (relations) between the partners. 804 The 1926 Civil Code aimed to set the parameters for the intimate and interpersonal relationships through determining the elements such as the proper bond for sexual activity (marriage), time (minimum age limits for marriage), number of partners (monogamy) and partner (heterosexuality). The legalization of sexuality was discussed and occurred through regulating marriage practices. In the 1950s, when the current Turkish government propagandized the free choice and private life of individuals which was developed against the acts of the previous government and the communist regimes, intervention in interpersonal relations under the name of "regulating marriage" was not considered a contradictory act. Instead, regulative attempts at marriage were discussed as a part of creating "a strong social body" and "healthy society." Legal justifications were used in line with the medical justifications by the governing actors and academic figures of the era in order to draw the limits for appropriate sexuality.

Based on the assumptions that sexuality will be experienced in marriage, informative writings on sexuality and sexual manners were published in marriage manuals. Sexuality was seen as a part of marriage life instead of an experience that could be experienced solely. Sexuality was not only positioned in the marriage institution by the sexual manners' publishing. However, women's magazines such as *İkimiz* also limited sexuality to the limits of marriage. In the narrative, where sexuality was limited in marriages, the ideal relationship between man and woman was displayed as

Turner, "Citizenship, Reproduction and the State," 47. Turner discusses the regulatory attempts of the states in constructing citizenship.

The 1926 Civil Code will be discussed in detail in the next chapter regarding its role in constructing marriage and family as a proper institution for reproduction.

<sup>805</sup> Max J. Exner, "Mükemmel İzdivaçın Şartları," trans. Muzaffer Aşkın (İstanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1950)

<sup>806 &</sup>quot;Aşkı Yaşatın," İkimiz, 4, 01.02.1955, 34.

a monogamic relationship. Besides the public discourse promoting monogamic relations, marriage was also formed legally as a monogamic institution starting from 1926. In this mindset, sexuality was expected to be experienced with one partner in a socially and legally accepted structure. Hence, the Turkish Republic actively aimed to intervene in inter-personal relations and determine the limits of sexuality with the help of the Civil Code.

Undoubtedly, the writers were aware of the possibilities of experiencing sexuality out of marriage. Therefore, while they were promoting the benefits of marital life in their articles, simultaneously, there were also listing the shortcomings, dangers and destructions of the out-of-wedlock (marriage) sexuality. The first article of the tenth issue of Seksoloji, Davit R. Mace touched upon chastity issue. He listed possible detrimental effects of out-of marriage on individuals as sexually transmitted diseases (STDs), illegitimate children and character flaws on individuals; and destructions on society as instability in family life.807 Two forthcoming outcomes that individuals and society should avoid were set as illegitimate children and STDs. The writers of the era from the populist press and academia explained and discussed the reasons and the harmful effects of these outcomes on society in detail. While discussing the reasons and consequences, they also displayed their perception regarding the differences between female and male sexuality. The discussion on illegitimate children turned into a case study to follow the proper limits of female sexuality, whereas STDs as a subject were discussed intertwined with male sexuality.

## 2.6.2. Out-of-Marriage Sexuality and Illegitimate Children

The limits of appropriate sexuality also determine the limits and characteristics of male and female sexuality. Although the generic attributes of appropriate sexuality applied, per principle, for men and women equally, the discussions on out-of-marriage sexuality displayed differentiated standards, expectations, and even laws for men and women when experiencing sexuality. The lines and negated behaviors for women were

807

Dr. Davit R. Mace, "İffetin Modası Geçmiş midir?," Seksoloji, 10 (1950), 2.

defined more clearly, whereas they were drawn more flexibly for men. The differentiated lines frequently emerged in the discussions regarding out-of-marriage sexuality.

Out-of-marriage sexuality experience was divided into three phases for women, in which marriage became the indicator of compartmentalizing women's life cycle and their relations with sexuality. The writers classified the sexual life cycle of women into three phases. The first phase was the pre-marriage period which was mostly discussed with the concerns regarding the virginity of women. The second phase was during the marriage period, which was labeled as adultery for women. The third phase was after marriage, which was applied to widows. There were several articles and chapters in the marriage manuals for virginity, virgin girls and young women, "woman life in marriage," and widows. 808 As mentioned in the above discussion, sexuality was suggested to be experienced in a heterosexual setting, in marriage, and for reproductive purposes. These three categories were particularly related to women's reproductive practices and capabilities, which were (assumed to be) limited in the marriage institution. According to these categories, writers have discussed the possible outcomes of out-of-marriage sexuality for women with a strong emphasis on their concern about illegitimate children.

#### Virginity

The pre-marriage sexuality discussion for women primarily focused on the virginity of women. Protecting women's virginity was discussed with the justifications related to personal well-being and social concerns. In other words, the writers have discussed the potential individual and social consequences of losing virginity in a detailed manner. The individual well-being of women was linked with the physical, psychological, and social outcomes of losing virginity. To emphasize its relationship with women's physical and psychological well-being, the writers have built their claims on the nature of women, which was a frequent reference point in the era while explaining sexuality-related subjects.

808

<sup>&</sup>quot;Dul Kadının Cinsi Hayatı," Seksoloji (1952).

Nature, as mentioned before, was narrated as a constant, determined, and durable imagination. The references, which were based on nature, have been explained and justified within the limits and discourse of science. These explanations had the legitimacy of expertise and scientific knowledge, which were displayed and strengthened through their references to particular and, also, anonymous theories and research. <sup>809</sup> In the end, they relied on the power of "knowing the subject" scientifically. In the discussions where writers argued and advised women about female sexuality, they underline the appropriate limits, necessities, and experiences for women. They listed and compared the attributed characteristics of women and men. Hence, they created a dualist understanding regarding experiencing sexuality.

The nature of the woman was described as nurturing, naïve and emotional. Because of her natural – innate – characteristics, women were created as monogamic beings who wanted to belong to one man.<sup>810</sup> According to an article translated from Sexology magazine, women's sexual urges were not assertive and high as long as the proper partner woke them up and in a proper relationship which should entail a loving and affectionate bond.<sup>811</sup> Women were expected to be monogamous and experience sexuality with one partner. Heinrich Kisch stated that women need to avoid any premarriage sexual relations to be "true to themselves." Also, women should protect their physical and psychological well-being that could happen due to any contradictory situation to their *essence*.<sup>812</sup> The nature of women was associated with their biological features and particularly with their

In some cases, the writers were mentioning particular names as a part of their argument. "Freud'un dediği gibi...." (as Freud said) "Kinsey'in araştırmasında....." (according to

Kinsey's survey). In other articles, they mentioning a research "bir araştırmada ...." (in a research) or they gave a general reference to science like "as it is said in scientific world." (bilim dünyasında da dendiği gibi)

Heinrich Kisch, *Kadın ve Evlilik Hayatı*, *no:6*, trans. Şevket Dilmaç and Ayet Altuğ (İstanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1951), 3-30.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Kadında cinsi soğukluk," *Seksoloji*, 10 (1950), 15. "Fakat kadın, hiç bir sevgi duymadığı, yahut kendisine karşı incelik be hassasiyetle muamele etmeyen bir erkeğe karşı cinsi bakımdan hararetli bir mukabele göstermez."

Heinrich Kisch, *Kadın ve Evlilik Hayatı*, *no:6*, trans. Şevket Dilmaç and Ayet Altuğ (İstanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1951), 3-30.

reproductive capacity. Women's reproductive capacity was used to highlight the difference from the men's characteristics. On the other hand, because of his biological features, man aims to distribute his offspring as much as possible. Therefore, Faruk Akbeğ stated that due to their nature, men are open to temptation. Yet, with civilization, the sexual urge of man was tamed partially, which could go off-road from time to time.<sup>813</sup>

Although being monogamic did not restrain women from experiencing pre-marriage sexuality, the emphasis on two concepts -honor (namus) and virtue (iffet)-brought significant limitations to the sexuality of women. Honor and virtue were defined as the main characteristics which should be entailed and protected both for men and women for a decent living. However, women's honor and chastity have also turned to subjects that were related to a public concern starting from the honor of the woman's family to the welfare of the nation, which was defined according to a woman's sexual relation with a man. According to Sirman, a woman's honor was not only a functional tool to regulate the female body. Honor was used to control the behaviors and desires of individuals. Moreover, woman's honor helped to define and classify the status of the individuals in a society.<sup>814</sup> In the article, which was translated from Coronet, the ultimate aim of women was stated by the psychologists as building a home (yuva kurmak) and raising children.815 As the builders of the family and mothers of the nation, Nihat Sami Banarlı argued that women should protect their virtue (innocence) to avoid unwanted consequences for themselves and for society. 816 "Mother of the Nation" was frequently used in the narratives since the establishment of the Republic that described the role of the Republican woman.<sup>817</sup> The discourse on "being mother of the nations" distinguished slightly from the

Faruk Akbeğ, "Erkeğin Sadakatsizliği," Seksoloji, no. 51 (1953), 34.

Nükhet Sirman, "Önsöz: Namusun Arka Planı," in *Haremler ve Kuzenler*, written Germaine Tillion, trans. Şirin Tekeli, Nukhet Sirman (İstanbul: Metis Yayınları, 2006), 21-28.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Bugünün genç kızları evlenebilmek için ahlaksız olmaya mecbur mudur?" *Seksoloji*, 51 (1953), 2.

Nihat Sami Banarlı, "Seni Düşüren Eller," Seksoloji, 29 (1951), 7.

Nükhet Sirman, "Kadınların Milliyeti," in *Modern Türkiye'de Siyasi Düşünce: Milliyetçilik cilt:4*, ed. Murat Gültekingil and Tanıl Bora (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2002), 226-245.

1930s to the 1950s with its covered subjects. In the 1930s, the discourse on "being a good mother" was solely related to "raising children of the nation properly." In the 1950s, the sexuality of women was anchored in this discourse due to its rising visibility. The new discourse aimed to discuss and state the limits of women's sexuality more openly.

Virginity was considered the primary indicator for protecting virtue, particularly for women, which also built a direct link with honor. Virginity was not only discussed from a moral standpoint and by asking young women to avoid any pre-marital activity. It was also turned into a physical being by defining, describing, and naming a hymen.<sup>818</sup> In the pages of the Seksoloji, doctors provided physical explanations about the physical form of the hymen and supported their discussions with illustrations. 819 In an article, hymen was diagnosed as the "definitive proof" of virginity. Yet, the writer also mentioned that this proof - the existence of hymen - may lead to fallacy. 820 Virginity attained a *natural* situation with the invention of the hymen, which could be diagnosed with physical proof by the doctors through a medical examination.<sup>821</sup> In other words, virginity gained a scientific and objective reality. Ercüment Baktır mentioned Forensic Medicine Institute (Adli Tip Kurumu) as an expert intuition whose expertise was sought in many cases to solve virginity problems.<sup>822</sup> The emergence of medical knowledge in diagnosing hymen had changed virginity into a medicalized subject.<sup>823</sup>

<sup>818</sup> Emek Ergün, "Önsöz: Türkiye'de Bekaretin "El Değmemiş" Tarihi," in *Bekaretin El Değmemiş Tarihi*, written by Hanne Blank, trans. Emek Ergün (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2007), 15.

<sup>819</sup> S.H.Aurelle, "Bekaret Zarı," Seksoloji, 4 (1949), 44–45.

<sup>820</sup> S.H.Aurelle, "Bekaret Zarı," *Seksoloji*, 4 (1949), 44. "... bu zar, bekaretin tek alameti olduğu gibi, hiç yanıltmaz delili de değildir."

Blank, *Bekaretin El Değmemiş Tarihi*. Ergün, "Önsöz," 27-28. Fatima Mernissi, "Bekaret ve Ataerki," in *Müslüman Toplumlarda Kadın ve Cinsellik*, ed. Pınar İlkkaracan (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003).

<sup>822</sup> Ercüment Baktır, "Tıbbi Bahisler: Tıp ve Adalet," *Milliyet*, 02.02.1960. "..bekaret meselelerinin çözülmesinde de Adli tıbbın fikrine müracaat edilir..."

Ergün, "Önsöz," 27-28. Dilek Cindoğlu argues that determining virginity with doctor's report is the intersection point between the modern medicine and tradition. Cindoğlu, "Modern Türk Tıbbında Bekaret Testleri ve Suni Bekaret," 116.

Doctors became the determining agents of "what is not virginity" and, also, the actions that terminated virginity.<sup>824</sup> First of all, doctors tried to explain, in detail, the physical types of hymen and, provided, in some cases, illustrations such as "intact hymen," "closed hymen" and "half-closed hymen." With these texts, they were not only providing explanations with the purpose of providing information. They were also trying to "keep clean" the names of young women who may have different hymen. Kemal Cağlar discussed virginity and hymen with displaying three different cases. All the cases were about newly-wed couples who spent their first night together. In all cases, husband became suspicious about the virginity state of his wife. After a short tantrum with their wives, they ran to a doctor, Kemal Çağlar, to consult the situation. In all cases, Kemal Çağlar asked them to bring their wives to his clinic to examine hymens. He found out that all women's hymen were created differently (f.e.with wholes) and shared his findings with husbands along with medical explanations. Because husbands trusted to a doctor, Kemal Çağlar, and medical proof, they were assured that their wives have been virgins. All cases closed with happy ending thanks to Kemal Cağlar and medicine. 825 The doctor became an agent to examine, label, classify, and differentiate normalcy from abnormality, deviance, and unchastity.826 They gained authority over the female body through seeing and knowing an invisible part associated with sexuality and virtue.

Predominantly, sexual intercourse was stated as the main reason which ruptured hymen and terminated virginity. The women who had an *untouched* hymen were called girl (kiz), whereas women who had sexual intercourse were called woman (*kadın*) both in the public discourse. Hence, women were divided into two categories according to their sexual experience which was assumed to be determined by medical examination and through the levels of *rupture* of their hymen. Burhan Öncel shared a patient's story in the "Pregnant Girls" (*Hamile Kızla*). The patient, a girl from a good family with a good upbringing, came to the clinic of Öncel's colleague to understand whether she had a tumor in her abdominal area.

<sup>824</sup> Blank, Bekaretin El Değmemiş Tarihi, 53.

<sup>825</sup> Kemal Çağlar, "Kızlık Zarı ve Bekaret," Seksoloji, 33 (1951), 20-23.

Michel Foucault, Discipline and Punish, 169, 184.

This girl and her family got worried due to a growth in her abdominal area. After a careful medical examination, the doctor discovered that this girl from a good family was five months pregnant. Yet, neither the girl nor the family was aware of this situation. The girl protested the outcome of this medical examination and told to her family and the doctor that she was still virgin. Based on her family's insistence, the doctor conducted another examination and found out that her hymen was still intact. Immediately, this family offered the doctor to perform a cesarean section to solve this unpleasant and devastating situation, keep the girl's hymen and protect the girl from devastating consequences.<sup>827</sup> A similar case, which the reporter of the courthouse reported, appeared in the pages of Milliyet. Z.Ü. turned to the public prosecution office with sexual abuse accusations of a twenty-five years old Y.D. As a result of her medical examination by the doctor of justice, Z.Ü was found as six months pregnant and, yet, a virgin. In the end, Z.Ü confessed the truth and told that she was not sexually abused. Rather, she and Y.D. went with their relationship a bit excessive 6-months ago in a theatre box.828

Hymen, as a sign of virginity, went beyond a physiological element. Moreover, it became a socio-physical indicator that secured virginity and labeled women as respectable and virtuous. Since hymen became an indicator of the virtuous character of women, stories and efforts to repair hymen became visible in the newspapers and magazines to avoid any labeling that could be an obstacle and a prerequisite for marriage. The doctor, as an actor, did not only have the initiative and control to determine the intactness of the hymen. They also participated in the repair process. Milliyet reported a development of a continuing lawsuit. A doctor in İzmir sued the responsible bodies of a newspaper, the Demokrat İzmir (Democrat İzmir), due to a piece of news that had the headline "The value of virginity is 100 thousand lira" (*Bekaretin değeri 100 bin lira*). According to the newspapers' claims, this doctor was performing hymenorrhaphy operations

-

<sup>827</sup> Burhan Öncel, "Kızlarda Gebelik, Seksoloji," Seksoloji, 10 (1950), 26-29.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Hem hamile hem bakire," *Milliyet*, 24.06.1955.

Lama Abu-Obeh, "Arap toplumlarında namus cinayetleri ve toplumsal cinsiyetin inşası," in *Müslüman Toplumlarda Kadın ve Cinsellik*, ed. Pınar İlkkaracan (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003), 254-256.

for 100.000 Turkish lira. The doctor sued the newspaper for compensation of 15.000 lira. However, the lawsuit could not continue due to the absence of the plaintiff. The doctor left the country for the United States for three months and has not returned for longer than a year and a half. The court interrupted the proceeding with the decision to investigate how the doctor had left the country. Since the lawsuit was in the continuum, whether hymenorrhaphy had been performed was not a question. However, as emerged in local and national newspapers, the subject was a part of public and legal discussion regardless of the actualization of hymenorrhaphy.

In another case, hymenorrhaphy was offered openly to a young woman by a well-known doctor. The series of "Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı" (Sexology and Youth Life) added a "question and answer" column on its first page and last page. One of the questions was presented with the title "bir genç kızın başına gelen büyük felaket" (a big disaster that happened to a young girl). An eightteen years old young girl lost her virginity after she experienced a sexual relationship with her current boyfriend, who was not coming to terms with getting married. She asked to the journal whether she could get pregnant and how she could convince her boyfriend to get married. The answer was provided by Kemal Çağlar who was a urology expert and familiar writer on sexual manners. 831 Çağlar described the young girl's letter as an object lesson (ibret levhasi). He accused the young woman of being reckless and stated that she deserved what happened to her since she went to her boyfriend's house and accepted sexual interaction. He added that her boyfriend was stalling her and amusing himself by using her "young body." In the last paragraph, Cağlar provided information about when a woman can get pregnant. He explained that a woman has twenty-eight days cycles and can get pregnant between sixteen and twelve days before her cycle ends. In the end, he provided a phone number and stated, "if this man would not get married to you immediately, your girlhood (kızlığınız) could be repaired. Please, contact our expert doctor through 44 14 36 numbered

<sup>830</sup> 

<sup>&</sup>quot;İzmir'deki duruşma," *Milliyet*, 03.07.1959. "15 bin liralık tazminat davası açan doktorun 3 aylığına Amerika'ya gitmesine rağmen 1,5 senedir dönmediği açıklanmış ve doktorun ne şekilde yurt dışına çıktığının tetkikine karar verilerek duruşma talik edilmiştir."

Kemal Çağlar was also a regular writer for the Seksoloji journal between 1949 and 1954.

phone."<sup>832</sup> Different than the lawsuit case, Çağlar suggested a hymenorrhaphy operation to a reader openly in the pages of the journal and, even provided the number of the doctor.

The loss of hymen and virginity were described as devastating experiences for young women. Even in articles of Seksoloji, young women who lost their virginity were not untouched (el değmemiş) anymore. 833 Young women who developed excessive intimate relations with men and were open to sexual experience were considered as "hafif kızlar or kötü kızlar" (easy girls or bad girls). While answering to a lengthy letter, Seksoloji editorial team named the young girls who were open to experience sexuality out-of-marriage as "girls with weak moral values." Seksoloji accused these young girls as "having blind hearts toward moral and sacred values such as love and loyality."834 A woman who lost her virginity was narrated as "became dirty" (kirlenmek) or "stained" (lekelenmek).835 The narrative was based on the "clean versus dirty" dichotomy. Cleanness, being virtuous and honorable were connected in the same narrative and used to define the limits of the approvable female sexual behaviors. Rather, she turned into a dirty being. Cleanness did not only refer to individual properness. But, it was also associated with the economic, cultural and social background of the girl and her family. A clean girl was assumed to have a clean family, which was articulated frequently as "she was coming from a clean family" (temiz bir aileden geliyordu).836 The same formula applied to the family as well. A clean family was assumed to have a clean daughter that was often narrated as "her family was a good and honorable people" (ailesi iyi ve namuslu insanlardı.) Cleanness of the girl, which was bound with their family, referred to her well-breeding which helped her to be recognized as an *insider*. It was also connected with future generations.

832 Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 3: *Genç Kızların Cinsi Bilgisizlikleri* (İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959), cover page.

<sup>833</sup> Burhan Öncel, "Kızlarda Gebelik, Seksoloji," Seksoloji, 10 (1950),

<sup>&</sup>quot;İffet ve Bekaret," *Seksoloji*, 35 (1952), 45. "Bunların kalbi, sevgi ve sadakat gibi ahlaki ve manevi duygulara karşı tamamen kördür."

<sup>&</sup>quot;Şehremini cinayetinin duruşmasına başlandı," *Milliyet*, 18.10.1950. Reports from the court gave detailed information about the murder and its reason – virginity of bride.

<sup>836.</sup> Burhan Öncel, "Kızlarda Gebelik," Seksoloji, 10 (1950), 29.

According to Delaney, the woman was considered a vessel which would carry the offspring of man to the next generation. Therefore, purity was not solely related to women. Instead, it was associated with the purity of the lineage, which will come from her and her prospective husband. Hence, if young girls would have sexual intercourse and lose their virginity, they would not only destroy themselves. They would also harm society by staining the pureness of the lineage and, consequently, distorting the moral values. 838

Virginity as a complementary concept of honor formed one of the most powerful control and regulative mechanisms for women's sexuality. On the one hand, doctors, as the main actors, gained substantial authority over the female body through physical examinations and with the help of medicine as a scientific discipline. On the other hand, writers of the popular press worked for the inauguration of the social and moral values regarding virginity. They do not state the norms for the proper behaviors of young women. They have also assessed and classified acceptable limits for women as a part of the regulative process. However, at most, young women were held responsible for regulating their behaviors, protecting their virginity, their honor, and their family's honor. Safa criticized the forced measures and control mechanisms of despotic fathers (müstebit babalar), whose efforts were to no avail in protecting virginity and their honor. Safa argued that fathers could protect young women from sexual traps (cinsi tuzaklar) by imprisoning them in the house or forbidding them from going outside. He asked, "what is the worth of chastity that is protected by force?" (zorla korunan bir namusun değeri nedir?) For him, "moral is a choice between good and bad." Hence, young women should be prepared sufficiently for the

<sup>837</sup> Carol Delaney, *Tohum ve Toprak*, trans. Selda Somuncuoğlu and Aksu Bora (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2001).

Tahincioğlu, *Namusun Halleri*, 79-80. Afsaneh Najmabadi, "Sevgili ve Ana olarak Erotik Vatan: Sevmek, Sahiplenmek, Korumak," in *Vatan-Millet-Kadınlar*, ed. Ayşegül Altınay (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2004), 129-167. Najmadi discusses the relation between the pureness of woman and pureness of the nation. Hence, protecting the honor of woman was narrated as "protecting the nation." In the texts of the 1930s, the analogy between woman's honor and nation became more apparent while the relation was established between the woman's honor and society in the 1950s.

issues of the twentieth century, to the "new society and moral system which is called civilization" (*medeniyet dediğimiz bu yeni cemiyet ve ahlak düzeni*). According to Safa, young women should be educated to discipline themselves and choose appropriately to protect their honor and, as well as, their virginity.<sup>839</sup>

Peyami Safa's another article referred to his book "Sözde Kızlar." In his article, Safa categorized the young women who experienced sexuality before marriage.840 The first group was considered as daughters of good families or good women or good-will women who were naïve enough to believe or to reply to the sexual demands of their boyfriends due to their marriage expectations. The other group, however, was labeled as "hafif" girls (easy girls), who mixed being free with being "düşük ahlaklı" (low moral). These girls did not have an awareness of the personal and social importance of protecting virginity. In both categories, girls were presented as emotional beings lacking rational mind. Accordingly, young women were interpreted as mindless and irrational beings who could not protect their virginity or control their sexuality and pleasure. 841 If girls could be educated within a scientific (rational) framework by an expert (rational mind), they may learn to distinguish the proper behaviors from immoral ones regarding sexuality. Safa stated that "only powerful moral manners can prevent a furious sexual desire."842 By teaching sexual manners, girls could change their way of thinking from emotional to rational by understanding the necessities and reasons behind the honor codes. Moreover, they could perceive and internalize what was expected from them and act accordingly, not because they were forced to behave in a chaste way. Instead, they would choose to behave due to their love and loyalty to their fathers and family.<sup>843</sup>

Peyami Safa, "Müstebit Babalar," Seksoloji, 56 (1953), 1-2.

<sup>840</sup> Peyami Safa, ""Sözde Kızlar ve Çeşitleri," Seksoloji, 49 (1953), 1-3.

<sup>841</sup> Tahincioğlu, Namusun Halleri, 228.

Peyami Safa, "Müstebit Babalar," *Seksoloji*, 56 (1953), 1-2. "eğer kuvvetli bir ahlak terbiyesinin de faydası yoksa, azgın bir cinsi arzunun önüne hiç bir şey geçemez."

İpek İlkkaracan and Gülşah Seral, "Kadının İnsan Hakkı Olarak Cinsel Haz: Türkiye'deki Bir Taban Eğitimi Programından Deneyimler," in *Müslüman Toplumlarda Kadın ve Cinsellik*, ed. İpek İlkkaracan (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003), 198. Tahincioğlu, *Namusun Halleri*, 116.

Safa's argument sounded, at first glances, like a pro-autonomy argument which also supported his emphasis on freedom in his discourse. However, as Nevin Tahincioğlu stated, this strategy held the women responsible for protecting their honor through self-disciplining and self-censorship from their clothes to their behaviors. Has Safa mentioned followingly in his article, a young woman could be tested according to her behaviors in the public sphere when she was alone and where all the evil was around her. Hollowing the 1930s changing social and economic conditions, women continued to share public space with men in the 1950s. Hence, protecting their virginity and honor could not be achieved through force or violence. Safa's argument was rather a call to women for chaste and virtuous behaviors to gain their consent. As Dr. Schweisheimer stated, "honor and clean moral values" came from the inside of a person. Hence, consent and self-disciplining were presented as prerequisites and essential values for women to exist in the public sphere without a chaperon.

Virginity was not only associated with physical sexual intercourse. It was also associated with *pure* spirituality and a *clean* mind. Like physical virginity, spiritual virginity was narrated as an immeasurable value and a powerful attraction for men for centuries. Women were asked whether not to have any feelings towards a man before their husbands or to forget any memories of a previous relationship to reach their spiritual virginity. <sup>848</sup> Last but not least, mental virginity was seen as necessary as physical virginity. Kisch argued that some physical virgins have bad morals full of erotic imaginations. According to him, although these young girls managed to

For self-disciplining, see: Tahincioğlu, *Namusun Halleri*, 116. Tahincioğlu's study was conducted in Şanlıurfa and focused on the differences between rural and urban perception regarding sexuality and honor. She discusses the differences between the women who are living in the rural areas and the women who are coming from middle class and living in the cities. Such a differentiation and categorization did not exist in the sexuality related literatüre of the 1950s in Turkey.

Peyami Safa, "Müstebit Babalar," Seksoloji, 56 (1953), 1-2.

Dr. Schweisheimer, "Ruhi Bekaret," Seksoloji, 15 (1950), 37.

<sup>847</sup> Tahincioğlu, Namusun Halleri, 116.

Dr. Schweisheimer, "Ruhi Bekaret," *Seksoloji*, 15 (1950), 36-37. "Gerek ruhi bekaret, gerekse bedeni bekaret, asırlardan beri erkekler için ölçüsüz bir kıymet ve kuvvetli bir cazibe unsuru olmuştur."

keep their hymen intact, they could not raise healthy children since they lacked moral consciousness, genuine decency, and manners.<sup>849</sup>

Both the spiritual and mental virginity were situated in front of the anatomical virginity and physical control. 850 The importance, which was given to the spirit and mind in protecting virginity, implied women's consent and compliance to overcome their bodily impulses with rational educated choices and spiritual devotion to their families and husbands. On the one hand, women were asked to regulate themselves due to their love and affection towards their families and their (future) husbands. The new development regarding virginity lay in the shift, which gave equal importance to mind and spirit virginity with physical virginity. With this shift, the attempts to keep virginity under control moved from (physical) coercion to persuasion. S52 On the other hand, the discursive location of virginity in hymen, mind, and spirit turned virginity into a state of being and humanized as a female role.

The discussions regarding virginity were not limited to consensual relations. Rather, sexual abuses or offenses were become a part of public discussion due to their threat to social order. "Girl abduction" (*kız kaçırma*) and sexual assaults on girls and women (*kız ve kadınlara*) have found significant space on the second or third pages of the newspapers. Also, there were numerous articles about the increasing number of the sexual assaults in the big cities. In the newspapers, writers asked the government to punish these crimes immediately and strictly to protect "our women," "our

Enoch Heinrich Kisch, *Kadın: Seksüel Hayatı ve Evliliğe Sadakatsizliği* (Ankara: Berkalp Kitabevi, 1944), 96-97. "cismen bir bakire ama ahlaken tamamile bozulmuş...muhayyilesi erotik sahnelerle dolu", "ahlaki şuurdan, hakiki edep ve terbiye mefhumundan ve kadınlık faziletinden nasibini..."

Ayşe Parla, "The "Honor" of the State: Virginity Examinations in Turkey," *Feminist Studies* 27, 1 (2001), 83-84.

<sup>851</sup> Tahincioğlu, Namusun Halleri, 249.

For a detailed discussion about the dichotomies of coercion/persuasion and mind/body, and forms and methods of power, domination and resistance, see: Timothy Mitchell, "Everyday Metaphors of Power," *Theory and Society* 19, 5 (1990): 545-577. Parla, "The "Honor" of the State: Virginity Examinations in Turkey," 88.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Arnavutköyünde gece yarısı bir kadın kaçırma davası," *Milliyet*, 09.06.1950. Doç. Dr. Nurullah Kunter, "Hukuki Meseleler: Irza Geçme Suçları," *Cumhuriyet*, 01.06.1954.

Turkish family," and "our society." The legislation regarding the sexual assaults and sexual offenses was based on the 1926 Criminal Law, including indecent behavior in public, sexual intercourse in public, prostitution, "deflowering" under the promise of marriage, abduction, pornographic acts, and adultery. 855

All forms of assaults that aimed at single persons were grouped under the heading "Crimes against Individuals" in the Criminal Law. According to the Criminal Code, the attacks on the body were considered a breach of individual integrity. However, the above-mentioned sexual assaults, particularly sexual assaults against women, were assessed under the "Crimes against Public Decency and Family Order." In other words, the sexual attacks on the female body were considered a threat to public and familial order. The heading of the law was another sign that female bodies did not only belong to women. But rather, they belonged to the society (nation) and the family. Although the punishment for sexual assault in the Turkish Criminal Code did look dissuasive, it had several exceptions for abatement. The penalty for the perpetrator was differentiated according to the marital status of women in the abduction cases. If the abducted woman is married, the minimum sentence is seven years. If not, the penalty can be reduced to three years. The ruling could be reduced if the abducted person is a sex worker. As seen from the differences in the duration of the sentences, the status of women, which was defined based on their relationship with men, determined the severity of the punishment. While a sexual assault on a woman, who was considered to belong to a certain man, formed a longer sentence, a sexual assault on a "fallen" woman was not considered a threat to the public. Hence it was lessened to two to third of the sentence. 856

Pre-marriage sexual intercourse had a special article in the legislation. The woman's status regarding her sexual activity —as a virgin, non-virgin, or married—played a significant role in how a crime against woman would be

224

For the analysis of period's newspapers about sexual crimes, see: Sancar, *Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti*, 259-260.

Yalçın Tuna, "Irza Geçme," *Adalet Dergisi*, 5 (1955): 446-476. The articles focus on sexual assualt are the articles from 414 – 447 of the *Turk Ceza Kanunu* (Turkish Criminal Code).

<sup>856</sup> Yalçın Tuna, "Irza Geçme," *Adalet Dergisi*, 5 (1955), 468-469.

interpreted. 857 According to Article 423, "if someone deceives a girl who is older than fifteen years old with the promise of marriage and deflowers her, he will be sentenced a minimum of six months to a maximum one year."858 This article applies to all types of pre-marriage sexual relations between man and woman, and, as well as, to the abduction cases. In the article, "girl" (kız) and "girlhood" (kızlık) were used linguistically instead of virgin and virginity. The identification of girl and virgin in the article had an important symbolic meaning which could be followed from the next sentence of the article. According to Article 423, if the perpetuator displayed his intention to marry the woman he has "deflowered" or attempted to rape, he can escape the liability and avoid serving a sentence. In a lawsuit, which was heard in the Supreme Court in May 1950, the court reached a verdict about a man, Hasan Gürle, who has abducted a minor, Hatice Kübra Gürle, with the intention of marriage. Hatice Kübra Gürle was engaged with someone else when she was abducted. Although the details about the current status of the relationship between Hasan Gürle and Hatice Kübra Gürle were not written in the sentence, based on their shared surnames, it could be assumed that they have been married after the abduction. Also, the lawsuit was about the abduction part. The court decided the reversal the abduction-related sentence based on the "marriage intention" of the perpetrator and his following actions.<sup>859</sup> With the provision and related article of the Criminal Code, virginity and sexuality were kept within the limits of marriage. Additionally, the woman's honor and family honor were protected from illegitimate sexual actions. Last, but not least, the possible and potential outcome, being pregnant and having a child, was constrainted in a legitimate and legal family.

Parla, "The "Honor" of the State: Virginity Examinations in Turkey," 79.

<sup>858</sup> *Turk Ceza Kanunu* (Turkish Penal Code), Article 423: Whoever deceives him by deceiving him to take a girl who turns fifteen years old will be imprisoned for six months to a year. In the event of marriage, the penalty is silent. As long as there is a divorce case within five years without an acceptable reason, the law will precede the general lawsuit. https://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/MevzuatMetin/5.3.765.pdf (06.03.2022)

<sup>859 &</sup>quot;Yargıtay Beşinci Ceza Dairesi Esas 4837-5082 – Karar: 49/3537," *Adalet Dergisi* 41, 5 (1950), 709.

The two other forms of female sexuality, which were discussed under the out-of-marriage sexuality, were identified with the status of women in relation to marriage. The first discussion was about the women who were married and having affairs. The other form was women whose marriage was ended due to the death of their spouses or divorce. Yet, either pre-marriage (virginity), during the marriage (adultery), or after marriage, out-of-marriage sexuality was associated and assessed directly with reproduction. Illegitimate children became one of the concerns and, also, topics for the popular discussions and, as well as, for the governing practices which was reflected in the legislative documents.

#### Illegitimate Children

Besides the concerns regarding female honor, one of the threatful outcomes of out-of-marriage sexuality was considered as having illegitimate children. The boundaries of marriage were not only drawn to point to a proper space for sexuality. But, marriage was also structured as the fundamental institution for the reproductive activities of the individuals. Pregnancy and children, who could be born out of wedlock (marriage), were considered as the embodied version of threats and problems against the social order of the society. The writers have argued that sexuality needs to be experienced in an institution, marriage, to protect the purity and the order of society. Predominantly, numerous writers strictly advised young people to stay abstinent and not to fall into pre-marriage sexuality to avoid unintended pregnancies.<sup>860</sup> In the cases where women became pregnant out of sexuality, illegitimate children were seen both as the symbols and outcomes of immoral sexual behavior.861 Particularly for women, they became the "scarlet letter." While female sexuality lived in marriage was considered a natural and normal phenomenon, women who experienced sexuality out-of-wedlock were considered the doom of society since they brought downfall to the culture and honor of society. The women who had

Bekar İnsanın Cinsi Hayatı," Seksoloji, 9 (1949), 3.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Kaza yapan çiftler evlenmeli mi?," *Seksoloji*, 52 (1953), 8. "Gayri Meşru Çocuklar," *Seksoloji*, 1 (1949), 43.

out-of-marriage children were considered as scapegrace (*hayırsız*).<sup>862</sup> Moreover, they were accused or suspected of having multiple sexual partners, whether simultaneously or consecutively, which led to discussions and uncertainties about the identity of the fa ther.

The writers stressed that the uncertainty of the father's identity is a problem for the child, the woman, and society, not only because of moral reasons. But also father's presence and support were considered a necessity to ensure the psychological and economic wellbeing of the child.<sup>863</sup> Even if the identity of the father was known and recognized by the father, the writers assumed that these men would ignore their children and reject them. In that case, children will be rootless, since fathers are considered the true owner of the offspring and carriers of the bloodline. 864 The children were known as bastards throughout their lives, which will taint and hold them back. 865 Even in the legislation, the father was defined as the sole guardian of the children. 866 To determine fatherhood, a new method was mentioned in the publications. "Blood type" tests were introduced as a new scientific method for fatherhood problem. However, it was stated that blood type tests served to determine who could not be father of the child instead of finding out who the father is.<sup>867</sup> Seniha Tunakan explained the role of anthropology and anthropology institutes in determining paternity in an academic article. According to Tunakan, anthropologist do not only analyze blood type of the child. But, they also examine physically child and tried to determine the similarities and link between the child and father. 868

<sup>&</sup>quot;Gayri Meşru Çocuklar," Seksoloji, 1 (1949), 44. - wanton (hafifmeşrep) and immoral (ahlaksız).

<sup>&</sup>quot;Kaza yapan çiftler evlenmeli mi?" Seksoloji, 52 (1953), 9. "Gayri Meşru Çocuklar," Seksoloji, 1 (1949), 43.

<sup>864</sup> Muammer Aksoy, "Evlad Edinme," İstanbul Üniversitesi Hukuk Fakültesi Dergisi, 282-283

<sup>865 &</sup>quot;Gayri Meşru Çocuklar," Seksoloji, 1 (1949), 45.

The Civil Law, Article 263 - While the marriage is in existence, the parents exercise custody together. If they cannot agree, the father's opinion is valid.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Fen Aleminde: Kimyanın Polise Yardımı Etrafında," *Milliyet*, 26.10.1950. "...Kan tahlili çocuğun asıl babasını bulmaktan ziyade o çocuğun babası olamıyacakları katiyetle töhmetten kurtarılmaktadır..." Dr. Roger Michel, "Kan Grupları ile Çocuğun Babasını Tayin," *Seksoloji*, 18 (1950): 49-51.

<sup>868</sup> Dr. Seniha Tunakan, "Antropoloji ve Babalık Tayini," Antropoloji, 1 (1963): 1-4.

The illegitimate children were diagnosed as the source of inheritance problems. According to Muammer Aksoy, even if the mother claims and the father accepts the child as his own, inheritance will remain a problem to be solved after the death of the father.<sup>869</sup> Apart from the father's identity, another social problem caused by the illegitimate children is abortion and miscarriage. 870 Writers have mentioned that women who got pregnant outof-marriage are committing double sins. Out of her shame or out of protecting their families from sorrow, they could commit abortion, miscarriage, suicide, or even murder. Milliyet gave place on its front page to a story of a judicial case that covered almost every aspect of the story, from the out-of-marriage sexuality to the illegitimate child situation. The lawsuit was against a daughter and mother, Zihniye and Zehra Birol, who were on trial due to homicide. The newspaper went into details of the story and provided the background in order to display what kind of "stink and fester social wound" the society face. 871 Zihniye, a 22 years old young woman, married a man two years ago and divorced after a short while due to incompatibility. Afterward, she started a relationship with a barber, Cevat, who promised Zihniye to get married. Zihniye became pregnant by Cevat after a while. However, Cevat asked and insisted that Zihniye would have a miscarriage. Zihniye tried to have a miscarriage by using Gripin several times, which she failed to achieve. After seven months of pregnancy, she threatened Cevat by suing him if he would not get married to her. According to Zihniye, Cevat accepted to register the child under his name without marriage.<sup>872</sup> After she gave birth in the Workers' Insurance Hospital last Friday, she went to the Bahariye graveyard with her mother and left her child in a ditch. Zihniye added that she was forced to abandon her child

Muammer Aksoy, "Evlad Edinme," İstanbul Üniversitesi Hukuk Fakültesi Dergisi, 282-283.

<sup>870</sup> Illegitimate children and abortion will be discussed in detailed in the *Birth Control* chapter.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Bir ana 3 günlük çocuğunu öldürdü," Milliyet, 24.01.1955. ".... derinleştirecek olursak nasıl bir sosyal dava, ufunetli ve cerahatli bir içtimai yara ile karşı karşıya olduğumuzu kolayca anlarız.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Bir ana 3 günlük çocuğunu öldürdü," *Milliyet*, 24.01.1955. "...Ver dedi. Maksat çocuğuna baba olmak değil mi? Evlenmeden de onu kabul eder ve nüfusuma kaydettiririm. Daha başka ne yapabilirim?"

since her older brother had threatened to kill her if she brought a "bastard" home. R73 The piece ended with four questions that asking whether to blame the brother who threatened his mother and his sister for bringing a bastard to home; the mother and grandmother who left the child to death; the candidate fugitive husband who caused all the problems or the society that did not have any social institution which could welcome illegitimate children. Alaw academic, Aytekin Ataay, suggested adoption to deal with the illegitmate child problem. Although reproduction was promoted and celebrated during the 1950s in Turkey, the unwed (out-of-marriage) reproduction was differentiated from the wed (in-marriage) reproduction drastically due to the moral codes and laws. Therefore, sexuality out-of-marriage was considered a terrible act that can cause devastating implications for whole society, and more severely for the illegitimate children.

### Male Sexuality

In addition to the "illegitimate children" issue, another concern regarding out-of-marriage sexuality was associated with the spread of the STDs. Out-of-marriage sexuality was associated frequently with prostitution and, also with STDs. Sex trade and any *advanced* level of flirting were considered possible suspects of STDs. Male sexuality, which was experienced out-of-marriage, was considered as the source of prostitution and, the spread of the STDs. Although out-of-marriage male sexuality was overlooked by the writers, they kept repeating their concerns and warnings due to the STDs. A reader asked Seksoloji "what is the purpose of using

<sup>873 &</sup>quot;Bir ana 3 günlük çocuğunu öldürdü," *Milliyet*, 24.01.1955. "..Abim "eğer eve piç getirirsen seni delik deşik ederim." Dedi. Ya kendi hayatımdan, ya da çocuğumun hayatından vazgeçmeye mecbur kaldım."

<sup>&</sup>quot;Bir ana 3 günlük çocuğunu öldürdü," *Milliyet*, 24.01.1955. "...Anasını ve kardeşini eve piç getirmemesi için ölümle tehdit eden ağabey mi? Çocuğunu, torununu, gözünü kırpmadan ölümün kucağına atan anne ile anneanne mi? Bütün bunlara meydan veren koca namzedi, kaçak berber mi? Yoksa?... Yoksa evladını eve alamıyacak durumda olan gayrimeşru çocuk sahibi ana babaların yavrularını bağrına bassacak bir içtimai müessesesi bulunamayan cemiyet mi?"

Dr. Aytekin Ataay, "Medeni Hukukta Evlad Edinme," *İstanbul Hukuk Fakültesi Mecmuası* 21, 1-4 (1957), 275.

condom?" Reply of editorial team was "condom can be used for two purposes: a) Not taking a venereal diseas from woman, b) to prevent a woman from getting pregnant." Mazhar Osman underlined the dangers of STDs against the health of society and, as well future generations since STDs could be transferred hereditarily. Also, the editorial team of *Seksoloji* warned young men about the possibility of infertility due to STDs even after the proper treatment in *Sual ve Cevaplar* (Question and Answers). The spreading threat and possibility of STDs were assessed regarding the reproductive practices of the individuals.

The experts suggested out loud keeping sexuality in marriage which was assumed to accommodate monogamous sexual practices of the individual. Marriage was seen as a guarantee for a monogamic relationship that could prevent the spread of STDs and, consequently, ensure the health of future generations. Out-of-marriage sexuality for men, like women, was disapproved of and condemned by the era's writers. Dr. Bowen Partington invited men, like women, to practice total abstinence from sex before marriage. However, sexuality that was experienced pre-marriage or during marriage with another woman was considered as a potential and ordinary incident not only due its frequent occurrence in society. But also, writers argued that men were forced to seek alternative solutions to quiet their will due to their nature and instincts. 879

In the "İşte Evlendiniz," and "Mükemmel İzdivaçın Şartları," writers of the manuals argued that another reason for men to seek and experience out-of-marriage sexuality was related to their duty to their future wives. In "Aşk Sanatı," it was stated that the husband is the responsible figure for his wife's sexuality, starting from introducing her to sexuality to her sexual pleasure. Different than the previous decade, female sexual pleasure was considered as a part of nature and affirmed by the writers. 880 Women had been provided

230

<sup>876 &</sup>quot;Sual ve Cevaplar: Sual 101," Seksoloji, 15 (1950), 62.

<sup>877</sup> Mazhar Osman, "Tenasüli Hastalıklar Üzerine," Seksoloji, 1 (1949).

Dr. Bowen Partington, "Cinsi Münasebet sıhhat için zaruri midir?" *Seksoloji*, 20 (1950): 56-60.

<sup>879</sup> Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı: Fuhuş (İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959)

<sup>880</sup> Dr. Le Mon Clark, İşte Evlendiniz.

the right to experience sexual desire.<sup>881</sup> However, for the satisfaction of the woman's desire, she was not encouraged for an autonomous search. Rather, the woman was assumed to be sexually passive and asleep by nature.<sup>882</sup> Her husband would turn her *switch* on after the marriage. Once a woman's sexual desire has been "awakened" by her husband, her satisfaction and her sexual pleasure were left to the hands of men.<sup>883</sup> Hence, being sexually experienced was seen as a desired asset for man.

Therefore, the pre-marriage sexual actions of a man could be overlooked and understood since they would become future-husbands. Based on this assumption, the man was provided detailed explanations about sexuality. They were provided detailed information about how to lead their future wives to sexual pleasure. Husbands were equipped with proper information to satisfy their wives and to ensure female pleasure. Marriage manuals on sexual manners provided technical and descriptive information about female pleasure, the actions to take, the timing and durations of these actions, and the process to reach a mutually happy and satisfying end. Almost in a Taylorist order, steps of sexual intercourse were explained and described to potential grooms to reach the most efficient outcome. Frigidity, which was described as a female sexual problem, was discussed in relation to the sexual skills of man in the articles. Therefore, husbands and future husbands were provided the necessary information to make their future wives *happy*, and to save them from sexual abnormalities.

Male out-of-marriage sexuality was overlooked due to his biological needs and, as well as for the sake of future happy marriages. 886 However, men cannot experience sexuality with "good women." Public houses

Gordon and Shankweiler, "Different Equals Less: Female Sexuality in Recent Marriage Manuals," 465.

<sup>882</sup> Dr. Le Mon Clark, İşte Evlendiniz.

Gordon and Shankweiler, "Different Equals Less: Female Sexuality in Recent Marriage Manuals," 461.

<sup>884</sup> Gordon and Shankweiler, "Different Equals Less: Female Sexuality in Recent Marriage Manuals," 462. Thurman B. Rice, "Zifaf Gecesini Nasıl Geçirmeli," *Seksoloji Yıllığı*, 1 (1952), 54. "... gelinin işini kolaylaştırmak için güvey icabeden herşeyi yapmalıdır."

Thurman B. Rice, "Zifaf Gecesini Nasıl Geçirmeli," Seksoloji Yıllığı, 1 (1952), 52-59.

<sup>886</sup> T. Bowen Partington, "İhtiraslara Nasıl Hakim Olmalı?" Seksoloji, 5 (1949), 2.

(*umumi evler*) were suggested as a place to fulfill the needs of young single men.<sup>887</sup> Prostitution was narrated as an element and a natural outcome of manhood.<sup>888</sup> However, the solution for men to experience pre-marital sexuality became a heated subject in the public discussion in the early 1950s. The parliament accepted a law regarding women trafficking in May 1949.<sup>889</sup> As a result of this law, public figures started to discuss the positive and negative aspects of closing the public houses.<sup>890</sup>

Some writers argued that closing public houses would not solve the prostitution problem. Instead, it would cause loss of control over the women who were working in these settings. Hence, the spread of STDs may increase due to uncontrolled sex trade. The public houses were narrated as "public" spaces that were under state control, particularly regarding STDs.<sup>891</sup> Some writers argued about necessity of public houses (*umumi evler*) given that they were controlled with administrative, medical, and legal mechanisms.<sup>892</sup> In 1953, Ata Tokgöz conducted interviews with the director and head doctor of the Venereal Diseases Director of the Istanbul Municipality. As the interviewer stated, he wanted to inform the public about the precautions in fighting and preventing STDs in order to set the public mind at rest.<sup>893</sup> Kept in the dark and out of reach of the authorities,

<sup>887</sup> Sancar, Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti, 270.

<sup>888</sup> Cantek, Cumhuriyetin Büluğ Çağı, 242. Sancar, Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti, 237.

According to Saymen, the Turkish Government signed an international agreement about women and children in 12 November 1947 in Geneva as a member of the United Nations. The parliament accapted the agreement and turned to 5394 numbered law. Prof. Dr. Ferit H. Saymen, "Türkiye'de Fuhuşla Mücadele," *Seksoloji*, 21 (1950), 4.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Genelevlerin kent dışına taşınması tartışması," *Hürriyet*, 21.12.1954. "Suşa paşanın konuşması," *Milliyet*, 09.09.1950. The head of the East Mediterrean Health Organization, Suşa Paşa, was asked what he was thinking about the current debate regarding the brothels. He replied based on his experiences in Egypt and emphasized the decrease in the venereal diseases after the closing of the brothels in Egypt.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Zührevi hastalıkların artmasına mani olunmalıdır." *Milliyet*, 20.10. 1950. For a similar discussion, see: Sancar, *Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti*, 268, 271.

<sup>892</sup> Ord. Prof. M. Şekip Tunç, "Psikolog gözü ile: Fuhuş Meselesi," *Seksoloji*, 5 (1949), 14.

Ata Tokgöz, "İstanbul Zührevi Hastalıklarla Nasıl Mücadele Ediyor," *Seksoloji*, 48 (1953), 23-27. "Bizi kimse basamaz diyen 3 randevu evi basıldı." *Hürriyet*, 13.10.1955.

rendezvous houses became a more concerning issue for the writers. <sup>894</sup> Therefore, women in the rendezvous houses may escalate the spread of STDs. "Businessmen, who are coming from different parts of Anatolia, may infect their families, when they go back." <sup>895</sup> The discussion continued throughout the 1950s. <sup>896</sup> Turkish Women Union was not convinced with these justifications. They organized protests and campaigns to close brothels. <sup>897</sup> In the end, the Turkish governance decided to regulate public houses and prostitution with strict laws and practices. <sup>898</sup>

The limits of appropriate sexuality, which were situated in the marriage, were narrated in association with the well-being of the society. Like the question on "illegitimate children," STDs were pointed to as important problems which could harm not only individuals. However they have been considered as fundamental erosions for the order, future, health and well-being of the population. Hence, the efforts focused on the necessities to correspond to the well-being of society with the help of settling the fundamentals of sexual manners.

Sexuality and related discussions became emerging and visible subjects in the popular press and academic articles in the 1950s in Turkey. Sexuality came out of the private space and became a part of the public discussions. In parallel to the visibility of sexuality, sexual manners became a central

<sup>894</sup> Rendezvous Houses were spaces where prostitution performed without state control. Reşad Enis, "Şehirden Röportajlar: İstanbulda gizli fuhşun önüne niçin geçilemiyor," *Cumhuriyet*, 28.12.1953.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Zührevi hastalıkların artmasına mani olunmalıdır." Milliyet, 20.10.1950. Reşad Enis, "Şehirden Röportajlar: Emrazı Zühriviye hastanesinde neler gördüm ve neler dinledim?" Cumhuriyet, 30.12.1953.

<sup>896 &</sup>quot;Fuhuş Tarifesi İndirildi," *Hürriyet*, 22.04.1955. "Ankarada Olay Çıkan 19 Genelev Kapatılıyor, 30 kadın başka illere sürülüyor." *Milliyet*, 13.09.1959. During these discussions, the well-being of women who were labelled as prostitutes, were not problematized except their possibility and risk of infecting men. They were whether objectivized to be examined medically or became anonymous to refer as "bad women" (*kötü kadın*). Another study about the prostitution in Turkey during the 1950s will be illuminating in future.

<sup>&</sup>quot;TKB fuhuşla mücadele kararı aldı.," Hürriyet, 07.01.195. Ezgi Sarıtaş and Yelda Şahin, "Ellili Yıllarda Kadın Hareketi," in Türkiye'nin 1950'li Yılları, ed. Mete Kaan Kaynar (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2015).

<sup>898 &</sup>quot;Kadın ticaretini önlemek için tedbirler," *Vatan*, 03.04.1954.

concept to define the norms and limits of appropriate sexuality with the help of the newly emerging experts from different fields, starting from medicine to law. Sexuality was considered, on the one hand, a personal matter which affected the health of the individuals. On the other hand, it was underlined as an important subject for the well-being of society. Hence, sexual manners, which was the regulative concept for sexuality, found a place in every aspect of the individual life cycle. Moreover, appropriate sexuality was defined with reference to the sexual manners in Turkey in the 1950s.

Appropriate sexuality was restrained in the limits of heterosexual marriage for the well-being of society and for reproductive purposes in the era's contemporary academic and popular literature, as developed by the Turkish writers or translated from foreign languages. However, although this principle applied equally to man and woman by asking them to practice abstinence to protect their virginity due to personal, familial, and social reasons, the difference between male and female sexuality was accepted and even explained with rational reasoning by the writers of the era. While female sexuality and pleasure were limited within the strict lines of the marriage through various regulative explanations and mechanisms, male sexuality was overlooked due mainly, to his nature and social expectations. Defining the limits of the appropriate sexuality also served to define the roles of manhood and womanhood based on their sexual practices. Additionally, female sexuality and male sexuality were constructed in relation to each other.<sup>899</sup>

The discussions regarding sexuality significantly influence the structuring of reproductive policies on different levels. On the individual level, women and men had been informed about the lines they can cross and also about the medical, social, and legal consequences that they may face if they step out of their designated behaviors and choices. On the institutional level, the policy framework was structured according to the lines mentioned above with the support of the Civil Law and Criminal Law. Hence, it also gave an idea about the power struggle on the bodies of, particularly, women.

899

For the mutual construction of woman and man sexuality, see: Porter and Hall, The Facts of Life.

Marriage and family turned to regulative institutions which hosted the appropriate sexuality. The next chapter analyzes the marriage institution and the woman's role in marriage and family to discuss the effects of changes regarding sexuality.

## Construction of Marriage and Family

Marriage was considered the proper and legitimate institution where sexuality should be experienced. Thus, marriage as an institution was mentioned in countless arguments during the discussions about the sexual and reproductive practices of individuals. Surely, it was neither an unknown, undiscussed, nor a new institution in the 1950s. However, it was an institution affected by the political, social, and economic changes in Turkey and the world. Moreover, the changing understanding of sexuality and reproductive practices in the 1950s also influenced the construction of marriage. Some of the era's writers were well aware of the changes in the marriage institution. They even discussed the effects of these changes on the marriage institution and the family.1 Nihat Sami Banarlı argued that the

For a critical reading, see: Betty Friedan, The Feminine Mystique (New York: Norton, 1 1963). For an early discussion about family in Turkey, see: Hilmi Ziya Ülken, "Aile," in Aile Yazıları 1: Temel Kavramlar, Yapı ve Tarihi Süreç, ed. Beylü Dikeçligil and Ahmet Çiğdem, (Ankara: T.C: Başbakanlık Aile Araştırma Kurumu Başkanlığı Yayınları, 1991), 268-278. The article was written in 1943.

Turkish family was going through a change and crisis (*buhran*) in 1953.<sup>2</sup> The change in the marriage institution and, accordingly, in the family affected the relationship between the spouses, including their sexualities and the roles of the spouses, along with the construction of a new womanhood as wives and mothers. Therefore, marriage (and family) turned into a regulatory framework that produced and reinforced accepted and appropriate behaviors and roles of spouses.<sup>3</sup> This chapter focuses on the discourses and practices that re-defined the marriage institution and, in relation to it, the understanding of the family in the 1950s. This chapter examines the development of the legal and social framework for marriage and family, from its formation to its dissolution.

Marriage as an "institution" was highly praised in the publications of the 1950s. Popular writings in newspapers and magazines presented marriage as a "union" whose sanctity is paramount. One of the most recurring themes in the era's popular newspapers and magazines was marriage life and the virtues of marriage. Hayat, one of the most popular magazines, was not excluded from this trend. The magazine started to be published on April 6, 1956, with a high circulation rate. The first issue sold 170,000 copies within days. As the numbers have also demostrated, the magazine was widely in circulation and consumed, particularly by the women of the era. Therefore, the portrayal of marriage in Hayat has a significant influence on forming the image of the "desirable" marriage. Hayat provided the readers with the definition of an ideal marriage and spouses, including the duties of the spouses, the way marital relationships should be formed, and how parenthood should be handled. Also, its content included a variety of

Nihat Sami Banarlı, "Kadın Anlayışımız ve Örnek Aile," *Seksoloji Yıllığı*, 2 (İstanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1953), 2.

For a detailed discussion on the regulatory power of family, see: Chloe Taylor, "Foucault and Familial Power," *Hypatia* 27, 1 (2012): 201-218.

<sup>4</sup> Koçer, "Demokrat Parti Döneminde Kadın." Okur, "Conspicuous Consumption in Turkey." For the United States, see: Elaine Tyler May, *Homeward Bound*.

Nihat Sami Banarlı, "Kadın Anlayışımız ve Örnek Aile," *Seksoloji Yıllığı*, 2 (İstanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1953), 2-7.

Okur, "Conspicuous Consumption in Turkey,"10-12. As Okur quated from Şevket Rado, the editor of the magazine, the normal circulation rate of the magazine was near 500,000.

<sup>7</sup> Okur, "Conspicuous Consumption in Turkey," 3.

subjects, such as fashion, home decoration, health, history, fiction, movies, and movie stars, as well as celebrity gossip and travel memoirs. In other words, *Hayat*'s discourse was not limited to the topic of marriage and family. It also provided perspective and suggestions regarding the lifestyle of individuals. In order to form its discourse, *Hayat* has benefited from numerous types of documents, such as articles, news from the country and the world, surveys, questionnaires, and tests about marriage-related topics, stories about good marriages, celebrity comments on the issues of marriage, photos and illustrations.

In the published materials, marriage was presented as the fundamental, core, and prior unit of society since the authors equated marriage with being the first step of "building a family" or "family" both in popular publications, academic studies, and legislative documents. Marriage in the Civil Code was described as the legal institution that granted permission to the partners to mate. Article 151 of the Turkish Civil Code, enacted in 1926, defined the essence of marriage as a unit in which a husband and wife become responsible towards each other to continue the marriage and to raise and educate children. The link between marriage and family builds on the assumption that spouses in a marriage union will have children eventually. In order to complete the marriage union, spouses are asked to have children. In *Hayat* magazine, parenthood was represented as an essential part of being a couple and building a family. In other words, being a family is equated

8 Okur, "Conspicuous Consumption in Turkey," 12.

Marriage and family did not only regulate sexuality and the role of the spouses. They also regulate the daily practices of the individuals including their consumption habits. See for a detailed discussion: Sancar, *Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti*, 233.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Gayri Meşru Çocuklar," Seksoloji 1, 1 (1949), 43. "İzdivaç, çocuk sahibi olmak isteyen çiftler için şarttır."

The Civil Law, Article 151: Marriage union comes into being with the execution of the marriage ceremony. Husband and wife are obligated to ensure the happiness of this union against each other and take care of the food and education of the children together. Husband and wife are obliged to each other with loyalty and cooperation. Yaprak Zihnioğlu, *Kadınsız Inklap* (İstanbul: Metis Yayınları, 2003), 182.

with having children in the magazines,<sup>12</sup> as well as in the legislative documents, as in Article 151 of the Civil Code. In various magazines, articles regarding the education, care, and well-being of children addressed parents in order to provide "valuable" information to fulfill their roles as fathers and mothers efficiently.<sup>13</sup> At least good and desirable marriages are considered as blessed with children. The ones who do not have children were discussed in an article on infertility. Nihat Baydur defined a childless family as a "fruitless tree." Although the writer does not define childless coupless as "non-familial," he underlined the risk of unhappiness and unfulfillment in childless marriages. <sup>14</sup>

In an academic article on child adoption, Aytekin M. Ataay classified the reasons for adoption and named one of them as sentimental. According to him, individuals and families have the need (*ihtiyaç*) and the thirst (*iştiyak*) to feel love for a child. "Adoption emerges as a hope for those who could not fulfill their needs in natural ways." Although marriage is technically not a prerequisite for having children or building a family, it was defined as the only legitimate host. Having children out-of-marriage bond was seen as an immoral act that could not be blessed with a sacred entity-family (familial). 16

Another magazine was also published with the name *Aile* (Family). *Aile* was the quarterly periodical of Yapı Kredi Bank (Structure and Credit Bank), which was published between 1947 and 1952.<sup>17</sup> Yapı Kredi Bank published another magazine before *Aile*. Aile followed the magazine of

Okur, "Conspicuous Consumption in Turkey," 36. In Hayat and Aile magazines had articles about child care almost in every issue, as if the magazines confirm that family could be complete with children.

Louis E. Bisch, "Kadınlık Güç bir Sanattır," *Seksoloji Yıllığı*, 2 (1953), 94-101.

Nihat Baydur, "Kısırlığın Sebepleri," Seksoloji, 21 (1950), 28.

<sup>15</sup> Aytekin M. Ataay, "Medenî Hukukda Evlâd Edinme," *İstanbul Hukuk Fakültesi Mecmuası* 21, 1-4 (1957), 286-287.

<sup>16 &</sup>quot;Gayri Meşru Çocuklar," *Seksoloji*, 1 (1949): 41-46.

The periodical was sold for 50 kuruş between 1947 and 48, and later its price went up to 100 kuruş. According to Arzuk, "there were advertisements and information about the services of the bank embedded within the short stories and articles, sometimes at the cost of damaging their flow." Deniz Arzuk, "Vanishing Memoirs: Doğan Kardeş Children's Periodical between 1945 and 1993" (MA Thesis, Boğaziçi University, 2007), 79.

Doğan Kardes, which was first published by the bank in 1945 and was aimed at the children of middle-class urban families. 18 Doğan Kardeş, similar to the following magazine - Aile -, was published as a cultural service of the *Yapı ve Kredi Bank* under the consultancy (of culture and arts) and editorship of Vedat Nedim Tör. 19 In Doğan Kardeş, children were presented as dutiful and responsible sons and daughters for their families as well as their country, with a touch of nationalist values. In other words, children were situated in a good family context. Following its success, Aile was published by the same partnership. Aile was an American magazine, Reader's Digest, and contained articles on a great variety of subjects, from literature to popular subjects like sports, movies, theatre, animals, and nature, to more domestic ones like health, child-care, education, cooking, fashion, housewifery, relationships, handicrafts, and inventions.<sup>20</sup> Similar to other magazines of the period, Aile also translated from different foreign magazines such as Women's Digest, Atlantic Monthly, Harper's Magazine, Magazine Digest, Better Homes and Collier.<sup>21</sup>

Aile was the predecessor of *Hayat* magazine, which was inspired by another American magazine, Life. "After Aile was closed down in 1952, Neşriyat Inc., of which Yapı Kredi Bank was the biggest shareholder, began to publish *Resimli Hayat* (Illustrated Life) family magazine, which later turned into *Hayat* (Life) in 1956."<sup>22</sup> Aile was one of the first publications

Özge Ertem, "The Republic's Children and Their Burdens in 1930s and 1940s Turkey" (MA Thesis, Boğaziçi University, 2005), 166. Okur quoted from Şevket Rado's article "Türk Matbaacılığında ve Mecmuacılığında Yenilikler." Okur, "Conspicuous Consumption in Turkey," 13.

<sup>19</sup> Arzuk, "Vanishing Memoirs," 10-11.

Arzuk, "Vanishing Memoirs," 16-17. Ertem, "The Republic's Children and Their Burdens," 166.

Aile has also translated texts from Britannia Eve, Changing Times, Christian Herald, Companion, Coronet, Die Lupe, Everybody's, Good Housekeeping, Healthy, Holiday, Hygeia, L'Illustre, La Femme, Ladies' Home Journal, Les Nouvelles Litteraires, Life Can Be Beautiful, Look Magazine, McCalls, Modern Motoring, New York Start, Pageant, Parent's Magazine, Recreation, Redbook, Science Digest, Selection, Success To-day, The American Mercury, The Star, This Week, Today's Woman, Week, Woman's Home Companion, Your Dreams, Your Life.

<sup>22</sup> Arzuk, "Vanishing Memoirs," 17.

which presented the ideal form of a family with photographs and illustrations in its pages. As the successor, Hayat has continued to contain the perfect picture of family. In the perfect picture, the family was presented as a unit consisting of a mother/wife, a father/man, and two children, preferably one son and one daughter.<sup>23</sup> The editorial piece of the first volume claimed that Aile aimed to provide its readers with the secrets of the "art of living" (*yaşama sanatı*) starting with how to leisure. Moreover, it aimed to be beneficial to its readers by enhancing their pleasure in life.<sup>24</sup> This idealized portrayal of family was used and normalized in a variety of publications, including the newspapers *Milliyet* and *Hürriyet*, as well as the magazines *Aile*, *Kadın Gazetesi*, and *Seksoloji*.<sup>25</sup>

During the 1950s, the publications continued to include more subjects about marriage and family in their pages. In 1953, even *Seksoloji* announced that they would become more of a family magazine gradually since they had fulfilled the first curiosity with their content focusing on the technical side of sexual life in their first issues and quarterly supplements (marriage manuals).<sup>26</sup> One of the remarkable changes in the magazine after the announcement of its change was the involvement of the new columns with their titles containing family, such as "Health in Family."<sup>27</sup> Marriage and family became two intermingled subjects that covered a range of topics, starting from ways to find a suitable spouse, the definition of a good marriage, being a good wife or husband, to ways of taking care of and raising children in the articles, interviews, and advice columns. During the process, the woman became an actor who was situated in the family in both the visual materials and the narratives.

<sup>23 &</sup>quot;Biz bir Aile oluyoruz: Bir Genç Anne Anlatıyor," *Aile* 1, 1 (1947), 19. "Fakat ancak ikinci çocuğumuzun dünyaya gelmesiyle "bir aile olmayı" öğrenmiye başladık."

<sup>24 &</sup>quot;Aileyi Kurarken," Aile 1, 1 (1947), 1.

Okur, "Conspicuous Consumption in Turkey," 44.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Aile Mecmuası," *Seksoloji*, 48 (1953), front page. "İlk sayılarında ve ciltlerinde hemen tamamiyle cinsi hayatın teknik tarafiyle meşgul olan mecmuamız, üç ayda bir çıkan ek yayınlarının da yardımiyle bu sahadaki ilk tecessüsleri [merakı] tatmin ettikten sonra, şimdi yavaş yavaş tam bir aile mecmuası olma yoluna girecektir."

<sup>27 &</sup>quot;Ailede sağlık," *Seksoloji*, no. 39 (1952).

The representation of the family as a four-member unit was, relatively, a change regarding the family ideal in Turkey. Although the image of small families began to appear in publications in the 1930s<sup>28</sup> (and in legislation with the Civil Code), the desire for large families remained loud and preferable in the narratives. In the 1930s, the extended family with grandmothers and grandfathers was portrayed as a symbol and carrier of traditional Turkish values in literature and everyday discourse in the 1930s.<sup>29</sup> Extended families implied a connection to the past, tradition, and culture of Turkishness since they bring together the memory (the grandparents) and the future (the grandchildren) together in the same space (household). The extended family and konak life was associated with the values of Turkish society. 30 Early republican literature had already started to raise the discussion about the conflicted change of the expected family size - from extended to nuclear family -and proper living arrangements- from big mansions (konak) to apartments or separate houses (müstakil ev) starting with the late 1920s.<sup>31</sup> Starting from the early republican literature, apartment life was a symbol of newness, westernization and modernity, with both positive and negative connotations. In the 1930s, some authors brought the potential dangers of apartment life against the values of Turkish society.<sup>32</sup> The loss of ties with the extended family was represented as losing one's roots to its history, traditions, and essence. Writers have warned the public about the degeneration of culture, especially among young people, as a result of loss or disconnection with their roots.<sup>33</sup> Banarlı, as a supportive argument, stated that the Turkish family was staggering and losing its connection with its culture and history in the last 150 years. He made references to certain names and titles from Turkish literature from the

28 Yurttagüler, "Social Policies on Female Body in the 1930s in Turkey," 88-89.

<sup>29</sup> Sancar, Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti, 135-137.

The relation between marriage (and family) and house is quite interesting. The word *Marriage* (*evlilik*) in Turkish was derived from the word, *house* (*ev*).

Alan Duben and Cem Behar, *İstanbul Haneleri, Evlilik, Aile ve Doğurganlık 1880-1940*, 2. edition (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 1998), 83.

For Konak and Apartment dichotomies, see: Yakup Kadri Karaosmanoğlu, *Kiralık Konak*, and Peyami Safa, *Fatih Harbiye* 

<sup>33</sup> Yakup Kadri Karaosmanoğlu, *Kiralık Konak*. Behar and Duben, *İstanbul Haneleri*.

middle of the nineteenth century and early twentieth century, such as Namik Kemal with *Intibah* (Renaissance), Sami Paşazade Sezai with *Sergüzeşt* (Escapade), Recaizade Ekrem with *Araba Sevdası* (Love for Car), Reşat Nuri Güntekin with *Yaprak Dökümü* (Shedding Leaves) for moral crisis and with *Eski Hastalık* (Old Illness) for economic crisis, all narrating the crisis of the Turkish family in their books due to the severity of the problem.<sup>34</sup> As a concluding remark, he suggested that the ideal norms for the Turkish family should be determined by the experts.<sup>35</sup> Followingly, according to Banarlı, society should be educated according to these consensual ideals and "aile terbiyesi" (family manners), which were connected to Turkish history and culture, starting from school in order to have happy families.<sup>36</sup> Family, like sexuality, was viewed as a subject best left to experts to regulate and reestablish in accordance with the needs of Turkish society, culture, and history.

In the 1950s, concerns regarding nuclear families and, accordingly, apartments (or separate houses) started to decrease distinguishably. Moreover, apartments and separate houses became symbols of the proper places to host modern nuclear families.<sup>37</sup> Parr's concept of "home dreams" referred to the nuclear family that was idealized as the norm, with a modern designed house, two children, and a perfectly happy married couple.<sup>38</sup> The real estate advertisements in *Aile* magazine used the association between marriage-family and home in their presentation.<sup>39</sup> With the illustrations,

Nihat Sami Banarlı, "Kadın Anlayısımız ve Örnek Aile," Seksoloji Yıllığı, 2 (1953), 3-4.

Nihat Sami Banarlı, "Kadın Anlayışımız ve Örnek Aile," *Seksoloji Yıllığı*, 2 (1953), 6 "... hukukçuların, cemiyeti bir laboratuar alimi bakışıyla inceleyip, onu doğru veya yanlış terkip eden bütün unsurları meydana koyacak hakiki içtimayat alimlerinin ve kanun yapıcılarımızın, üzerinde ısrarla durmaları gereken büyük problem budur..."

Nihat Sami Banarlı, "Kadın Anlayışımız ve Örnek Aile," Seksoloji Yıllığı, 2 (1953), 6-7.

<sup>37</sup> Vala Nureddin, "İnsan, ev sahibi olunca," *Aile* 1, 1 (1947), 15-17.

Joy Parr, "Introduction," in *A Diversity of Women: Ontario*, 1945-1980, ed. Joy Parr (Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press, 1995), 4.

<sup>39 &</sup>quot;Advertisement," *Aile*, 1 (1947), 3. "evlenmek, dünyanın hiç bir dilinde, izdivaç mefhumunu yuva kurmakla bir tutan evlenmek kelimesi yoktur. Türkler, yeni bir ailenin doğması için muhakkak yeni bir yuvanın da kurulması gerektiğini "evlenmek" kelimesi ile ne güzel ifade etmesini bilmişler. Bir ev sahibi olmak, her Türk'ün yüreğinde yatan bir arslandır."

couples were asked to buy a house to complete their families, where the family was presented in its nuclear form. As a result of the efforts to promote the nuclear family, its visibility has expanded and it has replaced other types of family in the 1950s.

## 3.1. Family as the core unit

The presentation of the nuclear family in a house formed the ground for two related discourses. First, the family, like the *house*, was associated with the private sphere, privacy (mahremiyet), and intimate relations. 40 Second, the family was considered as a single unit, like the house, with a separate space for each element. In Aile magazine, the advertisement of Yapı Kredi Bank (Structure and Credit Bank) promoted the motto: "A house for every single family."41 Accordingly, the family was regarded as the primary and smallest unit of society (rather than the individual) in popular discourse, articles, and policy documents. In an article, Ziyaedin Fahri Fındıkoğlu defined the family as the smallest and fundamental unit of society. Fındıkoğlu discussed the transformation of the family in parallel to the states' developments. He defined the family as the founding element of a society.<sup>42</sup> The nuclear family was presented as an independent and selfsufficient entity that was solely liable to the state in legal matters. 43 This narrative has strong similarities with the individualistic narrative of American discourse regarding the family that promotes the soleness, independence, and self-determination of each family. 44 In other words, each family was assessed as an individual unit. Its independence and freedom

<sup>40</sup> Sancar, *Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti*, 196. Davidoff, "Aile Paradoksu: Tarihçilere Bir Çağrı," 52.

<sup>41</sup> Aile: individual house for per family

<sup>42</sup> Ziyaedin Fahri Fındıkoğlu, "Türk Aile Sosyolojisi," İstanbul University Hukuk Fakultesi Mecmuası 11, 3-4 (1945), 264.

<sup>43</sup> Mustafa Şekip Tunç, "Eski Aileden Yeni Aileye," *Aile* 1, 1 (1947), 14. Okur, "Conspicuous Consumption in Turkey," 45-46.

May, *Homeward Bound*, 1-18. This narrative was not only produced by the popular publishings of the American press and translated to Turkish. The academic discourse also has the tendency to define family as independent, self-sufficient and self-determined unit. See, "Marriage and Living" Journal of the 1950s.

were seen as the building blocks of a functioning democracy, which was promoted as a precondition along with the "free world" (*hür dünya*) discourse.<sup>45</sup>

In addition to defining the family as the central and smallest unit of society, the family was also pointed to as the core unit, the fundamental nucleus, and the essence of society. 46 Particularly, the procreation function, which was situated in the marriage and family institutions as if *naturally*, was seen as proof of being the "core unit" since the continuum of society depended on the reproduction of the individuals. The family was the main host for the reproduction and care of the new generations. In Büyük Doğu, one of the conservative-leaning journals, the family was pointed out as the main host in which the new generations, from a baby to a grown girl, complete their education regarding the manners and customs in the family.<sup>47</sup> Moreover, the sole role and responsibility of the family were justified by the analogies derived from nature. 48 These analogies strengthened the link between family and nature. On the one hand, as in nature, the reproductive function of the individuals was located in the family.<sup>49</sup> On the other hand, the family had turned into a form that exists both in human society and nature. This discursive construction portrayed the family as ahistorical and unchanging in time and space.<sup>50</sup> This ahistorical position of the family due to its reference to nature was strengthened by scientific knowledge.

<sup>45</sup> May, *Homeward Bound*, 152. Okur, "Conspicuous Consumption in Turkey."

For the discussions in Turkey during 1950s, see, Sancar, *Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti*. For a general conceptualization, see, Horn, *Social Bodies: Science, Reproduction, and Italian Modernity*, 73.

<sup>47 &</sup>quot;Yeni nesiller, kundaktaki çocuktan gelinlik kıza kadar, terbiye ve örf-ü-adet müktesebatını burada tamamlar." Reşat Feyzi Yüzüncü, "Aile Müessesi," *Büyük Doğu*, 02.04.1948, 3.

Ord. Prof. Dr. Şekip Tunç, "Cinsi olgunluğun evlilikteki kıymeti," *Seksoloji*, 11 (1950), 1. "Aile nedir? Tabii bir oluş mu yoksa hukuki bir müesse midir? Hiçbir hukuk tabii, hayati bir hadise yaratamaz, olsa olsa bu hadiseye içtimai bir şekil verir." "Gayri Meşru Çocuklar," *Seksoloji*, 1 (1949), 44-46.

<sup>49 &</sup>quot;Gayri Meşru Çocuklar," Seksoloji, 1 (1949), 41.

Michele Adams, "Women's Rights and Wedding Bells: 19th Century Pro-family Rhetoric and (Re)Enforcement of the Gender Status Quo," *Journal of Family Issues*, 28 (2007), 501–528. Horn, *Social Bodies: Science, Reproduction, and Italian Modernity*, 73. Davidoff, "Aile Paradoksu: Tarihçilere Bir Çağrı," 50.

Due to the caregiving role of the family, the institution was located at the center of the value system of society. Since the family was assigned the role of taking care of the children, it was also held responsible for future generations' education. Taking care of children did not merely cover the physical well-being of the children. However, in the numerous articles, parents, particularly mothers, were held responsible for the proper education, discipline, and manners (talim-terbiye) of their children.<sup>51</sup> The transference of national values to the next generation was seen as one of the most important subjects as a part of the children's education, which was left to the privacy of the family. Family, as the smallest and the central forming unit of the society, was situated in the center of the Turkish society's value system, hosting the essence of the nation. The family was pointed to as the source, producer, and protector of the nation's values with its association with privacy and the private sphere.<sup>52</sup> Davran stated that familial relations were dominated by culture and traditions rather than legislation.<sup>53</sup> While the family was considered as the host and protector of the national cultural values, it was also portrayed as the tool to carry society into modern practices.<sup>54</sup>

As the core of society, the family was pointed to as the "starting point" of all societal changes. Sancar stated that the modernization attempts were supported by the new ideal of the modern family in the 1950s in Turkey.<sup>55</sup> Halide Edip Adıvar stated that the necessities of civilized (modern) society should be practiced in the family. Moreover, Adıvar stated that modernization of the country would start within the family and with the children.<sup>56</sup> In the publications of the era, the nuclear family was presented as an image of being modern with its form, appearance, behaviors,

Perihan Parla, "İçtimai Bahisler: Cemiyette, ailede kadının rolü," *Zafer*, 28.01.1950.

<sup>52</sup> Prof. Dr. İhsan Sükrü Aksel, "Ailenin Sağlığı: Evde sinir muvazenesi," Aile 1, 2 (1947), 31.

Bülent Davran, "Münevver Türk genci, hayat arkadaşını seçerken nasıl zorluklarla karşılaşıyor?" *Seksoloji*, 25 (1951), 1.

<sup>54</sup> Sancar, Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti, 191

<sup>55</sup> Sancar, Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti, 191.

Halide Edip Adıvar, "Sohbet: Kıymetli muharrir bu konuşmasında bilhassa genç kızlarımıza hitap ediyor," *Aile* 2, 6 (1948), 4-5.

consumption habits, and attributed values. Thus, the nuclear family was presented with a middle-class and urban image.

The discussion on modernization often associated with being democratic during the 1950s. Hence, the family was also pointed out as the first and fundamental place to produce and practice democratic values.<sup>57</sup> The family was expected to contribute to the enrichment and development of democratic values in society as the fundamental unit for values.<sup>58</sup> Füsun Üstel argued that family was presented as the right place to teach "democracy manners" to the children. The discussion about "democracy in the family" was also related to the re-regulation of family life. As a matter of fact, in a school textbook, "Democratic Life in the Family," family and democracy were presented and discussed together.<sup>59</sup> However, this presentation also produced the idea that age and gender hierarchy are ingrained in democratic societies like families. In other words, the association between family and society in terms of democracy justified a comparable division of labor, which legitimized the age- and gender-based division of labor in society.<sup>60</sup>

The overlapping references to the family created invisible tensions regarding the role of the family. On the one hand, the family was defined as a historical institution with its preserving role of the values. On the other hand, it was expected to set and practice the modern practices of the day.<sup>61</sup> Kandiyoti claimed that the urban middle class swayed between modern and

The democratization of family was not emerged first time during the 1950s. According to Behar and Duben, Ziya Gökalp has built a similar analogy between the democracy of the state and democracy of the family in 1917. He also shared his concern regarding the transformation of the Turkish family considering moral values. Ziya Gökalp, "Aile Ahlakı," *Yeni Mecmua*, 10, 13.09.1917, 181. Quoted from Duben and Behar, *İstanbul Haneleri*, 210. Another article with a title "democracy in the family" discussed the relation between spouses which was published in Sevimli Ay, in 1926. "Ailede Demokrasi," *Sevimli Ay*, 3, May 1926. Quoted from Duben and Behar, *İstanbul Haneleri*, 235-236.)

Okur, "Conspicuous Consumption in Turkey," 46.

<sup>59</sup> Üstel, Makbul Vatandaş'ın Peşinde, 269-270.

<sup>60</sup> Sancar, Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti, 257. Üstel, Makbul Vatandaş'ın Peşinde, 269-270.

<sup>61</sup> Sancar, Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti, 212-216.

traditional values.<sup>62</sup> This sway has also influenced the construction of gender roles, the selected values and adopted practices. Therefore, she underlined the urgency of regulating urban middle-class families during the 1950s. The potential threats and possible erosions of modernity towards the Turkish culture and Turkish family were repeated in a different medium with varying severity. In the 1950s, family was seen as a protective shield against these threats.<sup>63</sup> Yet, again, one of the biggest concerns regarding modernity was related to the dissolution of the family. Because the family was regarded as the source of culture and nation, its dissolution has been regarded as a threat to the survival of Turkish society.

In addition to the dangers of modernity, in the 1950s especially, communism was seen as the new and emerging threat to the values of Turkish society and the family.<sup>64</sup> Communism was considered a reason for moral decline in a society.<sup>65</sup> Hence, it was narrated as a threat against moral and national values. Since the family was designated as the core of the nation, the main target of communism became the Turkish family in order to destroy this sacred institution and spoil its inner values.<sup>66</sup> Therefore, strengthening the family and its values were seen as the antidote to the potential and possible dangers of Russia (and also communism).<sup>67</sup>

In addition to the benefits to society, building a family was defined as the ultimate goal for individuals. Being married was the default

Deniz Kandiyoti, "Erkeklik Paradoksları: Ayrımcılığın Yaşandığı Toplumlar Üzerine Bazı Düşünceler," in *Cariyeler, Bacılar, Yurttaşlar* (İstanbul: Metis, 1997), 193.

<sup>63</sup> Meltem Ahıska, *Radyonun Sihirli Kapısı: Garbiyatçılık ve Politik Öznellik* (İstanbul: Metis Yayınları, 2005), 257-300.

For a discussion about communism and family, see, Özkan Kerestecioğlu and Öztan ed., *Türk Sağı: Mitler, Fetişler, Düşman İmgeleri*.

May, *Homeward Bound*, 94-102. Similar analogies were also built in USA regarding the effects of communism on family life and moral values.

Yıldırmaz, "Nefretin ve Korkunun Rengi: "Kızıl," 63. Quoted from, Richard D. Robinson; "38-communism in the villages," *Letters from Turkey*, September 25, 1949 (Istanbul: Robert college, reprinted for the Peace Corp by Permission of the Insitute for Current World Affairs, 1949)

May, Homeward Bound, 91. Özkan Kerestecioğlu and Öztan ed., Türk Sağı: Mitler, Fetişler, Düşman İmgeleri.

mainstreaming norm for the 1950s, not only in Turkey but almost globally.<sup>68</sup> In other words, getting married and starting a family was seen as a desirable and necessary part of growing up and becoming an adult. Marriage was considered as the ultimate goal and a need to reach "happy end" in individuals' lives. Hence, happiness of individuals was closely associated with marriage.<sup>69</sup> As a result, obtaining a "happy marriage" was equated with people's ultimate happiness. In an interview with *Hayat*, Gönül Akın, a singer of the era, talks about her chance at happiness. She said that she would be getting married soon. "As I am to be married soon, it seems I have come close to 'happiness'."<sup>70</sup> Since reproduction (having children) was considered blessed and possible only in the marriage, marriage is considered a "first step to happiness" in the magazines.

Marriage and family were presented as the fundamental and responsible institutions of Turkish society since they have long been considered constitutive elements of the "social." Marriage and family became the core unit to preserve and enhance the cultural and moral codes of Turkish society. They also contributed to the development of the country through work, the workforce through reproduction, and wellbeing by keeping individuals away from unhealthy practices and occurences of the country such as STDs. In particular, the family's assigned role in raising and educating children transformed the institution into a focal point for the now and future of the *social*. Protecting children and raising them as productive and efficient individuals would remain a continuous quest for the

Stephanie Coontz, *The Way We Never Were: American Families and the Nostalgia Trip* (New York: Basic Books, 1992), 23-41. Anne Revillard, "Stating Family Values and Women's Rights: Familialism and Feminism within the French Republic," *French Politics*, 5 (2007), 211. May, *Homeward Bound*, 9-16.

<sup>69</sup> Okur, "Conspicuous Consumption in Turkey."

Interview with Gönül Akın, Hayat, 119, 16.01.1959, 20-21. "Gönül Akın saadet konusunda diyor ki: 'saadeti bulamamanın üzüntüsü içinde kıvranıyorum. İlk evliliğimde mesut olamamıştım. «saadeti» uzun yıllar aradım. Bulduktan sonra evlenmeğe karar vermiştim. Yakında evleneceğime göre «saadete» yaklaşmış sayılırım.' "Gönül Akın says: 'I am suffering from the despair of not finding happiness. I was not able to be happy in my first marriage. I searched for 'happiness' for long years. I decided to get married after finding it. As I am to marry soon, it seems I have come near to 'happiness'."

<sup>71</sup> Horn, Social Bodies: Science, Reproduction, and Italian Modernity.

government. Furthermore, the metaphor, which associated children with the future of the society and country, had strengthened the importance of the family. Therefore, the family was considered as a unit to regulate and also a framework to exercise the *disciplinary* (educative) practices inside this unit and on the individuals (members of the family).

The first step in establishing regulatory practices for marriage was setting the legal framework, which included the legal establishment of the marriage and the family, the legal responsibilities of husband and wife, and the legal position of the children. The regulatory aims did not end with the judicial framework. The opinion leaders of the era also provided the norms for a good and accepted marriage.

Marriage (and family), which defined the relationship between man and woman in a "socially recognized and accepted (institution) structure" was inextricably linked to the expectations, particularly, regarding the reproduction of society. Since marriage was accepted as the only structure for the sexual activity of women, it turned out to be the one and only possibility to procreate. Family with its regulating power over sexuality, reproduction and womanhood became the realm where the "appropriate" bodies for man and woman were defined, structured and promoted. The ideal and model family were promoted on different levels and mediums during the 1950s, since it was the era when the family as an institution was on the rise both in Turkey and around the world.<sup>72</sup> The promotion of the model family served to create common norms and values regarding the family, both on an individual and societal level. Along with regulating the family as a unit, inside of the unit was also interfered by defining the proper norms and values for the members, particularly for womanhood as a wife and mother since woman and family were closely associated under the realm of private.<sup>73</sup>

72 Sancar, Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti. May, Homeward Bound.

For the regulative mechanism in constructing citizenship in Turkey, see, Didem Ünal and Dilek Cindoglu, "Reproductive citizenship in Turkey: Abortion chronicles," *Women's Studies International Forum* 38 (2013), 24. Nükhet Sirman, "The Making of Familial Citizenship in Turkey," in *Challenges to Citizenship in a Globalizing World: European Questions and Turkish Experiences*, edited Fuat Keyman and Ahmet İçduygu (London: Routledge, 2005), 209.

Marriage and family were not only portrayed by the new and modern social values. Marriage and family were regulated with the new legislation, the Civil Code, which was implemented in 1926. The introduction of the Civil Code supported the social transition with the legislative framework. The 1926 Civil Code established the legal framework of the topics such as marriage agreement, the legal status, and the relationship between the spouses and their families, including their rights and responsibilities, the sexual relationship between the spouses, the benefits of joint property for the spouses and their children, and their custody.<sup>74</sup> In the end, the new legislation regulated almost all the steps of the marriage process since marriage as an institution was assumed to provide a legitimate and legal framework for sexuality and, eventually, procreation.<sup>75</sup>

Marriage, in particular, was primarily regulated by the 743 numbered article in the Civil Code. 76 According to this article, marriage was defined as a legal unification for a continuous life partnership or, in general, a legal agreement between a woman and a man. 77 The Civil Code was claimed to introduce equality among the spouses in a marital agreement, which was the most highlighted characteristic of the new legislation. The equality principle was referred to in the constitution of the new Republic, which "announced equality among man and woman, and removed and banned every kind of group, class, family, and individual privilege." The official marriage act was presented as a guarantee that provides equality and economic protection for women. The equality among the spouses became one of the most discussed topics among women and women's organizations such as *Türk* 

<sup>74</sup> Ferit H. Saymen, "Evlilikte Eşitlik," Seksoloji, 37 (1952), 19-22.

Horn, Social Bodies: Science, Reproduction, and Italian Modernity, 70.

<sup>76</sup> Türk Kanunu Medenisi ve Borçlar Kanunu (İstanbul: İsmail Akgün Matbaası, 1946), 473-479. Turkish Civil Code (Türk Kanunu Medenisi), http://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/MevzuatMetin/5.3.743.pdf (29.04.2019)

Gürol Cantürk, "Evlilik ve boşanma ile ilgili adli psikiyatrik uygulamalar," *Journal of Forensic Medicine* 3, 3 (2006): 58-64.

Ferit H. Saymen, "Evlilikte Eşitlik," *Seksoloji*, 37 (1952), 19. "...kadın erkek müsavatı ilan edilmiş ve her çeşit grup, sınıf, aile ve şahıs imtiyazı kaldırılmış ve yasak edilmiştir."

<sup>79</sup> Ferit H. Saymen, "Evlilikte Eşitlik," Seksoloji, 37 (1952), 19.

*Kadınlar Birliği* during the 1950s.<sup>80</sup> Although some of the writers were quite aware that the equality between men and women was not maintained thoroughly, they argued that this imbalance was grounded on natural and social causes. Moreover, Saymen added that the imbalance due to natural and social causes could be repaired and reinforced to achieve equality.<sup>81</sup>

The official marriage was used for the union when it was conducted by a public officer in the name of the state and documented with a marriage license. Therefore, the union was legalized by the recognition of a representative who was assigned (and described) by the Turkish Republic and the Civil Code. With this change, the Turkish state aimed to regulate "private matters" in the name of the social good, which was predominantly related to the legal situation of children. With the new legislation, monogamy became the legal situation in marriages where polygamous marriages, in which a man marries more than one woman, were legally banned with the 1926 Turkish Civil Code.<sup>82</sup> This law also included a legal prohibition on polygamous marriage, which was permitted by the religious code (Islamic code). However, this change did not completely prohibit religious marriages. Instead, according to the Civil Code, religious marriages were allowed if they were actualized separately and after the official marriages. Again, according to the criminal code, imams and the spouses who conducted religious marriages before the official one were considered to be committing an offense.<sup>83</sup>

<sup>80</sup> Sarıtaş and Şahin, "Ellili Yıllarda Kadın Hareketi," in *Türkiye'nin 1950'li Yılları*, ed. Mete Kaan Kaynar (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2015).

Ferit H. Saymen, "Evlilikte Eşitlik," *Seksoloji*, 37 (1952), 19. "Tabiattan ya da sosyal olarak kaynaklanan zaruretler yüzünden. Ancak bunlar yüzünden olan, oluşan eşitsizlikler, eşitliği teyit ve takviye içindir."

Ziyaedin Fahri Fındıkoğlu, "Türk Aile Sosyolojisi," İstanbul University Hukuk Fakultesi Mecmuası 11, 3-4 (1945), 273-274.

The Criminal Law, Article 237, if two people marry according to the religious codes before (or without) marrying officially, they could be sentenced from two months to six months. (Aralarında evlenme akdi olmaksızın evlenmenin dini merasimini yaptıran erkek ve kadınlar iki aydan altı aya kadar hapis cezasile cezalandırılır.) If a person performs a religious marriage ceremony before seeing a the official marriage act, the person could be sentenced from one month to three months. (Evlenme akdinin kanuna göre yapılmış olduğunu gösteren kağıdı görmeden bir evlenme için dini merasim yapanlar hakkında da

The monogamous marriage of the Civil Code was an attempt to inject modern family into social life with laws. Moreover, the new Civil Code ensured several rights for women, such as property rights and legal custody of children.<sup>84</sup> The legal characteristics of the official marriage were stressed by a legal expert with an analogy. Saymen resembled a wife without an official marriage contract (nikahsız karı) to a deedles field (tapusuz tarla).85 In this analogy, he did not only refer to the legal recognition of marriage at the state level. But, he also equalized a woman to a property such as a field, which could not be claimed without an official document. Moreover, the legal situation of the children who were born in a religious marriage was discussed quite frequently due to the inheritance problems. Saymen noted that these children would not be recorded under their father's name without an official marriage contract, which would cause them to lose their inheritance in the future<sup>86</sup> Official marriage was presented as an opportunity and right for equality while focusing on children and reproductive practices of spouses.

The marriage age of the spouses was also regulated by the Civil Code. In the 1926 Civil Code, men who had reached the age of eighteen and women who had reached the age of seventeen could get married without any permission from their parents (Article 88).<sup>87</sup> The marriage age of the spouses was modified in 1938 and decreased to seventeen for men and fifteen for women. The decrease in marriage age was closely related to the

bundan evvelki fikrada yazılı ceza verilir.) If muhtars learn that a religious marriage act occurs before an official act, he is obliged to report to responsible authority. If muhtar does not inform to public authorities, muhtar could be sentenced from 5 Turkish Lira to 100 Turkish Lira. (Muhtarlar aralarında evlenme akdi yok iken evlenmenin dini merasimini yaptıklarına muttali oldukları kimseleri salahiyetli makama bildirmeğe mecburdurlar. Bu hususta ihmal gösterenler beş liradan yüz liraya kadar ağır para cezasile cezalandırılır.) www.mevzuat.gov.tr/MevzuatMetin/5.3.765.pdf (01.08.2022)

- Prof. Dr. Ferit H. Saymen, "Evlilikte Eşitlik IV: Karının Durumu," *Seksoloji*, 40 (1952), 20-23.
- Prof. Dr. Ferit H. Saymen, "Dünyada ve Türkiyede Evlilik Buhranı," *Seksoloji*, 16 (1950), 22 23
- Prof. Dr. Ferit H. Saymen, "Evlilik ve cali evlenmeler," Seksoloji, 36 (1952).
- 87 *Türk Kanunu Medenisi ve Borçlar Kanunu* (İstanbul: İsmail Akgün Matbaası, 1946), 473-479.

pronatal policies of the Turkish state. The relation between early marriages and number of births was already established during the 1930s. Marriage age determined women's age at first child and number of children that a couple could have in a marriage.

Although it was not discussed in the 1930s, the *right* age for sexuality also became a subject in marriage age discussions in the 1950s. These ages were the minimum limits for when a person could experience sexuality legally. Since sexuality was assumed to be experienced in marriage, writers, including doctors, psychologists, and sociologists, tried to decide the proper age for sexuality. According to a sociologist of the period, Hans Ohl, claimed that the right age for marriage is thirty for men and twentyfive for women.<sup>88</sup> The sociologist linked marriage age with maturity of the potential spouses.<sup>89</sup> Ohl argued that maturity of spouses may determine whether a marriage would survive, or end in divorce. 90 Another issue regarding marriage was related to duties and responsibilities of spouses in a marriage. The designated ages were chosen according to the aptitude of the individuals to participate in the labor market, along with their capacity to shoulder their own responsibility. 91 Uraz and Kırçal stated that a man could only marry if he could carry the responsibility of earning sufficiently to take care of his family. A woman should be able to carry the responsibility of care work not only for her children but also for the household. 92 According to Samira Berksan, average of first marriage age was 19.62 for women and 23.73 for men in 1945. In 1960, although average age for first marriage in urban areas changed to 20.24 for women and 24.20 for men, total average age for first marriage remained almost same for women and men. 93 Later in

Hans Ohl, "Hangi Yaşta Evlenmeli?," Seksoloji, 42 (1952), 41.

Ferit Hakkı Saymen, "Evlenme yaşı," *Seksoloji*, 12 (1950), 8-9. Hans Ohl, "Hangi Yaşta Evlenmeli?," *Seksoloji*, 42 (1952), 42.

<sup>90</sup> Hans Ohl, "Hangi Yaşta Evlenmeli?," Seksoloji 42 (1952), 42.

<sup>91</sup> Hans Ohl, "Hangi Yaşta Evlenmeli?," Seksoloji 42 (1952), 42.

<sup>92</sup> Selçuk Karçal and Kayıhan Uraz, "Türkiye'de Cinsiyet Meselesi: Evlenme Yaşı," *Seksoloji*, 46 (1953), 53. Dr. Paul Popenone, "Evlenmeye Hazır Mısınız?" *Seksoloji Yıllığı*, 1 (1952), 114-122.

<sup>93</sup> Samira Berksan, "Marriage Patterns and the Effect on Fertility in Turkey," in *Turkish Demography: Proceedings of a Conference*, edited Frederic C. Shorter and Bozkurt Güvenç (Ankara: Hacettepe University Publications, 1969), 156, 159. Behar and Duben

the 1960s, when birth control became a public issue, raising the age of marriage became a strategy to regulate reproduction. <sup>94</sup> Marriage age did not affect fertility rates due to the women's age at their first birth. Rather, it had an important impact on the power dynamic between spouses. Greer Litton Fox discussed the effect of marriage age of women in controlling their reproductive practices in an article based on the Ankara Family Study's data conducted by David Goldberg. Fox argued that the relative power of women in marriage increases with the marriage age of wife. <sup>95</sup>

The Civil Code also regulated the restrictions regarding the marriage such as marriage with minors, with relatives, with mentally disabled people, and eligible partners for Turkish soldiers. <sup>96</sup> All the restrictions were justified by the wellbeing of the future offspring and their involvement in society. The possibility of inheriting mental disorders was seen as a threat and burden for society The marriage act ends, foremost, with the death of one of the spouses. Divorce also terminated the marriage act. <sup>97</sup> Grounds for annulment were also extended, to include marrying while suffering from communicable veneral disease, being of unsound mind, or for women, being impregnanted by another man. The legislative framework of marriage equated the institution with "being a family" and "having children", which

stated that the marriage age for men was 30 years old and a bit over 20 years old for women at the beginning of the century in Istanbul. In other words, the marriage age for the metropolitan – Istanbul – and Turkey was significantly different. Duben and Behar, *İstanbul Haneleri*, 83.

- Mümtaz Peker, "Türkiye'de Nüfusbilimin Kurumsallaşması ve Bu Süreçte Prof. Dr. Nusret H. Fişek'in Yeri," *Fişek Ensitüsü*, 20.01.2013. http://sosyalpolitika.fisek.org.tr/turkiyede-nufusbilimin-kurumsallasmasi-ve-bu-surecte-prof-dr-nusret-h-fisekin-yeri/
- 95 Greer Litton Fox, "Some Determinants of Modernism among Women in Ankara, Turkey," *Journal of Marriage and Family* 35, 3, *Special Section: New Social History of the Family* (1973), 524.
- Cass R. Sunstein, and Richard Thaler, "Privatizing Marriage," *The Monist* 91, 3-4 (2008), 379. Nuti, "How should marriage be theorised?" 286, 288. Nuray Ekşi, "Türk Hukukunda Kamu Personelinin Yabancılarla Evlenmesi," *Public and Private International Law Bulletin* 37, 2 (2017), 294–331.
- 97 The Civil Law Articles related to Divorce.

made it the main legal and legitimate institution for sexuality. The new Civil Code also defined the duties and responsibilities of spouses.

Family was socially, culturally, and legally located in the private sphere. Since the private realm was associated with women, family was seen and discussed as related to feminity. In other words, while the public sphere was linked with masculinity and men, the private sphere was seen as an area for women. <sup>98</sup> The dichotomy that paired man with the public sphere and woman with the private sphere has also formed the role of woman as wife and man as husband. The modern roles of women as wives and men as husbands in the family were re-structured based on public and private division. <sup>99</sup>

The division of labor in the family was also defined by the characteristics and *essences that* were attributed to womanhood and manhood. The responsibilities of a wife and husband were justified by their *nature*. Women as full-time wives and mothers were often equated with the family itself and held responsible for the care work of the family since they were the affectionate and loving ones. Moreover, women are confined to the private sphere of the family because they bear and rear children. Man, on the other hand, was defined as the main breadwinner of the family which made them the main actor who connected with the market and identified with activities in a separate economic sphere. Husband (man) was identified as the representative of the union regarding the decisions and economic property of the union. Accordingly, he was considered liason of

Carole Pateman, (1989) "Feminist Critiques of the Public/Private Dichotomy," in *The Disorder of Women* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1989), 118–140. Myra Macdonald, *Representing Women: Myths of Femininity in the Popular Media* (London, and New York: Edward Arnold, 1995).

<sup>99</sup> Sancar, Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti, 196.

<sup>100</sup> Walby, Theorizing Patriarchy, 174.

Barrie Thorne, "Feminism and the Family: Two Decades of Thought," in *Rethinking the Family: Some Feminist Questions*, edited Barrie Thorne and Marilyn Yalom (Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1992), 7. See: The Civil Law, Article 152 - The husband is the head of the union. The responsibility of the house, the proper provision of the wife and children belongs to him. "Article 152 - The husband is the head of the union. The responsibility of the house, the proper provision of the wife and children belongs to him."

<sup>102</sup> Hüseyin Cahit Oğuzoğlu, "Evlilik Birliğini Temsilde Medeni Kanunumuzun Dayandiği Esaslar," *Ankara Üniversitesi Hukuk Fakültesi Dergisi* 7 (1950), 312-313.

the union (family) with the outer world. A man was narrated as the responsible body who was taking care of the "external relations" while a woman was the actor who was taking care of business inside-the-family. Although this gendered division of labor was presented as a part of the democratic formation of the family by the writers of the era, this division strengthened the construction of gendered and sexual roles in the family. The unequal distribution of roles among men and women in the domestic realm affects the power dynamic of their relations in the family. The gendered/sexual division of labor in the family was not limited within Turkey. It was also promoted by the written material produced by the writers in the USA and translated then into Turkish.

The duties and responsibilities assigned to husband and wife and regulated the inner dynamics of the family were also defined and fortified by the civil code in other words, by the public administration. By granting marriage licenses, the new civil code of the Turkish state establishes a particular form of intimate and communal existence for the individuals in the marriage agreement<sup>107</sup> which determines the roles and limits of the spouses. In other words, the civil code redefined the familial roles and responsibilities of wife and husband, which were located in the private sphere, with a regulatory instrument, law. The legislative definition of marriage turned an intimate care-giving union into a state-defined cooperation.<sup>108</sup>

According to civil code articles 152 and 154, the husband was the union's head and representative. Since the husband was the head of the family, taking the husband's surname became compulsory for women

Daniele Villars, "Eşref Saatini Kollayınız," *Aile* 1, 2 (1947), 46. "Ama kadın evde "İçişleri Bakanı" değil midir?"

<sup>104</sup> Sancar, Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti, 195.

Nuti, "How should marriage be theorised?," 291.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Gayri Meşru Çocuklar," Seksoloji 1, 1 (1949), 43. (man as breadwinner, woman as housewife) "... anne... malı sıkıntılardan uzak ve bütün faaliyetini evine, ailesine hasretmiş. ... aile reisi olarak mali meseleleri hal ve para temin etmek, yani yuvasını refaha kavuşturmak."

Nuti, "How should marriage be theorised?," 287.

Tamara Metz, *Untying the Knot: Marriage, the State, and the Case for Their Divorce* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2010), 113.

according to article 153. Again, according to article 152, the husband was held responsible for electing a place of residence and taking care of his wife and children. If the husband failed to respond to the care of his wife and children, then, according to article 175, the woman (wife) has the right to ask for a divorce. A woman, on the other hand, was held responsible for taking care of the household according to article 153. 109 Moreover, article 159 stated that a woman has to receive her husband's permit if she wants to work outside of her household. Moreover, the authority of ahusband over his wife, children, and household was not only recognized legally. 110 But, it was also strengthened by public surveys and expert opinions. In an interview published in *Milliyet* and translated from an American magazine, Look, the experts stated that the husband should have the last word in the household. According to the surveys, among the families where final decisions were made by women, 53% of the families could not be happy, while 61% of the families where husbands made the last decision could definitely achieve happiness.<sup>111</sup> Although the family was expected to serve the development and internalization of democratic values, the roles and relations in the family which formed by cultural, academic and legal norms, were not approached with "democratic values." There was a clear hierarchy of the husband or father's word over the family. While marriage and family were presented as a part of natural flow in human life, they were narrated as if they were free of power struggles. In other words, marriage and family were narrated as institutions full of love and affection (with natural human beings). However the power relations in the marriage and family were either ignored or hidden by the "division of labor."

<sup>109</sup> Turkish Civil Law, Article 153: A woman is her husband's assistant and counselor as much as she can to ensure joint happiness. The woman looks after the house.

Nancy F. Cott, *Public Vows: A History of Marriage and the Nation* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2000), 3.

<sup>&</sup>quot;İktibas: Evliliğe dair sual ve en doğru cevaplar," *Milliyet*, 24.07.1952. "evde son söz kocanın olmasıdır. Kadının oldukça ehemmiyet kazandığı birleşik amerikada bile en mühim kararlar koca tarafından alınır. Bu hususta yapılan anketler, son kararın kadına tanındığı ailelerden yüzde 53 ünün kati surette saadet yüzü görmediği açığa çıkarmıştır. Buna karşılık son kararları kocanın aldığı ailelerin yüzde 61i saadete kavuşmaktadır."

## 3.2. Marriage as a Process in the Making

Marriage was not only narrated as a part of the natural cycle and as reaching for happiness. But it was also set as a responsibility to strengthen the inner values of Turkish society, to ensure the order of the community and to raise healthy generations. Hence, the ones who did not get married – because they did not want to or did not have the opportunity – were seen as the outcasts of society. In other words, bachelorhood was seen as a phase, if not a condition, that should be overcome with the proper approach and measures. Like sexuality and marriage, the perception of bachelorhood changed from the 1930s to the 1950s in Turkey. During the 1930s, bachelorhood was seen as an obvious threat to the livestock of society. It was considered the main reason for delaying procreation. In the 1950s, however, bachelorhood was narrated as a phase which should be overcome by young people to start their lives. In the articles, "starting their lives" was associated with getting married and having children for young people. In other words, young people were expected to get married in order to enter adulthood. Also, bachelorhood was considered an abnormal state - an anomaly – if it was prolonged. 112 The discourse, on the one hand, claimed that bachelorhood was not a natural and normal state if it was not ended at the proper period. On the other hand, it suggested that being married was the proper state for grown-ups. Since bachelors did not follow the natural flow, it could not be good for the individual's psychological well-being. Moreover, the abnormality and unnaturallness of bachelorhoods was associated with experiencing sexuality. As mentioned before, sexuality was narrated as a natural part of the human life cycle and biology. However, its practice was limited to the marriage institution. Hence, if they continued to stay bachelors, first, they may stay abstinent, which can cause severe problems. In Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, the writer argued that old virgins would experience terrible agonies such as "rahim tümörü" (uterine tumor)

Ord.Prof. M.Şekip Tunç, "Cinsi Olgunluğun Evlilikteki Kıymeti," *Seksoloji*, 11 (1950), 1. "Daimi bekarlık türlü anomalilerden doğan istisnai bir haldir."

and "vulva takallüsü" (constriction of the vulva)<sup>113</sup> Second, bachelorhood increased the possibility for young people to experience sexuality out-of-marriage, which could endanger the moral values of Turkish society. Although bachelorhood was considered as an individual "problem," a personal status and related to private life, it was narrated as a common problem for young people and, therefore, had a social dimension besides being a possible threat to the moral values of society. Yet, it should be noted that the concern regarding the state of bachelorhood in Turkey was overestimated by the writers.

The reasons for remaining as bachelors were also discussed in the articles. One of the main reasons was related to the economic conditions of young people, particularly young men. Bülent Davran claimed that young men could not dare to get married due to economic difficulties. Davran stated that they were afraid of getting married since their income would not be sufficient to take care of their families. Another reason for late marriages was a lack of opportunities to meet with the right partner. 114 Davran stated that young people did not want to get married with the old methods, which referred to match-making (görücülük). They wanted to meet with their mates and build a friendship before taking steps towards marriage. However, they could not acquire the right opportunities to meet with each other. 115 Another writer wrote about his own desire to get married. However, he stated that since he is a lonely person, he could not find the proper mate. 116 On the one hand, young people, were encouraged to search for a proper mate who would be in harmony with each other's tastes, ideas, and interests. However, on the other hand, they had limited opportunities for meeting with their prospective spouses for two reasons. First, the encounters

<sup>113</sup> Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 3: Genç kızlığın En Esrarlı Tarafı: Bakirelik (İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959), 22-27.

Dr. Bülent Davran, "Bir Cinsiyet Buhranı İçinde miyiz?" Seksoloji, 19 (1950), 4.

Bülent Davran, "Münevver Türk genci, hayat arkadaşını seçerken nasıl zorluklarla karşılaşıyor?" *Seksoloji*, 25, (1951).

Hasan Yılmazer, "Şehirden Notlar: Bekarlık Sultanlık, evlilik padişahlıktır," *Milliyet*, 05.05.1951. "- Neden evlenmezsin yahu? ... – Birader aradığımı bulamıyorum. Şöyle huyuma suyuma, yaşıma boyuma uygun bir şey bulsam hiç durmam evlenirim. Fakat, ben yalnız bir adamın biriyim, nasıl arar nasıl bulurum? yoksa evlenmeğe can atıyorum ..."

between men and women were quite limited, though they, relatively, shared more public spaces. Second, the norms for male-female friendship were still in the transformation process. The stress on selecting a "proper mate" was not only related to encouraging marriages. But it was also seen as one of the important measures to prevent divorces. The main reason for divorce was grounded on the unwise choices of mates. 117 As a result, "selecting the proper mate" became a popular subject in the publications in order to reduce bachelorhood, and sustain good marriages.

Before the Marriage: "How do we meet?"

While bachelorhood was outcast, marriage was praised by the public figures of the era. Therefore, the steps that built and functionalized the marriage were taken into consideration and discussed one by one. Selecting the proper match was the first step of the process. "How to select a proper mate?" became a common subject for different texts in journals such as *Seksoloji*, *Hayat*, and as well as in the marriage manuals.<sup>118</sup>

Hayat published a 15-week-long "How Did They Marry" series, in which 52 marriage stories are shared with its readers. Hayat displayed the marriage stories as exemplary cases, particularly for young women. It aimed to guide the young women to meet with the "right" spouse and question whether this match would make the spouses happy. In the series, the marriage stories are enriched with guidelines to follow for starting a happy marriage. In the editorial, the aim of the series was set as "to guide our readers who want to marry to happy marriages through displaying how our readers met with their spouses." The presentation of the stories consisted of two parts. While in the first part, how the couple met was presented, in

For the similar discourse in the same period in the United States, May, *Homeward Bound*, 116.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Nişanlınızı iyi seçtiniz mi?," Seksoloji, 19 (1950), 26-27. "Kocanızla nerede tanıştınız?" Aile 1, 1 (1947), 47.

<sup>119 &</sup>quot;Eş Bulma Anketi," *Hayat*, 41 (1957), 26-27. "Okuyucularımızın eşleriyle nasıl tanıştıklarını ve bu tanışmadan nasıl bir netice doğduğunu mecmuamızda neşretmekle evlenmek isteyen okuyucularımıza yardım etmek istiyoruz. Evlenmek bahsinde hangi yoldan gidenlerin mesut oldukları anket sonunda belli olacaktır."

the second part, the "desirable" characteristics for a future spouse were listed. The authenticity of the stories is, unavoidably, under question. Yet, whether the stories are authentic or fabricated, they display the meeting patterns of the spouses in the 1950s since, if nothing else, they contain a representation of the partners' meeting habits.

"The harmony among the spouses" was the most frequently mentioned characteristic to make a marriage successful and sustainable, which the majority of the writers agreed with. Therefore, writers advised young women and young men to search for a partner with whom they could live in harmony, with respect and love. <sup>120</sup> In an article published in *Look* magazine and translated to Turkish, experts - doctors and physicians - answered the question of whether the statement "opposites attract each other" was true. The experts based their response on surveys and added that the long-lasting and happy couples were those whose personalities, interests, ideas, ideals, and living styles resemble each other. 121 W.E. Sargent, a well-known writer on marriage, said that if a couple loses harmony, respect, affection, or love in their marriages, some men or women may start looking for their ideal partner. However, Sargent suggested that people should search for their own identity rather than search for an ideal partner in order to avoid disappointment. The writer claimed that one should know her or his own true self and choose her or his partner accordingly. In this manner, she or he may avoid cheating and divorce. 122 In the articles, divorce and cheating were not narrated as the causes of ending a marriage. Rather, it was presented as the outcome of unharmonious and unhappy relationships. The "partner selection" process was classified into two types. One was called as arranged marriage, which was also discussed under the name of matchmaking. The second was getting to know the partner, which was also called flirting or friendship (arkadaşlık etmek).

<sup>120</sup> Dr. Abraham Stone, "Geçimsizliğin Sebepleri," Seksoloji, 45 (1952), 1-2.

<sup>121 &</sup>quot;İktibas: Evliliğe dair sual ve en doğru cevaplar," *Milliyet*, 24.07.1952. "En çok zıt tipler birbirini çekermiş. Bunun ölçüsü nedir? – Olaylar bunun aksini gösteriyor. Anketlerden çıkan neticeye göre evlilik saadetine uzun müddet eren çiftler, şahsiyetleri, menfaatleri, düşünüşleri, idealleri ve yaşayış tarzları hissedilir derecede birbirinin aynı olan insanlardır."

W.E. Sargent, *Evlilik Hayatında Daha Bahtiyar Olmanın Yolları*, trans. Ömer Rıza Doğrul, (Istanbul: Arif Bolat Kitabevi, 1942), 23.

Matchmaking was described as an "old-style" marriage. In the popular press, matchmaking without the consent of the future spouses was even assessed as a traditional (not-up-to-date) act. 123 As Davran explained in detail, an arranged marriage was facilitated by the formal procedures of the extended family. In an arranged marriage, responsible figures of authority figure encourages the parties to the marriage. The authority figures could be parents of the partners (mothers), family members and the elderly (sisters or aunts), or religious officials. 124 In an arranged marriage, the parties are made to meet through a third party (through a family member or family friend). In some cases, a professional matchmaker could be engaged to find a suitable spouse. 125 Greer Litton Fox conducted a survey with 803 married couples in villages near-Ankara in 1966. Among the respondents, 73.2% of women were in arranged marriages. The percentage of arranged marriages decreased with women get younger. While 80.7% of women over 45 years old were in arranged marriages, 71.7% of women under 30 years old responded that their marriages were arranged by a third party. 126

According to Fox, marriages in rural areas were often formed through arranged marriages. <sup>127</sup> In arranged marriages, the consent of the young people, particularly young women, becomes a most concerning issue. The dowry for women (*başlık parası*) was seen as the main and, also, enforcing

Bülent Davran, "Münevver Türk genci, hayat arkadaşını seçerken nasıl zorluklarla karşılaşıyor?" *Seksoloji*, 25, (1951), 1.

<sup>124</sup> Bülent Davran, "Münevver Türk genci, hayat arkadaşını seçerken nasıl zorluklarla karşılaşıyor?" *Seksoloji*, 25, (1951), 1.

<sup>125</sup> Selçuk Karçal and Kayıhan Uraz, "Türkiye'de Cinsiyet Meselesi: Görücü, dönür, söz kesme, nişan ve nikah," *Seksoloji*, 42 (1952), 48, 50.

Greer Litton Fox, "Love Match and Arranged Marriage in a Modernizing Nation: Mate Selection in Ankara, Turkey," *Journal of Marriage and Family* 37, 1 (1975), 184. According to the 1966 study, 80.7% of women above 45 years old, 71.9% of women between 30 and 44 years old and 71.7% of women under 30 years old responded that their marriages were arranged marriages.

Greer Litton Fox, "Love Match and Arranged Marriage in a Modernizing Nation: Mate Selection in Ankara, Turkey," 180-193. For an anthropological assessment for the marriages in the Black Sea Region during the 1940s, see: Nermin Erdentuğ, "Türkiye'nin Karadeniz Bölgesinde evlenme görenekleri ve törenleri," *Antropoloji*, 5 (1969), 27-64. https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/antropolojidergisi/issue/60317/874363#article\_cite (29.08.2022).

factor for forced arranged marriages. <sup>128</sup> Again, the dowry became a symbol of the husband's ownership of the wife's sexuality and fertility. <sup>129</sup> Parental pressure was represented as one of the fundamental reasons for arranged and, consequently, unhappy marriages. In *Hayat*'s "How Did They Marry?" series, a woman from Ankara complained in her letter about the state of her marriage and her unhappiness. She stated that she had married someone she had never known due to the pressure of her parents. <sup>130</sup> In the same series, another reader from İzmir wrote that he married a woman he did not love because he did not want to decline the wishes and insistence of her mother. <sup>131</sup> Davran criticized the "matchmaking" style due its inadequacy of knowing each other. Davran questioned how can a young man decide in such a short period of time whether young woman is a suitable partner (*hayat arkadaşı*). He added that "we can not give up this unpleasant marriage method. If there would be no arranged marriages, meeting with a partner would be more difficult for people who want to marry." <sup>132</sup>

Flirting, also called "being friends" (arkadaşlık etmek) among men and young women (kız-erkek arkadaşlığı), 133 was stated in opposition to arranged marriages. While arranged marriages were narrated as traditional, pre-modern, old-fashioned, and even eastern style by the writers, flirting was pointed out as a new, modern, and western way of meeting the

Tahincioğlu, *Namusun Halleri*. Some of the arranged marriages was based on the dowry-based inheritance, where parents of the young women received a part of male wealth in exchange of marrying their daughter. Therefore, parents, particularly fathers have interest in their daughters' marriages.

<sup>129</sup> Pınar İlkkaracan, "Türkiye'nin Doğu Bölgelerinde Kadın Cinselliği Bağlamının İncelenmesi," in *Müslüman Toplumlarda Kadın ve Cinsellik*, ed. Pınar İlkkaracan (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003), 140.

<sup>130</sup> *Hayat*, 55 (25.10.1957), 26 "Ebeveynimin tazyiki ile hiç tanımadığım bir kimse ile evliyim. Çok bedbahtım. Mesut olmaya çalışıyorum, fakat olamıyorum."

<sup>131</sup> *Hayat*, 56 (01.11.1957), 26. "Askerliğimin sonunda, çok ufak yaşta ölen babamın yokluğunu belli etmeden beni büyüten,hayatını bana vakfeden annemin ısrarı ve arzusunu kıramıyarak evlendim. İstemiyordum. Sevmiyordum..."

Bülent Davran, "Münevver Türk genci, hata arkadaşını seçerken nasıl zorluklarla karşılaşıyor?" *Seksoloji*, 25, (1951), 2.

<sup>133</sup> Turhan Aytul ed., Türkiye'de Cinsiyet Problemi (İstanbul: Varlık Yayınevi, 1964), 45.

couples.<sup>134</sup> The discussing parties inquired about all aspects of flirting, starting from meeting the partner to the duration of flirting. Aytul classified different types and phases of flirting, including in the eyes of adolescents, university students, and also parents.<sup>135</sup>

A lot of writers advised young people to first meet with their future spouses and, after spending some time, to assess whether they were suitable for each other. Among the 52 marriage stories in *Hayat*, only 6 of them occurred through matchmaking methods, in which half of them ended bitterly. In most of *Hayat*'s stories, prospective spouses met, built *friendships*, and decided by themselves to get married. So in these stories, young people to be married are encouraged and counselled to meet their future partners before the marriage and to spend some time with them instead of having a third-party as a matchmaker to intervene. Is

The friendship among young people was supported since it would contribute to the harmony in marriage, which would serve the well-being of the individuals and society in general. Thus, pre-marital friendship was supported by a rational argument that established a link between a happy marriage and getting to know each other. Some writers suggested that young people could select a proper mate if they met with their significant other before marriage. However, the lack of joint and proper spaces to meet with a possible partner was presented as one of the main problems. The

Bülent Davran, "Münevver Türk genci, hata arkadaşını seçerken nasıl zorluklarla karşılaşıyor?" *Seksoloji*, 25, (1951), 1-2. Naşid Erez, "Sosyal ve Biyolojik Açılardan Flirt: Endişeye Lüzum Yok," *Milliyet*, 06.01.1963. Same article was also published as: Naşid Erez, "Sosyal ve Biyolojik Açılardan Tahlil: Flört Faydalıdır," ed. Turhan Aytul, *Türkiye'de Cinsiyet Problemi* (İstanbul: Varlık Yayınevi, 1964), 59. For a discussion from the literature: Brooke Wagner, "Becoming a Sexual Being: Overcoming Constraints on Female Sexuality," *Sexualities* 12, 3 (2009), 291. Wagner referred to the Yalom's study, see: Marilyn Yalom, *The History of the Wife*, (New York: Harper Collins, 2001).

<sup>135</sup> Turhan Aytul, "Cinsel ve Sosyal Davranışlarıyla Kadın no:1," Milliyet, 06.01.1963.

Bülent Davran, "Münevver Türk genci, hata arkadaşını seçerken nasıl zorluklarla karşılaşıyor?" *Seksoloji*, 25 (1951), 2-3.

Okur, "Conspicuous Consumption in Turkey." 31.

Okur, "Conspicuous Consumption in Turkey." 26-27.

Bülent Davran, "Münevver Türk genci, hata arkadaşını seçerken nasıl zorluklarla karşılaşıyor?" *Seksoloji*, 25 (1951), 2-3.

early republican period witnessed changes in the relations between men and women. In the 1930s, men and women of the Republic started to come together in the social spaces such as hospitals, schools, stores, in the balls and in the ceremonies. The places where men and women mixed appeared as sexualized social spaces since those people were unrelated and started to recognize each other with their sex and sexuality. In the 1950s, the physical "togetherness" of unrelated men and women in social spaces became familiar to the eyes of the public. Yet, the extent of this practice was still limited to the upper-middle classes.

As a way of verifying the numbers, young people were complaining about the absence of appropriate places where future spouses could meet. One of the solutions became "meeting clubs" in the era. In an interview published in *Millivet* in 1954, reporter of the newspaper announced the establishment of a new club, "The Bachelor Club," in Istanbul. One of the founders of the club explained their goals as "accustoming young women and young men without a friend to social life and letting them gain an refined circle." The eligibility criteria for membership was being of legal age and not having been married before. Their motto was "proper home" and their coat of arms was "crib." The aim of the club was stated as "bringing together the young people who wanted to get married, but could not find the opportunity for different reasons." <sup>143</sup> Another attempt to bring young people together was the "Society for Facilitating Marriage" (Evlendirmeyi Kolaylaştırma Cemiyeti). The head of the society, Zekiye Ergenc, explained the aim of the society as "bringing young people together who wanted to marry, yet could not find the type they wanted or could not find the courage." She stated that they wanted to serve bachelors who

Reynolds, "Salesclerks, Sexual Danger, and National Identity in Egypt, 1920s–1950s," 72.

<sup>141</sup> Turhan Aytul ed., *Türkiye'de Cinsiyet Problemi* (İstanbul: Varlık Yayınevi, 1964).

Fahir Ersin, "Röportaj: Bekarlık sultanlıktır, diyenlerin kulağı çınlasın," *Milliyet*, 10.02.1954. "...bizim gayemiz, hayatta arkadaşsız kalmış, sıkılgan, genç kız ve erkekleri toplumsal hayata alıştırmak, onlara yalnızlıklarını giderek nezih bir muhit kazandırmaktır."

<sup>143</sup> Fahir Ersin, Röportaj: Bekarlık sultanlıktır, diyenlerin kulağı çınlasın," *Milliyet*, 10.02.1954. "Bundan da anlaşılacağı üzere bir gayemiz de, evlenmeyi arzu eden, fakat türlü sebepplerle imkan bulmaıyan gençleri bir araya toplamaktır."

wanted to marry and also fulfill a national duty. Ninety percent of the society's 1000 registered members had already married.<sup>144</sup>

Two questions were raised regarding the process of selecting the right partner. One was related to the selection criteria. In other words, the fundamentals of marriage were divided into two sides, as love marriage and rational marriage (marriage of convenience)<sup>145</sup> and were open to discussion in order to guide young people. The second discussion was related to the flirting process, in which norms were not established and the process left in a gray area. Although flirting was advised by the writers to build a solid and durable marriage, the limits and content of flirting were uncertain. In other words, the intimacy level during flirting was a subject on which the consensus was not crystalized. Surely, having sex or living together before marriage was not acceptable during the period. 146 But Davran stated that it should not be approached as a reaction to a decent relationship between a man and a woman. He gave the example of Circassian villages and Circassian culture, where young people can meet before marriage. However, he added that there is no doubt about the honor of young Circassian girls. 147 The writers of sexual manners approve of innocent love while constantly warning young people about restraining their sexual desires. 148

<sup>144</sup> Hasan Yılmazer, Şehirden Notlar: Bekarlık Sultanlık, evlilik padişahlıktır," *Milliyet*, 05.05.1951. "Cemiyetin başkanı zekiye ergenç "cemiyet, evlenmeyi arzu edip te kendilerinde cesareti bulamıyanlar veya aradığı tipe rastlıyamayanlara yardımlarda bulunmak ve böylece hem evlenmek istiyen bekarlara hizmette bulunmak hem de milli bir vazifeyi ifa etmek için kurulmuştur. Şimdiye kadar cemiyete 1000e kadar aza kaydolmuş ve hemen hemen bunların yüzde doksanı ev bark sahibi olmuştur."

<sup>145 &</sup>quot;Münazara haberi, Mantık mı Aşka, Aşk mı Mantığa Hakim?" Cumhuriyet, 08.05.1953.

<sup>146 &</sup>quot;Histeri Bir Huydur," İkimiz, 3, 03.01.1955, 23.

Bülent Davran, "Münevver Türk genci, hayat arkadaşını seçerken nasıl zorluklarla karşılaşıyor?" *Seksoloji*, 25 1951), 3-5. "Batı'daki gibi çiftlerin evlenmeden birlikte yaşamaları kabul edilemez; fakat kadın-erkek arası nezih münasebetler'e de gerici bir tutumla yaklaşmamalıdır."

Marc Lanval, "Evlilikten önceki cinsi münasebetler," *Seksoloji*, 1 (1949), 28. "...masum aşkı tatmış olanlar için bu nefis bir tecrübe teşkil eder. Ancak, flört, cinsi istekleri tatmin arzusu doğurduğu takdirde tehlikelidir."

The tension regarding flirting lies between allowing, even encouraging, young people to flirt before getting married and limiting their possible sexual acts during the flirting period.

Although a consensus was established about the inappropriateness of sexuality before marriage, the acceptable level of intimacy between partners was not clearly described by the writers. In 1950, Milliyet shares in its pages the views of an American actress about flirting. According to Milliyet, she declared that a clever woman should not show her affection immediately even if she likes the man. She adds that she is completely against the fact that young girls in the United States are kissing the men with whom they have recently met. 149 While young women were strictly asked to stay abstinent, young men were, slightly, disapproved of when they performed out-of-marriage sexuality. Young women were especially warned against the extreme sexual attraction displayed during flirting, which could cause them to lose their virginity. In the marriage advice, women were asked to make themselves sexually desirable. However, they were obliged to be approachable only in a legal marriage. Peyami Safa criticized young women for acting in extreme "modern" ways. In his article, he stated that young women felt too sexually engaged with young men to get married. 150

Arat states that in Turkey, women's sexuality before marriage is a point of tension between being *alaturka* and being unchaste (*iffetsizlik*). Yet, the same tension came out in the translated articles, which were mostly published in the American press. In the articles, flirting was displayed as a dangerous process for young women that could destroy the rest of their lives. Young women who lost their virginity before marriage were characterized as victims of their innocence, naivety, or irresponsibility. Victim as a concept was structured by individual and social values, which

N.P., *Milliyet*, 07.05.1950 "Akıllı bir kadın erkekten hoşlansa da hemen belli etmemelidir. Amerikada genç kızların önlerine çıkan erkeklerle hemen öpüşmelerinin tamamen aleyhindeyim."

<sup>150</sup> Peyami Safa, "Sözde Kızlar ve Çeşitleri," Seksoloji, 49 (1953), 1-3.

<sup>151</sup> Kadıoğlu, "Cinselliğin İnkârı: Büyük Toplumsal Projelerin Nesnesi Olarak Türk Kadınları."

<sup>152 &</sup>quot;Ahlaksızlık yapmaya mecburlar mı makalesini," Seksoloji.

were used as a social control tool.<sup>153</sup> In the eyes of the writers, for by women, losing one's virginity was considered to be a victim. Yet, women were also blamed due to their choices, which turned them into untrustable and unreliable actors.<sup>154</sup>

Advice columns not only provided technical information about sexual and marital issues. But, they also offered the "right" way to find a husband, select the proper partner, and behave properly during the flirting period and in marriage. In these columns, the answers were blurred between womanly advice (or big brother's advice, in some cases)<sup>155</sup> and information from an expert. In sexual manners, the tone of the advice was more certain and alleged to refer to scientific findings and facts. Marital advice had the tone of a "heart-to-heart" discussion.

## 3.3. What kind of marriage is imagined?

Love as the fundamental basis of a marriage has become visible since the second half of the nineteenth century. Although most marriages were still arranged by the families, the idea of love started to have a strong hand in forming marriages and families. When it comes to the 1950s, love was an important aspect of building relations among partners. Okur stressed that *Hayat* covers love marriages in its articles and its stories with

Nadera Shalhoub-Kevorkian, "Tecavüzün Kültürel Bir Tanımına Doğru: Filistin Toplumunda Tecavüz Mağdurlarıyla Çalışırken Karşılaşılan İkilimler," in *Müslüman Toplumlarda Kadın ve Cinsellik*, ed. İpek İlkkaracan (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003), 208.

<sup>154</sup> Bülent Davran, "Münevver Türk Genci, Hayat Arkadaşını Seçerken Ne gibi Zorluklarla Karşılaşıyor?" *Seksoloji*, 25 (1951), 1-5.

Bashford and Strange, "Public Pedagogy: Sex Education and Mass Communication in the Mid-Twentieth Century," 86.

Duben and Behar, *İstanbul Haneleri*, 101-118. According to Kocaoğlu, "being in *romantic* love" was the only appropriate place in a woman-man relation for women to express themselves freely and as autonomous individuals. Yet, they need to act according to the certain limits, create heterosexual, monogamic families and raise "good children" who will be beneficial for nation and country. Dicle Koğacıoğlu, "Gelenek Söylemleri ve İktidarın Doğallaşması: Namus Cinayetleri Örneği," *Kultur ve Siyasette Feminist Yaklaşımlar*, 3 (2007).

appreciation.<sup>157</sup> Love stories dominated the popular literature of the era with the contributions of Muhazzez Tahsin, Kerime Nadir, and Esat Bozkurt.<sup>158</sup> Popular articles and books frequently emphasized the importance of love in the formation of marriage and family life. Peyami Safa underlined the power of love in marriage, which tames sexuality, gives sexuality more meaning and supports the continuation of marriage.<sup>159</sup> Yet, some writers approached love marriages with caution. They claimed that being in love is unrestrained and therefore an irrational state. Particularly, they warned young women about the consequences of love relations, which let them live their feelings uninhibited.<sup>160</sup>

Another warning was about eloping couples who were not permitted to get married by their parents. Although the elopement and, followingly, marriage were assumed to be actualized out-of-love, the writers displayed their concerns about the sudden, unprepared, and irrational act of running away with the lover. *Aile* warned his readers that eloping couples could end up with inappropriate partnerships in disharmonious marriages. Moreover, they added that without the consent of the grown-ups or parents, the marriage could not be blessed. However, it should be noted that eloping did not only occur because of irrational and sudden decisions. Rather, it could be a strategy where young people actualize if they cannot receive consent from their parents. In this strategy, the virginity of the woman

Okur, "Conspicuous Consumption in Turkey," 36.

Özkurt, "Tracing Modernity In The Popular Romances Of The Early Republican Period (1930-1945)." Güneş, "Kemalist Modernleşmenin Adab-ı Muaşeret Romanları: Popüler Aşk Anlatıları."

<sup>159</sup> Peyami Safa, "Sözde Kızlar ve Çeşitleri," Seksoloji, 49 (1953), 2-3.

<sup>160</sup> Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 9: Genç Kızlarda Sevilmek Arzusu (İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959)

<sup>161</sup> Dr. James F. Bender, "Evlilik Bahislerinde Çok Bilen Az Yanılır," Aile 2, 8 (1949), 48.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Cumhuriyetin Anketi: Kanunlarımızla ananelerimiz arasında büyük bir mücadele cereyan ediyor." *Cumhuriyet*, 13.10.1950. Cumhuriyet interviewed experts and received their views and opinions about increasing number of criminal assaults. This interview was conducted with a crimonologist Mehmed Ali Sebük. Mehmet Ali Sebük desribes sexual assault and eloping (*kız kaçırma*) as a strategy to get married in rural areas. "Irza geçme ve kaçırma fiilleri de, efkarı umumiyeye aksettirilen şekilde değildir. Daha ziyade köyün malı olan bu suçlar, evlenme etrafındaki formalite ile, köyde tatbik kabiliyeti olmıyan medeni kanunun

was particularly used against parental control. Even though the couple did not have sex, they could use the suspicion about the loss of the woman's virginity in order to force the parents and elders of the family to give their consent to their marriage.<sup>163</sup>

Love as the basis of a marriage was narrated from two perspectives which contradicted each other. On the one hand, love was stated as a regulating and taming factor of sexuality. Love was discussed as a state that distinguished itself from "animal instincts." Hence, it has a taming effect on the biological drives that enable human beings to control their sexuality. <sup>164</sup> On the other hand, love has been described as a very powerful emotion that can lead people to do extreme and dangerous things. Hence, it was strongly suggested that individuals should experience love in a moderate way.

Rational marriage, on the other hand, refers to choices where the heart is balanced with the mind. For a rational choice of a marriage, authors advocated selecting partners with proper economic, social, and cultural status. Regardless of whether the marriage was built on match-making or flirting, it was considered that the best marriages came out of those formed between spouses coming from similar, if not the same backgrounds. The *Hayat* marriage stories have implicitly stressed that same-class marriages tend to be happy unions. The marriage between the suitables was blessed since it had the potential to contribute to the country's well-being because the couple would raise both psychologically and physically balanced children. Second, the writers also encouraged young people to look for affection and respect in marriage instead of love. It was frequently repeated

eseridir. Şurası bir hakikattir ki, medeni kanunun hemen hiçbir maddesi, köyde tatbik kabiliyetini haiz değildir. Eski kanun ve eski ananeler, yaşamakta ve canlı kaideler halinde ayakta durmaktadır."

- 164 Peyami Safa, "Cinsi Terbiye," Seksoloji, 26 (1951).
- Helen Branson, "Evlilikte Yaş Farkı," Seksoloji, 27 (1951), 8.
- 166 "Eş Bulma Anketi," Hayat, 41 (19.07.1957), 26-27.
- "Aşk ve cinsiyet meseleleri," *Seksoloji*, 27 (1951), 9. "Bunun içindir ki çocukların evlilik hayatında mesut veya bedbaht olmaları, ana ve babalarının mesut bir izdivaç hayatı geçirmiş olup olmadıklarına çok yakından bağlıdır."

Blank, *Bekaretin El Değmemiş Tarihi*, 179. Pınar İlkkaracan, "Türkiye'nin Doğu Bölgelerinde Kadın Cinselliği Bağlamının İncelenmesi," in *Müslüman Toplumlarda Kadın ve Cinsellik*, ed. Pınar İlkkaracan (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003), 143.

that love comes to an end at one point. Yet, affection and respect remain between spouses until death. Although love was quite popular during the era, the irrational and uncontrollable features of love made it not only dangerous. But also, there was no room for love in the civilized picture of marriage.

While the common patterns of marriage were changing, the adoption of the transformation process took time. Starting from using the joint spaces to build proper relations between a woman and a man, the transformation process has brought new questions and discussions regarding proper womanhood. Young people are asked to select carefully within a balance between rational thought and emotional involvement to enjoy their marriages and avoid divorces. Thus, they were encouraged to meet and get to know their partners. In this narrative, young people were recognized as agents of their own lives who can choose. However, they were constantly warned to form their choices with the help of rational thought and not to fall for their emotions. Although the agency of young people to choose their proper partners was supported in the articles, the writers carried the fear of extensive freedom. Therefore, young people, especially women, were constantly warned against the dangers of this unregulated and uncontrolled process, which could end with unwelcome results. In other words, young women were held responsible for their honor when the honor of young women was transferred from their fathers to themselves. They were asked to behave as expected for the well-being of themselves, their families, and their society.

The articles about marriages often aimed to define the characteristics of "good marriages", from selecting the *right* mates to behaving *properly* according to their roles. Although marriage was narrated as a private bond between two individuals, the characteristics of a "good marriage" appeared frequently in the written media. The "good marriage" image was

168

Prof. Dr. İhsan Şükrü Aksel, "Ailenin Sağlığı: Evde sinir muvazenesi," *Aile* 1, 2 (1947), 30. "...nihayet karı koca arasında zamanla doğan ve kuvvetlenen canyoldaşlığı, arkadaşlık sevgisi almış bulunmaktadır." Nükhet Sirman, "The Making of Familial Citizenship in Turkey," in *Challenges to citizenship in a globalizing world: european questions and turkish experiences*, ed. Fuat Keyman and Ahmet İçduygu (London: Routledge, 2005), 254-255.

strengthened by popular and *scientific* advice.<sup>169</sup> In addition to articles, quizzes and checklists were shared with the readers to compare their marriages and assess whether they are happy in their married lives.<sup>170</sup> These articles, quizzes, and checklists aimed to guide their readers to the path of "happy and good marriage." The value of marriage was, mainly, determined by the quality of the relationship between the spouses. Harmony between the spouses was regarded as the most important component of a good marriage.

Harmony among the spouses was linked to several factors. The main factors for harmony were related to the attitudes and behaviors of the spouses. While the writers favored and promoted certain spouse behaviors, others were criticized and described as detrimental to a harmonious and happy marriage. Jealousy, lack of respect, negative criticism, lack of appreciation and personal care were primarily listed as the determining variables. Favored behaviors for a harmonious and happy marriage were narrated in the articles with exemplary cases, which were taken sometimes from the lives of famous foreign people like American artists and sometimes from fictive stories. Take to the attitudes and behaviors of the attitudes and behaviors of the attitudes and behaviors of the spouse behaviors, and happy marriage were narrated in the articles with exemplary cases, which were taken sometimes from the lives of famous foreign people like American artists.

Another factor, which can destroy or enhance marriage life, was related to sexual harmony among the spouses. In a translated article, Clifford R. Adams suggested that one of the important reasons for marital struggles lay in sexual struggles. He claimed that sexual harmony should be seen as a

Popular texts on "good marriage" were mostly published as short stories in the magazines such as in Hayat, Aile and Seksoloji, or as series (*tefrika*) in the newspapers such as *Demokrasi Güllesi* (Roses of Democracy) by Bedii Faik in *Milliyet* or *Aşk Esirleri* (Captives of Love) by Tarık Buğra. For the series of Tarık Buğra's *Aşk Esirleri*, see October 1950, *Milliyet*. For Bedii Faik's *Demokrasi Gülleri*, see May 1950, *Milliyet*.

<sup>170 &</sup>quot;Evlenmeye hazır mısınız?" *Seksoloji*, 42 (1952), 36-38.

Andre Maurois, "Evliliğin Temeli İyi Hareketlerdir," Seksoloji, 25 (1951), 6-8.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Karılarını niçin severler?" Seksoloji, 25 (1951), 25-27. This is an article which collected ideas and comments about "why they do love their wives?" from the American famous male artists such as Bob Hope, Van Heflin, Fred Astaire, Tyrone Power, Gary Cooper, James Stewart, Donald O'Connor, Robert Taylor, Bing Crosby, Alan Ladd, Edie Cantor, Victor Mature and Gregory Peck.

<sup>173</sup> For the discussion about the fictive stories, see chapter 3.

necessity for preserving marriage even though it is not sufficient.<sup>174</sup> In the articles, equality among spouses was presented as a desirable aspect to embrace necessities of the modern era.<sup>175</sup> Husband and wife were expected to encounter the problems and obstacles of modern life "shoulder to shoulder." On the one hand, writers advocated sharing the burden in a marital relationship. On the other hand, they underlined the importance of roles that were assigned to a wife and husband in a marriage. While the values and norms for women's roles were shifting, writers of the period struggled to define the limits of women's liberties in marriage. Therefore, they suggested a moderate balance regarding the liberties of women and fulfillment of their roles as "good mothers and wives."

Women were asked to follow their roles, which were defined by nature or tradition. Women were asked to act in moderation, which was frequently used as a concept for subjects such as democracy or sexuality in public discourse. However, women were also asked to adopt the modern ways of marriage and life. Women were encouraged to balance their behavior and avoid extremes, either falling into eastern or western ways. A "happy and good marriage" was represented as a combination of a modern lifestyle and traditional values. While marriage was stated as the ultimate goal for young people in their adult lives, having children was presented as the complementary aspect of marriage. Having children was stated as a way to achieve a happy marriage. In the "How did they marry?" series, a couple from İzmir expressed "Now we are very happy. We are sure that the baby we are expecting will reinforce our happiness." Another reader, Şükrü Ateşli, stated that after seven years of marriage "... we can honestly confess

174 Clifford R. Adams, "Niçin Kavga ediyoruz?" Seksoloji, 22 (1951), 50.

Dr. James F. Bender, "Evlilik Bahislerinde Çok Bilen Az Yanılır," *Aile* 2, 8 (1949), 47. "Karı koca arasındaki tahsil seviyesi farkı, saadete engel olur mu? Evet..."

Bülent Davran, "Münevver Türk genci, hayat arkadaşını seçerken nasıl zorluklarla karşılaşıyor?" *Seksoloji* 25, (1951), 1.

Fatma Berrin Okur gave the example of the *Hayat* magazine. Şevket Rado, in *Hayat*, emphasizes the importance of the modern lifestyle and traditional values. Okur, "Conspicuous Consumption in Turkey," 24.

<sup>178 &</sup>quot;Şimdi çok mesuduz. Gelmesini beklediğimiz yavrunun saadetimizi daha da perçinleyeceğine eminiz." *Hayat*, 45, 16.08.1957, 26. Quoted from Okur, "Conspicuous Consumption in Turkey," 38.

to each other that we started to love each other after the birth of our child." <sup>179</sup>

Another concern regarding harmonious marriages was related to the age difference between the spouses. The writers expressed their opinions on how much age difference a marriage can tolerate to become a harmonious and durable marriage. Although the discussion centered around "being at the proper ages," most of the writers did not define a particular age difference. Some writers defended the idea that men should be older than women. They contended that men will mature and settle later in terms of economic circumstances, the male mind, and life experiences. The writers added that the reproductive reasons for women's childbearing age ended earlier than men's reproductive functions. He "late maturity of men" turned into a reason for legitimizing the age difference between men and women. In fact, this age difference also helped men (husbands) to incorporate their hierarchical position into the marriage due to their economic, educational, and experience accumulation.

Another condition for a good marriage was based on the privacy of the marriage. "The privacy of the marriage" refered to keeping the relationship between the spouses private. The relationship between wife and husband was defined as private, sacred, and intimate. Hence, any third party intrusion was seen as inappropriate and dangerous for the sake of the marriage. Friends and neighbors were represented as the third party actors - besides the extended family - who could intervene in marital relations. Some husbands complained about the (potential) tempting attempts and/or efforts of friends and neighbors. In one of the reader's letters, the husband claims that his ex-wife was influenced by their neighbor, who she was very fond of

<sup>&</sup>quot;...Şimdi, birbirimize, «Ben seni çocuk doğduktan sonra sevmeğe başladım» diye samimi olarak itirafta bulunabiliyoruz." *Hayat*, 50, 20.09.1957, 27. Quoted from Okur, "Conspicuous Consumption in Turkey," 38.

Duben and Behar stated that "age in marriage and for marriage" was a discussion as early as 1910s. Duben and Behar, *İstanbul Haneleri*, 235.

<sup>181</sup> Hans Ohl, "Hangi Yaşta Evlenmeli?" Seksoloji 42 (1952), 41-43.

Andre Maurois, "Evliliğin Temeli İyi Hareketlerdir," *Seksoloji*, 25 (1951), 6-8. Herbert Willoughby, "Niçin Mesut Olamazlar?" *Seksoloji*, 42 (1952), 31.

and started fights that ended the marriage.<sup>183</sup> Obviously, husbands (men) were quite aware of the women's network. The women's network, which consisted of their neighbors (friends) and families, provided a communication and safety net for women. This circle enables opportunities for women to connect with different resources which were not limited within the boundaries of their husbands.

Mothers-in-law were seen as a constant intrusive force to mingle in "family" relations. In *Hayat* magazine, a male reader stated in his letter that his marriage had ended due to the bad influence of his mother-in-law. He asked the readers of the magazine to prevent their mothers-in-laws from visiting their homes frequently if she had ill thoughts. Another "bad" effect of the mother-in-law was nearly caused by the mother-in-law's ill treatment of the wife. He stated that he saved his marriage by separating the house with the intervention of his friends. As Okur mentioned, in order to have a "good marriage," living in a separate house—in a separate space—was stated as solid advice. This particular advice was also parallel to the "nuclear family" imagination, which was highly promoted during the 1950s. The ideal nuclear family was described as a household isolated from outside actors and controlled by the husband.

Socioeconomic status had become the deciding factor in successful marriages. In the *Hayat* survey, it was stated that the majority of marriages happened between men and women of the same social status. Moreover, readers also displayed their concerns regarding the inequality among the spouses and/or spouses-to-be to have good and harmonious marriages. The writers listed the disadvantageous aspects of a marriage that occurred among spouses coming from very different backgrounds. Writers said that young people should marry their "equivalents" in order to keep their

<sup>183 &</sup>quot;Bu kız komşulara çok düşkündü. Onlar zamanla evde kavga çıkarıyorlardı. O kadar ileri gitti ki neticede evi terkedip İstanbul'a gitti ve ayrıldık." Hayat, 57, 08.10.1957, 26.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Kayınvalidenizin huyuna göre hareket edin. Yanlış düşünceli ise sık sık evinize gelmesine mani olun." *Hayat*, 47, 30.08.1957, 27.

<sup>185</sup> *Hayat*, 53, 11.10.1957, 27.

Okur, "Conspicuous Consumption in Turkey," 31, 41.

One of the earliest versions is *Aşk-ı Memnu* and its main character, *Bihter*. Sancar, *Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti*, 130.

marriages happy and raise healthy children. While the mobility of the whole population was increasing, the relations between different classes were changing, and governing attempts to regulate new mobility were increasing.

#### 3.4. Divorce as a possible, but un-wanted practice

The "good marriage" was often described and discussed with its opposite situation, which was terminating the marriage by the will of one and/or both parties, *the divorce*. Divorce, as a part of the marriage act, was regulated from article 129 to article 150 in the Civil Code. In the articles, the reasons for divorce, the divorce process, and post-divorce claims such as alimony and custody of the children were regulated. Even though divorce was regulated in the legislation and recognized as a right for citizens, it was presented as a situation where people should avoid to protect and ensure their individual and social well-being. Divorce as a social concern was not a new subject for the 1950s. In the magazines, articles and novels of the 1930s, divorce was narrated as a disaster for the wellbeing of individuals and society, which had destructive consequences. In the 1950s, this narrative was in continuum and became a vital concern for the monitoring generation (*denetleyici kuşak*). Public figures were emphasizing the increasing number of marital breakdowns in the 1950s.

In an interview, one of the most well-known divorce lawyers of the time said that the number of divorces was increasing. <sup>190</sup> Even the perception that divorce cases were increasing prompted writers to title "divorce pandemic," <sup>191</sup> "divorce disaster" or "divorce/marriage crisis." <sup>192</sup> Divorce was also announced as an *earth-shattering* social problem. <sup>193</sup> According to

Turkish Civil Code. http://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/MevzuatMetin/5.3.743.pdf

<sup>189</sup> Işıklar Koçak, "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality," 14. Yurttagüler, "Social Policies on Female Body in the 1930s in Turkey."

<sup>190</sup> Cantek, Cumhuriyetin Büluğ Çağı, 83, 93

<sup>191 &</sup>quot;Boşanma Salgını," Seksoloji, 29, (1950), 22.

<sup>192</sup> Ferit H. Saymen, "Dünyada ve Türkiyede Evlilik Buhranı," *Seksoloji*, 16 (1950), 21-23. Ferit H. Saymen, "Evlilik Buhranı," *Seksoloji*, 17 (1950), 10. Ferit H. Saymen, "Evlilik Buhranı," *Seksoloji*, 18 (1950), 28.

<sup>193 &</sup>quot;Karı-koca anlaşmazlıkları ve bunu önleyecek çareler," *Milliyet*, 06.11.1951.

Ömer Türkeş, family was seen as an institution which kept the values of society. Therefore, the dissolution of families was associated with the emergence of moral problems such as losing ties with tradition and social decline and was named as a disaster.<sup>194</sup>

In Büyük Doğu, family was seen as one of the fundamental elements of society. Hence, divorce was considered as one of the main detrimental possibilities against the family and also society. Although the relationship between spouses was considered as a private subject that was confined to the private sphere, divorce was presented as a social crisis. Preventing divorces and preserving marriages (families) had become both the prerequisite and goal for the protection of society. The discourse which encouraged the couples to remain together was not exclusive to Turkey. However, in other countries such as the United Kingdom, France, and the United States, decision makers used policies, laws, and even discourses to keep spouses together by discouraging divorce. 196

According to Türker Alkan, the divorce rate increased slightly between 1951 and 1960. In 1944, the divorce rate was 3.2 per ten thousand, whereas it increased to 4.5 in 1956 and, again, decreased to around 4 in 1960. Karçal and Uraz prepared a series on marriage patterns for *Seksoloji* in 1953. They gave the numbers of marriages and divorces in ten different

Ömer Türkeş, "Muhafazakar Romanlarda Muhafaza Edilen Neydi?" in *Modern Türkiye'de Siyasi Düşünce: Muhafazarkarlık*, ed. Ahmet Çiğdem (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003). Ömer Türkeş gave Tarık Buğra's Küçük Ağa (1964) and Samet Ağaoğlu's novel for big family. There were rare writers who were more confident about the stability and sağlamlığı of the family. Şekip Tunç argued that families were trying to keep up with the necessities of the era. In the process, some people may fail and make mistakes. However, since family continued due to the law of life (hayat kanunu), the dissolvement of famiy is impossible. Şekip Tunç, "Cinsî olgunluğun evlilikteki kıymeti" *Seksoloji*, 11 (1950), 2-3.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Dünyamızda, aile müessesi, hiçbir devirde, bu derece azim bir sarsıntıya maruz kalmamıştır." Reşat Feyzi Yüzüncü, "Aile Müessesi," *Büyük Doğu*, 02.04.1948, 3.

<sup>196</sup> See for Britain as an example, Porter and Hall, *The Facts of Life*, 265.

Türker Alkan, *Kadın Erkek Eşitsizliği Sorunu* (Ankara: A.Ü. SBF Yayınları, 1981), 95-100. According to the 1950 census, the population over 15 years old was 12.923.709. Among them, the married ones were 8,708,585, while divorcees were 98.785. *Türkiye Nüfusu: 22 Ekim 1950, Genel Nüfus Sayımı, Publication no: 410*, (İstanbul: T.C. Başbakanlık İstatistik Genel Müdürlüğü, 1961), 101.

cities along with the total numbers for Turkey. They stated that the divorces were increased 10% compared to marriages. They also had 3% of married individuals who were living separately, though not divorced. According to their calculation, every 13 marriages out of 100 ended in divorce in 1953. Although the divorce tendency and rates in Turkey were pretty low compared to rich countries, it increased from 11 divorces in 1939 to 16 in 1950. They invited sociologists and, also, sexologists to attend the subject due to the regular and increase of 0.4% in divorce rates annually. 198

Official marriage (*resmi nikah*) could be actualized by the municipality (mayor or an officer assigned by the mayor), <sup>199</sup> which was a symbol of public recognition. However, the end of a marriage could only be decided by a judge. According to Article 138, a judge is the only legal person to decide on the continuation or termination of a marriage in the name of the Turkish Republic. <sup>200</sup> In an article translated from *Figaro Litteraire*, Andre Maurois, a French author, urged the state to make divorce more difficult. According to Maurois, the state could ease the cases where divorce was necessary while it could prevent abrupt divorce requests by prolonging them. <sup>201</sup> The Turkish Civil Law was already developed in parallel to this proposition. According to Article 138, the judge can decide on marital

<sup>198</sup> Selçuk Karçal ve Kayıhan Uraz "Türkiye'de cinsiyet meselesi XII: Boşanmalar," *Seksoloji*, 47 (1953): 46 – 47. Saymen also gave the same numbers of divorces in Turkey and additionally divorce numbers in different countries such as USA, Germany, France, Sweden in which divorce numbers were also increasing. Ferit Saymen, "Dünyada ve Türkiyede Evlilik Buhranı," *Seksoloji*, 16 (1950), 22.

Article 97 - This decision is announced when the man and woman who will marry each other declare their marriage decision to the mayor or his deputy in the municipal office, which is assigned by the chief, and to the council of elders in the villages.

Article 138 - When one of the reasons of divorce will be determined, the judge will be in control whether to separate the couple or to divorce them or keep them together. Turkish Civil Code, http://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/MevzuatMetin/5.3.743.pdf (29.04.2019)

<sup>201 &</sup>quot;Karı koca anlaşmazlıkları ve bunu önleyecek çareler," *Milliyet*, 06.11.1951. "Mesela boşanmayı güçleştirebilir. Bunların yanında hiç şüphe yok ki, boşanmanın son derece lüzumlu olduğu haller mevcuttur. İşte devletin vazifesi, bu gibi boşanmaları kolaylaştırmak ve ani olarak düşünmeden kararlaştırılan geçici boşanma taleplerini muamelesini mümkün mertebe uzatarak, bu gibi hiçten boşanmalara engel olmaktır."

separation without actualizing judicial separation.<sup>202</sup> The civil code enabled divorce in the cases where adultery (Article 129), attempt on life and ill treatment (Article 130), offense and dishonor (Article 131), abandonments (Article 132), mental disease (Article 133) and breakdown of marriage or inability to form a joint life (Article 134).<sup>203</sup>

"Irretrievable breakdown" was the most frequent reason for divorce. In a survey where 187 divorced women answered the question, "Why did they want to divorce?", 165 women applied to court for divorce with the reason of "irreconcilable differences." 204 According to Article 134, if the marriage union is shaken at its foundation, which prevents the spouses from continuing a joint life, then each of the spouses can file a lawsuit. 205 The approach of the law was based on protecting the well-being of the child and public morals through keeping the family together. Hence, if the judge decided to divorce the spouses, then the reason behind the verdict was not to ensure their wills. Rather, it aimed to protect the value of marriage for society since, in a *shaken* marriage, neither the well-being of the children nor the values of marriage could be protected. According to Article 134, the judge can decide to divorce the spouses when there will be no benefits worth protection for the children and the complainant in the continuum of marriage.<sup>206</sup> Divorce could be based on mutual consent of the parties with the main reason of "irreconcilable differences." <sup>207</sup> If mutual consent was not reached, then the divorce law interpreted one party as innocent and the other as guilty. 208 The classification of innocent and guilty could be followed

Article 138 - In the divorce case, if there is a possibility that the husband and wife can reconcile, separation can be ruled.

<sup>203</sup> Turkish Civil Code, http://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/MevzuatMetin/5.3.743.pdf

<sup>204</sup> Turhan Aytul, Türkiye'de Cinsiyet Problemi (İstanbul: Varlık Yayınevi, 1964), 145.

Article 134 - If the marital union is shaken to such an extent that it is not expected of the spouses to continue a joint life, each of the spouses can file a divorce case.

Article 134 - If it is not worthy in the continuation of the marriage union for the benefit of the defendant and the children, a divorce may be decided.

<sup>207</sup> Porter and Hall, *The Facts of Life*, 241. Porter stated that the mutual consent for divorce was accepted as a right for women in England in 1923 after a long struggle.

May, *Homeward Bound*, 45. May gave the example of the USA starting with the 1930s. Roy Porter also gave the England for the beginning of the 20th century for the innocent and guilty classification. Porter and Hall, *The Facts of Life*, 240.

clearly in the articles which regulated compensation when marriage ended in divorce. According to Article 143, the spouse without a fault<sup>209</sup> has the right to ask for pecuniary and non-pecuniary compensation from the one with a fault. <sup>210</sup> The judge decides that one party of the spouses is at fault in terminating (not-maintaining the marriage) the marriage in the name of society and in the name of the state.

Among the reasons for divorce, Karçal and Uraz set adultery as the fastest reason for divorce. In the Civil Code, it was set as the forthcoming reason for divorce. According to article 129, the spouses (husband and/or wife) could file charges against the other spouse if one of the spouses committed adultery. If the spouse forgave the other, then, the file would not be heard. Karçal and Uraz stated that divorces increased from 3863 in 1939 to 6816 in 1948, where adultery was the main reason for 810 divorces in 1939 to 1829 divorces in 1948. According to Aytul's edition, 69 women out of 187 divorcee women wanted to divorce due to adultery, even though only 11 women filed their complaints due to adultery.

The main reason and, also, the outcome of adultery were seen as the distortion in the family's and society's moral values.<sup>214</sup> Another reason was a breakdown in the marriage's harmony between the spouses. An article

<sup>209</sup> According to Turkish Criminal Law, there is a difference between fault and crime.

Article 143 - A blameless wife or husband whose existing interest is damaged by divorce is entitled to a claim for appropriate financial compensation from the offending party. In addition, if the events that caused the divorce seriously harmed the personal interests of the innocent wife or husband, the judge may even order a certain amount of compensation for non-pecuniary damages.

<sup>211</sup> Selçuk Karçal and Kayıhan Uraz, "Türkiye'de cinsiyet meselesi XII: Boşanmalar," Seksoloji, 47 (1953), 45.

Adultery: Article 129 - Each of the spouses (husband and wife) can file for divorce because the other has committed adultery. The divorce case becomes invalid after six months from the day on which the husband or wife, who has the right to sue, becomes aware of the reason for the divorce, and in any case, five years from the date of the adultery. In case of amnesty (forgiving), the lawsuit is not valid.

<sup>213</sup> Selçuk Karçal and Kayıhan Uraz, "Türkiye'de cinsiyet meselesi XII: Boşanmalar," Seksoloji 47 (1953), 45.

İrfan Emin "Niçin boşanıyorlar? Ata Tokgöz ile söyleşi," *Seksoloji*, 52 (1953), 12. Ferit Saymen, "Kanun karşısında kadın ve erkeğin zinası," *Seksoloji*, 11 (1950), 7. "zira ailenin dağılması cemiyeti zaafa düşürür ..."

based on Kinsey's research stated that spouses lose the harmony in their marriages due to a lack of respect and/or affection for each other. Hence, they would, eventually, search for affection and love in other people.<sup>215</sup>

According to Uraz and Karçal, 1365 cases were female adultory cases among the 1829 cases of adultory, whereas 464 cases were for male adultory, which were set as the reason for divorce in 1948.<sup>216</sup> Surely, it could not be concluded that married men experienced less out-of-marriage sexuality compared to women during the period. However, men's out-ofmarriage sexuality was most likely ignored while women's adultery became a reason to terminate marriages.<sup>217</sup> In parallel to this perception, the laws in Turkey also approach adulterous parties differently. Although marriage loyalty was defined equally for husband and wife, the Criminal Law defined different sentences for adultery for men and women. Based on the Civil Law, the equality principle gave the right for both parties to ask for a divorce if one of the spouses cheated on the other. However, the conditions of adultery were determined differently for men and women in the Criminal Law, which were supposed to be equal based on their citizenship status. The Criminal Law turned adultery into a criminal act. According to the Criminal Law, sexual intercourse should have been actualized in order to define an act as adulterous. The activities of kissing, petting, lesbianism (sevicilik), and anal sexual activity were not viewed as grounds for punishment.

Article 440 of the Criminal Law considers a woman's one-time sexual activity with a man other than her husband to be an adulterous act. The penalty for the wife and the other man was determined to be between three months and thirty months imprisonment if the other man was aware of the marital status of the woman. The conditions for the penalty were different for a husband than for a wife. According to the Criminal Law Article 441, a husband should have continuous sexual activity with another woman to be considered an adulterous act. The husband should live with a woman other than his wife in a separate and publicly known house or in the

215 "Kadınlar ve erkekler niçin ihanet eder?" *Milliyet*, 17.05.1961.

<sup>216</sup> Selçuk Karçal and Kayıhan Uraz, "Türkiye'de Cinsiyet Meselesi XII: Boşanmalar," *Seksoloji*, 47 (1953), 45.

<sup>217</sup> Marcelle Segal, "Aldatılan Bir Kadının İtirafları," trans. Orhan Karavel, *Seksoloji Yıllığı*, 1 (1952), 26-33.

house that he shared with his wife. The penalty for the husband and the other woman was determined to be between three months and thirty months imprisonment, if the other woman was aware of the marital status of the man.<sup>218</sup>

Different legal treatment of men and women in the case of adultery was justified by distinguishing individual and social consequences. On the individual level, Saymen<sup>219</sup> claimed women's adultery acts have more severe consequences on men compared to vice versa. Saymen argued that if a woman cheated on her husband, the husband would be ridiculed, mocked by the public, and his honor and reputation would be shaken. However, if a husband cheated on his wife, people would show her affection, mercy, and pity.<sup>220</sup> Even for a law professor, who was defending equality among the spouses in the same text, a man's honor and reputation were given more importance than a woman's dignity. On the social level, the adultery of a woman was narrated by Saymen as an act which shook the fundamentals of family institution. He stated that a woman may bring another man's child (strange child) to the family.<sup>221</sup> Also, the punishment for murdering a wife due to her adulterous relationship was lessened for the husband with Article 462 since the husband's actions were considered an act to protect the "family's honor and dignity."222 These differences and exceptions were closely related to the perception of women's sexuality, her reproductive function and her motherhood role. The law related to adultery was formed with a male mind, which normalized the flings of men while scandalizing

Ferit Saymen, "Kanun karşısında kadın ve erkeğin zinası," Seksoloji, 11 (1950), 6.

Ferit Hakkı Saymen was a law professor in Istanbul University, who started his career as an assistant in the same university in 1934. He specialized first in Civil Law. He was in charge of the Civil Law department starting 1952. Besides he prepared the "Türk Hukuk Kroniği Mecmuaları" and "Türk Hukuk Kroniği" between 1942 and 1960 which was the only law bibliography of the period. He wrote in Seksoloji periodically and prepared articles about civil law such as marriage, adultery, age for marrige. See: Ferit Hakkı Saymen, Türk Medeni Hukuku, Umumi Prensipler I (Istanbul: Kenan Matbaası, 1948).

<sup>&</sup>quot;… umumi efkar tarafından rahim ve şefkatle karşılanır, ona acınır" Ferit Saymen, "Kanun karşısında kadın ve erkeğin zinası," *Seksoloji*, 11 (1950), 7.

Ferit Saymen, "Kanun karşısında kadın ve erkeğin zinası," *Seksoloji*, 11 (1950), 7.

Ece Göztepe, ""Namus Cinayetlerinin" Hukuki Boyutu: Yeni Türk Ceza Kanunu'nun Bir Değerlendirmesi," *Türkiye Barolar Birliği Dergisi Dergisi*, 59 (2005), 35.

women's extramarital sexual relations. In other words, adultery was structured as a gendered crime.<sup>223</sup> The importance given to adultery also pointed the intricated position of sexuality in marriage. Ironically, marriage, an institution in which sexuality was tried to be contained, was threatened, again, by sexuality itself.

In an article entitled "Kadınlar niçin boşanıyorlar?" (Why do women divorce?), the writer stated some of the reasons for divorce. According to the writer, women asked for divorce due to the disloyality of their husbands and to their inappropriate sexual demands.<sup>224</sup> In another article, the dysfunction in sexual life was another strong reason for divorce, as discussed in the "Why do we need sexual manners?" section. The impotence of men and infertility of women were also listed as divorce reasons, which were closely related to the reproductive practices of the spouses. Last but not least, sexuality, virginity, was an issue, which caused the termination of marriages. However, in the case of virginity, annihilation of marriages was more common.

Another reason for divorce was related to the duties of the spouses. The women complained about the inability or insufficiency of their husbands as breadwinners.<sup>225</sup> Also, some of the women stated that their work and efforts at home were invisible in the eyes of their husbands. Hence, they wanted to get rid of their maid work at home and achieve their freedom.<sup>226</sup> One of the forthcoming reasons was about the insufficiency of women in taking care of their homes either due to their lack of skills or due to their laziness. Another husband stated that he wanted to divorce because he could not afford the never-ending demands and extravagance of his wife.<sup>227</sup> In an article, which was translated from English (or presented as translated from English), the writer answered the question of "why men cheat on their wives?" She stated that while wives do not dress up after marriage, other women smarten up to

<sup>223</sup> Cintia Kozonoi Vezzani, *Prohibited Pleasures: Female Literacy, Sex and Adultery in Turn-of-the-Century Brazilian Fiction* (Ph.D. Dissertation, Northwestern University, 2021), 15.

<sup>224</sup> Samuel G. Kling, "Kadınlar niçin boşanıyorlar," Seksoloji, 7 (1949), 27.

Herbert Willoughby, "Niçin Mesut Olamazlar?" Seksoloji, 42 (1952), 30.

<sup>226</sup> Samuel G. Kling, "Kadınlar niçin boşanıyorlar," *Seksoloji*, 7 (1949), 29. "... evdeki çekilmez hizmetçilik vaziyetinden kurtulup hürriyetine kavuşmalarıdır."

<sup>227</sup> Cantek, Cumhuriyetin Büluğ Çağı, 83.

attract men's attention.<sup>228</sup> In another article translated from the *Women* magazine, wife was obliged to be careful "about her clothes, smiling face, her words in order to be pretty and attractive all the time." The writer stated that, otherwise, the husband may go to another woman at any time.<sup>229</sup>

In parallel to the narrative of "harmonious marriage," the behaviors and attitudes of the spouses were held responsible for a divorce. Ferit Saymen claimed that spouses, who were supposed to be part of the marriage union, believed more in their own personalities and did not accept the idea of "melting in a family." Therefore as soon as the family could not respond their needs, they escaped from family and sought for other experiences. Samuel G. Kling stated that women wanted to reach their freedom and therefore they wanted to divorce. Irfan Emin stated that intolerant women and irresponsible men were the reasons for divorce. Last but not least, bad habits such as alcohol and gambling were more commonly discussed reasons where the divorce request was made by women.

Aile prepared a "question and answer" column for legal issues, "Ailenin Avukatı." One of the questions from Mrs. F.Ö., from Fatih asked the magazine whether his nightly drinking husband could be a reason for

Jules Archer, "Erkekler karılarını neden aldatırlar?" Seksoloji, 27 (1951), 44-48,

<sup>&</sup>quot;Kocanızı karşılamayı biliyor musunuz?" *Seksoloji*, 9 (1949), 65-66. "bir zevce tıpkı bir sevgili gibi giyimine, kuşamına ve bu arada güler yüzüne ve sözlerine dikkat etmelidir. Her zaman cazip ve çekici olmalıdır."

Ferit Saymen, "Dünyada ve Türkiye'de Evlilik Buhranı," *Seksoloji*, 16, (1950), 22. ".... Evlilik birliğini teşkil eden eşlerden her biri kendi şahsiyetlerine inanmışlar, bağlanmışlardır ve bunun aile içerisinde eriyip kaynaşmasına bir türlü razı olmamışlardır; bilakis bu şahsiyetleri evlilik içerisinde tatmin edildikçe, gelişme ve kökleşme imkanlarını buldukça evliliğe riayet etmişlerdir. Aile çemberi bu ihtiyaçları karşılayamaz bir vaziyet arzedince eşlerden birisi veya her ikisi, savuşarak başka tecrübelere atılmak iştiyakı ile bu çemberi kırmaktan çekinmemektedir."

Samuel G. Kling, "Kadınlar niçin boşanıyorlar," *Seksoloji*, 7 (1949), 26. "bir çok genç, ihtiyar, zengin, fakir, çocuklu, çocuksuz, ve yirmi seneden fazla evli bulunan veyahut henüz izdivaç etmiş olup ta boşanmak isteyen bir çok kadınlarla konuştum. Hepsinin de müşterek bir derdi vardı. O da hürriyetlerine kavuşmak idi."

İrfan Emin "Niçin boşanıyorlar? Ata Tokgöz ile söyleşi" *Seksoloji*, 52 (1953): 12. "Bunun nedeni, aile ahlakının bozulması, vicdanların sarsılması, kadınların tahammülsüz erkeklerin ise sorumsuz hale gelmeleridir."

divorce.<sup>233</sup> The editorial team answered: "Luckily, no." Same answer adviced Mrs. F.Ö. to avoid divorce at all costs to protect her children and her family. Mrs. F.Ö. was warned about taking the risk of divorce. The editorial team tried to persuade Mrs. F.Ö. to abandon the idea of divorcing.<sup>234</sup> May assessed similar developments in the USA during the 1950s as an attempt to escape from their depressive or oppresseive marriages and emancipate with divorce. However, they may experience economic difficulties, even poverty, loneliness, difficulties in caring for their children, and the exhausting life of a single parent.<sup>235</sup> Another reason for convincing women was related to their status in society. Milliyet claimed that women who wanted to divorce or were already divorced were not welcome by society and, also, were considered them as lacking moral values. Even Hollywood stars such as Shirley Temple fell from grace after she divorced her husband and was not proposed by the movie companies.<sup>236</sup>

Some writers even warned women about the risk of losing their virtue due to economic reasons.<sup>237</sup> Elaine Tyler May observed the same situation in USA during the 1950s and added that "those who divorced faced a powerful stigma that cast their personal virtue and even their status as mature adults into question."<sup>238</sup> This warning, in fact, contained the concerns about possible "emancipated" female sexuality. Since divorced women had already experienced sexuality and were no longer virgins, they could experience sexuality with their own will and seek for their own pleasure without considering *social* limitations.

Women were particularly addressed by the writers of the period about the divorce issue due to their assigned role in *good marriages*. The proper and desirable woman was described with her proper domestic and individual skills at home as a "good wife" and a "good mother." Some of the writers even claimed that women could prevent divorce if they fulfilled their duties

<sup>233 &</sup>quot;Ailenin Avukatı," Aile 2, 5 (1948), 61.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Ailenin Avukatı," Aile 2, 5 (1948), 61. "Bereket versin ki etmez."

<sup>235</sup> May, Homeward Bound, 213.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Sinema," *Milliyet*, 07.05.1950. "... bilhassa kocasından ayrıldıktan sonra halkın gözünden çok düşmüş ve şirketler tarafından fazla aranmamaya başlamıştır.

<sup>237</sup> Sancar, Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti, 263.

<sup>238</sup> May, Homeward Bound.

properly.<sup>239</sup> Moreover, women whose marriages ended in divorce were narrated as selfish, irresponsible, and immature.<sup>240</sup> They were blamed for failing their roles as "good wives," their responsibilities and/or duties if divorce happened in their marriages. That would affect their "good mothers" role negatively since children would be forced to grow up in *broken families*. In other words, when a woman asked for a divorce, she openly rejected the assigned role for them. Moreover, "divorce contributed to the sense that women were not only wives and/or mothers but also independent persons."<sup>241</sup> This new perception may lead women to question their assigned roles, the division of labor in marriage and even the family institution.

Another reason for avoiding divorce was associated with the well-being of the children. The family has been identified as the most important influencer in raising children and shaping their identities in both popular and academic publications. In an academic article, Nephan Atav compared the effects of a "normal" family and an "irregular home" on the formation of the identities of children. The normal family was defined as a union of mother, father, and children that was necessary for the development of the normal identity. The irregular homes were the families where they could not provide care for the welfare of the children due to the breakup of the family union. Another academic, at a later date, claimed that divorce could cause negativity in raising healthy children since they would be lacking proper education (*terbiye*) due to the absence of one of the parents. Atav claimed

<sup>&</sup>quot;Boşanmanın 7 kapısı! Mesut veya Bedbaht olmak kendi elinizdedir," *Seksoloji*, 11 (1950), 10-16. The article was translated from Paris Match.

<sup>240</sup> May, *Homeward Bound*, 15. May also discussed the stigmatization of women due to their divorce choices. May, *Homeward Bound*, 193-194.

<sup>241</sup> Christina Simmons, *Making Marriage Modern: Women's Sexuality: from the Progressive Era to World War II*, (New York: Oxford University Press, 2009), 112.

Nephan Atav, "Şahsiyetin Gelişiminde Aile Çevresinin ve Ailedeki Gerginliklerin Etkileri," *Ankara Üniversitesi Siyasal Bilgiler Fakültesi Dergisi* 10, no. 4 (1955), 143-144. https://dergipark.org.tr/download/article-file/37815 (30.04.2019)

Birsen Gökçe, "Çocuk Kişiliğinin Gelişiminde Aile, Okul, ve Dış Çevrenin Rolü," *Sosyal Hizmetler Dergisi* 2, 2-3 (1966), 39-43. Birsen Gökçe, "Çocuk Kişiliğinin Gelişiminde Aile, Okul, ve Dış Çevrenin Rolü," in *Aile Yazıları 3: Birey, Kişilik ve Toplum*, ed. Beylü Dikeçligil and Ahmet Çiğdem (Ankara: T.C. Başbakanlık Aile Araştırma Kurumu Başkanlığı, 1991).

that children who were raised in irregular homes displayed mild and severe symptoms starting with stress, anxiety, low self-esteem, a decrease in school achievement, anti-social behaviors, even criminality among children<sup>244</sup> and identified them as "problem children" which was a term borrowed from American social psychology literature.<sup>245</sup> Erez pointed out that divorce cases were fewer among children of happily married parents compared to divorced ones. Additionally, Erez claimed that children would copy the behavior of their parents. Therefore, parents should remember that their behaviors would effect their children and strived to be good examples.<sup>246</sup> Similar suggestions and concerns have been raised for divorce cases in the United States. In the 1950s, May stated, parents were encouraged to set good examples for their children, stay together, and not divorce in order to keep the families together and continue with their proper roles.<sup>247</sup> The academics of the era considered that divorce had a negative impact on the present wellbeing of the child (the identity formation of the child), as well as her or his future happiness (their future happiness and marriage). According to them, the child should be raised in a normal family in order to have a healthy child and also to contribute to the happiness of society in the future.

Writers also proposed possible preventive measures to save marriages. First and foremost, specific articles were published in the newspapers, journals, and/or manuals about the reasons for the divorce, such as cheating<sup>248</sup> along with preventive measures to keep happy and healthy marriages. Vedat Nedim Tör mentioned courses on family relations given by sociologists and psychologists in American universities. The courses

<sup>244</sup> Atav, Şahsiyetin Gelişiminde Aile Çevresinin ve Ailedeki Gerginliklerin Etkileri, 145-147.

<sup>245</sup> Atav, Şahsiyetin Gelişiminde Aile Çevresinin ve Ailedeki Gerginliklerin Etkileri, 145-147.
May gave similar examples from the American publishing in which "disasterous effects" of divorce on children were discussed. May, Homeward Bound, 194.

Naşit Erez, "Sosyal ve biyolojik açıdan geçimsizlik: boşanma sebepleri," in *Türkiye'de Cinsiyet Problemi*, edited Turhan Aytul, (İstanbul: Varlık Yayınevi, 1964), 153. "... kızının evlendiği zaman mesut olmasını isteyen ana ve baba, bu bakımdan kendi davranışlarının çok etken olduğunu hatırlayarak, iyi bir misal teşkil etmeye çalışmalıdır. Çünkü, mesut ebeveynin çocukları arasında boşanma daha nadir olarak görülmektedir."

<sup>247</sup> May, Homeward Bound, 104.

<sup>248 &</sup>quot;Kadınlar Niçin İhanet Ederler?" (İstanbul: Hadise Publishing, 1956).

aimed to educate the students and to sustain family life.<sup>249</sup> Nezahat Nurettin Ege wrote instructive articles on marriage counseling centers along with the advice from doctors to prevent divorces.<sup>250</sup> Again, another article announced the opening of a marriage counseling center by a psychologist, Josef Zillner in Duisburg, Germany as a new development.<sup>251</sup> Zillner aimed to transform the center into a "marriage school" in the process.<sup>252</sup> In sum, the writers advocated that receiving training about marriage and/or self-education for marriage is a necessary step for happy and healthy marriages. Based on this flow of thought, if an individual can have the necessary knowledge, which will be provided by an expert – marriage counselor –, and if that person disciplines himself/herself accordingly, then he/she can build a happy and healthy marriage. Marriage was narrated as an institution that could be managed with proper knowledge. Hence, the spouses, mostly wives, who failed to learn and apply this knowledge were held responsible for the divorce.

In the narratives, having a good marriage was set as a goal and as a process for the individuals for their personal health and happiness and, also, for the well-being of society. In order to achieve this goal, the process was described in detail, starting from the goal of the marriage—such as having children—to the division of labor in the marriage. As a part of the "division of labor," the articles started the process by "selecting the proper spouse" and continued with giving advice about how to manage the marriage properly and efficiently. In continuum of the previous era, the 1930s, marriage and roles of the spouses were defined and narrated in relation to their reproductive and care roles. However, unlike the previous period, sexuality became a topic for the formation and continuation of marriage.

<sup>249</sup> Aile 3, 12 (1949), 9.

<sup>250</sup> Koçer, "Demokrat Parti Döneminde Kadın: 1950-1960 Arası Kadın Dergilerinde Kadın İmajı."

For the reference to marriage counselling centers, see, Prof. Dr. İhsan Şükrü Aksel, "Ailenin Sağlığı: Evde sinir muvazenesi," *Aile* 1, 2 (1947), 31. Marriage counseling centers in Germany, see: Atina Grossman, *Reforming Sex: The German Movement for Birth Control and Abortion Reform, 1920-1950* (New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995).

<sup>252 &</sup>quot;Evlilik mektebi," *Milliyet*, 18.09.1953.

Moreover, discussions regarding the "division of labor" covered role of the spouses related to their sexualities. Like the formation of the union, the dissolution of marriage, divorce, turned to a vital discussion topic. Divorce did not only become a concern due to the reproductive roles of the spouses or future of children. Divorce was identified as dissolution of a unity, which reserved sexuality under control.

4

,

### Conclusion

Sexual manners continued to appear in the pages of periodicals and marriage manuals throughout the 1950s and early 1960s. Writers of sexual manners produced texts about various issues, from the "art of love" to the "science of procreation." The beginning of the 1960s witnessed a noteworthy development about the discussions regarding the reproduction and consequently sexuality of individuals. The first Five-Year Development Plan, which was prepared by the State Planning Agency founded in 1960, emphasized the necessity of a birth control program and a shift to anti-natal policies for the well-being of the population and the development of the country. The Population Planning Law (PPL) was passed by the Assembly and the Senate, and was signed by the president in April 1965 under the Justice Party government. With the PPL, the Turkish government has started to practice anti-natal policies officially and actively, first time ever, since the establishment of the Republic. The PPL permitted the import and export of contraceptive devices and medicines. Hence, the Scientific Committee

under the Ministry of Health licensed oral contraceptives for sale and allowed the use of the IUD in 1965 and 1966. In the early days after the enactment of the law, a new plan was launched to achieve the goals set out in the First Five-Year Development Plan. The Ministry of Health prepared educational programs in collaboration with the Ministry of Education, Ministry of Defense, and Ministry of Rural Affairs and Agriculture, which named the programs "family planning." Family planning education covered subjects such as the mechanics of sexuality, conception, and contraception. Alongside with its content, the title of sexual manners was transformed to sexual knowledge (cinsel bilgiler). The road of sexual manners divided into two lanes. While family planning education overtook the normal, natural, and healthy parts of sexuality, illnesses and abnormalities were left in the field of sexual knowledge. Throughout the years, family planning education established its mainstream position in providing sexual knowledge, while sexual knowledge was relegated to the periphery in sexuality-related discussions.

This study has focused on the discursive and practical construction of sexual manners discourse in Turkey between the years 1945 and 1965, a period characterized by profound political, economic, and social transformations. In this study, I tried to display and examine the emergence of sexual manners' discussions, its contents, and its relational dynamics among the authors and its audience in the period when the sexuality of the citizens was considered invisible and muted in the public sphere. This study aimed to analyze the impact of the sexual manners on the formation of *new citizens* and on the governing practices of intimate relations.

In the 1930s, in Turkey, sexuality was an invisible subject except for fighting against venereal diseases and prohibiting contraception; those served to improve of the population's health and quantity. The concerns regarding the sexuality of individuals were limited to their reproductive capacities, which could be considered a process for the construction of reproductive citizenship. The social sciences literature emphasized the significance of reproduction and population policies in Turkey until the mid-1960s, when a shift regarding natal policies occurred. However, those studies mentioned the invisibility regarding the sexuality of the citizens.

As shown in the second chapter, right after the Second World War, sexuality became more visible in the popular press and public sphere. The visibility of sexuality has mobilized two discussions. On the one hand, opinion leaders, academics, and decision-makers started to discuss the naturalness of sexuality as a part of human life in Turkey and globally. On the other hand, the increasing visibility of sexuality has become a concern and has received important criticism among different circles. Hence, the visibility of sexuality went hand in hand with the emergence of cinsi terbiye (sexual manners) discourse in the public sphere in Turkey in the 1950s. Sexual manners discourse was presented as a response of the increasing public visibility of sexuality. Authors and publishers of sexual manners claimed the sexuality discussions. Furthermore, they discussed sexual matters in the popular media openly. Hence, my findings about the visibility of sexuality in the 1950s led me to question the views that placed emphasis on the invisibility of sexuality in the public sphere and the asexual identity of women in academic studies.

The sexual manners had similarities with the other manners' discourses, such as democracy manners (*demokrasi terbiyesi*), regarding its emergence and content. The opinion leaders of the era (*the monitoring generation*) aimed to educate the citizens of the Republic about sexuality by disseminating knowledge about sexual manners. They aimed to provide necessary information about the norms and boundaries of experiencing sexuality. Hence, they tried to intervene and regulate the "intimate relations" of the citizens. The emphasis of the 1930s on citizens' sexuality shifted from reproductive to intimate citizenship in the 1940s with sexual manners discourse.

Different than the previous decade, with the sexual manners discourse, opinion leaders of the era encouraged citizens to develop self-learning and self-regulating mechanisms and processes about their sexualities. Instead of disciplining individuals with external enforcements, the opinion leaders ask the citizens to assess themselves and comply with the norms with their own "will." Hence, this study argued that a new perspective, "self-regulating citizen" was launched in between the lines of sexual manners discussion.

The authors and publishers of the discourse on sexual manners accepted sexuality as a natural, normal, and healthy necessity of human life. They

underlined the importance of a healthy sexuality for individuals and, consequently, for a society. First of all, they defined the limits of experiencing sexuality while highlighting its significance for psychological and physiological well-being. They tried to inform the public about the lines between normal and abnormal, healthy and sick, appropriate and unacceptable sexual practices. In other words, sexual manners became the foundational discourse for sexuality.

Appropriate sexuality was defined as a conduct that should be in a "heterosexual relationship," "in marriage," and "for reproductive purposes." Hence, marriage was designated as the central institution where individuals could experience appropriate sexuality. Marriage has also become a point of convergence for sexuality and reproduction. The discourse on sexual manners extended to defining the characteristics of a good marriage and the roles of the spouses. With the era's changing conditions, marriage's steps were opened to critical discussions and re-structuring. From "finding the proper spouse" to "spousal roles," every step of marriage was discussed in relation to sexuality and reproductive practices. During the process, the writers warned the readers particularly about two areas: flirting and divorce, which were connected with out-of-marital sexuality. The content of sexual manners discussed the individuals' legal, moral and social appropriateness based on their sexualities ranging from their single sexual conduct to their on-going spousal responsibilities.

Another finding from this study concerns the creators of sexual manners discourse. First of all, sexual manners as a discussion was raised by a group of experts who were gathered around publishing houses such as *Seksoloji* Publication. Interestingly, the discussions, which became visible in a short period of time in popular publications, were raised, produced, and disseminated by private companies, not state-led institutions. In the literature, the 1950s Turkey was associated with conservative political and social tendencies. However, contrary to the 1950s narrative in the literature, private individuals and companies took sexual manners into their own hands without state intervention or support. The authors and publishers laid their legitimacy on informing the citizens with scientific knowledge. Along with the scientification of life during the period, on the one hand, they recreated a terminology on sexual matters. On the other hand, they used the

"intangibleness" of science to reinforce their position regarding sexuality. Another interesting finding of this study is related to the connectedness of the authors and publishers with the world-wide's sexology literature. They brought contemporary sexology literature to the magazines as translations or referred to them in their authentic articles. In the historiography of sexuality, social scientists emphasize global network sexology. Parallel to this analysis, sexual manners authors and publishers established relationships with their foreign counterparts in Turkey in the 1950s.

As mentioned before, the sexual manners discourse served two purposes. On the one hand, sexual manners tried to promote public well-being by focusing on topics such as venereal diseases. Sexual manners, on the other hand, were presented as essential knowledge for individuals' physical and psychological health. The emphasis on population was not new to the 1950s. In the previous decade, the intervention methods and language were based on watching over the well-being of the population. However, the emphasis on the health of individuals was a newly emerging subject in the 1950s. Although adult sexual activity in marriage is considered private by law, health became a convenient excuse and reason to advise citizens about their sexualities and intervene in their private lives. As a result, sexual manners became a regulative and operational discourse that linked the governing policies of individual and collective bodies.

There are several limitations to this study, which leads me to ask additional questions for further studies. First and foremost, this study aimed to demonstrate the emergence of sexuality in the public sphere under the guise of "sexual manners." As a result, this study's research was primarily limited to what was found on the pages of newspapers and magazines. Consequently, the voice in this research is mostly articulated by male experts. However, there is little information how individuals experience sexuality during the 1950s. There is a need for further research to understand individual experiences regarding sexuality.

Another finding of my study is related to the women of the 1950s. Reproductive policies were planned and regulated around female bodies. Since the establishment of the Republic, legislation has been used to intervene in female bodies regarding their sexuality and reproduction. The 1950s were narrated as a silent period in women's history. Moreover,

women were portrayed as passive recipients of the regulations. However, as displayed by the discussions about virginity and extramarital relations, women were not always in complete compliance, either with the norms regarding sexuality or with the legislation. My analysis of female bodies was limited to the scope of virginity and extramarital relations, which only pointed to an alternative perspective for women's history. Clearly, more research is needed to determine what kinds of strategies women used to respond to social norms and state regulations.

This study was built on the sexuality-related discussions, which were situated at the intersection point with medical expertise. Medicine, particularly psychiatry, became the prominent discipline to determine the norms of appropriate sexuality. Developments in psychiatry could have been affected the creation of a narrative regarding sexual manners, which requires further studies related to the formation of the discipline.

My research did not extend its scope to the discussions regarding natal policies. Authors of sexual manners texts, on the other hand, create texts and discussions about the conception process and contraception use during the period. Moreover, they took part in the public anti-natal discussions, which had been pioneered by doctors since 1958. Hence, there is a link between the public visibility and accumulation of sexual manners discourse and the shift in natal policies that began to be discussed in the early 1960s. Another study is needed to investigate the role of sexual manners discourse and physicians in shifting toward anti-natal policies.

This study aimed to display the invisible history of sexuality discussions in Turkey during the 1950s. I tried to examine the impact of sexual manners' authors on the formation of intimate relations. Cantek's metaphor regarding the 1950s Turkish Republic as an adolescent (*buluğ*) period suits the political, economic, and social transformations of the period. Pursuing this metaphor, the citizens of the adolescent (*buluğ*) period experienced transformations in the formation and construction of their sexualities, which became a governing practice for private and intimate relations.

# Bibliography

PRIMARY SOURCES

NEWSPAPERS

Cumhuriyet

Milliyet

Zafer

PERIODICALS

Adalet Dergisi

Aile

Akis

Hayat

Kadın Dünyası

Sağlığımız

Seksoloji Yıllığı

Seksoloji

Sıhhi Sahifalar

#### SECONDARY SOURCES

- 40ından sonra Cinsi Hayat. İstanbul: İstanbul Klinik Dersleri Yayınevi, 1960.
- 200 Sual 200 Cevap. İstanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1952.
- Doğumu Tanzim. Translated by Muzaffer Aşkın. İstanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1952.
- Abu-Obeh, Lama. "Arap toplumlarında namus cinayetleri ve toplumsal cinsiyetin inşası." In *Müslüman Toplumlarda Kadın ve Cinsellik*, edited by Pınar İlkkaracan. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003.
- Adak, Hülya. "Otobiyografik Benliğin Çok Karakterliliği: Halide Edip'in İlk Romanlarında Toplumsal Cinsiyet." In *Kadınlar Dile Düşünce*, edited by Sibel Irzık and Jale Parla. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2004.
- Adams, Michele. "Women's Rights and Wedding Bells: 19th Century Profamily Rhetoric and (Re)Enforcement of the Gender Status Quo." *Journal of Family Issues*, no. 28 (2007): 501–528.
- Adcock, Robert and Mark Bevir. "Political Science." In *The History of the Social Sciences since 1945*, edited by Roger E. Backhouse and Phillippe Fontaine. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2010.
- Ahıska, Meltem. *Radyonun Sihirli Kapısı: Garbiyatçılık ve Politik Öznellik*. İstanbul: Metis Yayınları, 2005.
- Ahmad, Feroz. *Demokrasi Sürecinde Türkiye 1945-1980*. Translated by Ahmet Fethi, 2nd Edition. İstanbul: Hil Yayınları, 1996.
- ——. *The Making of the Modern Turkey*. London, New York: Routledge, 1993.
- Akın, Yiğit. Gürbüz ve Yavuz Evlatlar: Erken Cumhuriyet'te Beden Terbiyesi ve Spor. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2004.
- Aksoy, Muammer. "Evlad Edinme," İstanbul Üniversitesi Hukuk Fakültesi Dergisi, 282-283.

- Akşit, Elif Ekin. *Kızların Sessizliği: Kız Enstitülerinin Uzun Tarihi*. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2005.
- Alemdar, Yalçın. Siyasal ve Sosyal Değişmeler Açısından Cumhuriyet Dönemi Turk Romanı. Ankara: Akçağ Yayınları, 2002
- Ali Eşref Bey. "İçtimai Dertlerimizden Biri." In *Sıhhat Almanağı*. Edited by Mazhar Osman. İstanbul: Kader Basımevi, 1933.
- Alkan, Türker. Kadın Erkek Eşitsizliği Sorunu. Ankara: A.Ü. SBF Yayınları, 1981.
- Allan, Jonathan A. "Circumcision Debates in Sexology Magazine (1934–1975)." *Journal of Men's Studies* 29, no.3 (2021).
- Anderson, Benedict. *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*. London, New York: Verso, 1983.
- Andreas, Gottfried. *Görgü: 1. En Yeni ve İleri Muaşeret Usulleri*. Trans. Turan Aziz Beler. İstanbul: İnkılâp Kitabevi, 1943.
- Appleton, Lynn M. "Rethinking Medicalization: Alcoholism and Anomalies." In *Images of Issues*, edited by Joel Best, 59-80. New York: Aldine de Gruyter, 1995.
- Arat, Yeşim. "The Project of Modernity and Women in Turkey." In *Rethinking Modernity and National Identity in Turkey*, edited by Sibel Bozdoğan and Reşat Kasaba. Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1997.
- "Türkiye'de Toplumsal Cinsiyet ve Vatandaşlık." In 75. Yılda Tebaa'dan Yurttaşa Doğru, edited by Artun Ünsal. İstanbul: Tarih Vakfı Yayınları, 1998.
- Arpacı, Murat. "Hastalık, Ulus ve Felaket: Türkiye'de Frengi ile Mücadele (1920-1950)." *Toplum ve Bilim*, no. 130 (2014): 59-86.
- Arzuk, Deniz. "Vanishing Memoirs: Doğan Kardeş Children's Periodical between 1945 and 1993" Master's Thesis, Boğaziçi University, 2007.

- Aşkın, Muzaffer. "Giriş." In *Doğumu Tanzim*. Translated by Muzaffer Aşkın. İstanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1952.
- Ataay, Aytekin M. "Medenî Hukukda Evlâd Edinme." *İstanbul Hukuk Fakültesi Mecmuası* 21, no. 1-4 (1957).
- Atav, Nephan. "Şahsiyetin Gelişiminde Aile Çevresinin ve Ailedeki Gerginliklerin Etkileri." *Ankara Üniversitesi Siyasal Bilgiler Fakültesi Dergisi* 10, no. 4 (1955): https://dergipark.org.tr/download/article-file/37815 (30.04.2019)
- Attwood, Feona edited. *Mainstreaming Sex: The Sexualisation of Western Culture*. New York: I.B. Tauris, 2009.
- Aykaç, Çağla Elçin. "Kemalist Utopia, Study of the Propaganda Magazine: La Turquie Kemaliste (1934-1948)" Master's Thesis, Boğaziçi University, 2003.
- Aytul, Turhan edited. *Türkiye'de Cinsiyet Problemi*. İstanbul: Varlık Yayınevi, 1964.
- Bailey, M.E. "Foucauldian Feminism: Contesting Bodies, Sexuality and Identity." In *Up Against Foucault*, edited by Caroline Ramazanoğlu. London: Routledge, 1993.
- Bashford, Alison and Carolyn Strange. "Public Pedagogy: Sex Education and Mass Communication in the Mid–Twentieth Century." *Journal of the History of Sexuality* 13, no. 1 (2004): 71-99
- Basu, Srimati. "Judges of Normality: Mediating Marriage in the Family Courts of Kolkata, India," *Signs* 37, no. 2 (2012): 469-492.
- Bauer, Heike. Sexology and Translation: Cultural and Scientific Encounters across the Modern World, 1880–1930. Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 2015.

- Beccalossi, Chiara. "Latin Eugenics and Sexual Knowledge in Italy, Spain, and Argentina: International Networks across the Atlantic." in *A Global History of Sexual Science*, 1880–1960, edited by Veronika Fuechtner, Douglas E. Haynes, and Ryan M. Jones. Oakland, California: University of California Press, 2018.
- Benhabib, Seyla. "Models of Public Space: Hannah Arendt, the Liberal Tradition, and Jürgen Habermas." In *Habermas and the Public Sphere*, edited by Craig Calhoun. Cambridge, Massachusetts, London: MIT Press, 1996.
- Bennett, Linda Rae. Single Women, Sexuality and Reproductive Health in Contemporary Indonesia. London and New York: Routledge, 2005.
- Bergmann, Sven. "Fertility Tourism: Circumventive Routes That Enable Access to Reproductive Technologies and Substances." *Signs* 36, no. 2 (2011): 280-289.
- Berksan, Samira. "Marriage Patterns and the Effect on Fertility in Turkey." In *Turkish Demography: Proceedings of a Conference*, edited Frederic C. Shorter and Bozkurt Güvenç. Ankara: Hacettepe University Publications, 1969.
- Berktay, Fatmagül. "Batılılaşma." In Modern Türkiye'de Siyasi Düşünce, Modernleşme ve Batıcılık, Cilt *3*, edited by Murat Gültekingil and Tanıl Bora. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2002.
- ——. "Türkiye'de Toplumsal Değişim Sürecinde Kadın." In *75. Yılda Kadınlar ve Erkekler*, edited by Ayşe B. Hacımirzaoğlu, 1-12. Istanbul: Türk Tarih Vakfı Yayınları, 1998.
- ——. "Yeni kimlik arayışı, eski cinsel düalizm: Peyami Safa'nın romanlarında toplumsal cinsiyet." *Kadın Araştırmaları Dergisi*, no. 9 (2006):77-90.
  - http://www.iudergi.com/tr/index.php/kadin/article/view/337.
- Bernard, Sandie and Pierre Clement, "Teaching Human Reproduction and Sexuality: A Historical Approach in France since 1950," unpublished paper.

- Besim Ömer, Doğum Tarihi, (İstanbul: Ahmet İhsan Matbaası, 1932).
- Bess, Roch. Evli Kadınlar için Metres Tehlikesi Nedir? İnsan Hayatı Dizisi, 9.
  - Translated by Selim Yetkili. Istanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1956.
- Beyinli, Gökçen. *Elleri Tılsımlı: Modern Türkiye'de Ebelik*. Ankara: Ayizi Kitap, 2014.
- Bisch, Louis E. *Kadınlar Niçin İhanet Ederler*, *İnsan Hayatı Serisi*, 7. Translated by Selim Yetkili. Istanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1956.
- Bland, Lucy and Laura Doan. "General Introduction" In *Sexology Uncensored: The Documents of Sexual Science*, edited by Lucy Bland and Laura Doan, 1-7. Chicago: University of Cfhicago Press, 1998.
- Blank, Hanne. *Bekaretin El Değmemiş Tarihi*. Trans. Emek Ergün. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2007.
- Bloomfield, Brian P. and Theo Vurdubakis, "Re-Engineering the Human: New Reproductive Technologies and the Specter of Frankenstein." *International Journal of Social Sciences* 1, no. 1 (2006): 19-24.
- Bora, Aksu. "Türk modernleşme sürecinde annelik kimliğinin dönüşümü" In *Yerli bir Feminizme Doğru*, edited by Aynur İlyasoğlu and Necla Akgökçe, 77-107. İstanbul: Sel Yayınları, 2001.
- Bora, Tanıl. "Analar, Bacılar, Orospular: Türk-Milliyetçi Muhafazakar Söyleminde Kadın," in *Şerif Mardin'e Armağan*, edited by Ayşe Öncü and Orhan Tekelioğlu, 241-282. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2005.
- . "Cumhuriyet, Demokrasi ve Muhafazakar Türk Cumhuriyetçiliği." In *Medeniyet Kaybı Milliyetçilik ve Faşizm Üzerine Yazılar*. İstanbul: Birikim Yayınları, 2006.
- Bora, Tanıl and Necmi Erdoğan. "Muhafazakar Populizm." In *Modern Türkiye'de Siyasi Düşünce: Muhafazakarlık, Cilt 5*, edited by Tanıl Bora and Murat Gültekingil, 632-644. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003.

- Boran, Behice. *Türkiye ve Sosyalizmin Sorunları*. İstanbul: GünYayınları, 1968.
- Bordo, Susan. "Feminism, Foucault and the Politics of Body." In *Up Against Foucault: Explorations of Some Tensions between Foucault and Feminism*, edited by Caroline Ramazanoğlu. London: Routledge, 1993.
- Bosley, Jocelyn. "From Monkey Facts to Human Ideologies: Theorizing Female Orgasm in Human and Nonhuman Primates, 1967–1983." *Signs* 35, no. 3 (2010): 647-671.
- Bosworth, Richard. "Nations Examine Their Past: A Comparative Analysis of the Historiography of the "Long" Second World War." *The History Teacher* 29, no. 4 (1996): 499-523.
- Boulos, Margaret. "The global biopolitics of the IUD: How science constructs contraceptive users and women's bodies Chikako Takeshita." *Feminist Theory* 16, no. 1 (2015): 113 116.
- Boyer, Kate. "Neoliberal Motherhood': Workplace Lactation and Changing Conceptions of Working Motherhood in the Contemporary US." *Feminist Theory* 15, no. 3 (2014): 269 288.
- Bozdoğan, Sibel and Reşat Kasaba edited. *Rethinking Modernity and National Identity in Turkey*. Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1997.
- Briggs, Laura. Somebody's Children: The Politics of Transracial and Transnational Adoption. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2012.
- Bristow, Joseph. Sexuality. London and New York: Routledge, 1997.
- Browne, Victoria. "Feminist Philosophy and Prenatal Death: Relationality and the Ethics of Intimacy." *Signs* 41, no. 2 (2016): 385-407.
- Browner, Carole H. "The Politics of Reproduction in a Mexican Village." *Signs* 11, no. 4 (1986): 710-724.
- Bulut, Selda. "Hürriyet Gazetesi: 1948-1953 Döneminin Yayın Politikası." PhD Dissertation, Ankara University, 2007.

- Butler, Judith. *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity*. New York and London: Routledge, 1999.
- Campbell, Beatrix. "A Feminist Sexual Politics: Now you see it, now you don't." *Feminist Review*, no. 5 (1980): 1-18.
- Canaday, Margot. "Thinking Sex in the Transnational Turn: An Introduction." *American Historical Review* 114, no. 5 (2009).
- Cantek, Levent. Cumhuriyetin Büluğ Çağı: Gündelik Yaşama Dair Tartışmalar (1945-1950). İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2008.
- Cantürk, Gürol. "Evlilik ve boşanma ile ilgili adli psikiyatrik uygulamalar." *Journal of Forensic Medicine* 3, no. 3 (2006): 58-64.
- Carabine, Jean. ""Constructing Women": Women's Sexuality and Social Policy." *Critical Social Policy* 34, no. 1 (1992): 23-37.
- Chavernac, Laurent. *On Derste Cinsiyet*. Translated by A. Kahraman. Istanbul: Çağlayan Yayınevi, 1957.
- Chavez, Leo R. "A Glass Half Empty: Latina Reproduction and Public Discourse." *Human Organization* 63, no. 2 (2004): 173-188.
- Chiang, Howard Hsueh-Hao. "Double Alterity and the Global Historiography of Sexuality: China, Europe, and the Emergence of Sexuality as a Global Possibility." *E-pisteme* 2, no. 1 (2009): 33-52.
- Chickedel, Maurice. *Bekarlarda Cinsi Hayat*. Translated by Semih Yazıcıoğlu. Istanbul: N.P., 1952.
- . *Nişanlılarda Cinsi Hayat*. Translated by Semih Yazıcıoğlu. Istanbul: N.P., 1952.
- ——. Evlilikte Cinsi Hayat. Translated by Semih Yazıcıoğlu. Istanbul: N.P., 1953.
- Cindoğlu, Dilek. "Modern Türk Tıbbında Bekaret Testleri ve Suni Bekaret." In *Müslüman Toplumlarda Kadın ve Cinsellik*, edited by Pınar İlkkaracan. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003.

- ——. "Reproductive citizenship in Turkey: Abortion chronicles." Women's Studies International Forum, no. 38 (2013)
- Clark, Le Mon. *İşte Evlendiniz*. Translated by Muzaffer Aşkın. 3rd edition. İstanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1951.
- Cocks, Harry G. "Saucy stories: pornography, sexology and the marketing of sexual knowledge in Britain, c.1918-70." *Social History* 29, no. 4 (2004): 465-484.
- Cohler, Deborah. Citizen, Invert, Queer: Lesbianism and War in Early Twentieth-Century Britain. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2010.
- Cook, Hera. "Sex and the Doctors: the Medicalization of Sexuality as a Two-way Process in Early to Mid-Twentieth-century Britain." In *Cultural Approaches to the History of Medicine*, edited by Willem de Blécourt, Cornelie Usborne. London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004.
- ——. The Long Sexual Revolution: English Women, Sex, and Contraception 1800-1975. Oxford, New York: Oxford University Press, 2004.
- Coontz, Stephanie. *The Way We Never Were: American Families and the Nostalgia Trip.* New York: Basic Books, 1992.
- Conrad, Peter. "Medicalization and Social Control." *Annual Review of Sociology*, no.18 (1992): 209–232.
- Conrad, Peter and Joseph W. Schneider. *Deviance and Medicalization:* From Badness to Sickness. Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1992.
- Cott, Nancy F. *Public Vows: A History of Marriage and the Nation*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2000.
- ——. "1920'lerin Modern Kadını, Amerikan Tarzı." In *Kadınların Tarihi: Yirminci Yüzyılda Kültürel bir Kimliğe Doğru*, *Vol. V*, edited Georges Duby and Michelle Perrot, 80-93. Istanbul: Türkiye İş Bankası Yayınları, 2005.

- Crozier, Ivan Dalley. "Introduction: Havelock Ellis, John Addington Symonds and the Construction of Sexual Inversion." In *Havelock Ellis and John Addington Symonds. Sexual Inversion: A Critical Edition*, edited by Ivan Crozier, 1-86. Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008.
- Çağlar, Kemal. "Gençlik Artık Yürüdüğü Yolu Biliyor!" In *Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 3: Gençkızların Cinsi Bilgisizlikleri*, 3. İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959.
- Daniels, Cynthia R. and Erin Heidt-Forsythe. "Gendered Eugenics and the Problematic of Free Market Reproductive Technologies: Sperm and Egg Donation in the United States." *Signs* 37, no. 3 (2012): 719-747.
- Daniş, Remzi Korok. Çocuklu ve Çocuksuz Dullar. Istanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1937.
   Dul Kadın ve Erkeklerle Gizli Konuşmalar. Istanbul: Bozkurt, Basımevi, 1937.
   Dul Kadınlara Rağbet ve Sebepleri. Istanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1937.
   Dullarda Aşk ve İhtiras. Istanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1937.
   Dullarda İhtiyarlık ve Izdırap. Istanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1937.
   Dullarda İzdivaç ve Neticeleri. Istanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1937.
- . Dullarda Serbest Hayat ve Sefalet. Istanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1937.
- . Dulluk ve Zararları. Istanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1937.
- . Erkek ve Kadında Cinsi İktidarsızlık. Istanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1936.
- . Evli Kadınlara Göre Memnu Meyva. Istanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1937.
- ——. Evli Kadınlarla Gizli Konuşmalar. İstanbul: Sebat Basımevi, 1936.

- ——. Evli Kadınlarda Son Gençlik ve İhtiras. Istanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1937. —. Genç Evli Kadınlarla Gizli Konuşmalar. 2nd edition. Istanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1937). —. Genç Kadınlar 45 Yaşına Kadar. İstanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1937. ——. Genç Kızlara Gizli Tavsiyeler. İstanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1935. ——. Genç Kızlara Göre İzdivaç ve Zifaf. İstanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1937. ——. Genç Kızlarla Gizli Konuşmalar. İstanbul: Sebat Basımevi, 1936. ——. Genç Kızlarda Fena Adetler. İstanbul: Nümune Basımevi, 1937. —. Genç Kızlarda Sevişme ve Muaşaka Arzusu. Istanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1937. —. Hamile kalmak için gizli konuşmalar. Hamile kalmamak için gizli konuşmalar. İstanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1936. —. Kadın nasıl erkek ister. İstanbul: Özeniş Basımevi, 1937. ——. Kızlar Onaltı Yaşına Kadar. İstanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1937. — . Kızlar Onsekiz Yaşına Kadar. İstanbul: Bozkurt Basımevi, 1937. Danziger, Kurt. "A question of identity: Who participated in psychological experiments?" In The rise of experimentation in American psychology, edited by Jill G. Morawski, 35-52. New Haven, CT: Yale University
- Davaz Mardin, Aslı edited. *Kadın Süreli Yayınları: Hanımlar Aleminden Roza'ya (1929-1996)*. Istanbul: K.E.K.B.M.V & T.E.T.T.V., 1998.

Press, 1988.

Davidoff, Leonore. "Aile Paradoksu: Tarihçilere Bir Çağrı." In *Feminist Tarihyazımında Sınıf ve Cinsiyet*. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2002.

- Dean, Mitchell. "The Malthus Effect: Population and the Liberal Government of Life." *Economy and Society* 44, no. 1 (2015): 18-39.
- Delaney, Carol. *Tohum ve Toprak*. Translated by Selda Somuncuoğlu and Aksu Bora. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2001.
- Demirci; Nuray and Çağatay Üstün. "Monograph: Prof. Dr. Hulusi Behçet'in (1889-1948) frengi akkındaki bir radyo konuşması." *Lokman Hekim Journal* 3, no. 1 (2013): 56-58.
- Demirel, Tanel. *Türkiye'nin Uzun On Yılı: Demokrat Parti İktidarı ve 27 Mayıs Darbesi.* İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Yayınları, 2011.
- Denbow, Jennifer M. "Abortion as Genocide: Race, Agency, and Nation in Prenatal Nondiscrimination Bans." *Signs* 41, no. 3 (2016): 603-626.
- Devellioğlu, Ferit. *Osmanlıca Türkçe Ansiklopedik Lugat*, 22nd edition. İstanbul: Aydın Kitabevi, 2005.
- Dewey, John. *Demokrasi ve Terbiye*. Translated by Avni Başman. Ankara: Devlet Matbaası, 1928.
- Donath, Orna. "Regretting Motherhood: A Sociopolitical Analysis." Signs 40, no. 2 (2015): 343-367.
- Donchin, Anne. "Toward a gender-sensitive assisted reproduction policy." *Bioethics* 23, no. 1 (2009): 28–38.
- Douglas, Ann. "Periodizing the American Century: Modernism, Postmodernism, and Postcolonialism in the Cold War Context." *Modernism/Modernity* 5, no. 3 (1998): 71-98.
- Dreyfus, Hubert and Paul Rabinow. *Michel Foucault: Beyond Structuralism and Hermeneutics*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1983.
- Drucker, Donna J. *The Classification of Sex: Alfred Kinsey and the Organization of Knowledge*. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 2014.
- Duben, Alan and Cem Behar. İstanbul Haneleri, Evlilik, Aile ve Doğurganlık 1880-1940. 2. Edition. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 1998.

- Duggan, Lisa. *Sapphic Slashers: Sex, Violence, and American Modernity*. Duke: Duke University Press, 2000.
- Durakbaşa, Ayşe. *Halide Edib: Türk Modernleşmesi ve Feminizm*. Istanbul: İletisim Yayınları, 2002.
- ——. "Türk Modernleşmesinin Kamusal Alanı ve "Kadın Yurttaş." In *Birkaç Arpa Boyu, 21. Yüzyıla Girerken Türkiye'de Feminist Çalışmalar Cilt 1*, edited by Serpil Sancar. İstanbul: Koç Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2011.
- Egemen, Bedi Ziya. *Terbiye İlminin Problemleri ve Terbiye Felsefesi*. Ankara: Ankara Üniversitesi Basımevi, 1965.
- Ekşi, Nuray. "Türk Hukukunda Kamu Personelinin Yabancılarla Evlenmesi." Public and Private International Law Bulletin 37, no. 2 (2017): 294–331.
- Elias, Norbert. *Uygarlık Süreci, Cilt 1*. Translated by Ender Ateşman. 11th edition. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2021.
- Emre Kaya, Ayşe Elif. "Demokrat Parti Politikalarının Cumhuriyet Gazetesinde Ele Alınış Biçimleri 1950-1960" PhD Dissertation, Ankara University, 2009.
- Engster, Daniel. *The Heart of Justice: Care Ethics and Political Theory*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007.
- Ercilasun, Bilge. "Türk Edebiyatında Popülerlik Kavramı ve Başlıca Eserler." *Yeni Türk Edebiyatı Üzerine İncelemeler no. 1.* Ankara: Akçağ Yayınları, 1997.
- Erdentuğ, Nermin. "Türkiye'nin Karadeniz Bölgesinde evlenme görenekleri ve törenleri," Antropoloji, 5 (1969): 27-64.
- Erduran, Refik. İblisler, Azizler, Kadınlar. Istanbul: Dünya Kitapları, 2005.
- Erez, Naşit. "Sosyal ve Biyolojik Açılardan Tahlil: Flört Faydalıdır." In *Türkiye'de Cinsiyet Problemi*, edited Turhan Aytul. İstanbul: Varlık Yayınevi, 1964.

- ——. "Sosyal ve biyolojik açıdan geçimsizlik: boşanma sebepleri," In *Türkiye'de Cinsiyet Problemi*, edited Turhan Aytul. İstanbul: Varlık Yayınevi, 1964.
- ——. "Önsöz." In *Resimli Seksoloji Ansiklopedisi*, edited by Naşit Erez, Sadi Irmak, Mansur Sayın, Çevik Alp, Kemal Çağlar, Turgut Metiner, Naci Berkay. İstanbul: Arkın Kitabevi, 1963.
- Erez, Naşit, Sadi Irmak, Mansur Sayın, Çevik Alp, Kemal Çağlar, Turgut Metiner, Naci Berkay edited. *Resimli Seksoloji Ansiklopedisi*. İstanbul: Arkın Kitabevi, 1963.
- Ergün, Emek "Önsöz: Türkiye'de Bekaretin "El Değmemiş" Tarihi," in *Bekaretin El Değmemiş Tarihi*, written by Hanne Blank. Translated by Emek Ergün. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2007.
- Ericksen, Julia A. (with Sally A. Stefen). *Kiss and Tell: Surveying Sex in the Twentieth Century*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1999.
- Erkaya Balsoy, Gülhan. *Kahraman Doktor İhtiyar Acuzeye Karşı: Geç Osmanlı Doğum Politikaları*. İstanbul: Can Yayınları, 2015.
- Ertem, Özge. "The Republic's Children and Their Burdens in 1930s and 1940s Turkey" Master's Thesis, Boğaziçi University, 2005.
- Exner, Max Joseph. *Mükemmel İzdivacın Şartları*. Translated by Muzaffer Aşkın. Istanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1950.
- ——. *Mükemmel İzdivacın Şartları*. Translated by Muzaffer Aşkın, 3rd edition. İstanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1951.
- . Mükemmel İzdivacın Başlangıcı. Translated by N.P. Istanbul: Yeni Seksoloji, 1962.
- Fannin, Maria. "Placental Relations." *Feminist Theory* 15, no. 3 (2014): 289 306.
- Fındıkoğlu, Ziyaedin Fahri. "Türk Aile sosyolojisi," İstanbul University Hukuk Fakultesi Mecmuası 11, no. 3-4 (1945), 264-274.

- Foster, Gwendolyn Audrey. *Troping the Body: Gender, Etiquette, and Performance*. Carbondale and Edwardsville: Southern Illinois University Press, 2000.
- Foucault, Michel. *The Birth of The Clinic: an Archaeology of Medical Perception*. Translated Alan Sheridan. London: Tavistock, 1973.
- ——. *The History of Sexuality, Vol. I: An Introduction*. Translated by Robert Hurley. New York: Pantheon Books, 1978.
- ———. "The Confession of the Flesh." In *Michel Foucault: Power/Knowledge*, edited by Colin Gordon. Hemel Hempstead: Harvester, 1980.
- ——. "Truth and Power." In *Power/Knowledge Selected Interviews and Other Writings* 1972-1977, edited by Colin Gordon, 109-133. Translated by Colin Gordon, Leo Marshall, John Mepham, Kate Soper. New York: Pantheon Books, 1980.
- ——. "The Subject and Power." *Critical Inquiry* 8, no. 4 (1982): 777-795.
- ——. "The Subject and the Power." In *Michael Foucault: Beyond Structuralism and Hermeneutics*, edited by Hupert Dreyfus and Paul Rabinow. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1982.
- ——. *The History of Sexuality, Vol. III: The Care of the Self.* Translated by Robert Hurley. New York: Pantheon, 1986.
- ——. *The History of Sexuality, Vol. II: The Use of Pleasure.* Translated by Robert Hurley. New York: Vintage Books, 1990.
- ——. Discipline and Punish the Birth of Prison. Translated by Alan Sheridan. New York: Vintage Books, 1995.
- ——. "Söylemin Düzeni." In *Ders Özetleri*, 9-42. Translated by Selahattin Hilav. Fifth edition. İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Yayınları, 2001.

- Fraser, Nancy. "Rethinking the Public Sphere: A Contribution to the Critique of Actually Existing Democracy." in *Habermas and the Public Sphere*, edited by Craig Calhoun, 109-142. Cambridge, Massachusetts, London: MIT Press, 1996).
- Frey, Frederick W. The Turkish Political Elite. Cambridge: MIT Press, 1965.
- Friedan, Betty. The Feminine Mystique. New York: Norton, 1963.
- Fuechtner, Veronika, Douglas E. Haynes, and Ryan M. Jones. "Introduction: Toward a Global History of Sexual Science: Movements, Networks, and Deployments." In *A Global History of Sexual Science*, *1880–1960*, edited by Veronika Fuechtner, Douglas E. Haynes, and Ryan M. Jones, 1-25. Oakland, California: University of California Press, 2018.
- Georges, Eugenia. *Bodies of Knowledge: the Medicalization of Reproduction in Greece*. Nashville: Vanderbilt University Press, 2008.
- Geppert, Alexander C. T. "Divine Sex, Happy Marriage, Regenerated Nation: Marie Stopes's Marital Manual Married Love and the Making of a Best-seller, 1918-1955." *Journal of the History of Sexuality* 8, no. 31 (1998): 389-433.
- Gibson, Margaret F. "Adopting Difference: Thinking through Adoption by Gay Men in Ontario, Canada." *Signs* 39, no. 2 (2014): 407-432.
- Giddens, Anthony. *Mahremiyetin Dönüşümü*, 2nd edition. İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları, 2010.
- Gilmartin, Mary and Allen White. "Interrogating Medical Tourism: Ireland, Abortion, and Mobility Rights." *Signs* 36, no. 2 (2011): 275-280.
- Ginsburg, Faye and Rayna Rapp edited. *Conceiving the New World Order: The Global Politics of Reproduction*. London: University of California Press, 1995.
- Ginsburg, Faye and Rayna Rapp. "The Politics of Reproduction." *Annual Review of Anthropology*, no. 20 (1991): 311-343.

- Gordon, Michael and Penelope J. Shankweiler. "Different Equals Less: Female Sexuality in Recent Marriage Manuals." *Journal of Marriage and Family Sexism in Family Studies* 33, no. 3 (1971).
- Gökçe, Birsen. "Çocuk Kişiliğinin Gelişiminde Aile, Okul, ve Dış Çevrenin Rolü." In *Aile Yazıları 3: Birey, Kişilik ve Toplum*. Edited by Beylü Dikeçligil and Ahmet Çiğdem. Ankara: T.C. Başbakanlık Aile Araştırma Kurumu Başkanlığı, 1991.
- Göztepe, Ece. "'Namus Cinayetlerinin" Hukuki Boyutu: Yeni Türk Ceza Kanunu'nun Bir Değerlendirmesi." *Türkiye Barolar Birliği Dergisi Dergisi*, no. 59 (2005): 29-48.
- Greenlee, Jill S. *The Political Consequences of Motherhood*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2014.
- Grewal, Inderpal and Caren Kaplan. "Global Identities: Theorizing Transnational Studies of Sexuality." *Gay and Lesbian Quarterly*, no. 7 (2001).
- Grossman, Atina. *Reforming Sex: The German Movement for Birth Control and Abortion Reform, 1920-1950.* New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995.
- Grosz, Elizabeth. "Notes Towards a Corporeal Feminism." *Australian Feminist Studies, Feminism and the Body* 2, no. 5 (1987): 1-16.
- ——. *Volatile Bodies: Toward a Corporeal Feminism.* Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1994.
- Gunnarsson Payne, Jenny. "Grammars of Kinship: Biological Motherhood and Assisted Reproduction in the Age of Epigenetics." *Signs* 41, no. 3 (2016): 483-506.
- Gupta, Kristina. "Compulsory Sexuality: Evaluating an Emerging Concept." *Signs* 41, no: 1 (2015): 131-154.
- Gutting, Gary. "Foucault and History of Madness." In *The Cambridge Companion to Foucault*, edited by Gary Gutting, 47-67. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005.

- Günal, Asena. "Health and Citizenship in Republican Turkey: An Analysis of the Socialization of Health Services in Republican Historical Context" PhD Dissertation, Boğaziçi University, 2008.
- Güneş, Aslı. "Kemalist Modernleşmenin Adab-ı Muaşeret Romanları: Popüler Aşk Anlatıları" Master's Thesis, Bilkent Üniversitesi, 2005.
- Güngör, Nazife. "Türkiye'de Popüler Kültür ve Çizgi Roman." *Gazi University Journal of Economics and Administrative Sciences* 12, no. 1-2 (1996): 337-354.
- Gürbilek, Nurdan. "Erkek Yazar Kadın Okur." In *Kadınlar Dile Düşünce*, edited by Sibel Irzık and Jale Parla. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2004.
- ——. "Kadınlaşma Endişesi: Efemine erkekler, hadım oğullar, kadın adamlar." In *Kör Ayna, Kayıp Şark*. 51-74. İstanbul: Metis Yayınları, 2004).
- H. B. edited. *Evli kadınlara tavsiyeler (Seksoloji bahisleri 3)*. Istanbul: Beküs, 1955.
- Haeri, Shahla, "İran'da Geçici Evlilik ve Devlet: Kadın Cinselliği Üzerine İslami Bir Söylem." In *Müslüman Toplumlarda Kadın ve Cinsellik*, edited by Pınar İlkkaracan. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003.
- Hall, Lesley A. "Heroesorvillains? Reconsidering British fin de siècle sexology." in *New Sexual Agendas*, edited by Lynne Segal. London: MacMillan, 1997.
- ——. *Sex, Gender and Social Change in Britain Since 1880.* Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire, London: Macmillan, 2000.
- Harder, Lois. "The State and the Friendships of the Nation: The Case of Nonconjugal Relationships in the United States and Canada." *Signs* 34, no. 3 (2009): 633-658.
- Harraway, Donna. *Primate Visions Gender, Race and Nature in the World of Modern Science*. New York, London: Routledge, 1989.

- Hart, Graham and Kaye Wellings. "Sexual behavior and its medicalization: in sickness and in health," in BMJ Clinical Research 324, no. 7342 (2002): 896-900.
  - https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC1122837/#B6 (26.11.2021)
- Hawkes, Gail. *A Sociology of Sex and Sexuality*. Milton Keynes: Open University Press, 1996.
- Herrn, Rainer. "Magnus Hirschfield's *Onnagata*." In *A Global History of Sexual Science*, *1880–1960*, edited by Veronika Fuechtner, Douglas E. Haynes, Ryan M. Jones. Translated by Micheal T. Taylor. Oakland, California: University of California Press, 2018.
- Hilliard, David. "Church, family and sexuality in Australia in the 1950s'." *Australian Historical Studies* 27, no. 109 (1997): 133 146.
- Hobsbawm, Eric. Age of Extremes: the Short Twentieth Century 1914-1991. London: Abacus, 1995.
- Holliday, W. Kimseye Söyleyemiyorum, İnsan Hayatı Dizisi, 2. Translated by C. Arhan. Istanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1956.
- Hoppeler, Jean. *Evlenmeden Önce*. Translated by Muzaffer Aşkın. Istanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1951.
- Horn, David G. Social Bodies: Science, Reproduction, and Italian Modernity. Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1995.
- Huber, Valerie J. and Michael W. Firmin. "A History of Sex Education in the United States since 1900." *International Journal of Educational* Reform 23, no. 1 (2014): 25-51.
- Hulusi Behçet, "Frengi Niçin Ayıp Görülür? Frengiyi Neden Gizli Tutmak Adet Olmuştur? Tabiatta Ayıp Denen Hastalık Var mıdır?" in İstanbul Radyosunda Verilen Konferans. İstanbul: İstanbul Halkevi, 1935.

- Hutton, Patrick H. "Foucault, Freud, and the Technologies of Self," in Technologies of the Self, A Seminar with Michel Foucault, edited by Luther H. Martin, Huck Gutman and Patrich H. Hutton. London: Tavistock Publications, 1988.
- Ikemoto, Lisa C. "Eggs as Capital: Human Egg Procurement in the Fertility Industry and the Stem Cell Research Enterprise." Signs 34, no. 4 (2009): 763-781.
- İlkkaracan, İpek and Gülşah Seral. "Kadının İnsan Hakkı Olarak Cinsel Haz: Türkiye'deki Bir Taban Eğitimi Programından Deneyimler." In *Müslüman Toplumlarda Kadın ve Cinsellik*, edited by İpek İlkkaracan. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003.
- İlkkaracan, Pınar. "Giriş: Müslüman toplumlarda kadın ve cinsellik." In *Müslüman Toplumlarda Kadın ve Cinsellik*, edited by Pınar İlkkaracan. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003.
- "Türkiye'nin Doğu Bölgelerinde Kadın Cinselliği Bağlamının İncelenmesi." In *Müslüman Toplumlarda Kadın ve Cinsellik*, edited by Pınar İlkkaracan. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003.
- Irni, Sari. "Steroid Provocations: On the Materiality of Politics in the History of Sex Hormones." *Signs* 41, no. 3 (2016): 507-529.
- Irvine, Janice M. Disorders of Desire: Sexuality and Gender in Modern American Sexology. Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 2005.
- Isambert, Fenande. *Evliliğin İlk Basamağında Neler Bilmelidir*, *İnsan Hayatı Dizisi*, 6. Translated by Selim Yetkili. Istanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1956.
- Irzık, Sibel and Jale Parla. "Önsöz." In *Kadınlar Dile Düşünce*, edited by Sibel Irzık and Jale Parla. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2004.
- Işıklar Koçak, Müge. "Problematizing Translated Popular Texts on Women's Sexuality: A New Perspective on the Modernization Project in Turkey from 1931 to 1959." PhD. Dissertation, Boğaziçi University, 2007.

- Jackson, Margaret. "'Facts of Life" or the Eroticization of Women's Oppression? Sexology and the Social Construction of Heterosexuality." In *The Cultural Construction of Sexuality*, edited by Pat Caplan. London: Tavistock, 1987.
- Jackson, Stevi and Sue Scott. *Theorizing Sexuality*. Berkshire, England: Open University Press, 2010.
- Jayawardena, Kumari. Feminism and Nationalism in the Third World. London, New Jersey: Zed Book, 1989.
- Jewett, Andrew. Science, Democracy and the American University: From the Civil War to the Cold War. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012.
- Kaçmazoğlu, H. Bayram. *Demokrat Parti Dönemi Toplumsal Tartışmaları*. İstanbul: Doğu Kitabevi, 2012.
- Kadıoğlu, Ayşe. "Cinselliğin İnkârı: Büyük Toplumsal Projelerin Nesnesi Olarak Türk Kadınları." In *75. Yılda Kadınlar ve Erkekler*, edited by Ayşe B. Hacımirzaoğlu. Istanbul: Türk Tarih Vakfı Yayınları, 1998.
- Kahn, Fritz. *Tenasul Hayatımız: Herkes ve Aile için Bir Rehber*. Translated by Cemil Cahit Cem. İstanbul: TürkiyeYayınevi, 1940.
- Kalkınma Planı (Birinci 5 yıl) 1963-1967. Ankara: T.C. Başbakanlık Devlet Planlama Teşkilatı, 1963.
- Kamer, Tunay and Ramazan Alabaş. "Ahlâk Terbiyesi Kongresi ve Basına Yansımaları." *Kastamonu Eğitim Dergisi* 25, no. 2 (2017): 821-848.
- Kandiyoti, Deniz. "Cariyeler, Fettan Kadınlar ve Yoldaşlar: Türk Romanında Kadın İmgeleri." In *Cariyer, "aşlar, Bacılar*, 133-147. İstanbul: Metis Yayınları, 1997.
- ——. "Erkeklik Paradoksları: Ayrımcılığın Yaşandığı Toplumlar Üzerine Bazı Düşünceler." In *Cariyeler, Bacılar, Yurttaşlar*, 181-201. İstanbul: Metis, 1997.

- ——. "Kimlik Kavramı ve Yetersizlikleri." In *Cariyer Bacılar Yurttaşlar*. 148-166. İstanbul: Metis Yayınları, 1997.
- "Modernin Cinsiyeti: Türk Modernleşmesi Üzerine Çalışmalarda Gözden Kaçırılan Yönler." In *Cariyer, Yurttaşlar, Bacılar*, 202-221. İstanbul: Metis Yayınları, 1997.
- Karaincioğlu, Nihal. "Türkiye'de Çok Partili Sisteme Geçis ve Demokrasi Sorunları." In *Tarih ve Demokrasi: Tarık Zafer Tunaya'ya Armagan*, edited by Üniversite Ögretim Üyeleri Dernegi. İstanbul: Cem Yayınevi, 1992.
- Karaömerlioğlu, Asım. "Turkey's 'Return' to Multi-Party Politics: A Social Interpretation," *East European Quarterly* 40, no. 1 (2006): 89-107.
- Karaveli, Orhan. *Bir Ankara Ailesinin Hikayesi*. İstanbul: Doğan Kitap, 2011.
- Katz, Jonathan Ned, Vidal Gore and Lisa Duggan. *The Invention of Heterosexuality*. New York: Dutton, 1995.
- Kazancıgil, Tevfik Remzi. "Eser hakkında bir (Takriz-beğenti)." In Tenasül Hayatımız: Herkes ve aile için bir rehber. Written by Fritz Kahn. Translated by Cemil Cahit Cem. İstanbul: TürkiyeYayınevi, 1940.
- Kelly, Kimberly. "In the Name of the Mother: Renegotiating Conservative Women's Authority in the Crisis Pregnancy Center Movement" *Signs* 38, no. 1 (2012): 203-230.
- Keyder, Çağlar. "Türkiye Demokrasisinin Ekonomi Politiği." In *Geçis Sürecinde Türkiye*, edited by Irvin Cemil Schick and Ertugrul Ahmet Tonak. İstanbul Belge Yayınları, 1990.
- . *Türkiye'de Devlet ve Sınıflar*. Translated by Sabri Tekay. 5th Edition. İstanbul: İletisim Yayınları, 1999.
- Kinsey, Alfred C. Kadınların Cinsi Hayatı Hakkında Kinsey Raporu (Seksoloji Yayınları Yeni Seri, 1). Translated N.P. Istanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1955.

- Kinsey, Alfred, et al.. *Sexual Behavior in the Human Male*. Philadelphia: W.B. Saunders, 1948.
- Kirkpatrick, Clifford, Sheldon Stryker and Philip Buell. "An Experimental Study Of Attitudes Towards Male Sex Behavior With Reference To Kinsey Findings." *American Sociological Review* 17, no. 5 (1952).
- Kisch, Heinrich. Evlilikte Cinsiyet (Yeni Seksoloji Kitapları, 2). Istanbul: Yeni Seksoloji, 1961.
- . *Kadın: Seksüel hayatı ve Evliliğe Sadakatsizliği*. Ankara: Berkalp Kitabevi, 1944.
- . *Kadın ve Evlilik Hayatı Cilt 1*. Translated by Şevket Dilmaç and Ayet Altuğ. Istanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1951.
- . *Kadın ve Evlilik Hayatı Cilt 2*. Translated by Şevket Dilmaç and Ayet Altuğ. Istanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1951.
- Koca, Bayram. "Ellili Yıllarda Merkez Sağ: Demokrat Parti'nin Özgürlük ile İstismar Arasındaki Dini Politikaları." In *Türkiye'nin 1950'li yılları*. Edited by Mete Kaan Kaynar, 293-319. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2015.
- Koçak, Cemil. *CHP İktidarının Sonu Türkiye'de İki Partili Siyâsî Sistemin Kuruluş Yılları (1945-1950) Cilt 6.* İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2017.
- . İktidar ve Demokratlar Türkiye'de İki Partili Siyasi Sistemin Kuruluş Yılları (1945-1950), Cilt 2. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2018.
- Koçer, Dilara Nergishan. "Demokrat Parti Döneminde Kadın: 1950-1960 Arası Kadın Dergilerinde Kadın İmajı" PhD. Dissertation, Marmara University, 2009.
- Koğacıoğlu, Dicle. "Gelenek Söylemleri ve İktidarın Doğallaşması: Namus Cinayetleri Örneği." *Kultur ve Siyasette Feminist Yaklaşımlar*, no. 3 (2007).
- Koloğlu, Orhan. "Sedat Simavi: Kadın Resmini Basına Yerleştiren Gazeteci." *Tarih ve Toplum*, no. 231 (2003).

- Köymen, Nusret. *Demokrasiyi Kurtaralim: Demokrasiyi Kurtaracak Halk Eğitimidir*. Istanbul: Türkiye Basimevi, 1952.
- LaFollette, Marcel C. "A Survey of. Science Content in U.S. Television Broadcasting, 1940s through 1950s: The Exploratory Years." *Science Communication* 24, no. 1 (2002): 34–71.
- Leinaweaver, Jessaca B. "Practice Mothers." *Signs* 38, no. 2 (2013): 405-430.
- Leng, Kirsten. "Permutations of the Third Sex: Sexology, Subjectivity, and Antimaternalist Feminism at the Turn of the Twentieth Century." *Signs* 40, no. 1 (2014): 227-254.
- Leng, Kirsten and Katie Sutton. "Histories of sexology today: Reimagining the boundaries of Scientia Sexualis." *History of the Human Sciences* 34, no. 1 (2021): 3-9.
- Litton Fox, Greer. "Love Match and Arranged Marriage in a Modernizing Nation: Mate Selection in Ankara, Turkey." *Journal of Marriage and Family* 37, no. 1 (1975): 180-193.
- ——. "Some Determinants of Modernism among Women in Ankara, Turkey." *Journal of Marriage and Family* 35, no. 3, *Special Section: New Social History of the Family* (1973): 520-529.
- Liu, Monica. "Surrogate Dating and the Translation of Gendered Meanings across Borders: The Case of China's E-mail-Order Brides." *Signs* 41, no: 1 (2015): 29-53.
- McMauldin, Fred. *Her Nişanlı Genç Kız Neler Bilmelidir? Yarın Evleneceksin*. Translated by Selim Yetkili. Istanbul: Hadise Yayınevi, 1956.
- ——. Buluğ Çağında Bir Kız Neler Bilmelidir. Translated by Selim Yetkili. Istanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1956.
- Kızıma Nasıl Söyliyeyim: Her genç kız neler bilmelidir, İnsan Hayatı Dizisi, 1. Translated by Selim Yetkili. Istanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1956.

- Macdonald, Myra. Representing Women: Myths of Femininity in the Popular Media. London, and New York: Edward Arnold, 1995.
- Maniglier, Patrice. "The Order of Things." In *A Companion to Foucault*, edited by Christopher Falzon, Timothy O'Leary, and Jana Sawicki, 104-121. Malden, Oxford, West Sussex: Wiley-Blackwell Publishing, 2013.
- Markens, Susan. Surrogate Motherhood and the Politics of Reproduction. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2007.
- Marmor, Judd. "Homosexuality and Cultural Value Systems." *American Journal of Psychiatry*, no. 130 (1973): 1208-1209
- Martin, John F. [et. all], "Changing Sex Ratios: The History of Havasupai Fertility and Its Implications for Human Sex Ratio Variation [and Comments and Reply]," *Current Anthropology* 35, no. 3 (1994): 255-280.
- Martin, Luther H., Huck Gutman and Patrick H. Hutton edited. *Technologies of the Self: A Seminar with Michel Foucault*. London: Tavistock Publications, 1988.
- Martion, Emily. "Grafting Together Medical Anthropology, Feminism, and Technoscience." In *Medical Anthropology at the Intersections: Histories, Activisms, and Futures*, edited by Marcia C. Inhorn and Emily A. Wentzell. Durham and London: Duke University Press, 2021.
- May, Elaine Tyler. America and the Pill: A History of Promise, Peril, and Liberation. New York: Basic Books. 2010.
- ———. Homeward Bound American Families in the Cold War Era. 3rd edition. New York: Basic Books, 2008.
- May, Josephine. "Secrets and Lies: Sex Education and Gendered Memories of Childhood's End in an Australian Provincial City, 1930s—1950s." *Sex Education* 6, no. 1 (2006): 1-15.
- Mazhar Osman edited. Sıhhat Almanağı. İstanbul: Kader Basımevi, 1933.

- Mazower, Mark. *Dark Continent: Europe's Twentieth Century*. New York: Penguin, 1999.
- McRobbie, Angela. "'More! New Sexualities in Girls' and Women's Magazines." In *In the Culture Society: Art, Fashion and Popular Music*. London: Routledge, 1999.
- Mendes, Kaitlynn. "Reading Chatelaine: Dr. Marion Hilliard and 1950s Women's Health Advice" *Canadian Journal of Communication*, no. 35 (2010): 515-531.
- Mernissi, Fatima. "Bekaret ve Ataerki." in *Müslüman Toplumlarda Kadın* ve Cinsellik, edited by Pınar İlkkaracan. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003.
- Metz, Tamara. *Untying the Knot: Marriage, the State, and the Case for Their Divorce*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2010.
- Mitchell, Timothy. "Everyday Metaphors of Power." *Theory and Society* 19, no. 5 (1990): 545-577.
- Moddelmog, Debra A. "Modernism and Sexology." *Literature Compass* 11, no. 4 (2014): 267–278.
- Mullings, Leith. "Resistance and Resilience: the Sojourner Syndrome and the Social Context of Reproduction in Central Harlem." *Transforming Anthropology* 13, no. 2 (2005): 79–91.
- Muzaffer, Süheyla. 2. Subay, Asker, Memur, Mektepli ve Umumiyetle Herkes için Modern Adabı Muaşeret. İstanbul: İnkılâp Kitabevi, 1940.
- Naciye Emin Hanım, "Sütninelerin, Ahçılarınızın, Hizmetçilerinizin Kanlarını Mutlak Muayene Ettiriniz." In Sıhhat Almanağı. Edited by Mazhar Osman. İstanbul: Kader Basımevi, 1933.
- Najmabadi, Afsaneh. "Contested Veils, Veiled Contestations: Power and the Public Female." (paper presented at the conference on "Women, Work and Power in the Middle East." University of California at Los Angeles, 12-13 April, 1991).

- ——. "Sevgili ve Ana olarak Erotik Vatan: Sevmek, Sahiplenmek, Korumak." In *Vatan-Millet-Kadınlar*, edited by Ayşegül Altınay, 129-167. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2004.
- Nordqvist, Petra. "Feminist heterosexual imaginaries of reproduction:Lesbian conception in feminist studies of reproductive technologies." *Feminist Theory* 9, no. 3: 273–292.
- Nuti, Alasia. "How should marriage be theorised?" *Feminist Theory* 17, no. 3 (2016): 285 302.
- O'Donnell, Kelly Suzanne. "Reproducing Jane: Abortion Stories and Women's Political Histories." *Signs* 43, no. 1 (2017): 77-96.
- O'Malley, Pat. "Governmentality and Risk." In *Social Theories of Risk and Uncertainity, an Introduction*, edited by Jens O. Zinn, 52-75. Malden, Oxford, and Victoria: Blackwell Publishing, 2008.
- Oğuzoğlu, Hüseyin Cahit. "Evlilik Birliğini Temsilde Medeni Kanunumuzun Dayandığı Esaslar." Ankara Üniversitesi Hukuk Fakültesi Dergisi no. 7 (1950): xxx.
- Okur, Fatma Berrin. "Conspicuous Consumption in Turkey in the 1950s: an Examination of Hayat Magazine" Master's Thesis, Boğaziçi University, 2007.
- Oktay, Ahmet. Türkiye'de Popüler Kültür. İstanbul: YKY Yayınevi, 1997.
- Orhon, Alaettin. *Kadın Sağlığı: Doğuştan Adet Kesilmesine Kadar*. Ankara: Ankara Üniversitesi Tıp Fakültesi Yayınları, 1962.
- Owen, Roger and Şevket Pamuk. A History of Middle East Ecnomies in the Twentieth Century. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1999.
- Örnek, Cangül. "1950'li yıllarda ABD ile bluşma: Anti-komünizm, Modernleşmecilik ve Maneviyatçilik." Ph.D. Dissertation, Marmara University, 2010.

- Özbay, Cenk, Ayşecan Terzioğlu, and Yeşim Yasin. "Türkiye'de Neoliberalleşme ve Mahremiyetin Dönüşümü." In Neoliberalizm ve Mahremiyet, edited by Cenk Özbay, Ayşecan Terzioğlu, and Yeşim Yasin, 9-30. İstanbul: Metis Yayınları, 2011.
- Özbay, Ferhunde. "Nüfus Hareketleri ve Devlet Politikaları." In *Dünden Bugüne Aile, Kent ve Nüfus*. İstanbul:İletişim Yayınları, 2015.
- Özkan Kerestecioğlu, İnci and Güven Gürkan Öztan edited. *Türk Sağı: Mitler, Fetişler, Düşman İmgeleri.* İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2012.
- Özkır, Yusuf. "Hürriyet Gazetesi'nin Kimliği." *Iğdır University Journal of Social Sciences*, no. 3 (2013): 45-70.
- Özkurt, Kerem. "Tracing Modernity In The Popular Romances Of The Early Republican Period (1930-1945): The Novels Of Kerime Nadir, Esat Mahmut Karakurt and Muazzez Tahsin Berkand" Master's Thesis, Boğaziçi University, 2007.
- Özsan, Gül. "Türkiye'de Modernleşme ve Kadın Sağlığı Politikaları" PhD. Dissertation, Mimar Sinan Güzel Sanatlar Üniversitesi, 2007.
- Öztamur, Pınar. "Defining a Population: Women and Children in Early Republican Turkey, 1923-1950" Master's Thesis, Boğaziçi University, 2004.
- Özman, Aylin and Aslı Yazıcı Yakın. "Anti-Komünist Fantaziler: Doğa, Toplum, Cinsellik." In *Türk Sağı: Mitler, Fetişler, Düşman İmgeleri*, edited İnci Özkan Kerestecioğlu and Güven Gürkan Öztan. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2012.
- Parker, Richard. "Sexuality, culture and society: shifting paradigms in sexuality research." *Culture, Health and Sexuality* 11, no. 3 (2009): 251-266.
- Parla, Ayşe "The "Honor" of the State: Virginity Examinations in Turkey." *Feminist Studies* 27, no. 1 (2001): 65-88.
- Parr, Joy. "Introduction." in *A diversity of women: Ontario, 1945-1980*, edited by Joy Parr. Toronto, ON: University of Toronto Press, 1995.

- Pateman, Carole. "Feminist Critiques of the Public/Private Dichotomy." In *The Disorder of Women*, 118–140. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1989
- ——. *The Sexual Contract*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1988.
- Peker, Mümtaz. "Türkiye'de Nüfusbilimin Kurumsallaşması ve Bu Süreçte Prof. Dr. Nusret H. Fişek'in Yeri." *Fişek Ensitüsü* (20.01.2013).
  - http://sosyalpolitika.fisek.org.tr/turkiyede-nufusbiliminkurumsallasmasi-ve-bu-surecte-prof-dr-nusret-h-fisekin-yeri/
- Pekman, Cem. *İstanbul Radyosu: Anılar, Yaşantılar*. İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Publishing, 2000.
- Pınar, Mehmet. "Fuhuş ve Zührevi Hastalıkların (Frengi) TBMM'de Tartışılması ve Resmi Raporlara Yansımaları (1920-1932)." *Van Yüzüncü Yıl Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi, Salgın Hastalıklar Özel Sayısı* 1, no. 6 (2020): 15-42.
- Pilcher, Jane. "School Sex Education: Policy and Practice in England 1870 to 2000." *Sex Education* 5, no. 2 (2005), 153-170.
- Pigg, Stacy Leigh and Vincanne Adams. "Introduction: The Moral Object of Sex." In *Sex in Development: Science, Sexuality, and Morality in Global Perspective*, edited by Vincanne Adams and Stacy Leigh Pigg. Durham and London: Duke University Press, 2005.
- Plummer, Ken. "Studying Sexualities for a Better World? Ten Years of Sexualities." *Sexualities* 11, no. 1-2 (2008): 7-22.
- Povinelli, Elizabeth A. and George Chauncey. "Thinking Sexuality Transnationally: An Introduction." *Gay and Lesbian Quarterly*, no. 5 (1999).
- Plumwood, Val. *Feminizm ve Doğaya Hükmetmek*. Translated by Başak Ertür. İstanbul: Metis Yayınları, 2004.
- R.Y. edited. *Genç kızlara tavsiyeler (Seksoloji konuları 1)*. Istanbul: Beküs, 1953.

- Rabinow, Paul. "Introduction." In *The Foucault Reader*, edited by Paul Rabinow. London: Penguin Books, 1991.
- Repo, Jemima. *The Biopolitics of Gender*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2016.
- Reuman, Miriam G. *American Sexual Character: Sex, Gender, and National Identity in the Kinsey Reports.* Berkeley, London, LosAngeles: University of California Press, 2005.
- Revillard, Anne. "Stating Family Values and Women's Rights: Familialism and Feminism within the French Republic." *French Politics*, no. 5 (2007): 210-228.
- Reynolds, Nancy Y. "Salesclerks, Sexual Danger, and National Identity in Egypt, 1920s–1950s." *Journal of Women's History* 23, no. 3 (2011): 63–88.
- Ritchie, Rachel. "The Housewife and the Modern: The Home And Appearance in Women's Magazines, 1954 1969." PhD. Dissertation, the University of Manchester, 2010.
- Rivkin-Fish, Michele. "Conceptualizing Feminist Strategies for Russian Reproductive Politics: Abortion, Surrogate Motherhood, and Family Support after Socialism." *Signs* 38, no. 3 (2013): 569-593.
- Robinson, Richard D. "38-Communism in the Villages." *Letters from Turkey*, September 25, 1949. Istanbul: Robert College, reprinted for the Peace Corp by Permission of the Insitute for Current World Affairs, 1949.
- Rosario, Vernon A. *Homosexuality and Science: A Guide to Debates*. Santa Barbara, Denver and Oxford: ABC-CLIO, 2002.
- Porter, Roy and Lesley Hall. *The Facts of Life: the Creation of Sexual Knowledge in Britain*, 1650-1950. New Haven and London: Yale University, 1995.
- Rosenblatt, Louise M. *Literature as Exploration*, 5th edition. New York: MLA, 1995.

- Rubin, David A. "The Classification of Sex: Alfred Kinsey and the Organization of Knowledge by Donna J. Drucker, Gentlemen's Disagreement: Alfred Kinsey, Lewis Terman, and the Sexual Politics of Smart Men by Peter Hegarty, Fuckology: Critical Essays on John Money's Diagnostic Concepts by Lisa Downing, Iain Morland, and Nikki Sullivan." *Signs* 41, no. 2 (2016): 464-471.
- Rupp, Leila J. "Toward a Global History of Same-Sex Sexuality." *Journal of the History of Sexuality*, no. 10 (2001).
- Ryan, Maura A. "The Introduction of Assisted Reproductive Technologies in the "Developing World": A Test Case for Evolving Methodologies in Feminist Bioethics." *Signs* 34, no. 4 (2009): 805-825.
- Saktanber, Ayşe. "Kemalist Kadın Hakları Söylemi." In *Modern Türkiye'de Siyasi Düşünce: Kemalizm cilt: 2*, edited by Murat Gültekingil and Tanıl Bora, 323-334. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2001.
- Sancar, Serpil. *Türk Modernleşmesinin Cinsiyeti*. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2012.
- Sanger, Alexander. Beyond Reproductive Freedom in the 21st Century Choice. New York: PublicAffairs, 2004.
- Sanz, Veronica. "No Way Out of the Binary: A Critical History of the Scientific Production of Sex." *Signs* 43, no. 1 (2017): 1-27.
- Saraçoğlu, Kemal. "Gençlik ve Seksoloji Bilgisi." In *Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no.1: Genç Kızlığın En Esrarlı Tarafı: Bakirelik,* 3. İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959.
- Sargent, W.E. *Evlilik Hayatında Daha Bahtiyar Olmanın Yolları*. Translated by Ömer Rıza Doğrul. İstanbul: Arif Bolat Kitabevi, 1942.
- Sarıtaş, Ezgi. "Seksoloji: 1945-1955 arası Türkiye'de Cinsel Terbiye." *Fe Dergi* 4, no. 2 (2012): 57-71.
- Sarıtaş, Ezgi and Yelda Şahin. "Ellili Yıllarda Kadın Hareketi." In *Türkiye'nin 1950'li Yılları*, edited by Mete Kaan Kaynar. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2015.

- Saymen, Ferit H. *Türk Medeni Hukuku, Umumi Prensipler I.* Istanbul: Kenan Matbaası, 1948.
- Scales, Peter. "Sex Education in the '70s and '80s: Accomplishments, Obstacles and Emerging Issues." *Family Relations* 30, no. 4, *Family Life Education* (1981): 557-566.
- Schrift, Alan D. "Discipline and Punish." In *A Companion to Foucault*, edited by Christopher Falzon, Timothy O'Leary, and Jana Sawicki, 137-153. Malden, Oxford, West Sussex: Wiley-Blackwell Publishing, 2013.
- Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no.1: Genç Kızlığın En Esrarlı Tarafı: Bakirelik. İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959.
- Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 2: Genç erkekte cinsiyet firtinası. İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959.
- Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no.3: Gençkızların Cinsi Bilgisizlikleri . İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959.
- Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 4: Genç erkeğin tehlikeli evreleri. İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959.
- Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 5: Kızlık Merdivenleri. İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959.
- Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 6: Genç erkeklerde rüya Kadınları. İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959.
- Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 7: Genç Kızlarda Cinsi Rüyalar. İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959.
- Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 8: Genç erkeklerde aşk korkusu. İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959.
- Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 9: Genç Kızlarda Sevilmek Arzusu. İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959.
- Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 10: Her genç erkeğin gözüyle Kadın. İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959.

- Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 11: Her Genç Kızın Gözüyle Erkek. İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959.
- Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 12: Fuhuş ve Fahişeler. İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959.
- Shalhoub-Kevorkian, Nadera. "Tecavüzün Kültürel Bir Tanımına Doğru: Filistin Toplumunda Tecavüz Mağdurlarıyla Çalışırken Karşılaşılan İkilimler." In *Müslüman Toplumlarda Kadın ve Cinsellik*. Edited by İpek İlkkaracan. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003.
- Shanley, Mary Lyndon and Adrienne Asch. "Involuntary Childlessness, Reproductive Technology, and Social Justice: The Medical Mask on Social Illness." *Signs* 34, no. 4 (2009): 851-874.
- Shannon, Christopher. "Sex, Science, and History." *Journal of Policy History* 12, no. 2 (2000).
- Shorter, Frederic C. "The Population of Turkey after the War of Independence," *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 17, no. 4 (1985): 417-441.
- Sigel, Lisa Z. "Name Your Pleasure: The Transformation of Sexual Language in Nineteenth Century British Pornography." *Journal of the History of Sexuality* 9, no.4 (2000), 395-419.
- ———. "Filth in the Wrong People's Hands: Postcards and the Expansion of Pornography in Britain and the Atlantic World, 1880—1914." *Journal of Social History* 33, no. 4 (2000), 859-885.
- ——. *Making Modern Love: Sexual Narratives and Identities in Interwar Britain.* Philadelphia: Temple UP, 2012.
- Simmons, Christina. *Making Marriage Modern: Women's Sexuality from the Progressive Era to World War II*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009.
- Sirman, Nükhet. "Kadınların Milliyeti." In *Milliyetçilik: Modern Türkiye'de Siyasi Düşünce, cilt 4*, edited by Tanıl Bora, 226-245. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2002.

- ——. "Önsöz: Namusun Arka Planı." In *Haremler ve Kuzenler*, written by Germaine Tillion, 21-28. Translated by Şirin Tekeli, Nükhet Sirman. İstanbul: Metis Yayınları, 2006.
- ——. "The Making of Familial Citizenship in Turkey." in *Challenges to Citizenship in a Globalizing World: European Questions and Turkish Experiences*, edited by Fuat Keyman and Ahmet İçduygu. London: Routledge, 2005.
- Smith, Anna Marie. "Reproductive Technology, Family Law, and the Postwelfare State: The California Same- Sex Parents' Rights "Victories" of 2005." *Signs* 34, no. 4 (2009): 827-850.
- Smyth, Lisa. "The Cultural Politics of Sexuality and Reproduction in Northern Ireland." *Sociology*, no. 40 (2006).
- Stone, Hannah and Abraham Stone. *Evlilik Rehberi (Seksoloji Yayınları, Yeni Seri, 2)*. Translated by N.P. Istanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1955.
- Stone, Hannah and Abraham Stone. 200 Sual 200 Cevap. Istanbul: İtimat, 1963.
- Sunstein, Cass R. and Richard Thaler, "Privatizing Marriage," The Monist 91, no. 3-4 (2008), xxxx.
- Sutton, Katie and Kirsten Leng. "Forum Introduction: Rethinking the Gendered History of Sexology." *Gender & History* 31, no. 2 (2019): 256–265.
- Szasz, Ivonne. "Fertile Matters: The Politics of Mexican- Origin Women's Reproduction by Elena R. Gutiérrez." *Signs* 34, no. 4 (2009): 1008-1010.
- Şenol-Cantek, Funda. "Ellili Yıllar Türkiye'sinde Basın." In *Türkiye'nin* 1950'li Yılları, edited by Mete Kaan Kaynar, 423-450. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2015.

- Şentürk, Ayşegül. "1931 Matbuat Kanunu'ndaki Değişiklikler Üzerine Kronolojik Bir Değerlendirme: Basın Hürriyeti Bağlamında Meclis Tartışmaları ve Basındaki Yankılar" *Tarih İncelemeleri Dergisi* 30, no. 1 (2015): 199-230.
- Tahincioğlu, A. Nevin Yıldız. Namusun Halleri. İstanbul: Postiga, 2011.
- Tahir-Gürçağlar, Şehnaz."Tercüme Bürosu Nasıl Doğdu. Birinci Türk Neşriyat Kongresi ve Çeviri Planlaması." In *Çeviriyi Düşünenler*, edited by M. Rıfat, 48-58. Istanbul: Dünya Yayıncılık, 2003.
- ——. "The Politics and Poetics of Translation in Turkey 1923-1960" PhD. Dissertation, Boğaziçi University, 2001.
- Taylor, Chloe. "Foucault and Familial Power." *Hypatia* 27, no. 1 (2012): 201-218.
- Tevetoğlu, Fethi. *Faşist Yok, Komünist Var*. İstanbul: Komünizmle Mücadele Yayınları, 1962.
- Thomson, Rachel. "Moral Rhetoric and Public Health Pragmatism: The Recent Politics of Sex Education." *Feminist Review*, no. 48 (1994).
- Thorne, Barrie. "Feminism and the Family: Two Decades of Thought." In *Rethinking the Family: Some Feminist Questions*, edited Barrie Thorne and Marilyn Yalom. Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1992.
- Tiefer, Leonore. "New Perspective on Sexuality: from rigor (motris) to richness." *The Journal of Sexuality* 28, no. 4 (1991).
- Toledano, Sarah Jane and Kristin Zeiler, "Hosting the Others' Child? Relational Work and Embodied Responsibility in Altruistic Surrogate Motherhood." *Feminist Theory* 18, no. 2 (2017): 159 175.
- Toury, Gideon. "The Notion of 'Assumed Translation' An Invitation to a New Discussion." In *Letterlijkheid, Woordelijheid/Literality, Verbality*, edited by Henri Bloemen, Erik Hertog and Winibert Segers. Antwerpen, Harmelen: Fantom, 1995.

- Truog, Robert D. "Patients and Doctors The Evolution of a Relationship," *The New England Journal Of Medicine* 366, no. 7 (2012): 581-585.
- Tuna, Yalçın. "Irza Geçme." Adalet Dergisi, no. 5 (1955): 446-476.
- Tunakan, Seniha. "Antropoloji ve Babalık Tayini." *Antropoloji*, no. 1 (1963): 1-4.
- Turner, Bryan S. "Citizenship, Reproduction and the State: International Marriage and Human Rights." *Citizenship Studies* 12, no. 1 (2008).
- TÜİK, İstatistik Göstergeler 1923-2009. Ankara: Türkiye İstatistik Kurumu, 2010.
- Türkent, Münir. "Cinsi hayat ve Gençlik." In *Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no.1: Genç Kızlığın En Esrarlı Tarafı: Bakirelik*, 1-2. İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959.
- Türkeş, A. Ömer. "Aşk Romanlarının Unutulmaz Yazarları Ask Olsun!" *Virgül*, no. 18 (1999).
- ——. "Romana Yazılan Tarih." *Toplum ve Bilim*, no. 91 (2002): 166-212.
- -----. "Cinsel Özgürlük Neden Masum Değildir?" *Milliyet Sanat* (2004).
- . "Muhafazakar Romanlarda Muhafaza Edilen Neydi?" In Modern Türkiye'de Siyasi Düşünce: Muhafazarkarlık. Edited by Ahmet Çiğdem. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003.
- Türkiye Nüfusu: 22 Ekim 1950, Genel Nüfus Sayımı, Publication no: 410. İstanbul: T.C. Başbakanlık İstatistik Genel Müdürlüğü, 1961.
- Tyler, Melissa. "Managing between the Sheets: Lifestyle Magazines and the Management of Sexuality in Everyday Life." *Sexualities* 7, no. 1 (2004): 81-106.
- Ullman, Sharon R. Sex Seen: The Emergence of Modern Sexuality in America. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997.

- Urban, Rudolf (Rudolph) von. *Aşk Sanatı*. Translated by Muzaffer Aşkın. Istanbul: Seksoloji Yayınları, 1950.
- . Evlilikte Cinsi İstek (Seksoloji Yayınları). Translated by N.P. Istanbul: İtimat, 1963.
- Ülken, Hilmi Ziya. "Aile," in *Aile Yazıları 1: Temel Kavramlar, Yapı ve Tarihi Süreç*, edited by Beylü Dikeçligil and Ahmet Çiğdem, 268-278. Ankara: T.C: Başbakanlık Aile Araştırma Kurumu Başkanlığı Yayınları, 1991.
- Üstel, Füsun. "Makbul Vatandaş"ın Peşinde, II. Meşruiyet'ten Bugüne Vatandaşlık Eğitimi. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2004.
- Varsa, Eszter. "Sex Advice East and West: Sex education and Family Planning in Cold War Austria and Hungary." *The History of the Family* 25, no. 4 (2020): 649-670.
- Velde, Theodor Hendrik van de. *Cinsi Münasebetler (Yeni Seksoloji Yayınları, 3)*. Translated by .N.P. Istanbul: Yeni Seksoloji, 1961.
- Vezzani, Cintia Kozonoi. "Prohibited Pleasures: Female Literacy, Sex and Adultery in Turn-of-the-Century Brazilian Fiction" PhD. Dissertation, Northwestern University, 2021.
- Wagner, Brooke. "Becoming a Sexual Being: Overcoming Constraints on Female Sexuality." *Sexualities* 12, no. 3 (2009).xxxx
- Walby, Sylvia. *Theorizing Patriarchy*. Oxford and Cambridge: Blackwell Publishers, 1997.
- Waters, Chris. "Sexology." In *Palgrave Advances in the Modern History of Sexuality*, edited by Harry G. Cocks and Matt Houlbrook. Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2006.
- Weeks, Jeffrey. Making Sexual History. Cambridge: Polity Press, 2000.
- Whiting, Betty. Her Dul Kadın Neler Bilmelidir, İnsan Hayatı Serisi, 4. Translated by Selim Yetkili. Istanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1956.

- Wieringa, Saskia E. "Portrait of a Women's Marriage: Navigating between Lesbophobia and Islamophobia." *Signs* 36, no. 4 (2011): 785-793.
- Williams, Christine L and Arlene Stein. "Introduction." In *Sexuality and Gender*, edited by Christine L Williams and Arlene Stein. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 2002.
- Wohlmann, Anita. "Of Termites and Ovaries on Strike: Rethinking Medical Metaphors of the Female Body." *Signs* 43, no. 1 (2017): 127-150.
- Wolf, Joan B. "Framing Mothers: Childcare Research and the Normalization of Maternal Care." *Signs* 41, no. 3 (2016): 627-651.
- Yapar Gönenç, Aslı. "Türkiye'de Dergiciliğin Tarihsel Gelişimi," *İletişim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 29 (2007): 63-78.
- Yapça, Talha. "Gençliğe Doğru Yolu Gösterme Ümidi." In *Seksoloji ve Gençlik Hayatı, no. 3: Gençkızların Cinsi Bilgisizlikleri*, 2. İstanbul: Hadise Yayınları, 1959.
- Yıldırım, Umut. "The Representation and the Perception of the United States," Master's Thesis, Boğaziçi University, 2002.
- Yıldırmaz Sinan. "Demokrat Parti ve Dönemi: Sol Tarihyazımında "Kayıp" Zamanın İzinde." *Praksis*, no. 18 (2009): 23-42.
- ——. "From "Imaginary" to "Real": A Social History of the Peasantry in Turkey" PhD. Dissertation, Boğaziçi University, 2009.
- ——. "The Mass Mobilization in the Elections of the Democrat Party Period." Master's Thesis, Boğaziçi University, 2002.
- "Nefretin ve Korkunun Rengi: "Kızıl."" in *Türk Sağı: Mitler, Fetişler, Düşman İmgeleri*, edited İnci Özkan Kerestecioğlu and Güven Gürkan Öztan. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2012.
- Yıldız, Nuran. "Demokrat Parti İktidarı (1950-1960) ve Basın." *Ankara Üniversitesi SBF Dergisi* 51, no: 1 (1996): 481-505.
- Yurttagüler, Laden. "Social Policies on Female Body in the 1930s in Turkey" Master's Thesis, Boğaziçi University, 2004.

- Yuval Davis, Nira and Floya Anthias, *Woman-Nation-State*. London: MacMillan, 1989.
- Zeisel, Hans. "Book Review on "Sexual Behavior in the Human Female by Alfred C. Kinsey," *The University Of Chicago Law Review*, no. 21 (1954): 517-525.
- Zihnioğlu, Yaprak. Kadınsız Inkilap. Istanbul: Metis Yayınları, 2003.
- Zimmerman, Jonathan. "A Family of Man? Sex Education in a Cold War World, 1940-1964." in *Too Hot to Handle: A Global History of Sex Education*, edited by Jonathan Zimmerman. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2015.
- Zola, Irving Kenneth. "Medicine as an institution of social control." *Social Review* 20, no. 4 (1972): 487-504.