

THE DIFFUSION OF MALCOLM X AS A  
POLITICAL SYMBOL AMONG TURKISH ISLAMISTS

JEFFREY HOWARD BISHKU-AYKUL

BOĞAZİÇİ UNIVERSITY

2020

THE DIFFUSION OF MALCOLM X AS A  
POLITICAL SYMBOL AMONG TURKISH ISLAMISTS

Thesis submitted to the  
Institute for Graduate Studies in Social Sciences  
in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Arts  
in  
International Relations: Turkey, Europe, and the Middle East

by  
Jeffrey Howard Bishku-Aykul

Boğaziçi University

2020

## DECLARATION OF ORIGINALITY

I, Jeffrey Howard Bishku-Aykul, certify that

- I am the sole author of this thesis and that I have fully acknowledged and documented in my thesis all sources of ideas and words, including digital resources, which have been produced or published by another person or institution;
- this thesis contains no material that has been submitted or accepted for a degree or diploma in any other educational institution;
- this is a true copy of the thesis approved by my advisor and thesis committee at Boğaziçi University, including final revisions required by them.

Signature.....

Date .....21/10/2020.....

## ABSTRACT

### The Diffusion of Malcolm X as a Political Symbol Among Turkish Islamists

This thesis investigates the influence of Malcolm X on contemporary Turkish Islamism. It applies a social movement theory framework to understand the role Turkish Islamist newspaper columnists have played in interpreting and spreading Malcolm X's image and ideas. A discourse analysis is applied to 242 columns published in three Turkish Islamist newspapers between 1996 and 2019 to identify key themes in the literature. This study argues that Malcolm X's anti-colonial and pan-Islamist rhetoric has aided in his adoption as a political symbol by Turkish Islamists. Furthermore, it finds that by adopting Malcolm X as a political symbol, Turkish Islamists have selectively emphasized certain elements of the Black nationalist's message. This study contributes to the field of English-language American studies by closely examining how Malcolm X is understood in contemporary Turkey. It also contributes to social movement theory by analyzing Malcolm X's interpretation in Turkey as a case study.

## ÖZET

### Türk İslamcılar Arasında

#### Malcolm X'in Siyasi Bir Sembol Olarak Yayılımı

Bu tez, Malcolm X'in çağdaş Türk İslamcılığı üzerindeki etkisini araştırmaktadır. Sosyal hareket teorisi çerçevesi içerisinde Türk İslamcı gazete köşe yazarlarının Malcolm X'in imajını ve fikirlerini yorumlama ve yaymada oynadıkları rol incelendi. Literatürdeki ana temaları belirlemek için 1996 ile 2019 yılları arasında üç Türk İslamcı gazetede yayınlanan 242 köşe yazısına söylem analizi uygulandı. Bu çalışma, Malcolm X'in sömürgecilik karşıtı ve pan-İslamcı söyleminin, Türk İslamcılar tarafından siyasi bir sembol olarak benimsenmesine yardımcı olduğunu savunuyor. Dahası, Malcolm X'i siyasi bir sembol olarak benimseyerek, Türk İslamcılarının Siyah milliyetçinin mesajının belirli unsurlarını seçici bir şekilde vurguladıkları sonucuna varıyor. Bu çalışma, Malcolm X'in günümüz Türkiye'sinde nasıl anlaşıldığını yakından inceleyerek İngiliz dili Amerikan çalışmaları alanına katkı sağlamaktadır. Ayrıca, Malcolm X'in Türkiye'deki yorumunu bir vaka çalışması olarak analiz ederek sosyal hareket teorisine katkıda bulunur.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Foremost, I would like to thank my advisor, professor Mert Arslanalp, for his extensive support in this project. This endeavor would have simply been impossible without his invaluable insight and guidance. I am also deeply grateful for the support of: Asli Orhon, MIR Administrative Coordinator; professors Zeynep Kadirbeyoğlu and Deniz Erkmen, of my thesis defense committee; the Master of Arts Program in International Relations: Turkey, Europe and the Middle East; and Boğaziçi University.

*Dedicated to Sara, for the idea; to mom and dad, for their encouragement; and to  
nanny, for her insistence.*

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1: MALCOLM X: AN INTERNATIONAL MAN OF INTRIGUE .....	1
1.1 Introduction.....	1
1.2 Research contributions and implications .....	5
CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW: FRAMING AND DIFFUSION .....	9
2.1 Overview .....	9
2.2 Defining social movements.....	10
2.3 Framing, collective action frames and frame alignment.....	11
2.4 Diffusion and its mechanisms .....	14
2.5 Malcolm X, decontextualized .....	17
CHAPTER 3: THE TRANSMITTER: MALCOLM X.....	19
3.1 Overview .....	19
3.2 Malcolm X's era.....	20
3.3 Malcolm X's troubled beginnings: articulating the problem .....	23
3.4 Malcolm X in the Nation of Islam: adopting the solution .....	24
3.5 Malcolm X looks east: bridging frames.....	27
3.6 Malcolm X's legacy .....	31
CHAPTER 4: THE ADOPTER: TURKISH ISLAMISM .....	34
4.1 Overview .....	34
4.2 Islamism as a political project.....	34
4.3 Political Islamism and anti-Western sentiment in the global context.....	37
4.4 Turkish Islamism and its relationship to the state.....	39
4.5 Turkish Islamism and its Relationship to the World.....	45
CHAPTER 5: THE DIFFUSER: TURKISH ISLAMIST COLUMNISTS .....	55



5.1 Overview .....	55
5.2 Methodology and dataset .....	55
5.3 Discourse analysis and discussion .....	60
CHAPTER 6: CONCLUSION: A WAY FORWARD? .....	78
APPENDIX A: MILLI GAZETE COLUMNS.....	82
APPENDIX B: YENI SAFAK COLUMNS.....	93
APPENDIX C: YENI AKIT COLUMNS .....	108
APPENDIX D: SEARCH QUERIES .....	114
REFERENCES.....	115

## CHAPTER 1

### MALCOLM X: AN INTERNATIONAL MAN OF INTRIGUE

#### 1.1 Introduction

Although I grew up in the United States, it was not until I moved to Turkey that I read *The Autobiography of Malcolm X*. I finally did so in 2016, upon the recommendation of a colleague at the English-language Turkish state broadcaster, TRT World. As a longtime Turkish-American resident Chicago who grew up near the onetime home of Malcolm X's mentor, Elijah Muhammad, I found the book to be a fascinating and multidimensional account of Islamic and American identity. Like a Rorschach inkblot, Malcolm X's life story could mean different things to different readers, depending on their experiences, beliefs and cultural background.

Nearly two years passed, until a January 2018 walk in Istanbul's Fatih neighborhood, where I found Malcolm X's face staring at me through the window of an Islamic bookstore. Perched atop a pile of books covering subjects such as Russia, the Palestinian-Israeli conflict and Turkish-Islamic thought sat a collection of speeches by the 20th century Black nationalist leader. The store was promoting a copy of *Challenging America (Amerika'ya Meydan Okurken)*, the first in a two-part series of speeches translated by Istanbul-based writer Buğra Özler; through the window, I could also see Alex Haley's *Autobiography of Malcolm X*. Three months after that, I saw Malcolm X's name graffitied near the bookstore. I also saw it in the nearby Balat neighborhood, and farther away, in Ortaköy. It was unclear whether these names were the work of the same vandal but seeing Malcolm X's speeches displayed so prominently in a bookshop window and his name scribbled publicly in a

city so distant from his native U.S. indicated a Turkish connection to him. These encounters served as the inspiration for this thesis, which investigates perceptions of Malcolm X among Turkish Islamists; they begged such questions as: How did Malcolm X come to be a potent symbol among Turkish Islamists? How do Turkish Islamists interpret him? And in adapting Malcolm X to their own cultural and political climate, which elements of his original message are lost? Which elements are emphasized, and which are overlooked?

Malcolm X occupies a unique position in United States history. He was one of the most prominent Black leaders of the 20th century, perhaps only second to the Reverend Martin Luther King, Jr. Yet unlike his counterpart, whose activism won a Nobel Prize, he was a fierce critic of the American political system. He spoke of separating Black from white Americans and favored Islam over the majority religion of Christianity. He traveled throughout Europe, the Middle East and Africa, publicizing American race issues, and spoke passionately about the rise of newly independent countries abroad. He associated with such foreign leaders such as Egypt's Gamal Abdel Nasser, Ghana's Kwame Nkrumah and Cuba's Fidel Castro. His political and religious journey of transformation culminated with a 1964 hajj, and a year before his assassination, he renamed himself *el-Hajj Malik el-Shabazz*, renouncing the Black supremacist Nation of Islam, to which he had formerly belonged.

Today, the memory of Martin Luther King occupies a territory within the American political mainstream, with even a federal holiday named after him. The memory of Malcolm X, however, occupies a space more firmly outside the American mainstream, and appeals directly to Muslims internationally, including in Turkey. An American-born convert who found Islam at a time when it was far more

culturally marginal—before the advent of the Internet, 9/11, the War on Terror and immigration liberalization—he became one of the religion’s most public and controversial faces in America. He advocated for Islam as a solution to American racism, referenced independence movements abroad, and internationalized the Black struggle for rights in America by linking it to anti-colonial and Islamic movements worldwide. His travels linked Harlem to Cairo, and Mecca to Chicago, forging a link between Black Americans, the Islamic world and newly independent nations abroad. Thus, Malcolm X’s political activities prove a fertile area of study, particularly as they regard global movements and international politics.

This thesis focuses on how Turkish Islamists employ the symbol of Malcolm X and his words. It relies on social movement theory, Turkish history, American history, and empirical evidence in the form of Islamist newspaper articles to examine: 1) Malcolm X’s involvement in transmitting his own ideas abroad, 2) the language and contexts in which Malcolm X has been mentioned by Turkish Islamists, and 3) and the implications of this interpretation. This thesis argues that by internationalizing his cause, Malcolm X ultimately transmitted his ideas and himself as a symbol to Turkish Islamists, who have adopted them. It shows that although Turkish Islamist newspaper columnists have played a role in diffusing these, in the process of doing so they have also metaphorized the Black experience in America and selectively stripped the political symbol of Malcolm X of its subversive roots.

These arguments are developed by drawing on social movement scholarship, in particular how social movements create and transmit meaning. Examining the sociological concept of “framing” and political concepts of “diffusion,” “transmission” and “adoption” helps us to understand and analyze the spread of Malcolm X as a symbol and his role in it, as well as the role of Turkish Islamists in

relation to their adoption of his ideas and interpretation of him. This thesis presents Malcolm X's ideological evolution in terms of "framing;" that is, he links his political views to anti-colonial and pan-Islamist movements abroad, thereby reaching a broader audience and "transmitting" his ideas to the Turkish Islamist movement. It details Malcolm X's ideological evolution and role as a transmitter of ideas, and how the contemporary Turkish Islamist movement, ranging from Necmettin Erbakan's landmark *Milli Gorus* (National View) party through the present day, became a likely adopter of Malcolm X as a symbol. The latter has to do with the linkages between the movement and broader global political developments in the mid-to-late 20th century, primarily Islamism's position against Western hegemony and support for pan-Islamism.

In order to explore the diffusion of Malcolm X as a political symbol in the Islamist movement, I turn to the writings of Turkish Islamist columnists, who do the diffusion work as the intellectuals of the movement. Over the course of decades, Turkish Islamists founded many newspapers with a wide readership. Drawing from a discourse analysis of newspaper columns, I identify major themes, key historical periods and authors featured in three prominent Islamist Turkish publications: *Milli Gazete*, *Yeni Akit* and *Yeni Safak*. More than 242 such newspaper columns by 85 authors mentioning Malcolm X, published between 1996 and 2019, were collected by devising and executing dozens of advanced online search queries. This thesis unearths and discusses at length three phenomena that define references to Malcolm X in this body of work. First, columnists assign credibility and significance to Malcolm X's Muslim identity: Throughout the columns, Malcolm X is framed as reputable and significant because of his Muslim beliefs, featured as one of a class of important Islamic martyrs or political figures. Second, Malcolm X is referenced to

reaffirm negative beliefs about America: These columns point to the Black nationalist's rhetoric to build their case against America and its policies at home and abroad. Finally, discussion of Malcolm X and the Black American experience is defined by metaphors and analogies—for example, Malcolm X is compared to Turkish President Recep Tayyip Erdoğan, or his defiance is compared to Turkish defiance toward Germany.

Ultimately, this thesis finds that in the years since Malcolm X successfully internationalized his political cause, it has been readapted and reinterpreted by Turkish Islamist newspaper columnists to make the case for their own political causes in contemporary Turkey. It shows that while Malcolm X has been used as a political symbol for righteous subversion and defiance against Western hegemony, he has also been used in contemporary appeals to state authority by Turkish Islamists, who have achieved political hegemony with the rise of the ruling AK Party. Most notably, these columnists compare Malcolm X's struggle for justice as a Black American to their own perceived struggles as Turkish Islamists, and emphasize his Muslim identity as a source of righteousness and strength, without comparing his political status as a Black American to that of longtime ethnic minorities in Turkey, such as Jews, Armenians, Greeks or Kurds.

## 1.2 Research contributions and implications

Although the areas of study this thesis brings together may appear disparate and wide-ranging, there are at least four major justifications for this research. First, America's race issue is internationally recognized. American politics is discussed around the world, both in terms of the country's foreign relations and internal affairs. Especially since the end of World War II and the birth of the Cold War, the country

has maintained a high international profile, and thus its successes and failures have been the focus of much observation and scrutiny. Since America's founding, the government's handling of race has been a central domestic political issue, from the current era's #BlackLivesMatter movement, to the Civil Rights Movement, and the slave trade. Martin Luther King Jr's 1964 Nobel Peace Prize is a testament to the global reverberations of this history, as are Malcolm X's politically charged travels throughout Europe, Africa and the Middle East.

Second, Malcolm X is recognized in Turkey. Although his name does not feature prominently in Turkish political discourse, Malcolm X has been the focus of some major headlines and politically significant events. In September 2018, for example, Turkish President Recep Tayyip Erdoğan met with Malcolm X's daughters, Ilyasah and Qubilah Shabazz, on the sidelines of the 73rd UN General Assembly; in an interview around that time, Ilyasah Shabazz said that Erdoğan represented her father's legacy (Daily Sabah, 2018a). A month later, amid ongoing tensions between the U.S. and Turkey, the Turkish government renamed the avenue where a new American embassy was being constructed after Malcolm X (The Guardian, 2018). Both events were covered extensively in Turkish language media. It does not appear that Malcolm X himself ever visited Turkey, but he met with at least one Turkish official during his travels abroad, according to his autobiography. Of his 1964 trip to Mecca, he said, "Kasem Gülek, of the Turkish Parliament, beaming with pride, informed me that from Turkey alone over six hundred buses—over fifty thousand Muslims—had made the pilgrimage. I told him that I dreamed to see the day when shiploads and planeloads of American Muslims would come to Mecca for the Hajj" (X, 1999, p. 350). This meeting between Gülek and Malcolm X is significant, as

Gülek had once served as Turkey's Minister of Transport, the Minister of Public Works and Secretary General of the CHP.

Third, the interpretation of Malcolm X by Turkish Islamists serves as a social movement theory case study. On a broad level, the references to Malcolm X that this study investigates show how a mid-20th century Black nationalist figure in America has impacted influential contemporary producers of Turkish Islamist discourse. Pre-existing scholarship on social movement theory, with roots in sociology, details how social movements transmit and adopt ideas, and the factors that play a role in this process. Thus, detailing the evolution of Malcolm X into an exemplary symbol for Turkish Islamist ideals offers us an opportunity to better understand an ongoing phenomenon already recognized by social movement theory, and in turn, this thesis may help scholars further refine theories detailing the transmission and adoption of ideas among different social movements.

Finally, investigating sentiment about Malcolm X in Turkey represents an opportunity to expand and internationalize the field of American studies. Because Malcolm X was an American Black nationalist leader with a major impact on his own society, much of what is written about him is in English and published in the United States; however, as noted earlier, he has attracted attention across the world, including in Turkey. By analyzing the reception of Malcolm X by Turkish Islamists, this thesis allows scholars to better contextualize domestic U.S. discourse and policy. In her 2018 book on American influence in Turkey, *The Limits of Westernization*, Perin Gürel wrote that “the growing literature on Occidentalism, which, in part, analyzes Asian uses of ‘the West,’ has yet to make its mark on cultural studies of the United States and Middle East,” adding that this is in part due to “the vernacular tradition” noted by Edwards and Goankar “of (monolingual) American



studies...bilingual Americanist research on foreign reactions to U.S. hegemony has also been dominated by European texts and archives” (as cited in Gürel, 2017, pp. 8-9). As this study will show, the West comprises a crucial element of Malcolm X’s discourse and how he is discussed among Turkish Islamist columnists. By researching how Malcolm X is understood in Turkish for an English-language university in Turkey, this bilingual study transcends this so-called “vernacular tradition” that Gürel observes in American studies.

This thesis is organized into six chapters; this introduction, which has offered a broad overview of Malcolm X and the following investigation into how Turkish Islamists interpret him, serves as Chapter 1; Chapter 2 provides a literature review of theory and terminology related to how social movements influence each other; Chapter 3 is a review of Malcolm X’s life and times, and the role he played in transmitting his own ideas; Chapter 4 reviews the evolution of, and influences on, the contemporary Turkish Islamist movement; Chapter 5 features a discourse analysis of columns in Turkish Islamist newspapers that reference Malcolm X; and finally, Chapter 6 provides concluding reflections and remarks on Malcolm X’s relationship to Turkish Islamists.

## CHAPTER 2

### LITERATURE REVIEW: FRAMING AND DIFFUSION

#### 2.1 Overview

This literature review focuses on social movement theory, specifically as it regards the international flow and interpretation of political ideas and symbols. I have chosen this field because it offers a means by which to define, and in turn identify, the mechanisms by which Malcolm X has influenced contemporary Turkish Islamists. Malcolm X's image and ideas have circulated widely across the world after his death, with references to him by Turkish Islamist newspapers serving as an example of a social movement in one country (American Black nationalism) influencing another one abroad (contemporary Turkish Islamism). Social movement theory, which relies heavily on sociological concepts, offers a framework for understanding how the former transmitted Malcolm X as a symbol to the latter.

While this thesis covers Malcolm X's life trajectory as a whole, the following literature review and subsequent arguments emphasize his final form before he was assassinated, as an orthodox Muslim who advocated for Black American rights on the international stage. Malcolm X—who passed away in 1965—is presented as a transmitter of ideas associated with Black nationalism to the Turkish Islamist movement of the 1990s through today. This literature review frames this phenomenon within existing literature on social movement theory and the cross-national diffusion of symbols and ideas. The following framework builds the foundation for this thesis' ultimate argument that the diffusion of Malcolm X as a

political symbol has helped to decontextualize it and facilitate its inclusion in Turkish Islamist appeals to authority.

## 2.2 Defining social movements

Writing in 1992, sociologist Mario Diani noted that while the concept of social movement was being increasingly studied, and “several scholars have provided analytical definitions of it, we still lack, to my knowledge, a systematic comparison of these conceptualisations” (Diani, 1992, p. 1). Thus, he proposed this “synthetic” definition: “A social movement is a network of informal interactions between a plurality of individuals, groups and/or organizations, engaged in a political or cultural conflict, on the basis of a shared collective identity” (Diani, 1992, p. 13).

Charles Tilly described social movements as involving three elements, as instances “in which people making collective claims on authorities frequently form special-purpose associations or named coalitions, hold public meetings, communicate their programs to available media, stage processions, rallies, or demonstrations, and through all these activities make concerned public displays of worthiness, unity, numbers, and commitment” (Tilly, 2004, p. 29).

Thus, this study concerns two broadly defined movements: Turkish Islamism and American Black nationalism. By Diani’s standard, both Turkish Islamists and U.S. Black nationalists would be seen as representing social movements. Each group has formed a “network of informal interactions between a plurality of individuals, groups and/or organizations”; furthermore, they are each “engaged in a political or cultural conflict, on the basis of a shared collective identity” (Diani, 1992, p. 13). Broadly speaking, in the case of Turkish Islamists, this conflict regards law and lifestyles in the modern Turkish State and is based on Muslim identity; meanwhile

the U.S. Black nationalist movement is a response to racial injustice that seeks rights and self-determination for Black Americans. Finally, both movements exhibit Tilly's stated characteristics: each have sought concessions from political authorities, waged highly public campaigns involving action on multiple levels, and include committed participants who emphasize their strength (Tilly, 2004, p. 29). The following sections of this chapter will help us understand how disparate movements might influence one another.

### 2.3 Framing, collective action frames and frame alignment

Recognizing how social movements construct meaning—that is, how they employ “frames”—is key to understanding how they transmit symbols and ideas to one another (Benford and Snow, 2000, p. 614). In his seminal work, “Frame Analysis: An Essay on the Organization of Experience,” sociologist Erving Goffman writes that “definitions of a situation are built up in accordance with principles of organization which govern events—at least social ones—and our subjective involvement in them; frame is the word I use to refer to such of these basic elements as I am able to identify” (Goffman, 1986, pp. 10-11). He proceeds to explain that individuals adopt “primary frameworks”: “schemata of interpretation” that provide “what would otherwise be a meaningless aspect of the scene into something that is meaningful...each primary framework allows its user to locate, perceive, identify, and label a seemingly infinite number of concrete occurrences defined in its terms” (Goffman, 1986, p. 21). Robert Entman writes that frames respond to problems by defining them, identifying their causes, morally judging actors linked to them and presenting solutions or treatments for them (Entman, 1993, p. 52). Noting that the concept of framing is not limited to sociology, and drawing from discussion in a

variety of fields, Benford and Snow describe a frame as “an interpretive schemata that simplifies and condenses” the broader world to make sense of elements of the present or the past (Snow and Benford, 1992, pp. 136-7). In other words, a subjective filter is applied to the events or problems that we experience, which in turn impacts how we judge them and our reactions to them. However, the concept of frames extends well beyond individual experiences; it has also proven useful in analyzing social movements.

“Collective action frames” help to describe how entire social movements act within and make sense of the world. Groups of people interpret and react to problems similar to individuals. Benford and Snow write that collective action frames “are constructed in part as movement adherents negotiate a shared understanding of some problematic condition or situation they define as in need of change, make attributions regarding who or what is to blame, articulate an alternative set of arrangements, and urge others to act in concert to affect change” (Benford and Snow, 2000, p. 615). Thus, a movement’s collective action frame provides the blueprint for understanding a problem and how to fix it. Yet unlike an individual, this negotiation over the nature of a problem may play out publicly; William A. Gamson notes that “movements may have internal battles over which particular frame will prevail or may offer several frames for different constituencies,” despite agreeing on the need for action (Gamson, 1992, p. 7). Furthermore, he argues that collective action frames feature three components: injustice, referring to a sense of “moral indignation,” agency, referring to the understanding that the group can change the situation through collective action, and identity, referring to how groups define who they are and how their values differ from others (Gamson 1992, p. 7). As movements, both American Black nationalism and Turkish Islamism feature these components.

Snow and Benford argue that whether a movement is successful in attracting support depends in part on how well they perform three “core framing tasks”; these include identifying a need to change something due to an event or aspect of life, proposing a solution to the problem, and reasoning for or a call to engage in an action that will fix the issue (Snow and Benford, 1988, p. 199). Together, Snow and Benford maintain, these three tasks involve establishing a consensus and motivating the group to take action—the better developed these are, the more successful the group will be in mobilization (Snow and Benford, 1998, p. 199). According to Stefania Vicari, these three tasks will shape the movement’s discourse, bringing about a “shared vocabulary of action” consisting of “claims, mottos, and logos” (Vicari, 2010, p. 506).

There is also the question of how social movements appeal to adherents’ frames. A person’s perspective must align with that of a social movement organization so that they participate; Snow et al. refer to this as “frame alignment” (Snow et al., 1986, p. 464). They identify four so-called frame alignment processes: frame bridging, frame amplification, frame extension and frame transformation (Snow et al., 1986, 467). Frame bridging refers to the linkage of an unconnected frames; frame amplification refers to application of a frame to specific situations or issues; frame extension, refers to appealing to interests and points of view that are significant to potential followers; and frame transformation refers to changing the frames of individuals to adhere to that of the group’s (Benford and Snow, 2000, p. 624-5). The two authors write that, “Bridging can occur between a movement and individuals, through the linkage of a movement organization with an unmobilized sentiment pool or public opinion cluster, or across social movements” (Benford and Snow, 2000, p. 624). As the next chapter will show, Malcolm X engaged in frame

bridging by internationalizing the cause of American Black nationalism; he aligned the case for Black power in the United States with broader themes of global human rights, anti-colonialism and global Islamic unity. It was this framing process which Malcolm X initiated that eventually allowed for Turkish Islamist columnists to participate in a process of so-called “diffusion.” While these columnists do not appear to have adopted a Black nationalist collective action frame, they have made great use of Malcolm X as a symbol.

#### 2.4 Diffusion and its mechanisms

The aforementioned authors indicate that social movements frame issues collectively and attract and encourage participation through framing. Scholars in the field use the term “diffusion” to describe the international spread of ideas, symbols and tactics among social movements. Della Porta and Sidney Tarrow specifically define diffusion as “the spread of movement ideas, practices, and frames from one country to another (della Porta and Tarrow, 2005, p. 2). They add that it “need not involve connections across borders, but only that challengers in one country or region adopt or adapt the organizational forms, collective action frames, or targets of those in other countries or regions” (della Porta and Tarrow, 2005, p. 3).

Doug McAdam and Dieter Rucht identify four elements of diffusion; they write that it involves an “emitter or transmitter,” an “adopter,” an “item that is diffused,” and a “channel of diffusion that may consist of person or media that link the transmitter and the adopter” (McAdam and Rucht, 1993, p. 59). In a discussion of their work Sarah Soule notes that their analysis implies that social movements in different countries and periods construct collective identities and that one group’s actions can impact other groups’ future actions (Soule, 2004, pp. 298-9). This case—

which involves both geographic and temporal diffusion—exhibits McAdam and Rucht’s four elements; in this case the Black nationalist movement is the transmitter, and the Turkish Islamist movement is the adopter. The “item” that is being diffused is the symbol of Malcolm X, and in this case columns in Turkish Islamist newspapers are the channel of diffusion. This item is an emotionally charged one for both movements, but it stands to reason that each group’s primary frameworks and framing of Malcolm X are distinct.

Strang and Soule write that: “Diffusion studies...provide an opportunity to observe the cultural construction of meaning, where we learn how practices are locally and globally interpreted, and ask why some practices flow while others languish” (Strang and Soule, 1998, p. 266). Three factors include: organizational ties, cultural characteristics and geographical proximity. First, regarding organizational ties: In Doug McAdam and Dieter Rucht’s 1993 article, “The Cross-National Diffusion of Movement Ideas,” they write that for people “in one country to identify with their counterparts in another, a nontrivial process of social construction must take place in which adopters fashion an account of themselves as sufficiently similar to that of the transmitters to justify using them as a model for their own actions. In our view, direct relational ties—even if minimal in number—between adopters and transmitters increase dramatically the chances of this process taking place...Early relational ties encourage the identification of adopters with transmitters, thereby amplifying the information available through non-relational channels” (McAdam and Rucht, 1993, pp. 73-4). Second, geographical proximity is a factor. According to della Porta and Tarrow, “it is more likely that diffusion will take place between countries that are close together geographically. In fact, interaction will tend to be the strongest between neighboring countries (della Porta



and Tarrow, 2005, p. 186). Finally, regarding culture, Strang and Meyer, write that “the cultural understanding that social entities belong to a common social category constructs a tie between them...where actors are seen as falling into the same category, diffusion should be rapid” (Strang and Meyer, 1993, p. 490). This case involves two movements with limited ties in distant countries, with a shared commitment to Islam culturally linking Malcolm X with Turkish Islamists.

This similar element helps facilitate the diffusion of Malcom X by Turkish Islamist newspaper columnists, while also rendering new and different interpretations of the Black nationalist figure. Literature suggests that diffusion can occur between disparate groups, such as Turkish Islamists and American Black nationalists. Sean Chabot writes that diffusion between different movements—such as that occurring between 20th century African-American and Indian intellectuals—are cases that are “exceptional yet highly significant: although ideas and practices are *more likely* to spread between similar social movements and contexts, *truly innovative ideas* and practices often come from divergent social movements and context” (Chabot, 2004, p. 37). However, in such cases, scholarship by Snow and Benford suggests we should not necessarily expect the interpretation of such disparate movements to be similar; they write that “very little is likely to be diffused, especially across different sociocultural contexts, without either alteration of the object of diffusion or alignment of aspects of the transmitting and adopting units,” adding that “social movement leaders and activists are actively engaged in a social constructionist process as framing agents: they not only strategically borrow or promote, but the objects of both — be they cultural ideas, items or practices — are framed behaviourally or lingually so as to enhance the prospect of their resonance with the host or target culture” (Snow and Benford, 1999, p. 38). As this thesis will

show, while Turkish Islamist newspaper columnists engage in adopting and diffusing Malcolm X as a resonant symbol within their movement, they also render him a general representation of defiance against Western hegemony, and overlook some of the implications of his experience as an ethnic minority.

## 2.5 Malcolm X, decontextualized

While this study of how Malcolm X is interpreted by contemporary Turkish Islamist newspaper columnists draws from the literature detailed above, there are some intricacies in this framework worth noting, factors which may serve to further decontextualize Malcolm X.

First, there is a temporal element, a disconnection in terms of the time period both parties are operating within. Malcolm X, as has been noted, is a late mid-20th century Black American leader with no direct link to contemporary Turkish Islamism. While ideas may be diffused between movements spanning disparate geographies, this thesis investigates a body of literature that begins in 1996, without investigating Turkish newspaper columns from Malcolm X's time period and potential links between the Turkish Islamist movement of his time. This thesis does not precisely detail the history of the adoption of Malcolm X as a symbol by the Turkish Islamist movement—it simply notes contemporary references to the Black nationalist leader and analyzes their implications.

Furthermore, there is the phenomenon of Malcolm X being a so-called “transmitter” of his own image and ideas. Malcolm X played a major role in the transmission of these by traveling to foreign countries, collaborating on an autobiography and appearing in countless broadcast interviews. As someone who adapted his ideology so many times and eventually left the Nation of Islam to form

his own organization, much of his legacy is arguably defined not by his representation of a single movement, but by his ideas and sayings. While I have identified him as part of the Black nationalist movement, he has also served an exponent of pan-Islamist and anti-colonial ideas, as the following chapter will show.

The above reasons perhaps play a role in how Malcolm X's image and words are prone to decontextualization. Firstly, due to the temporal span that separates his mid-20th century movement from contemporary Turkish Islamists, he does not actively shape, contest or interact with interpretations of himself and his words in current times. Secondly, because of his special role as a potent transmitter of his own image and ideas, no current day movement exists to offer a standard account of his beliefs. For this reason, he and his words are open to a range of interpretations that an official movement leader, for example, might not be. While a scholar of social movement theory may expect diffusion between different movements in "different sociocultural contexts" to yield considerably different interpretations of an "object of diffusion" (Snow and Benford, 1999, pp. 38), it is possible this phenomenon may be further exaggerated by the above conditions, yielding the kinds of decontextualization and metaphorization of Malcolm X that feature in this study.

## CHAPTER 3

### THE TRANSMITTER: MALCOLM X

#### 3.1 Overview

Despite a short life that ended abruptly more than 50 years ago, Malcolm X's legacy is still felt in America today. Many histories have been written about him, his autobiography and its film adaptation remain popular, and he continues to prove a divisive and complicated figure. Malcolm X's words and ideas changed considerably throughout his life, in an evolution that is well documented by a largely oral record consisting of speeches, interviews and TV appearances. It is also reflected in his autobiography as told to editor Alex Haley, an edited but exceptionally comprehensive account of his life published just a year before his assassination.

Relying on a combination of primary and secondary sources, this chapter traces his transformation, examining the personal experiences and political influences that shaped it. The aim of this chapter is to equip the reader with an understanding of how Malcolm X ultimately influenced Turkish Islamists. This chapter divides and analyzes Malcolm X's life in three broad phases, which reflect Entman's definition of the framing process as one in which actors: “define problems—determine what a causal agent is doing with what costs and benefits, usually measured in terms of common cultural values; diagnose causes—identify the forces creating the problem; make moral judgments—evaluate causal agents and their effects; and suggest remedies—offer and justify treatments for the problems and predict their likely effects” (Entman, 1993, p. 52). These phases include: 1) Malcolm X's troubled beginnings, 2) his association with the Nation of Islam (NOI), and 3)

his subsequent association with the international community. It is during the first phase that he defined the problems he faced as a Black American. In the second, he diagnosed causes, made moral judgments and suggested remedies by joining the Nation of Islam. Finally, in the third phase, he revised his solution by turning away from the NOI and toward the international community. This chapter argues that it was during this final phase of his life that he participated in what Benford and Snow call “frame bridging,” by linking unconnected frames and thereby establishing his role as a transmitter of ideas and symbols from the American Black nationalist movement to the Turkish Islamist movement (Snow and Benford, 2000, pp. 624-5). First, however, this chapter will discuss the time period within which Malcolm X grew up and developed his ideologies.

### 3.2 Malcolm X’s era

To understand Malcolm X and the work that he did in bringing together Black nationalist perspectives in America with those of pan-Islamists and anti-colonial movements, it is useful to review the era within which the Black nationalist figure lived and developed his ideas. Modern Black nationalism has its roots in Garveyism, a movement spearheaded in the U.S. in the early 20th century by Marcus Garvey, a Jamaican immigrant in New York. In his 2014 work, “The Age of Garvey,” Adam Ewing writes that although Garveyism was not an ideology, it spread “a belief that African redemption and Negro redemption were coterminous and biblically ordained; a view of the ‘Negro race’ as a unified and ancient category of belonging; and an understanding of history that suggested a declining white civilization and an ascendant Negro one (Ewing, 2014, p. 6). In fact, Garvey, who was famous for his slogan “Africa for the Africans,” “had long held a fascination for the Irish cause. He.

Aligned Irish subjugation and peonage under the British with the suffering of black people worldwide....Garvey turned towards Irish Republicanism for inspiration. Sinn Feiners' agitation for home rule served as a blueprint for Garvey's evolving philosophy of Black Nationalism" (Grant, 2008, pp. 174 and 198). Thus, anti-colonialism and the Black politics of New York's Harlem neighborhood were inextricably intertwined since before Malcolm X rose to prominence.

As World War II made way to ascendant independence movements in Asia and Africa, two so-called "Afro-Asian meetings" were held in Bandung, Indonesia (1955) and Cairo (1961); historian Vijay Prashad notes that the Congressman representing Harlem, Adam Clayton Powell, was in attendance despite the discouragement of the U.S. State Department (Prashad, 2007, xvii). Prashad writes that the conference "made manifest tendencies such as the relatively common social conditions of the colonized states and the nationalist movements that each of these states produced," adding that "what is still important about Bandung is that it allowed these leaders to meet together, celebrate the demise of formal colonialism, and pledge themselves to some measure of joint struggle against the forces of imperialism" (Prashad, 2007, 32). In fact, Malcolm X referenced the conference in his own famous speech, "Message to the Grass Roots," delivered in Detroit in November 1963. He noted of the conference's attendees, "They realized all over the world where the dark man was being oppressed, he was being oppressed by the white man; where the dark man was being exploited, he was being exploited by the white man. So they got together under this basis—that they had a common enemy," adding that in the United States, Black Americans must "do what they did" (X, 1963). Here, one can explicitly see the influence that political events of the early-to-mid 20th century had on Malcolm X, with regard to anti-colonialism and Black nationalism.

One of the nations that was front and center in the African quest for independence from Europe and featured in Malcolm X's rhetoric was Algeria. After the end of World War II, the French colony, which had been home to millions of French from the country's mainland, became the theater for a hard-fought and bloody war of independence. This created ideological shockwaves around the world; In *Mecca of Revolution*, Jeffrey James Byrne writes that the famed philosopher Franz Fanon, "who happened to be working in an Algerian hospital when the nationalist rebellion began, embraced the FLN's cause as his own, and became arguably the single most influential ideological voice of both the Algerian Revolution specifically and revolutionary anti-colonialism in the more general, global sense (Byrne, 2016, p. 2). Indeed, the Algerian movement for independence was a globally prominent example of decolonization, which came to define so-called "Third Worldism"; Byrne writes that "Third Worldism transformed from a transnational mode of cooperation that evaded and subverted the authority of the colonial state into an international collaboration that legitimized and zealously defended the authority of the postcolonial state. In other words, Third Worldism imposed order and structural uniformity on the process of decolonization" (Byrne, 2016, p. 10). Thus, the struggles faced by the Vietnamese, the Algerians, the Ghanaians and Egyptians alike, could be viewed as a definitional process that offered a blueprint for others, such as Malcolm X. When considering the ideological evolution of Malcolm X, and how he bridged the frames of anti-colonialism, pan-Islamism and Black Nationalism, it is key to keep in mind that Malcolm X was also a diffuser of the ideas he saw around himself.

### 3.3 Malcolm X's troubled beginnings: articulating the problem

Malcolm X was born Malcolm Little in Omaha, Nebraska in 1925. He grew up one of eight children, to mother Louise Little and father Earl Little. His family moved to Milwaukee, Wisconsin and then Lansing, Michigan, where he spent most of his early childhood. His father's public support for Marcus Garvey's Universal Negro Improvement Association (UNIA)—an early 20th century Pan-African independence movement—led to harassment by white supremacists, and, Malcolm X maintains, his death at their hands in 1931. In 1938, his mother had a nervous breakdown, and was institutionalized from 1939 to 1963. Michael A. Gomez writes in *Black Crescent* that “It is clear from the *Autobiography* that the death of Earl Little, determined by Malcolm to have been the work of the Black Legion in retribution for Earl Little's UNIA activities, was identified as the beginning of the end for Malcolm's family” (Gomez, 2005, p. 335).

After his mother was institutionalized, Malcolm X went to live with his extended family in Boston. There, he worked a series of odd jobs and became involved in small time crime. His involvement in crime continued after moving to New York City, where he was eventually arrested and charged with theft. Malcolm X spent more than six years in prison, a period that was formative for his identity and his intellect. It was there that he began to learn how to read; his autobiographer, Alex Haley would later quote Malcolm X as saying, “I'd put prison second to college as the best place for a man to go if he needs to do some thinking” (Haley, 2015, p. 450). It was also while in prison that Malcolm X became interested in the NOI and established correspondence with its leader, Elijah Muhammad. As a result, he underwent a defining transformation: he gave up his given surname and replaced it



with an X—a custom among NOI members recognizing the unknowable African lineage of Black Americans whose families adopted slaveholders’ surnames.

As can be seen in this telling of his life, Malcolm X’s early experiences helped him articulate the harsh realities of being Black in America, and set the stage for his ideological evolution. Both his father and Elijah Muhammad served as political role models, and shaped his defiant response to the unjust realities of being Black in America. This period represents his first major transformation as an adult, from that of wayward criminal to intellectual and political activist. Although authors of the Turkish newspaper columns this thesis analyzes do not admire the former phase, they do admire his evolution, which ultimately puts him on the path toward accepting orthodox Islam.

#### 3.4 Malcolm X in the Nation of Islam: adopting the solution

After leaving prison, Malcolm X became a minister and prominent spokesman for the NOI, eventually becoming a popular guest on television programs and gaining prominence for his uncompromising positions. With his support, the NOI became more widely known, and reached new heights of national notoriety, particularly with the 1959 airing of the TV documentary, “The Hate that Hate Produced.” Malcolm X’s role as second in command to leader Elijah Muhammad involved promoting uncompromising beliefs that were perceived as hateful among many mainstream white Americans.

In 1930, W.D. Fard founded the Nation of Islam, which he ran for four years until he disappeared, never to return. His origins are unclear and shrouded by dubious claims—Karl Evanzz writes, for example, that nearly two decades later the *Chicago New Crusader* reported that Fard was a white, Muslim, Nazi agent from

Turkey (Evanzz, 2011, p. 204). According to another account, he came from Saudi Arabia. Fard's student Elijah Muhammad—born Elijah Robert Poole in rural Georgia—maintained his following, and with Malcolm X's involvement it grew dramatically. Malachi D. Crawford writes that NOI membership was no greater than 3,000 before Malcolm X became involved, but with his help, anywhere from 20,000 to 100,000 new members joined (Crawford 2005, p. 56).

Although the NOI bears some superficial similarities to orthodox Islam—such as referring to their one God as “Allah” or avoiding pork and alcohol (both of which Malcolm X abstained from after joining)—it has been marked by some major differences, including its inception story and key figures. In stark contrast to Sunni Islam, for example, the NOI has regarded W.D. Fard as Allah, and Elijah Muhammad as his prophet (Evanzz, 2011, pp. 102-4 and Muhammad, 2009, p. 142). Furthermore, in a marked departure from the Abrahamic tradition, the NOI has preached that the white people are the result of an ancient scientist's nefarious experiments, that they are “devils” who use their “tricknology” to oppress Black people (Lincoln, 1994, pp. 16 and 72). White people have been framed as inherently evil and misguided, in contrast to the so-called “original” Black man, who was said to originally speak Arabic and have been spared of such experimentation (Lincoln, 1994, pp. 71 and 113).

Yet despite these extreme divergences from more orthodox forms of Islam, the NOI was politically significant in at least two major ways. First, it built upon elements of Marcus Garvey's Black nationalist UNIA, emphasizing self-sufficiency and independence; given the association of Malcolm X's father with the UNIA, it should not be surprising that Malcolm X was attracted to the NOI's separatist Black nationalist philosophy. Second, the NOI was a prominent and politically active group

of self-described Muslims in the mid-20th century. Thus, at a time when the country had yet to liberalize its immigration laws, and so the Muslim American population was much lower than it is today, the NOI promoted Islam and rapidly gained converts (Curtis, 2010, p. 261). Although there has been a Muslim presence in some parts of the U.S. since before the arrival of the English (Gomez, 2005, p. 144), the NOI brought Islam and Black Muslims into the spotlight in the age of mass broadcasting. The group also fostered connections with the wider Muslim world at a time when long distance travel was becoming more common. Herbert Berg writes that “The dramatic growth and financial success of the Nation of Islam allowed Elijah Muhammad to visit Muslim countries at the end of 1959,” including Turkey, Ethiopia, Sudan, Egypt, Saudi Arabia and Pakistan (Berg, 2009, p. 41).

Having articulated the problems that Black Americans face, the NOI represented a solution for Malcolm X. It represented his first foray into Black nationalism, a version which espoused racial supremacy and separation from white Americans. Much of what Malcolm X said during the mid-1950s through the early 1960s reflects the ideology and beliefs of the Nation of Islam. He held a publicly negative opinion of white Americans and belittled the efforts of the more mainstream civil rights activist Martin Luther King, whom he called a “modern Uncle Tom”—a derogatory reference to a character from the abolitionist novel “Uncle Tom’s Cabin,” directed at Black males deemed too deferential to whites (mrholtshistory, 2008). At the same time, despite his rising political power, his identity as a self-described Muslim kept him on the margins, in stark contrast to Martin Luther King, a Christian minister who employed the theology of the country’s majority religion to evoke a “dream” of what America could become. Although he would later give up his association with the NOI and Black supremacy, his association with Islam and fierce

opposition to the policies of the United States government primed him to eventually bridge the frames of American Black nationalism with those of movements against Western hegemony abroad. Already, prior to his split with the NOI, he framed the “Western World” as “sick,” and Christianity as an “illusion” (Schuessler, 2018). Following a split from the NOI and high-profile travels abroad, he established links with post-colonial and Islamist leaders outside the country, thereby internationalizing his Black nationalist struggle. Although Elijah Muhammad had traveled abroad, Malcolm X’s embrace of orthodox Islam further cemented his link to Muslims across the world.

### 3.5 Malcolm X looks east: bridging frames

Malcolm X’s break from the NOI and subsequent embrace of orthodox Islam represented a major change in his life trajectory. By 1964, Malcolm X’s relations with the NOI had become considerably strained, in part due to revelations of Muhammad’s infidelity, as well as a serious political misstep: The previous December, he had been punished by Elijah Muhammad after calling JFK’s fatal shooting “a case of the chickens coming home to roost” in an answer to a question from a reporter (X, 2015, p. 347), despite Muhammad previously warning him against referencing President Kennedy in public (Marable, 2013, p. 274). In the aftermath of his March 8, 1964 split with the NOI, he was aware that little time remained: that year, he appeared on national broadcaster CBS and said, “I probably am a dead man already” (National Public Radio, 2012). His prediction came true eight months later.

During this phase he articulated the problems Black Americans faced within broader issues of global human rights and anti-colonial struggles for independence.

“We are African, and we happen to be in America. We’re not Americans,” Malcolm X declared in a speech in New York City’s Washington Heights neighborhood roughly a month before going on hajj. “Our forefathers weren’t the Pilgrims. We didn’t land on Plymouth Rock; the rock was landed on us” (captioning for the end of the world, 2008). Freshly separated from the NOI, and just ahead of a life-changing pilgrimage, Malcolm X continued his criticism of the U.S. government’s treatment of Black Americans, drawing from anti-colonial rhetoric. Within this framework, he compared to the struggles of Black Americans to those of colonized peoples abroad. That April, he gave his famous speech, *The Ballot or the Bullet*, in which he proclaimed that America was not a dream, but a “nightmare.” The speech, made ahead of the 1964 presidential election, articulates the quest for rights in stark terms: either the state’s political apparatus peacefully grants them, or Black Americans will take up armed struggle to secure them. He said, “What do you call second-class citizenship? Why that’s colonization...Just as it took nationalism to remove colonialism from Asia and Africa, it’ll take black nationalism today to remove colonialism from the backs and the minds of twenty-two million Afro-Americans here in this country. And 1964 looks like it might be the year of the ballot or the bullet” (X, 1964).

This outlook dovetailed with the aims of his Organization for Afro-American Unity (OAAU)—a pan-Africanist organization he established in the summer of that year, modeled after the Organization of African Unity (OAU), an intergovernmental body established in Addis Ababa just one year earlier, and the predecessor to today’s African Union (AU). His politics maintained key elements of the NOI’s philosophy—such as Black nationalism and self-sufficiency—while rejecting Black supremacy. In an interview with Claude Lewis of the *New York Post*, he said that he

had discussed the problems Black Americans faced with foreign ministers in the Middle East and Africa while abroad. He said, “Not only did they seem to know much about it, but they were very sympathetic with it. In fact, it’s not an accident that in the United Nations during the debate on the Congo Problem in the Security Council, that almost every one of the African foreign ministers tied in what was happening in the Congo with what’s happening in Mississippi” (Lewis, 1994, p. 196). This statement by itself intimates that the issues of Black Americans in the Southern United States could be reasonably compared to those faced in the then Republic of Congo, a state that was transitioning from Belgian rule to independence. By highlighting the sympathy of foreign ministers abroad, Malcolm X emphasized the relatability of the plight of Black Americans to those governing in peripheral regions of the world. At a time when the Vietnam war was ratcheting up, Malcolm X drew parallels between the actions of the United States abroad and at home (Lewis, 1994, p. 198). In his autobiography, Malcolm X drew a clear association between Black Americans and their non-white counterparts abroad, one that he lamented had not taken hold in the United States. The book recalls, “I reflected many, many times to myself upon how the American Negro has been entirely brainwashed from ever seeing or thinking of himself, as he should, as a part of the non-white peoples of the world. The American Negro has no conception of the hundreds of millions of other non-whites’ concern for him: he has no conception of their feeling of brotherhood for and with him” (X, 2015, p. 352).

However, it is not only within anti-colonial terms that he reframed the U.S. Black nationalist struggle, but also in terms of pan-Islamism. Marable writes that “In taking the necessary steps to become a true Muslim he had regained the certainty that had abandoned him with each new revelation of Elijah Muhammad’s perfidy or

infidelity. He could also now see the role Islam would play not just in his spiritual life, but in his work” (Marable, 2011). His hajj trip served to reframe his approach to race. Of the pilgrimage, he said, “we were all participating in the same ritual, displaying a spirit of unity and brotherhood that my experiences in America had led me to believe never could exist between the white and the non-white (X, 2015, p. 391).” He added that, “America needs to understand Islam, because this is the one religion that erases from its society the race problem...I have never before seen *sincere* and *true* brotherhood practiced by all colors together, irrespective of their color (X, 2015, p. 391).” In a letter to a friend about hajj in which Malcolm X wrote of the white contingent, “Their belief in the Oneness of God has actually made them so different from American [sic] whites, their outer physical characteristics played no part at all in my mind during all my close associations with them” (Handler, 1964). This stood in stark contrast to his past advocacy for Black separatism, in which he had gone so far as to even call on white Americans to oppose racial integration with their Black counterparts (Marable, 2011). Within this new post-hajj context, Malcolm X distanced himself from the Black supremacy of the NOI and instead emphasized the unity of Black Muslims with their white counterparts. Here, the frame of those fighting for Black rights in America is bridged with that of the fight to spread Islam, a stance that culminates in his comments to a young Muslim men’s organization, Shuban al-Muslimin, in Cairo in 1964: “I come before you here in the Muslim World, not only to rejoice over the wonderful blessing of Islam, but also to take advantage of the opportunity to remind you that there are 22 million of us in America, many of whom have never heard of Allah and Islam, and all of whom are the victims of America’s continued oppression, exploitation and degradation” (DeCaro, Jr., 1997, p. 239 and New York Public Library). His involvement with this

group, which was co-founded by Muslim Brotherhood founder Hassan Al-Banna (Abou-El-Fadi, 2015, p. 108), as well as his correspondence with Hassan al-Banna's son, Said Ramadan, placed him in direct contact with a strain of political Islam that aligned with the Turkish Islamist concept of *ummetcilik*, or global Islamic unity. By prescribing Islam as a remedy for the social ills of his society and emphasizing his unity with other Muslims, he bridged the frame of American Black nationalism with that of pan-Islamists who seek to unite Muslims across the world.

### 3.6 Malcolm X's legacy

As the late Manning Marable notes, Malcolm X played a risky game in Egypt, where he associated both with figures representing anti-colonial secularism and political Islamism. He writes of Malcolm X's involvement with Gamal Abdel Nasser and figures linked to the Muslim Brotherhood, "Malcolm, indebted to both sides, could not afford to take positions that might offend either" (Marable, 2011). Thus, it makes sense that Malcolm X's framing of American Black nationalism toes the line between anti-colonialism and political Islamism, straddling both to produce a stance broadly against anti-Western hegemony. On the one hand, there is the necessity to make the case for the rights of Black Americans—a racial minority in the US—within the postcolonial context, presenting it before the United Nations as a violation of human rights (Marable, 2011). On the other hand, there is the quest to end racism in America, which adopting Islam can help to achieve, according to Malcolm X. It is in this way that Malcolm X links the language and aims of American Black nationalism part of a broader international discourse—and eventually, as we shall see, contemporary Turkish Islamist discourse.



However, it is important for readers to consider two intricacies of Malcolm X's legacy. First, in contrast to his warm reception abroad and in the Turkish Islamist newspaper columns this thesis analyzes, Malcolm X continues to be a divisive figure in the United States. In fact, to some extent, how one views Malcolm X today may correlate with their race. A February 2015 poll marking the 50th anniversary of Malcolm X's death, for instance, showed that a majority of Black Americans approved of Malcolm X, while their white counterparts did not (Moore, 2015). While many Americans on both sides of the racial aisle approve of Martin Luther King, Jr, Malcolm X's life, death and legacy continue to attract controversy. On the heels of an in-depth Netflix documentary on the death of Malcolm X in early 2020, the Manhattan District Attorney's Office even launched a review into the investigation around his assassination (Al Jazeera, 2020).

Second, although this thesis considers Malcolm X in his final form as an international figure who participated in a process of frame bridging, this is not meant to imply that this would be the final culmination of his politics. From petty criminal to devout Muslim, from roaming the streets to roaming the world, from the Nation of Islam to Muslim internationalism, he continually changed and morphed into something new; as he said in an interview with Claude Lewis, "Whatever I do, whatever I did, whatever I've said, was all done in sincerity. That's the way I want to be remembered because that's the way it is" (Lewis, 1994, p. 206). It is reasonable to assume he would have had a response to the decline of the non-aligned movement or the Iranian revolution, although it is impossible to know exactly how he would have responded. In the early 1960s, he represented a challenge to the global hegemonic order, critiquing the United States and the West, without aligning himself with the Soviet Union. Much changed after he died, as the fight for Black rights progressed in

the US, and abroad, some independent African countries succeeded economically. At the same time, many continued to suffer from poverty, and police brutality has continued to prove an issue for Black Americans, despite the granting of many *de jure* rights. In Turkey, meanwhile, Islamists have ascended into mainstream politics, challenging America and the West in their rhetoric while adopting free-market economic policies and maintaining alliances such as NATO. The next section discusses the rise of contemporary Turkish Islamism and the movement's ideological tendencies that align with its adoption of Malcolm X as a political symbol.

## CHAPTER 4

### THE ADOPTER: TURKISH ISLAMISM

#### 4.1 Overview

Having reviewed Malcolm X as a transmitter of a symbol and ideas that bridged the frame of American Black nationalism with anti-colonial and pan-Islamist politics, this chapter reflects on the role of Turkish Islamists as their adopter. It reviews major historical moments and ideological elements of Turkish Islamism in the second half of the 20th century, particularly the years in the run-up to the establishment of Necmettin Erbakan's seminal *Milli Gorus* party to the present day. In the process, this overview provides evidence of rhetoric against Western hegemony and for pan-Islamism among Turkish Islamists, which figures prominently in the columns that mention Malcolm X. The first part of this chapter defines Islamism as it is discussed here; the second covers the rise of political Islamism in Turkish state politics; and the third reviews the Turkish Islamist approach to the United States and the West. Throughout, this chapter shows how the Turkish Islamist rhetoric against Western hegemony and for pan-Islamism facilitates their adoption of Malcolm X and his ideas as a potent political symbol; this will lay the groundwork for later arguments as to why their interpretation of him is problematic.

#### 4.2 Islamism as a political project

Islamism is a commonly used term throughout academic and non-academic literature; thus, it has no single meaning and a wide variety of connotations. Unlike in popular Western usage, the term's use in this chapter does not indicate support for

political violence or strict religious practice, although both might align with a particular Islamist's worldview. Rather, the term is employed here to describe what is often called "political Islam," a philosophy in which the religion plays a significant role in shaping the state. Asef Bayat defines Islamism as "ideologies and movements that strive to establish some kind of an 'Islamic order'—a religious state, shari'a law, and moral codes in Muslim societies and communities," adding that "Association with the state is a key feature of Islamist politics" (Bayat, 2013, p. 4). In his 2016 book, "Islamism: What it Means for the Middle East and the World," Tarek Osman writes that, "For the vast majority of Islamists, the principles of the faith entail submitting to those rules that - as a Muslim - one believes were laid down by God in a divine revelation to the Prophet Mohammed," adding, however, that there exists a "spectrum of 'Islamisms': some views that strongly invoke certain interpretations of Islam in political and social life; others that have adopted a light-tough approach" (Osman, 2016, pp. vii and ix). Carrie Wickham explains further, that "Although the goals and strategies of Islamists differ, they are united in their conviction that the most vexing problems facing contemporary Muslim societies can be resolved through an individual and collective return to religion" (Wickham, 2002, p. 1). These definitions do not explicitly indicate the extent to which an Islamist might seek to apply Islamic law or customs. Islamist movements span aims, environments and methods, ranging from Sayyid Qutb's Muslim Brotherhood, to supporters of Aliya Izetbegovic's Islamic Declaration, to members of Necmettin Erbakan's *Milli Gorus* to Recep Tayyip Erdoğan's neoliberal AK Party.

Approaches and aims vary so widely perhaps in part because the scope of the question at hand is so open-ended: Broadly speaking, the Islamist project—as Mahmood Mamdani notes—is a political one, which was meant to chart out a path in

the European-dominated era of modernity. Mamdani traces the roots of political Islamism back to the 19th century reformer Jamal al-Din al-Afghani, whose “religious vision came to be informed by a very modern dilemma. On the one hand, Muslims needed modern science, which they would have to learn from Europe. On the other, this very necessity was proof” of inferiority (Mamdani, 2005, p. 46). According to Mamdani, this was also a question involving colonialism and independence; the shift from reformist to radical political Islamism came with postcolonialism, moving from Muslim Brotherhood founder Hassan al-Banna to later leading member Sayyid Qutb, “whose experience of such brutal repression under a secular government was one influence shaping the birth of a radical orientation in Egyptian Islamist thought” (Mamdani, 2005, p. 49). Mamdani writes that Qutb “made a distinction between modernity and Westernization, calling for an embrace of modernity but a rejection of Westernization”; he emphasized material progress but shunned adopting Western philosophy (Mamdani, 2005, p. 56). Interestingly, as an activist jailed by the secularist pan-Arabist Gamal Abdel Nasser, Qutb represents Islamist struggle against hegemony within one's own society. By the time Qutb was in jail, it was not just European notions of modernity or the West with which Islamists were struggling—in some cases, they were also at odds with their own governments, which discouraged political Islam. This is the environment in which contemporary Republican-era Turkish Islamism emerged. However, as this chapter will also show, despite strong negative rhetoric, Turkish Islamist perceptions of the U.S. and the broader West have not been uniformly so; rather, negative views have represented an influential and vocal contingent within a broader movement that has achieved hegemony itself.

#### 4.3 Political Islamism and anti-Western sentiment in the global context

As discussed in the previous section, Islamism was a political project that grew out of attempts to grapple with the dominance of the West. Modern global political Islamism has a strong history of anti-imperial sentiments, including against the United States. One prominent example of a country where Islamists have grappled extensively with the relationship the West is Iran. Although the country stands in contrast to many of its Muslim neighbors because of its Shia heritage, it represents a foremost example of a country that gravitated toward political Islam and positioned itself in opposition to the West. In his discussion of Iran under the Shah in *The Darker Nations*, Prashad writes, “Nationalism, democracy, and rationalism: the root of the Third World intellectual’s quandary was how to create a new self in the new nations. Each of their societies had ample resources to fill this self, but they also recognized the necessity to articulate a new relationship with the ‘West’” (Prashad, 2007, p. 92). He notes that “Although Iran had never been formerly colonized, it belonged with the hungry. Indeed, much of the world that stood at the pole of the hungry had remained nominally free during the era of colonialism,” adding that “The Iranian elite, like much of the parasitic elite in the postcolonial world, groomed their aesthetic sense around Europe’s Sublime” (Prashad, 2007, p. 80). It was in this context, particularly after an attempt to nationalize the country’s oil infrastructure and a subsequent Western-backed overthrow of the government, that Iranian sentiments against the West grew.

Graham Fuller, former vice chairman of the National Intelligence Council at the CIA writes that, “For Muslims today, there are few issues more burning than freedom from intrusive and neo-imperial policies of the West....the West for at least four centuries did indeed exercise dominant imperial power over the rest of the world

with great profit and relative impunity. The United States today is, by its own reckoning, the overwhelmingly dominant power of the globe in nearly all spheres, with the determination to impose its will by one means or another” (Fuller, 2010, p. 252). While his general description of Muslim political concerns lacks nuance, it points to the United States as a contemporary focus of opposition against Western hegemony. Whereas 19th century political Islamism was a reaction to growing European power, the second half of the 20th century era saw the intensification of American hegemony and political Islamist reactions against it. In Iran and abroad, the intellectual Ali Shariati helped to facilitate this sentiment. Fatemeh Shayan writes, “Ali Shariati believed that Islam was the appropriate response to the evils of capitalism and imperialism,” adding that “it was possible for Shariati to present a religious framework for the Iranian nation, which brought Islam and Islamic identity to the forefront of the collective consciousness. The emphasis was placed on the contrast between good and evil, embodied in the confrontation between Iran with Islamic identity and the United States” (Shayan, 2017, p. 229).

Asef Bayat writes that “Immediately post- revolution, the student movement retained much of its ideological character (political radicalism, a revolutionary strategy, nationalism, Third Worldism, and an anti-imperialist orientation)” (Bayat, *Post Islamism*, p. 41). Since then, notions of the West and America as standing in opposition to Islam have proliferated throughout the Muslim world. According to Shayan, this framing of the United States in opposition to Islamic identity has taken place in the broader region post-Iraq War (Shayan, 2017, p. 245). In Turkey, too, although the state has maintained its membership in Western-aligned organizations such as NATO, Shariati maintains an influence on Islamists. The notion of the United States as being at odds with Islamic identity is evident throughout the

columns this thesis analyzes, which make reference to Malcolm X—and in one case even compare him to Shariati. In *Passive Revolution*, Cihan Tugal describes the radical Islamists he met in Sultanbeyli in the 1990s as “focused on the writings of” Sayyid Qutb and Ali Shariati, among others, adding that “Differing from nonradical groups, they were not interested in the Ottoman Empire's contribution to Islamic civilization, which they perceived as Islam's deformation rather than its improvement” (Tugal, 2009, p. 64). In this context, it makes sense that Malcolm X's bridging of pan-Islamist with anti-colonialist and American Black nationalist frames would be potent and successful, including in Turkey. The following sections of this chapter will help explain why it was successful in the Turkish context, amid an ascendant Islamist movement.

#### 4.4 Turkish Islamism and its relationship to the state

Shortly following the establishment of the Turkish Republic in 1923, Islam and its teachings were placed under heavy state control. This greatly affected religious practice in Turkey. For example, Ceren Lord writes in *Religious Politics in Turkey*, that “the closure of the dervish lodges and orders in 1925 by the one-party regime following the Sheikh Said Rebellion effectively supported the Diyanet's monopoly on religious life” (Lord, 2018, p. 93). Furthermore, in the new secular republic, the traditionally Arabic call to prayer was also scrapped, and substituted for a brief period with the Turkish language, a controversial move that Atatürk biographer Andrew Mango writes was implemented unevenly and was the target of protests (Mango, 2002). But the secularization of Turkey was much more, leading to the incorporation of women in public life and putting an end to the caliphate. It was a “nation-building project,” according to Hakan Yavuz, in which “Islamic institutions



and ideas no longer functioned as the sources of legitimacy in political life”; by replacing such cultural elements as the alphabet, calendar and dress, “the Republic introduced a new set of symbols to mark the shift from Islamic to Western civilization” (Yavuz, 2009, p. 26). One of the most important symbols of the transition to a modern secular nation has been Atatürk himself, whose statues across Turkey, Cihan Tugal writes, “remind citizens of the official commitment” to his “secular nationalism” (Tugal, 2009b, p. 432). Turkey’s pivot to secularism, impacting a variety of areas of life, from law to education and lifestyles—although somewhat problematic because it entails official control of religious practice by Turkey’s Directorate General of Religious Affairs—sought to lessen the influence of Islam in realm of the political and social (Dagi, 2013, pp. 76-7). This sweeping aim would come to define the era of single party rule.

In reaction, a new party would challenge the ruling CHP’s secularist vision. The Arabic version of the call to prayer was restored after the 1950 election—the country’s first multiparty vote—in which Adnan Menderes and his *Demokrat Partisi* (Democrat Party) came to power. Under its rule, restrictions on religious life eased and the economy improved, before deteriorating. The party won parliament again in 1954 and 1957, but Menderes drew the ire of universities and the press (Ahmad, 2008, p. 236), as well as the bureaucracy, judiciary and military (Akyol, 2012, p. 74). While the Democrat Party was more tolerant than its predecessors of public expressions of Islam, it was largely intolerant of the opposition—particularly the CHP—and Menderes “spoke of curtailing democracy” (Ahmad, 2008, p. 237). Tension within the public and government grew, and in 1960, the armed forces staged a coup. Finally, in 1961, Menderes was charged with violating the constitution and executed.

It is worth noting, however, that Menderes did not represent an outright challenge to the Western-oriented republic. In fact, it was under Democrat Party rule that Turkey forged strong links with NATO, became the recipient of Marshall Plan funds and grew closer to the United States. Although he was charged with violating the constitution, Menderes' politics represented a significant sector of the ruling class; Cihan Tugal writes that "The bloc's subordinate sector—conservative elements of the bureaucracy and professional middle class, an export-oriented bourgeoisie, merchants, and provincial notables—tended to advocate a larger space for Islam, albeit still under 'secular' control," while they "often succeeded in extracting concessions from" the dominant sectors of the ruling class by drawing from the support of those including clerics, artisans, and provincial entrepreneurs" (Tugal, 2013, p. 114). It was this entrepreneurial class along with intellectuals seeking to make the Turkish state independent of the West, according to Tugal, that lent support to a German-educated engineer named Necmettin Erbakan elected as an independent MP for Konya in 1969 (Tugal, 2013, pp. 114-5).

That same year, Erbakan paved the way for his Islamist *Milli Gorus* (National View) movement by publishing a similarly titled manifesto. According to Waldman and Caliskan, the movement promoted Turkish identity with Islam at its center; furthermore, like Qutb's movement, it was "an attempt to reconcile traditional Islam with modernism, and particularly to incorporate Western science and technology with commitment to Islamic ideals" (Waldman and Caliskan, 2017, p. 50). In 1971, Erbakan founded the *Milli Nizam Partisi* (National Order Party) and in 1972 the *Milli Selamet Partisi* (National Salvation Party)—both Islamist parties that were eventually closed down. Yet his rise in politics was rapid and continued; he served as

Deputy Prime Minister in three different coalitions, from January–November 1974, March 1975–June 1977 and July 1977–January 1978.

Although another coup put a temporary ban on electoral democracy as well on Erbakan's involvement in political activity, the trend of Islamization in Turkey continued under military rule through a policy that would become known as Turkish-Islamic Synthesis. Banu Eligur writes in *The Mobilization of Political Islam in Turkey* that, "The military rulers, while viewing Islam and Islamist groups with suspicion, regarded Sunni Islam both as a legitimizing force for its policies and as a unifying instrument against anarchy. For this reason, they tried to create a sense of community among those who shared Islam as their faith, while attempting to control the Islamist groups" (Eligur, 2010, p. 94). Although coup leader Kenan Evren disapproved of Imam Hatip schools, for example, they were maintained and Ataturk was portrayed as someone "who had engaged in a jihad to protect his nation" (Yavuz, 2003, p. 127). Waldman and Caliskan write that Turkish-Islamic Synthesis "was about neither religiosity nor political Islam. Rather, it was a cultural phenomenon that emphasised not piety but the centrality of Islam to Turkish identity and history" (Waldman and Caliskan, 2017, pp. 54-55). Thus, at the same time that the military emphasized Kemalism and the memory of Ataturk, it also promoted Turkey's Islamic identity as part of an effort to maintain order and establish hegemony. At the same time, the heavy influence of the U.S. in post-coup Turkey, and the acceleration of privatization and market liberalization under Turgut Ozal, encouraged free market economics.

The rise of free market economic policies led to an exodus of laborers from rural regions to Turkish cities, a demographic phenomenon that would fuel the rise of the Refah Party. The party, co-founded by Erbakan in 1983, bore an ideological

resemblance to its predecessor, the National Salvation Party (Hale, 2009, p. 4). But its rise was unprecedented, with Recep Tayyip Erdoğan leading the party to victory in the 1994 Istanbul mayoral election and a 1996 parliamentary victory, culminating with Erbakan becoming Prime Minister. Although Erbakan resigned in 1997, after what has been popularly described as a “postmodern coup”—in which the military made mandatory “recommendations” including the controversial university headscarf ban (Al Jazeera, 2016)—his party built a movement that led to the eventual success of the AK Party. Caliskan and Waldman have called the Welfare Party “the latest in a long line of parties associated with the Milli Gorus tradition,” arguing that it came to power in part thanks to mobilizing grassroots activists, in particular those who reached out to alienated migrants to Turkish cities (Waldman and Caliskan, 2017, pp. 55-6). Furthermore, they write, that at the same time they appealed to Islamist businesses and networks, the party also provided welfare to voters in the form of clothes, food and coal (Waldman and Caliskan, 2017, pp. 56). The movement’s successful mobilization effort also included outreach through its media. According to Cihan Tugal, the Welfare Party—like the Milli Salvation Party—sought to reorder life around Islam, but because of government restrictions on religious propaganda, Islamic newspapers such as a *Milli Gazete* played a role in encouraging Turks to follow the principles of shari’a (Tugal, 2013, p. 110). This movement contrasted with Islamic conservatism, according to Tugal, in that “the emphasis was on the preservation of national culture through mobilizing Islam, rather than an Islamic purification of that culture” (Tugal, 2013, p. 110).

This mobilization effort appealing to traditionally marginal voters, along with an appeal to the language of human rights on the global stage in the post-Cold war era, was key to challenging the hegemony of the Kemalist ruling class. Roy frames

the experience of Turkish Islamists as one in which a minority “who very quickly had to give up their hope of securing a monopoly of political representation for Islam in a country” where the majority self-identified as Muslims, adding, however, that the Welfare Party’s “municipal Islamism” led the party “toward a pluralist political practice” (Roy, 2007, p. 93). It was this pluralist approach that defined the early era of the party that grew out of the ashes of the Welfare Party: The Justice and Development Party (AKP).

After the Refah Party disbanded, Turkish Islamists were forced to regroup and rethink their strategies. They split into two groups: the Felicity Party and the AK Party; in *Passive Revolution: Absorbing the Islamic Challenge to Capitalism*, Cihan Tugal writes that after the coup, “the Islamist party underwent a few tumultuous years, at the end of which a new generation of leaders split the party to establish the AKP, while the old leaders founded the Felicity Party. The AKP leaders attempted to remove any ambivalence and market the party as a secular, pro-state, pro-Western, and procapitalist organization” (Tugal, 2009, p. 6). The AKP became Turkey’s ruling party in 2002, on the heels of a severe economic crisis, and by appealing to politically marginalized groups including Turkey’s Kurds and headscarved women, a stance that fit into the Western pro-human rights consensus of the time. Tugal writes, “The ensuing global disillusionment with prospects for Islamic unity manifested itself in Turkey in the turn of the Islamists to the EU and to the discourse of universal human rights and democracy, especially after 1997. This move discredited the Islamists in the eyes of nationalist-leaning religious people, while it gained them the sympathy of liberal intellectuals and professionals” (Tugal, 2009, p. 48).

As can be seen, the AKP has been able to consolidate its power throughout the years and establish political hegemony in part through a rights-based and justice-

oriented discourse. However, it appears the party has achieved significant political gains for practicing Sunni Muslims, while Kurdish-Turkish tensions and concerns over the rights of religious minorities continue to simmer. To what extent the Turkish Islamist emphasis on universal human rights was a sincere versus strategic goal can be debated; but the findings of this thesis point to a selective emphasis of rights and justice among Turkish Islamists, with the columnists emphasizing Malcolm X's rhetoric against Western hegemony and his Muslim identity while avoiding comparisons of the issues he faced as an minority in the United States to the issues ethnic and religious minorities face in Turkey.

#### 4.5 Turkish Islamism and its relationship to the world

Throughout the history of modern Turkey until the current day, the question of how to respond to Western power has been a central one. Accordingly, reactions to Western political and economic hegemony have figured prominently in Turkish Islamist rhetoric. At the same time that a radical contingent of Turkish Islamists has expressed support for a Pan-Islamist foreign policy and opposition to European and American power, the political realities of Turkey's place in the world and its membership in NATO have tempered these sentiments. For the authors of the newspaper columns this thesis analyzes, Malcolm X represents Pan-Islamism and opposition to a Western-dominated political and economic order, both key positions among a faction of contemporary Turkish Islamists. This section analyzes the appeal and influence of these positions among Necmettin Erbakan and his successors, as well as political realities that kept them in check.

#### 4.5.1 Pan Islamism and Turkish nationalism in the shadow of Neo-Ottomanism

The ascendant Turkish Islamism of Necmettin Erbakan and his successors has balanced Pan-Islamism with Neo-Ottoman-inspired Turkish nationalism. Hakan Yavuz writes of Neo-Ottomanism that, “Although obtaining an accurate definition upon which everyone could agree is difficult, there is a generic and working definition that means rooting present notions of Turkish national identity within their Ottoman Islamic heritage” (Yavuz, 2020, p. xxi). Furthermore, he writes that “Ottomanism incorporates two contradictory emotions: one is centered on trauma and grievances stemming from the ethnic cleansing and persecution of Muslims by European powers in the 19<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup> centuries; the other is a lost sense of glory and grandeur as the hegemon of a continental civilization” (Yavuz, 2020, p. xiii). While Turkish Islamist beliefs bear some similarities to the ideas of Sayyid Qutb and the Muslim Brotherhood, they are shaped heavily by notions of Turkish exceptionalism, which are often linked to the country’s Ottoman past. As a country that fought for its independence in the aftermath of World War I, modern Turkey’s foundations were rooted in nationalism, yet the republic is also the successor to an empire whose leader was once the *Caliph*, the leader of all Muslims worldwide. For this reason, Turkish Islamism has been defined by an at times seemingly paradoxical mix of nationalist (*milliyetçilik*) and Pan-Islamist sentiments (*ümmetçilik*) seeking to link Turkey more closely with its Muslim neighbors while claiming leadership of them. The AK Party’s predecessor, the Welfare Party, was key in bringing these two currents of Pan-Islamism and Turkish nationalism together; Cihan Tugal writes that, “The [Refah Party] had absorbed the Islamic internationalism of the radicals into Turkish nationalism. Along with the inclusion of ex-radicals in the party, the RP moved from a Turkish nationalist line to one that emphasized cross-national and

cross-ethnic Islamic unity, while still claiming Turkish superiority over and leadership of non-Turkish Muslims” (Tugal, 2009, p. 242). This combination of nationalism with Pan-Islamism explains in part the attraction of some Kurdish voters to the AK Party—an organization which was instrumental at the onset of national rule at easing Turkish-Kurdish tensions, despite a more nationalist streak following the party’s 2015 coalition with the MHP and the 2016 coup attempt. Sevinc Bermek writes that while the “Turkish-Kurdish cleavage is a very distinct voting behaviour” in the country’s politics, and that “Kurdish voters were likely to vote for right-wing parties and parties that advocate for Islam and *ümmetçilik*” (Bermek, 2019, p. 51).

Turkish Islamism’s strong nationalism has roots in Neo-Ottomanism, which influenced Erbakan’s *Milli Gorus* movement, and was further cemented by the subsequent Turkish-Islamic Synthesis of the 1980s. Both served to Islamize the identity of Turks, as in both cases religious identity was considered an integral component of Turkishness. In the first case, one can see the influence of Neo-Ottomanism in the writing of Necmettin Erbakan, who declared, for example, that “the Europeans, by making us copy them blindly and without any understanding, trapped us in this monkey’s cage and as a result, forced us to abandon our personality and nobility. That is to say, he was successful in this because he used agents recruited from within, who felt [inferior and] disgusted with themselves, bringing to his knees the Turk who for centuries could not be defeated by the crusades and external blows” (Dag, 2014, p. 87). In this view—which mirrors that of opponents to the Tanzimat (Lord, 2018, p. 212)—Turks lost power and prestige by straying from their true roots, of which Islam was an integral part. In Neo-Ottoman rhetoric, Turkey’s imperial past has often been used to justify Turkey’s position as a leader of Muslims, and this quote from Erbakan does so by positioning Turkey’s



indigenous culture as decidedly un-European and thoroughly Muslim. The Turkish-Islamic synthesis, on the other hand, although implemented under Kemalist military rule, also Islamized the country's identity; Waldman and Caliskan write that it "held that Islam was attractive to the Turks because of its similarities to the pre-Islamic Turkish society—its sense of justice, morality and family life, and belief in the immortal soul, adding that it "was not a programme for religious education but rather a policy of using Islam to forge a cultural identity in harmony with Turkish national identity" (Waldman and Caliskan, 2017, p. 53). An imperial mentality linking Turkey to the broader Muslim world and placing it at its center can still be seen today; for example, in Erdoğan's 2014 presidential victory speech, he thanked "my friends and brothers all over the world who prayed for our victory. I thank my brothers in Palestine who saw our victory as their victory. I thank my brothers in Egypt who are struggling for democracy and who understand our struggle very well. I thank my brothers in the Balkans, in Bosnia, in Macedonia, in Kosovo and in all cities in Europe who celebrate our victory with the same joy we have here" (Erdoğan, Hurriyet Daily News, 2014). In discussing the Turkish election as a contest of interest to people across former Ottoman possessions, he framed the power of his party in Pan-Islamist, Neo-Ottoman terms. During the same era, in the aftermath of the Arab Spring, Turkey doubled down on its support for Islamist movements abroad fueled by Neo-Ottoman ambitions. This was particularly the case under the foreign policy doctrine of Ahmet Davutoglu, Kirisci writes, whose "aspiration was to seek an ideologically and religiously motivated political leadership for Turkey in the post-Ottoman space," but whose efforts to "reunite the Muslim *Ummah* of the Middle East never materialized in the quagmire that the region has turned into with the civil war in Syria" (Kirisci, 2017, p. 17).

#### 4.5.2 The West versus the rest

Contemporary Turkish Islamism has also been defined by a push and pull between radical anti-Western sentiments and official pro-Western policies. At the same time that Turkish Islamists have argued for an internationalist, Islamically-focused foreign policy that challenges Western hegemony, they have also balanced alliances with NATO and close bilateral relations with Western countries such as Germany and the United States. Turkish Islamists in government have strengthened links with the wider Muslim world and spoken out against the West, while also negotiating membership in European communities, participating in an anti-Soviet alliance and dealing with issues linked to Turkey's large diaspora in Europe. This means that while many Turkish Islamists may hold anti-Western sentiments—like some of the authors of the columns this thesis analyzes—these ideas remain more firmly within the domain of the radical and rhetorical as opposed to the practical and actionable.

On the one hand, Erbakan and his associates have maintained a defiant attitude toward the West. Alessio Calabro writes that in his 1975 book, *Milli Gorus*, Erbakan discusses foreign policy while referring to what he sees as inherent differences between Westerners and Islamic civilization (Calabro, 2017). He adds that, “According to Erbakan, if Turkey followed its own national values and character, it would easily succeed in obtaining economic development and independence. The country's foreign policy, says Erbakan, needs to follow ‘our values,’ leaving aside the alien ideas of ‘imitators’ that want to maintain Turkey's dependence on Western interests” (as cited in Calabro, 2017). The European Common market appears to be a central part of this imitation; in *Religion in an Expanding Europe*, Hakan Yavuz writes that “Erbakan treated Turkey's attempt to join the Common Market as a process of becoming a colony of Europe...Until 1995, Erbakan remained very much

anti-Europe and led the opposition against the customs union with the EU in the Turkish Parliament and portrayed the agreement with the EU as a disgraceful colonial treaty” (Yavuz, 2006, p. 244). Although Byrnes and Katzenstein write that Erbakan warmed toward Europe over time, he still sought connections with Islamic countries. Soner Cagaptay writes in his book, “The New Sultan: Erdoğan and the Crisis of Modern Turkey,” that “Erbakan maintained his pro-Islamist foreign-policy focus, hewing to his National Outlook origins. He proposed new international allegiances, such as a ‘D-8 (the ‘D’ standing for ‘Developing’), composed of the eight most populous Muslim nations, to compete with the G7. Erbakan also suggested an Islamic security organization to rival NATO, as well as an Islamic currency called the dinar” (Cagaptay, 2017, p. 78).

However, Erbakan was also known to balance anti-Western rhetoric with Western expectations of Turkey as a reliable partner. Heinz Kramer writes that during his time as Prime Minister, “In foreign policy Ciler and Erbakan developed a kind of division of labor, with the deputy prime minister taking care of relations with Europe and the Western allies, while the prime minister tried to establish the first elements of what could be termed a more Islamic foreign policy” (Kramer, 2001, p. 72). Furthermore, under the AK Party, despite incendiary rhetoric in recent years that has alarmed some in Washington and Brussels, and support for Muslim Brotherhood rule in Egypt, Turkey has maintained its NATO membership. Especially in earlier years, the government took on a somewhat pro-Western stance, with its overtures toward the European Union and attraction of substantial foreign investment from the West. Particularly in the aftermath of 9/11 and in the pre-Gezi, pre-Mavi Marmara, pre-Davos era, Turkey was discussed as a model Muslim democracy—a country that

was seen as successfully balancing Muslim identity with a modern market economy and political system.

Furthermore, despite the anti-Western sentiments described above, Western-style neoliberal free-market economics have thrived under Turkish Islamist rule. For example, while we see an anti-imperial appeal for a Muslim power structure outside Moscow or Washington's control, reflected in Erdoğan's slogan, "The World Is Bigger Than Five"—a dig at the UN Security Council and the name of a book the leader gifted to Malcolm X's daughter in 2018 (Daily Sabah, 2018b)—he has also overseen significant Western investment in the country. While anti-imperialist rhetoric has featured heavily in Erbakan's various arguments, including his opposition to the European Common Market (Lord, 2018, p. 212), free market policies have also dramatically transformed society, spreading wealth from a more select urban elite to the hinterlands. In *The Neoliberal Landscape and the Rise of Islamist Capital in Turkey*, Balkan and Oncu write that, "Since its foundation, the Turkish republic has been strategically oriented toward integration with Western imperialism. The Western orientation of the dominant fraction of its big bourgeoisie, as represented by TUSIAD and its circles, is a product of the need to articulate the interests of international capital and Western imperialism" (Balkan and Oncu, 2015, p. 98). In the aftermath of market privatization in the 1980s, many religious businessmen from the Anatolian heartland—the so-called "Anatolian Tigers"—started to become rich, and this led to the creation of groups such as MUSIAD to counterbalance TUSIAD. Furthermore, Yildiz Atasoy writes that "The presence of a strong pro-Islamic faction within [Turgut Ozal's Motherland Party] was crucial in establishing a link between Muslim cultural values and a neoliberal economic development project" (Atasoy, 2009, p. 105). Under the Refah Party and the

subsequent AK Party, this trend continued, and as Cihan Tugal reports in his seminal book, “Passive Revolution,” abortive attempts at explicitly Islamist parties and groups led to deradicalization and “traditional religion’s emphasis on patience was now disarticulated from the ‘Islamic economy’ project and articulated to neoliberalism” (Tugal, 2009, pp. 237-8 and p. 224).

Finally, it is worth noting the role of the Cold War in tempering anti-American and anti-Western sentiments among Turkish Islamists. Although some Islamists like Necmettin Erbakan believed Turkey fit neither with the capitalist West nor Communist Soviets, others expressed support for America for its opposition to the USSR. As noted earlier, the conservative mainstream predecessor to the rise of Turkish Islamism—the Democrat Party—was markedly pro-American. It was during this time that Turkey joined NATO and received aid as part of Truman’s Marshall Plan. This happened in part due to the intensification of the Cold War and the related efforts at industrialization, including a technological partnership with the United States to challenge the Soviets: Ali Erken writes that “The Democrat Party governments sped up the pace of industrialization, which necessitated far more skilled engineers in different fields. Furthermore, in the 1950s the American political-intellectual elite often expressed their need for a closer ally in the Near East to the pleasure of Celal Bayar and Adnan Menderes, who sought to modernise the country’s industry” (Erken, 2018, p. 145). But was not just the Democrat Party, often remembered for its introduction of more religion into public politics. Islamist groups were encouraged so long as they showed support for the West due to its opposition to the Soviet Union; Hakan Yavuz writes that “The leadership of the DP allowed a degree of freedom to religious group as long as they were anti-communist and pro-NATO. Neither civil society nor human rights were at the top of the DP agenda. Its

primary goal was to defeat communism in Turkey” (Yavuz, 2009, pp. 90-91). Later, during the apex of the Cold War, under Turgut Ozal, Robert Kaplan writes that “Ozal’s genius in the later years of the Cold War was to stay political anchored to the West, even as he softened the arch-secularist tendency of Kemalism to give religious Muslims a larger stake in the system...The Turkish generals, supremely uncomfortable with Ozal’s religiosity, stayed in control of nationalist security policy, which Ozal did not challenge, because he and the generals were in broad agreement about Turkey as a NATO bulwark” (Kaplan, 2013, p. 291). Thus, forces that played a significant role in ultimately promoting Turkish Islamism also encouraged pro-American policies and sentiments. It is these political realities that have existed at the same time that anti-Western and anti-American rhetoric has pervaded the more radical elements of the contemporary Turkish Islamist movement.

As this chapter shows, anti-Western and pan-Islamist sentiments have found a following among a significant contingent of Turkish Islamists. Although the ascendant Turkish Islamist movement has lent support to a new domestic hegemony, and have aided Western powers abroad, anti-Western sentiments and a struggle for power in the Turkish politics appear to fuel the popularity of Malcolm X among the authors of the columns this thesis analyzes. The last chapter argued that by taking the case of Black Americans to the international stage, Malcolm X bridged the frame of the American Black nationalist movement with those of anti-colonial and pan-Islamist struggles abroad. This chapter shows how the leanings of some Turkish Islamists against Western hegemony primed the movement to adopt the symbol and rhetoric of Malcolm X, despite ushering in a new hegemony within Turkey that has served as a partner of Western hegemony abroad.

Despite the distance and disconnection of Turkish Islamists from the American Black struggle, they have adopted some of Malcolm X's and his movement's ideas; thus, it makes sense that they will have adapted and modified them to fit its own frames. As noted earlier, Malcolm X's affiliation with Islam and subsequent hajj pilgrimage connected him to the wider world of Muslims, while also acquainting them with his own personal struggles as a Black American. The major overlap between the frames of Turkish Islamists and Malcolm X comes from their anti-Western sentiments, internationalist approach to politics, and a shared Muslim faith. Furthermore, Malcolm X's negative experience as an American citizen serves to cement negative notions of the United States. However, some crucial differences exist in how Turkish Islamists interpret Malcolm X's ideas. This point will be illustrated in further detail in the subsequent chapter, in which the discussion and diffusion of Malcolm X by Turkish Islamist newspapers to the broader movement is analyzed.

## CHAPTER 5

### THE DIFFUSER: TURKISH ISLAMIST COLUMNISTS

#### 5.1 Overview

Broadly speaking, this thesis has argued so far that Malcolm X's bridging of American Black nationalist, anti-colonial and pan-Islamist frames have facilitated his diffusion by Turkish Islamist newspaper columnists. This chapter will show how those columnists participate in diffusion and interpret Malcolm X as a political symbol for the broader Turkish Islamist movement. It will explore this dynamic through a discourse analysis of language and themes within the columns, arguing that they often approach Malcolm X and the Black condition in the United States as a metaphor. Ultimately, this thesis argues that Malcolm X is reinterpreted in a way that strays far from and does not align with his original message, that of an aggrieved leader of an ethnic minority criticizing an ethnic majority. This chapter is divided into two parts. The first provides an overview of the methodology for collecting relevant columns and the key authors, depictions of Malcolm X, historical events contained within them (for the full dataset and queries, see Appendices A-D). The second section analyzes and discusses how the columns interpret Malcolm X. The following chapter will review possible applications of these findings in other cases or areas of study.

#### 5.2 Methodology and dataset

This discourse analysis draws from a data set comprising 242 columns from three Islamist newspapers in Turkey. To obtain these columns, this researcher conducted



60 searches online between Friday, May 17 and Sunday, May 19, 2019. Boolean Google queries drew from the column sections of the websites of *Yeni Safak*, *Yeni Akit* and *Milli Gazete* to find works mentioning Malcolm X and other variations of his name. Because *Milli Gazete*'s website search engine allowed users to filter for columns, searches for columns were also conducted there. To minimize variation in results, each publication's Google searches were conducted one at a time, consecutively and at a specific location. Results were not restricted by date. Articles with duplicate or similar text from the same author were included in the data set, so long as they possessed different hyperlinks and were published on different dates (this allowed for analysis of recycled or republished content). This methodology yielded columns by 85 authors, including 121 articles from *Yeni Safak*, 81 from *Milli Gazete* and 40 from *Yeni Akit*, all of which mentioned Malcolm X or one of his aliases at least once.

Due to constraints in this author's geographical mobility and ability to access physical archives for the duration of this study, the scope of this data set was adjusted to include any columns that could be accessed on the three publications' websites. For this reason, this data set represents a much more contemporary era from the one in which Malcolm X was active, and covers a period of great political and social change in Turkey just shy of 23 years, ranging from November 3, 1996 to May 18, 2019. Because of the likely incomplete and uneven distribution of columns throughout the years, the data set was not quantitatively analyzed for overall trends in sentiment over time or differences in coverage between publications. Rather, this body of work represents a source of qualitative data indicating significant themes, authors and time periods in Turkish Islamist discourse about Malcolm X.

*Milli Gazete*, *Yeni Safak* and *Yeni Akit* were chosen for their historical importance in the Turkish Islamist movement. While they may align with more mainstream political actors following the AK Party's rise to power, their ideological roots lie in the ascendant Islamist movements of Necmettin Erbakan and his successors. The publication *Milli Gazete* is the oldest of the three; it began publishing in 1973 in support of Necmettin Erbakan's Milli Gorus movement, and has shown support for his Felicity Party (previously known as the Welfare Party), while *Yeni Akit* (established in 1993 as *Akit*) and *Yeni Safak* (established in 1995) are pro-government, although the latter is reported to have initially included more liberal viewpoints as well (Open Source Center and Euro Topics). *Millie Gazete* was reported to have a circulation of roughly 51,000 in 2008, while *Yeni Akit* had a circulation of 53,000 in 2018, and *Yeni Safak* had a circulation of 112,000 in 2016 (Open Source Center and Euro Topics). *Yeni Safak* is closely aligned with the ruling AKP through its ownership by the Albayrak family; Berat Albayrak is Recep Tayyip Erdoğan's son-in-law and Turkey's current finance minister. In a 2002 analysis of Turkish Islamist press, sociologist Cihan Tugal reviewed these same three publications, calling them "prominent Islamist newspapers in Turkey" (Tugal, 2002, 92). "The print media are crucial to Islamist movements in Turkey," he argued. "Activists and followers participate in collective readings in coffee houses, dormitories and civil organizations. While these readings circulate ideas beyond the printed page, they also create intellectual space for the popular negotiation of the meaning generated in Islamist print" (Tugal, 2002, p. 92).

### 5.2.1 Key depictions in the discourse

In these 242 articles, columnists depict Malcolm X in at least one of eight distinct ways (themes discussed in more detail later in this chapter):

- As a quotable moral authority
- As a symbol of the Ummah
- As a symbol of martyrdom
- As proof of Islam's transformative power
- As an internal critic of America
- As a companion of Muhammad Ali
- As a symbol in the Turkish political context
- As a subject of literature and cinema

### 5.2.2 Key events in the discourse

Although mentions of Malcolm X appear in articles reacting to a variety of different historical events, ranging from the 2001 Turkish economic crisis to the 1996 U.S. election and the 2014 Ferguson Unrest, at least two historical events attracted considerable coverage:

- The 2008 election of President Barack Obama
- The 2016 death of boxer Muhammad Ali

### 5.2.2 Key columnists in the discourse

*Yeni Safak* accounts for half of all columns mentioning Malcolm X (121), with *Milli Gazete* coming in second place (81) and *Yeni Akit* in third (40). Notably, just over

half of the 85 authors (43) published more than one article mentioning Malcolm X. The vast majority wrote four or fewer articles, with just over a fifth (17) writing five or more articles, most of them in *Yeni Safak*. In *Yeni Akit*, the columnists who wrote more than five articles were Hasan Aksay and Abdurrahman Dilipak; in *Milli Gazete*, they were: Abdulaziz Kiransal, Meryem Nida, Sakir Tarim, Mahmut Toptas and Mustafa Yildirim; in *Yeni Safak*, they were Hakan Albayrak, Muhammad Berdibek, Akif Emre, Nazif Gurdogan, Ali Murat Guven, Ali Nur Kutlu, Omer Lekesiz, Gokhan Ozcan, Rasim Ozdenoren, Salih Tuna.

A few of the above authors in particular are worth highlighting, given their political involvement and controversial statements. Firstly, Hasan Aksay, who is featured in several *Yeni Akit* articles, served as an MP for the Justice Party from 1961 to 1965, and helped found the National Order Party, as well as holding posts with the National Salvation Party and the Refah Party in later years (Biyografya). Secondly, Hakan Albayrak, who is featured in several *Yeni Safak* articles, went to prison in 2004 for insulting Ataturk in an article in which he claimed that the leader was buried without the recitation of a funeral prayer (Hürriyet, 2004). Thirdly, Abdurrahman Dilipak, no stranger to controversy, is at the center of a recently filed lawsuit by women in the AKP for calling supporters of the Istanbul Convention “prostitutes” in a July 27 column (Bianet, 2020).

Finally, although he is not included in this list, it is also worth noting that former Turkish Prime Minister Ahmet Davutoglu is among the *Yeni Safak* authors represented in this dataset. While he only brings up Malcolm X once—incidentally and in passing—to refer to the evolution of the Nation of Islam into a more internationally-minded organization with a greater interest in the global Islamic

community, it indicates an awareness in elite Turkish political circles of Black American Islam (Davutoglu, 1996).

### 5.3 Discourse analysis and discussion

This section shows how prominently Malcolm X's Islamic identity and his response to America's role as a hegemonic power have figure in his diffusion by Turkish Islamist columnists. Authors of these columns reference both to assign credibility to Malcolm X (Malcolm X as a quotable moral authority, symbol of the Ummah, symbol of martyrdom and companion of Muhammad Ali) and draw reaffirm their own beliefs (Malcolm X as an internal critic of America, proof of Islam's transformative power). Frequently, Malcolm X is employed as a symbol and his words are used to legitimize these columnists' political positions, regardless of whether they are directly relevant to the Black leader's life and work. As a result, Malcolm X and the Black condition in America become a metaphor for perceived injustices in other contexts, in this case some of them distinctly Turkish (Malcolm X as a symbol in the Turkish political context).

#### 5.3.1 The diffusion of the symbol and ideas of Malcolm X

As noted earlier, a central concept in sociology are "frames," which, according to Robert Entman, "define problems," "diagnose causes," "make moral judgments" and "suggest remedies" (Entman, 1993, p. 52). "Collective action frames" refer to the frames of social movements, which are "constructed in part as movement adherents negotiate a shared understanding of some problematic condition or situation they define as in need of change, make attributions regarding who or what is to blame, articulate an alternative set of arrangements, and urge others to act in concert to

affect change” (Benford and Snow, 2000, p. 615). Thus, Malcolm X and the broader Black nationalist movement can be considered as representing frames. Malcolm X’s work to internationalize his cause, particularly in the Middle East and independent Africa, reached a wide and global audience including Turkish Islamists. While his views on the intrinsic evil of white Americans softened as he distanced himself from the Nation of Islam, he linked the challenges faced by Black Americans to broader issues between the West and non-Western countries, and addressed these challenges by promoting Islamic values and anti-colonial defiance.

Similarly, Turkish Islamism is a movement whose adherents adopt frames, in which they seek to “define problems,” “diagnose causes,” “make moral judgements” and “suggest remedies” (Entman, 1993, p. 52). Although the movement is broad, and, thus, these problems, causes, judgments and remedies do not apply universally to all adherents and throughout all periods of its history, this dynamic describes the way in which Turkish Islamists and these newspaper columns operate. As a body of literature, these columns point to various problems in Turkey and the world (i.e. currency fluctuations, ethnic divisions, political instability, terrorism), diagnose causes (i.e. Western and American imperialism), make moral judgments (i.e. regarding perceived Islamophobia and racism in the United States) and suggest remedies (i.e. Islamic teachings). Columnists find common ground on Malcolm X, comparing him to Necmettin Erbakan and Recep Tayyip Erdoğan, framing him as a martyr and juxtaposing their own political struggle in Turkey to that of the Black nationalist leader.

It does not matter that Malcolm X never spoke Turkish nor visited Turkey; despite the fact that he never belonged to nor endorsed the contemporary Turkish Islamist movement himself, his efforts at internationalizing and thus bridging his

own movement's frame with those of others led to the eventual diffusion of him as a symbol and his ideas by Turkish Islamist newspaper columns to their readers. Because of the key role that newspapers have played in the Turkish Islamist quest for hegemony, references to Malcolm X by columnists have been important to the diffusion of the leader as a symbol to the broader movement. In his 2009 study of Islamist mobilization in Turkey, Cihan Tugal writes that "hegemonic mobilization reconfigures state and society through a long walk, which concentrates on repetitive conversations, oral debates, readings (of newspapers, books, pamphlets), education, rituals, and routinized everyday practices" (Tugal, 2009b, p. 430). In particular, in the Istanbul neighborhood of Sultanbeyli, which Tugal studied, he noted that the "main Islamizing actors in Sultanbeyli were the Islamist party, imams, intellectuals, and tradesmen. Islamism was also the main tendency among the columnists and editors of the newspapers (*Akit*, *Milli Gazete*, *Yeni Safak*) they followed" (Tugal, 2009b, p. 436). On a broader level, scholars have noted the influence of media on individuals' framing; in their 1989 study of media coverage of nuclear power, Gamson and Modigliani noted that "media discourse is part of the process by which individuals construct meaning" (Gamson and Modigliani, 1989, p. 2).

As these columns show, Malcolm X's bridging of frames and Turkish Islamist newspaper columnists' later reference to him as a symbol and his ideas constitute diffusion, a phenomenon which refers to "the spread of movement ideas, practices, and frames from one country to another (della Porta and Tarrow 2005, p. 2). This diffusion involves four elements: (1) a person, group, or organization that serves as the emitter or transmitter; (2) a person, group, or organization that is the adopter; (3) the item that is diffused, such as material goods, information, skills, and the like; and (4) a channel of diffusion that may consist of persons or media that link

the transmitter and the adopter” (McAdam and Rucht, 1993, p. 59). In this case, 1) Malcolm X is the emitter; 2) Turkish Islamists are the adopter; 3) the diffused items are the teachings, values and symbol of Malcolm X and 4) the channel of diffusion are the columnists this thesis analyzes. Strang and Soule write that diffusion studies provide “an opportunity to observe the cultural construction of meaning, where we learn how practices are locally and globally interpreted, and ask why some practices flow while others languish” (Strang and Soule, 1993, p. 266). This thesis aims to do exactly that with the case of Malcolm X among Turkish Islamists.

As noted earlier, diffusion of a movement’s politics or symbols does not necessarily mean they are interpreted accurately by their adopters. Snow and Benford write that “the object of diffusion is likely to be strategically modified and adapted to the host culture in the case of cross-cultural borrowing,” adding that leaders and activists of social movements “not only strategically borrow or promote, but the objects of both — be they cultural ideas, items or practices — are framed behaviourally or lingually so as to enhance the prospect of their resonance with the host or target culture” (Snow and Benford, 1999, pp. 37-8). This is the role of these columnists: they “enhance the prospect of resonance” of Malcolm X’s ideas with Turks. The following sections outline two framings they engage in to enhance this prospect: Malcolm X’s Muslim identity and his adversarial relationship with American hegemony. Both of these positions align with the Pan-Islamist and anti-Western sentiments of contemporary Turkish Islamism described in the last chapter.

### 5.3.2 Assigning credibility and significance to Malcolm X’s Muslim identity

In these columns, a major factor underpinning Malcolm X’s credibility is his Muslim identity. Malcolm X and his life story are frequently interpreted through a Pan-



Islamist lens, with an emphasis on his identity as a Muslim convert, a Black/African/American member of the *Ummah*, an exemplary man of faith and a martyr. Authors of these columns repeatedly invoke his name alongside other high-profile Muslim figures (i.e. Necmettin Erbakan or Alija Izetbegovic). While some articles mention Malcolm X purely in the context of racial politics, a large number of them emphasize his Muslim identity, reflecting a Turkish Pan-Islamist view in which the political leader's religious identity is potentially more significant than his racial or ethnic identity. In a February 2016 column in *Yeni Safak*, for example, author Yusuf Ziya Comert evoked the memory of "Malcolm X's martyrdom," writing, "There is no Islamist who does not know the life story of Malcolm X, one of the best Muslims of the past century" (Comert, 2016). Although he did not elaborate any further as to why this is the case, he indicated how relevant Malcolm X and his views were to Turkish Islamism by mentioning him alongside Turkish Islamist activist Metin Yuksel. In another example, a column entitled "The Conquering of Istanbul and the Conquest Prayer," author Abdulaziz Kiransal (who uses the very same line in several articles) quotes Malcolm X as saying that, "As a Muslim, I feel obligated to fight for the spread of Islam until all the world bows before Allah" (Kiransal, 2016). Ironically, he ignores the rest of Malcolm X's remark in Cairo, in which he added "but as an Afro-American, I can never overlook the miserable plight of my people in America, so I have two fights, two struggles" (New York Public Library).

On the other hand, when Malcolm X's Black identity is emphasized, it is often done so to showcase the breadth of the *Ummah*, the global community of Muslims spanning across geography, race and ethnicity. For example, in one article entitled "A Pledge for our Children"—also by Kiransal of *Milli Gazete*—the author mimics the tone of Turkey's Republican student pledge. He writes, "I am a Muslim,

*Alhamdulillah...*In America, whites knew me as Malcolm X, the child of a black-skinned woman” (Kiransal, 2018). In this case, Malcolm X is portrayed as the Muslim world’s Black American emissary. A *Yeni Akit* article, “Young Man, the Ummah Is This,” an open letter of sorts written by Ahmet Anapali in December 2015 as a response to people those who claim it is in disarray (Anapali, 2015), reads: “You are as Turkish as Alparslan Gazi, as Kurdish as Selahaddin-i Eyyubi, as Arab as Omer Muhtar, as Chechen as Sheik Samil, as Albanian as Mehmet Akif, as Bosnian as Aliya Izzet Begovic, as Black and African as Malcolm X.” Although this description overlooks Malcolm X’s identity as an American citizen and portrays him as “African”, it nevertheless serves the purpose of expanding the concept of the *Ummah* to include Black Muslims and Africans.

Furthermore, coexisting with his identity as a Muslim—and thus symbol of the Ummah—is his reputation among some Turkish Islamists as a globally significant martyr. While mainstream American references often overlook his place within the broader realm of global Islamic history, many of these columns refer to Malcolm X as a martyr, comparing him to a slew of other Muslim figures from across the Middle East, Europe and Africa. Columnist Mehmet Kocak wrote in *Yeni Akit* in February 2016 that “Malcolm X is the symbolic name of our American martyrs” (Kocak, 2016). Across all three publications, Malcolm X’s martyrdom is an especially popular topic in February, referred to by some authors as the “month of martyrs.” In a *Yeni Akit* article entitled “February, month of martyrs,” Mehmet Ali Tekin lists Malcolm X among other names such as Hasan al-Banna and Esad Erbili (Tekin, 2014)—names that appear in other writing, too (Yildirim, 2014 and Nida, 2017). Another author, Mahmut Toptas of *Milli Gazete*, went so far as to write in November 2008 (without clarifying who “they” is): “Let’s just say they killed him because he

was Muslim” (Toptas, 2008). Although this serves as a defining example of his Muslim identity among these columns, this is also a simplistic and problematic framing given the role that the domestic politics of the United States and internal affairs of the Nation of Islam played in his untimely death, as well as the complex role that secular anti-colonial politics and politicians such as Gamal Abdel Nasser played in his affairs.

Finally, another significant way in which Malcolm X is associated with Islam by these columnists is by mentioning him as a companion of Muhammad Ali, another world-famous Muslim convert. The passing of the champion boxer was an internationally important event, with even Turkish President Recep Tayyip Erdoğan, who was in the U.S. at the time, attending an Islamic prayer event for him. In the days and years since, columns have remembered Ali and Malcolm X positively. On June 10, 2016, *Yeni Safak* columnist Ibrahim Karagul reflected on both men’s lives in a column entitled, “Muhammad Ali, Malcolm X and the path of upstanding men,” in which he wrote, “They offered new values, goals and identities to their own societies, besides Islam. In such an era, names like Muhammad Ali and Malcolm X expressed resistance. In the greatest poverty they stood on their feet with an identity, and with that identity they could rebel in the heart of the West” (Karagul, 2016). Even a year after his death, in 2017, *Milli Gazete* columnist Ibrahim Halil Er wrote, “I recognized Muhammed Ali at a young age. After that, I became interested in American Muslims and got to know Malcolm X, another hero. I read his [biography]. I became consciously opposed to Western imperialism” (Er, 2017). In the aftermath of the 2018 currency crisis, *Milli Gazete* columnist Mahmut Toptas, in an article entitled “We Don’t Need Dollars, We Need Men,” wrote that that “What America really needs are the principles of Islamic faith that Muslims like [Malcolm

X] and [Muhammad Ali] have” (Toptas, 2018). In these examples, Malcolm X is placed in the broader history of Islam in America, a history in which he and Muhammad Ali occupy an important role. Both Malcolm X and boxer occupy a significant position within a pan-Islamist perspective of the United States.

### 5.3.3 Referencing Malcolm X to reaffirm negative beliefs about America

Another significant factor facilitating the transmission of Malcolm X and his ideas to Turkish Islamists is his criticism of the United States and his stance against its government. At the same time that his Muslim identity ties him to Turkish Islamists and lends him credibility, he is also distinguished by his status as an American citizen. As a Muslim in America, he serves as an observer from behind unfriendly—if not enemy—lines. Malcolm X’s familiarity with and negative experiences in America lend credibility to his and others’ criticism of the United States, as he is intimately aware of the situation there and can claim a native understanding of it. Thus, it appears, many of the authors of these articles reference Malcolm X’s criticism of the United States to provide evidence for their own criticism of America. For them, the activist serves as a knowledgeable victim and critic of the United States.

In a *Yeni Akit* article entitled, “Is there any country that America has not haunted?” for example, author Huseyin Ozturk criticizes U.S. military actions from Vietnam to Japan to Iraq, writing that “rather than [studying] thousands of examples, those who just study the life of Malcolm X can see how the U.S. exported terror to other innocent peoples” (Ozturk, 2018). In another article, critical of President Obama, the author Cemile Bayraktar concludes, “We have experienced that the ‘American Dream’ engraved in minds cannot be a reality, and will be the stuff of

dreams, because of these words that Malcolm X said half a century ago: ‘I don’t see [any] American dream, I see an American nightmare.’” (Bayraktar, 2015). Within this context, his racial identity is significant for authors of these columns, as it solidifies America’s reputation as an unjust place. In these columns, his experiences as a Black man in search of justice contrast with the immorality of America’s government. For example, a *Yeni Safak* article by Hakan Albayrak about the revolutionary group the Black Panthers, begins with a whopping 30-line paragraph in which the author voices a mythical “Uncle Sam” berating America’s Black citizens (i.e. “Look at the mirror, at your pitch-black faces, look and be embarrassed! You are ugly! You are gross!...Yes, you are inferior, you are ugly! Don’t you dare forget this!”) (Albayrak, 2007). In his symbolic recounting of American racial history, this state of affairs continues “until one of them—Malcolm X—shouts ‘Black is beautiful!’” This account of American history, despite its symbolism and oversimplification, underscores the importance of Malcolm X’s Black identity to presenting the United States as an unjust place.

Furthermore, juxtaposed against this unjust society, Malcolm X’s conversion to Islam is portrayed as a righteous and wise move. The significance of his life trajectory is emphasized in these articles, in which many columnists portray it as a testament to Islam’s transformative power. They credit his conversion with a move away from a life of crime and negativity, and toward righteousness and positivity. For example, in one *Yeni Akit* article, entitled “Those terrorists are the result of not learning Islam,” author Ali Erkan Kavakli recommends Malcolm X’s autobiography to see how “a person becomes benevolent after becoming Muslim” (Kavakli, 2015). In another article in *Milli Gazete*, author Meryem Nida discusses an Islamic youth program that includes teachings about Malcolm X. She says the children witnessed

how “in a society that oppressed and was oppressed, where even being Black was considered a crime, [Malcolm X] reached for a bright future from under his pitch-black skin and toward the shining sun of Islam” (Nida, 2014). Despite the use of arguably racist imagery here, it unmistakably illustrates Islam as a force for good. Meanwhile, in a narrative that reflects his own autobiography, his 1964 hajj trip is referenced by these columnists as an example of Islamic spiritual transformation. In a *Milli Gazete* article entitled “The need for Hajj and Organizations,” Ismail Killioglu begins with a quote from Malcolm X about the variety of races present at hajj to show their love to God, referring to him as returning to America afterward as a “renewed” Muslim, “placed on a steady path;” he adds, “Undoubtedly, the impressions of Mâlik al-Şahbaz’s Hajj are observations that register in the inner world of a beginner Muslim. But they are also a reference to the universal meaning of Hajj” (Killioglu, 2006). Mahmut Toptas’ language comes off as harshly critical of the United States and of Christianity, associating Malcolm X’s turn to Islam as a transformation for the better. For example, in one article, he writes: “America’s Malcolm X, who used to do the dirtiest things when he was Christian, took the name Malik el Şahbaz after he became a Muslim.” He brings Malcolm X up alongside Jesus, Hasan al Banna and Sayyid Qutb, saying the Black leader became a “martyr” at the hands of CIA agents “when he began to draw the attention of the American people to Islam with his effective sermons” (Toptas, 2013). Ali Haydar Haksal, meanwhile, deflates expectations of Barack Obama ahead of the 2008 election. He writes, “The United States did not tolerate Malcolm X. He was killed as a result of an assassination. America cannot tolerate strong Muslims and a strong Islamic state. It is against its soul” (Haksal, 2008). Thus, in these articles, Malcolm X’s Muslim

identity stands in righteous contrast to an unjust society—the United States—which is seen to be deserving of criticism.

#### 5.3.4 Malcolm X and the Black American experience as metaphor and analogy

While assigning credibility to Malcolm X’s Muslim identity, and using his life story and opinions to reaffirm their own beliefs about the United States, many columnists also end up metaphorizing his life and the broader Black American experience. For example, as noted earlier, a columnist spoke of how children in an Islamic education program learned about how Malcolm X “reached for a bright future from under his pitch-black skin and toward the shining sun of Islam” (Nida, 2014)—a racially-charged contrast that associates blackness with a lack of opportunity and direction, in contrast to the “sunlight,” or enlightenment, that Islam offers. Also aforementioned, Hakan Albayrak’s article about a racist “Uncle Sam” demeaning Black Americans goes as far as to construct a dialogue between the mythical figure and Malcolm X, an exchange that serves as a metaphorical description of American history, a representation of the American government’s oppression of Black Americans in the mid-20th century. Yet some columns go a step further, divorcing references to Malcolm X and the Black condition from American politics entirely, instead using his experience and the experience of Black Americans as a general representation for asymmetrical power relations in other contexts, including in Turkey.

A striking example of this appears in an article addressing German-Turkish relations, in a *Yeni Akit* column published in March 2017, shortly after Erdoğan accused Germany of “Nazi practices” after the cancellation of pro-referendum rallies there. Author Abdurrahman Dilipak addressed Chancellor Angela Merkel directly, writing “You expected us to be Uncle Tom. Uncle Tom died. Malcolm Xes are

coming. Don't be so afraid, our compassion is greater than our wrath. And our love than our hate. If we weren't like this what difference would be left between us!" (Dilipak, 2017). In this case, the author compares Turkey's position vis-a-vis Germany with that of an oppressed Black American vis-a-vis their white counterparts, employing a spectrum of compliance to defiance ranging from the submissive fictional Uncle Tom to the defiant Malcolm X. Divorced entirely of an American context, this use compares Turkish defiance against Germany to Black-white relations in the US. In yet another column in *Yeni Safak*, entitled "You Rascal House Negro," author Ismail Kilicarslan accuses certain Turks of being "house negroes"—a term Malcolm X uses to describe submissive Black Americans (based off the idea that slaves in slaveholders' homes were more compliant than their counterparts working in the field). He begins the article with what appears to be a loose adaptation of an exchange from Spike Lee's 1992 film, "An Autobiography of Malcolm X," in which the Black leader describes the concept of a "house negro" (Kilicarslan, 2016). Kilicarslan then mentions attacks by ISIS in France and the events of September 11th and KKK terror in the U.S., followed by an apparent reference to ongoing violence by Kurdish separatists in Turkey. He writes, "Don't you see? Do you think that if the 'masters' succeed in putting Turkey in [an] 'undignified' position, do you think they'll give you a medal? If you are content with eating three spoonfuls of rice on top of what you eat now, that's your choice of course" (Kilicarslan, 2016). Here, Malcolm X's words have been used as a metaphor to describe critics of the Turkish government's fight with Kurdish separatists, framing them as undignified by linking them to submissive slaves in antebellum America. Similarly, the Malcolm X quote "Strike at the puppeteer, not the puppet," which he used originally to describe the position of Black Americans vis-a-vis white



oppression, is used to describe Turkey's conflict with Kurdish separatists in at least two *Milli Gazete* articles by two different authors in 2007 and 2016. Thus, we see the versatility and adaptability of Malcolm X and his words, being used metaphorically to address situations geographically, politically and culturally distant from their original context.

Finally, these columnists analogize the life of Malcolm X to those of Necmettin Erbakan and Recep Tayyip Erdoğan. His defiance is also compared with Turkish leaders Recep Tayyip Erdoğan and Necmettin Erbakan, both significant figures in the Turkish Islamist movement. On February 25, 2016—roughly five years to the date of Erbakan's death—*Milli Gazete* author Meryem Nida wrote of him that “there was a piece of everyone in him,” including “Hassan al-Banna's energy” and “Malcolm X's love” (Nida, 2016). In a *Yeni Akit* article from September 2018 entitled “President Erdoğan is an exemplary leader with his speeches, pleas and warnings,” Mehmet Kocak writes that while listening to his speech to the UN General Assembly figures came to mind including Bosnian President Alija Izetbegovic and India's Mahatma Gandhi, as well as Nelson Mandela and Malcolm X, both “exemplary leaders of the fight against racism” (Kocak, 2018). One can even find a comparison of Malcolm X with Erdoğan dating as far back as the late 1990s, after he was famously jailed for reading from Ziya Gokalp's “A Soldier's Prayer,” comparing minarets to bayonets. In an April 1999 column, columnist Nazif Gurdogan mentions meeting Erdoğan in jail. The future president had entered jail in March, where he would end up serving for four months. Gurdogan reported that Erdoğan said he spent his nights reading Islamic texts; the columnist proceeded to compare his situation to that of Dostoyevsky and Malcolm X. He writes, “Like Malcolm X says, especially in Turkey, ‘If someone needs to think, the best place he

can go next to university is jail” (Gurdogan, 1999). Given that Malcolm X’s years in jail were a time of extensive growth and development during which he developed his sense of self and prowess as an intellectual, the author appears to grant Erdoğan political legitimacy and significance through the use of this analogy.

One reason for the metaphorization of Malcolm X by these columnists may be the outsized role Malcolm X’s autobiography plays—both in print and film—in their understanding of him and his circumstances. *An Autobiography of Malcolm X* was published in Turkish as early as 1978 (NadirKitap), followed by Spike Lee’s 1992 biopic Hollywood adaptation of it. Many of these columns mention at least one of the two works. Columnists not only draw from these sources for Turkish political metaphors (Kılıçarslan, 2016 and Zelan, 2016), but also directly comment on and praise the two works. For example, in an article in *Milli Gazete* entitled “The subject of religion in American and Western film,” the columnist mentions Lee’s “Malcolm X” among “the important films” that “address the subject of Islam directly (Siyami 2018). Meanwhile, in *Yeni Safak* column, the author says Malcolm X’s Autobiography was a book that touched his heart and that he savored: “Despite being as thick as brick,” he wrote, he was “scared that it would be over. At night, I would turn off the electricity because the people in the house would get angry and read it under the covers with a flashlight. Occasionally, I would close my eyes and try to portray the streets of Harlem depicted by Malcom X in the book, and the atmosphere in the prison” (Kutlu, 2015). Although it is impossible to ascertain how many of these columnists first became acquainted with Malcolm X through the written autobiography or its film adaptation, the above references serve as a testament to their importance among these newspaper columnists.

### 5.3.5 Malcolm X's righteous and selective defiance

What is most notable about these articles is the sheer variety of contexts in which Malcolm X's name is mentioned in relation to a quote. In fact, many articles do not focus on Malcolm X, bringing him up instead incidentally, often in the context of a quote. The quotes play roles ranging from supporting Turkey's fight against the PKK, to describing its righteous relationship vis-a-vis Europe, or buttressing the case for converting the Hagia Sophia into a mosque. On the surface, these quotes appear to address disparate, unrelated issues. However, upon closer examination, they resemble one another in terms of tone and usage; for many of the authors quoting Malcolm X, the Black leader represents a righteous defiance, not unlike the kind that might be derived from the words of a religious authority. Below is a selection of quotes featured in these articles (correctly attributed quotes in their original form):

- “The best advice is a good example.” (falsely attributed to Malcolm X)
- “Don’t strike at the puppet, strike at the puppeteer.”
- “If you’re not careful, the newspapers will have you hating the people who are being oppressed, and loving the people who are doing the oppressing.”
- “As a Muslim, I feel obligated to fight for the spread of Islam until all the world bows before Allah.”
- “I’m for truth, no matter who tells it. I’m for justice, no matter who it is for or against. I’m a human being, first and foremost, and as such I’m for whoever and whatever benefits humanity as a whole.”
- “We are collecting sins for a world that won’t remain for us.” (unattributable)
- “If you don’t stand for something you will fall for anything”

As one can see, these quotes share a defiant, aspirational and authoritative tone, particularly regarding moral matters; in some cases, the authors of these columns use the same quotes in multiple articles over the years. This leaves no doubt as to the exceedingly positive tone with which these columnists discuss Malcolm X and the high regard they have for him.

Yet it is worth also noting that the Turkish Islamist interpretation of Malcolm X detailed in this thesis is just as problematic as it is potent. On a surface level, Turkish Islamism seeks freedom through independence and separation from Europe. Just as Malcolm X believed that Black Americans would not gain acceptance and prosperity by adhering to a white American political structure, Neo-Ottoman Turkish Islamists like Erbakan did not believe that Turkey would prosper by adhering to the standards and expectations of Europeans; rather, it would be by challenging the hegemonic order and adhering to their own cultures that both movements would succeed. Furthermore, Both Malcolm X and some Turkish Islamists have seen the West as a source of problems for their respective communities and have sought to establish stronger connections with the wider world. However, these surface-level similarities upon which some interpretations of Malcolm X appear to be based, belie the extent to which a comparison mischaracterizes and even contradicts the American Black nationalist's core ideas. Malcolm X and his experience cannot be neatly compared to those of Turkish Islamists and the discriminated "Black Turks" with whom Erdoğan has associated himself (Michael Ferguson, 2014, pp. 78-9). Malcolm X's political experience cannot conveniently and neatly be transposed to a Turkish context with one-to-one takeaways for Turkish Islamists.

Although the columnists this thesis analyzes appear to have adopted the ideas and symbol of Malcolm X to fit their own cause and have used him as a vehicle to

explicate their own political issues, it would behoove them to probe whether such a comparison is appropriate in the first place. After all, for example, fighting an armed insurgency by separatist Kurds—part of an ethnic minority group in Turkey—cannot be accurately compared to Malcolm X’s position vis-à-vis the U.S. government; in fact, the Black nationalist leader’s radical and separatist rhetoric might more accurately be said to reflect that of a Kurdish insurgent in the Turkish context. Similarly, the experience of an Alevi Turk who is the victim of sectarian violence, or a Christian Greek who is devastated at the conversion of the Hagia Sophia into a mosque might more closely reflect Malcolm X’s politically marginal position as a Muslim in America, as opposed to that of a Sunni Muslim living in a majority Muslim country with a ruling party that is sympathetic to its perspective.

Furthermore, although this study’s data set makes it difficult to qualitatively point to definitive trends in sentiment, the rise of the AKP and its establishment of domestic hegemony begs the question of how Turkish Islamists have realigned their position toward the state, its authority and attempts to subvert it. Accordingly, these columns suggest that Turkish Islamist columnists are flexible in their use of Malcolm X to challenge authority or appeal to it, based on their rhetorical needs. The contrast between two aforementioned articles illustrates this best: in 1999, Erdoğan was compared positively to Malcolm X for spending time in prison for his controversial reading of a poem, while in 2007 and 2016, readers are told to “strike the puppeteer,” a reference to perceived shadowy machinations behind the ongoing Kurdish insurgency in Turkey. In the first case, Malcolm X boosts Erdoğan’s moral position by lending credibility to subversion of the state; in the second, Malcolm X warns against subversion of the state, framing it as the result of immoral forces. Thus, this raises the possibility that the AKP’s establishment of hegemony has changed and will

continue to change how Turkish Islamists view Malcolm X—from perhaps at first representing a fellow challenger of the (secular Kemalist) state, to eventually symbolizing righteous and passionate support for their so-called “New Turkey.”

## CHAPTER 6

### CONCLUSION: A WAY FORWARD?

This thesis shows step-by-step how Malcolm X internationalized his cause by participating in frame bridging, which in turn facilitated the diffusion of him as a symbol among Turkish Islamists. Thus, this analysis offers a framework for understanding his popularity among Turkish Islamists and Erdoğan's association with his daughter on the international stage, particularly in an era of strained relations between Ankara and Washington. Further, it points to the significance of renaming the boulevard that is home to Washington's embassy in Ankara after Malcolm X: the move serves as a symbolically pan-Islamist critique of Washington's hegemony, indicating a perceived lack of justice in the U.S. and its government's dealings.

Yet this investigation into the Turkish Islamist interpretation of Malcolm X also points to further possible inquiries in the areas of Turkish and American studies. For example, a similar discourse analysis and methodology could be employed to analyze Turkish discussion of other American political figures—such as Martin Luther King—to offer new ways of understanding American history and how it has been interpreted in Turkey. In another instance, social movement theory scholarship similar to that detailed in this thesis could be used to understand how the ongoing #BlackLivesMatter movement is being diffused in Turkey. In contrast to Malcolm X's era, information about social movements and activists moves much faster, including after the recent protests against police brutality in Minneapolis and other American cities. Finally, it might be worth investigating how Turkey's leftists

interpret Malcolm X and his internationalist struggle. Although Malcolm X appears to have become a popular symbol among the political right in Turkey, and his image has been commodified (Davis, 1992, p. 40), he has been influential in the United States as a symbol of the radical American left. Analysis of contemporary leftist Turkish discussion about Malcolm X would offer an invaluable contrast to the Islamist interpretations detailed in this thesis.

Ultimately, this thesis suggests that a boundless range of movements and movement leaders from across the world—ranging from Che Guevara, to Necmettin Erbakan, to BLM, BDS, the LGBT movement, Turkish Islamism, and the American Christian right—can and should be studied in a global and multilingual context, as they and their ideas can be adapted to fit political agendas across countries and time periods. Foreign interpretations of political figures of movements may differ significantly from domestic interpretations and overlook some key issues while selectively adapting others to fit another political context. This is highly evident in the case of Malcolm X, in that while Turkish Islamist rhetoric draws from his anti-colonial stance to make a case against Western hegemony, it also argues for the exceptionalism of Turkey and the Turks. It claims solidarity with Muslim leaders, like Malcolm X, while at the same time suggesting that Turks are worthy of leading the Muslim world; a tension emerges between Malcolm X's defiant anti-colonial aspirations and the desire of Turkish Islamists to live up to romantic notions of an imperial past. Furthermore, aligning Turkish Islamist aims with American Black nationalist aims shows a lack of appreciation for the significance of Malcolm X's experience as a minority ethnic group. While Turkish Islamists may perceive themselves to be waging a righteous and uphill battle against powerful political forces, this does not mean that Malcolm X and his cause is necessarily aligned with



theirs. In contrast to Turkish Islamists, Black Americans comprise an ethnic minority within their own country. While Turkish Islamists have been at odds with the ruling governments of past decades and have strong memories of their struggle for power, they have been able to ascend politically and become part of Turkey's hegemonic political structure no doubt in part due to their association with the ethnic and religious majority of Turkish Sunni Muslims. A similar outcome would be next to impossible for American Black nationalists to achieve, barring any substantial demographic changes in the United States, just as it would be arguably impossible for religious or ethnic minorities in Turkey to achieve political hegemony in Turkey. Thus, as noted in the previous chapter, Malcolm X's struggle as a Black American could be compared to that of a Kurd, Greek, Jew, Armenian or Alevi in today's Turkey—an important point that these columns overlook.

In the end, the tendency of these Turkish Islamist columnists to overlook the potential implications of Malcolm X's minority experience for similar groups within their own country points to the limits of this discourse. Malcolm X's cause, referenced repeatedly, aligns snugly with Turkish Islamists' political aims, never challenging them or their political allies. One sees a continuation of this myopic approach in a more recent round of columns mentioning Malcolm X, this time in reference to George Floyd's death. At least four such columns have been published in *Milli Gazete* and *Yeni Safak*; all are by authors who have discussed Malcolm X before, two reference the Black leader as a Muslim martyr (Tuncer, 2020 and Muradoglu, 2020) and all portray him positively and criticize the United States, with titles such as "Is it George Floyd who can't breathe, or America?" and "America was founded on genocide" (Kaya, 2020 and Ozkan, 2020). Although for these columnists

Malcolm X might help clarify the failings of America, he does not help clarify problems with the treatment of minorities in in their own society.

Just as the Black nationalist leader's adopted surname of "X" represents an indeterminate African lineage, he symbolizes an indeterminate and unfixed range of ideas for Turkish Islamists. It is unknowable whether Malcolm X would have approved of Turkish Islamist policy proposals and aims; and while he is famously known to have advocated for Black power "by any means necessary," the implications of this position in contemporary Turkey, let alone in the context of 2020's #BlackLivesMatter protests, can only be interpreted, not explicitly known. As Cornel West pertinently asks, in an apparent reference to Malcolm X's status as a guest of the Saudi royal family, "Did his relative silence regarding the monarchies he visited in the Middle East bespeak a downplaying of the role of democratic practices in empowering oppressed peoples?" (West, 1992, p. 54). This question and many others remain difficult to answer, but this study makes clear that even beyond America there is no shortage of interpretations of the Black nationalist figure, whose name has proven a potent enough political symbol to grace a wall in Istanbul's Old City more than 50 years after his death in Harlem.

APPENDIX A  
MILLI GAZETE COLUMNS

Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
1	2016-5-26	Abdülaziz Kıranşal	Ayasofya'da Fetih Namazı ve İstanbul'un Fethi	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/847624/abdulaziz-kiransal/ayasofyada-fetih-namazı-ve-istanbulun-fethi">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/847624/abdulaziz-kiransal/ayasofyada-fetih-namazı-ve-istanbulun-fethi</a>
2	2016-10-20	Abdülaziz Kıranşal	Universitelerimiz in Genç Müslümanlarına	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/845743/abdulaziz-kiransal/universitelerimiz-in-genç-müslümanlarına">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/845743/abdulaziz-kiransal/universitelerimiz-in-genç-müslümanlarına</a>
3	2017-5-11	Abdülaziz Kıranşal	Ayasofya'da Fetih Namazı ve İstanbul'un Fethi	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/842873/abdulaziz-kiransal/ayasofyada-fetih-namazı-ve-istanbulun-fethi">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/842873/abdulaziz-kiransal/ayasofyada-fetih-namazı-ve-istanbulun-fethi</a>
4	2017-8-10	Abdülaziz Kıranşal	Üniversiteyi kazanan Müslüman gençlere	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1220941/abdulaziz-kiransal/universiteyi-kazanan-müslüman-gençlere">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1220941/abdulaziz-kiransal/universiteyi-kazanan-müslüman-gençlere</a>
5	2018-05-10	Abdülaziz Kıranşal	Zincirler kırılacak Ayasofya açılacak	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1540390/abdulaziz-kiransal/zincirler-kırılacak-ayasofya-açılacak">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1540390/abdulaziz-kiransal/zincirler-kırılacak-ayasofya-açılacak</a>
6	2018-09-09	Abdülaziz Kıranşal	Üniversiteyi kazanan Müslüman gençlere...	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1684580/abdulaziz-kiransal/universiteyi-kazanan-müslüman-gençlere">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1684580/abdulaziz-kiransal/universiteyi-kazanan-müslüman-gençlere</a>

Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
7	2018-10-21	Abdülaziz Kıranşal	Çocuklarımız için Andımız	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1723653/abdulaziz-kiransal/cocuklarimiz-icin-andimiz">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1723653/abdulaziz-kiransal/cocuklarimiz-icin-andimiz</a>
8	2016-03-14	Abdülkadir Özkan	Kuklalar ve kuklacılar!..	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/848589/abdulkadir-ozkan/kuklalar-ve-kuklacilar">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/848589/abdulkadir-ozkan/kuklalar-ve-kuklacilar</a>
9	2016-12-21	Adnan Öksüz	Büyükelçi suikastinin mesajı ne?	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/844891/adnan-oksuz/buyukelci-suikastinin-mesajine">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/844891/adnan-oksuz/buyukelci-suikastinin-mesajine</a>
10	2017-02-27	Adnan Öksüz	10 yıldır bekliyorlar, yine hac çıkmadı!	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/843913/adnan-oksuz/10-yildir-bekliyorlar-yine-hac-cikmadi">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/843913/adnan-oksuz/10-yildir-bekliyorlar-yine-hac-cikmadi</a>
11	2017-08-07	Adnan Öksüz	AGD Demek Kur'an Demek...	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1219909/adnan-oksuz/agd-demek-kuran-demek">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1219909/adnan-oksuz/agd-demek-kuran-demek</a>
12	2019-01-18	Adnan Öksüz	Bu da kupür haber farkı!	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1782159/adnan-oksuz/bu-da-kupur-haber-farki">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1782159/adnan-oksuz/bu-da-kupur-haber-farki</a>
13	2008-08-29	Ali Haydar Haksal	Barack Hüseyin Obama niçin tercih edilir	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/871356/ali-haydar-haksal/barack-huseyin-obama-nicin-tercih-edilir">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/871356/ali-haydar-haksal/barack-huseyin-obama-nicin-tercih-edilir</a>
14	2008-09-08	Ali Haydar Haksal	Bir öykü ustası: Cemal Şakar	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/871352/ali-haydar-haksal/bir-oyku-ustasi-cemal-sakar">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/871352/ali-haydar-haksal/bir-oyku-ustasi-cemal-sakar</a>

Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
15	2017-03-05	Fatma Tuncer	Malik el şahbaz kimdir? (1)	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/843822/fatma-tuncer/malik-el-sahbaz-kimdir-1">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/843822/fatma-tuncer/malik-el-sahbaz-kimdir-1</a>
16	2017-03-06	Fatma Tuncer	Malik el şahbaz kimdir? (2)	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/843801/fatma-tuncer/malik-el-sahbaz-kimdir-2">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/843801/fatma-tuncer/malik-el-sahbaz-kimdir-2</a>
17	2018-03-17	Fatma Tuncer	Meşakkatli yolların çocuğuydu	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1518110/fatma-tuncer/mesakkatli-yollarin-cocuguydu">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1518110/fatma-tuncer/mesakkatli-yollarin-cocuguydu</a>
18	2015-05-27	Hüseyin Akın	İşte bunlar hep kitap	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/852340/huseyin-akin/iste-bunlar-hep-kitap">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/852340/huseyin-akin/iste-bunlar-hep-kitap</a>
19	2015-03-28	İbrahim Halil Er	Osmanlı'nın doğduğu topraklar - 1	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/853159/ibrahim-halil-er/osmanlinin-dogdugu-topraklar-1">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/853159/ibrahim-halil-er/osmanlinin-dogdugu-topraklar-1</a>
20	2017-06-11	İbrahim Halil Er	Ezilmişlerin yumruğu “Muhammed Ali Clay”	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/760406/ibrahim-halil-er/ezilmislerin-yumruğu-muhammed-ali-clay">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/760406/ibrahim-halil-er/ezilmislerin-yumruğu-muhammed-ali-clay</a>
21	2015-02-02	İshak Beyazay	VİP Arpalıklar	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/853875/ishak-beyazay/vip-arpaliklar">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/853875/ishak-beyazay/vip-arpaliklar</a>
22	2017-12-12	İshak Koç	Atılan taş ürkütülen kurbağaya değer mi	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1436265/ishak-koc/atilan-tas-urkutulen-kurbagaya-deger-mi">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1436265/ishak-koc/atilan-tas-urkutulen-kurbagaya-deger-mi</a>

Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
23	2018-01-03	İshak Koç	Bir İç Afrika'dan Amerika'ya Meydan Okurken	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1479181/ishak-koc/bir-ic-afrikadan-amerikaya-meydan-okurken">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1479181/ishak-koc/bir-ic-afrikadan-amerikaya-meydan-okurken</a>
24	2017-09-13	İsmail Demirel	Şahitler, Yönümüzü Gösteren Pusuladır	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1232747/ismail-demirel/sahitler-yonumuzu-gosteren-pusuladir">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1232747/ismail-demirel/sahitler-yonumuzu-gosteren-pusuladir</a>
25	2006-01-18	İsmail Kılıoğlu	Hacc ve organizasyon gereği	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/867568/ismail-killioglu/hacc-ve-organizasyon-geregi">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/867568/ismail-killioglu/hacc-ve-organizasyon-geregi</a>
26	2005-07-24	Mahmut Toptaş	Emniyet imandan gelir	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/871254/mahmut-toptas/emniyet-imandan-gelir">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/871254/mahmut-toptas/emniyet-imandan-gelir</a>
27	2007-11-15	Mahmut Toptaş	Emniyet imandan gelir	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/870663/mahmut-toptas/emniyet-imandan-gelir">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/870663/mahmut-toptas/emniyet-imandan-gelir</a>
28	2008-11-03	Mahmut Toptaş	04 Kasım 2008 bir milattır	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/870368/mahmut-toptas/04-kasim-2008-bir-milattir">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/870368/mahmut-toptas/04-kasim-2008-bir-milattir</a>
29	2008-11-10	Mahmut Toptaş	Aaaahlar ateşe dönüşüyor	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/870358/mahmut-toptas/aaaahlar-atese-donusuyor">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/870358/mahmut-toptas/aaaahlar-atese-donusuyor</a>
30	2012-10-12	Mahmut Toptaş	Bu böyle biline	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/865043/mahmut-toptas/bu-boyle-biline">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/865043/mahmut-toptas/bu-boyle-biline</a>

Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
31	2013-08-12	Mahmut Toptaş	İhtida belgesi alanlar ne alemde	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/861056/mahmut-toptas/ihtida-belgesi-alanlar-ne-alemde">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/861056/mahmut-toptas/ihtida-belgesi-alanlar-ne-alemde</a>
32	2013-08-28	Mahmut Toptaş	Geri adım yok	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/860832/mahmut-toptas/geri-adim-yok">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/860832/mahmut-toptas/geri-adim-yok</a>
33	2013-12-16	Mahmut Toptaş	Zalimin eliyle de bu din yücelir	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/859354/mahmut-toptas/zalimin-eliyle-de-bu-din-yucelir">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/859354/mahmut-toptas/zalimin-eliyle-de-bu-din-yucelir</a>
34	2014-02-04	Mahmut Toptaş	İSLAM VE TERÖR	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/858692/mahmut-toptas/islam-ve-teror">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/858692/mahmut-toptas/islam-ve-teror</a>
35	2016-02-25	Mahmut Toptaş	Amerika bizi kandırmıyor Biz kendimizi kandırıyoruz	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/848846/mahmut-toptas/amerika-bizi-kandirmiyor-Biz-kendimizi-kandiriyoruz">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/848846/mahmut-toptas/amerika-bizi-kandirmiyor-Biz-kendimizi-kandiriyoruz</a>
36	2016-06-07	Mahmut Toptaş	Muhammed Ali Clay?dan inciler	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/847456/mahmut-toptas/muhammed-ali-claydan-inciler">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/847456/mahmut-toptas/muhammed-ali-claydan-inciler</a>
37	2016-06-08	Mahmut Toptaş	Çağın putuna karşı tek başına savaşıyor Muhammed Ali Clay	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/847442/mahmut-toptas/cagin-putuna-karsi-tek-basina-savasan-muhammed-ali-clay">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/847442/mahmut-toptas/cagin-putuna-karsi-tek-basina-savasan-muhammed-ali-clay</a>
38	2018-09-04	Mahmut Toptaş	Dolara değil adama ihtiyacımız var	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1681550/mahmut-toptas/dolara-degil-adama-ihtiyacimiz-var">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1681550/mahmut-toptas/dolara-degil-adama-ihtiyacimiz-var</a>

Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
39	2018-12-30	Mehmet Biten	Görüntü de Bir Örüntü	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1772533/mehmet-biten/goruntu-de-bir-oruntu">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1772533/mehmet-biten/goruntu-de-bir-oruntu</a>
40	2013-12-19	Meryem Nida	Cihadı örnek, şehadeti diriliş!	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/859315/meryem-nida/cihadi-ornek-sehadeti-dirilis">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/859315/meryem-nida/cihadi-ornek-sehadeti-dirilis</a>
41	2014-03-05	Meryem Nida	Dönmez zulmün çarkı, kırılır bir gün!	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/858275/meryem-nida/donmez-zulmun-carki-kirilir-bir-gun">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/858275/meryem-nida/donmez-zulmun-carki-kirilir-bir-gun</a>
42	2014-08-20	Meryem Nida	AGD İle Yaz Bir Başka	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/856061/meryem-nida/agd-ile-yaz-bir-baska">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/856061/meryem-nida/agd-ile-yaz-bir-baska</a>
43	2014-12-17	Meryem Nida	Uyuyanları Kim Uyandıracak?	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/854475/meryem-nida/uyuyanlari-kim-uyandiracak">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/854475/meryem-nida/uyuyanlari-kim-uyandiracak</a>
44	2016-02-17	Meryem Nida	Koşanlar ? 2	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/848953/meryem-nida/kosanlar-2">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/848953/meryem-nida/kosanlar-2</a>
45	2016-02-25	Meryem Nida	Ümmet için koşan mücahid?	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/848856/meryem-nida/ummet-icin-kosan-mucahid">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/848856/meryem-nida/ummet-icin-kosan-mucahid</a>
46	2017-02-09	Meryem Nida	Şehid, şehadeti arzulayandır	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/844169/meryem-nida/sehid-sehadeti-arzulayandir">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/844169/meryem-nida/sehid-sehadeti-arzulayandir</a>
47	2019-03-07	Meryem Nida	Yolun sahibi olmak	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1902949/meryem-nida/yolun-sahibi-olmak">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1902949/meryem-nida/yolun-sahibi-olmak</a>



Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
48	2016-06-07	Mustafa Kaya	Muhammed Ali Clay	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/847454/mustafa-kaya/muhammed-ali-clay">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/847454/mustafa-kaya/muhammed-ali-clay</a>
49	2014-01-05	Mustafa Yıldırım	Bir hilal beş yıldız İstanbul'a hazırız'	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/859075/mustafa-yildirim/bir-hilal-bes-yildiz-istanbula-haziriz">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/859075/mustafa-yildirim/bir-hilal-bes-yildiz-istanbula-haziriz</a>
50	2014-01-12	Mustafa Yıldırım	Gencim, Özgürüm, Yakarım, Yıkarım	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/855396/mustafa-yildirim/gencim-ozgurum-yakarim-yikarim">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/855396/mustafa-yildirim/gencim-ozgurum-yakarim-yikarim</a>
51	2014-02-16	Mustafa Yıldırım	Şehitler direnişin adıdır	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/858506/mustafa-yildirim/sehitler-direnisin-adidir">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/858506/mustafa-yildirim/sehitler-direnisin-adidir</a>
52	2014-07-20	Mustafa Yıldırım	Geçmiş zaman olur ki; hatırası ömre bedel - 8	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/856430/mustafa-yildirim/gecmis-zaman-olur-ki-hatirasi-omre-bedel-8">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/856430/mustafa-yildirim/gecmis-zaman-olur-ki-hatirasi-omre-bedel-8</a>
53	2014-11-02	Mustafa Yıldırım	Kert-emey-enkele	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/855105/mustafa-yildirim/kert-emey-enkele">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/855105/mustafa-yildirim/kert-emey-enkele</a>
54	2015-08-17	Mustafa Yıldırım	Toplum adil mi ki idareci adil olsun	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/851324/mustafa-yildirim/toplum-adil-mi-ki-idareci-adil-olsun">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/851324/mustafa-yildirim/toplum-adil-mi-ki-idareci-adil-olsun</a>
55	2015-08-24	Mustafa Yıldırım	Dedeler kanlarıyla kurtardı vatani şimdi torunlar parçalıyor	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/851222/mustafa-yildirim/dedeler-kanlariyla-kurtardi-vatani-simdi-torunlar-parcaliyor">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/851222/mustafa-yildirim/dedeler-kanlariyla-kurtardi-vatani-simdi-torunlar-parcaliyor</a>

Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
56	2016-03-07	Mustafa Yıldırım	Elestü bi Rabbiküm kalu bela	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/848702/mustafa-yildirim/elestu-bi-rabbikum-kalu-bela">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/848702/mustafa-yildirim/elestu-bi-rabbikum-kalu-bela</a>
57	2016-08-01	Mustafa Yıldırım	İhlasla tutulan nöbetleri festivale çevirdik	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/846773/mustafa-yildirim/ihlasla-tutulan-nobetleri-festivale-cevirdik">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/846773/mustafa-yildirim/ihlasla-tutulan-nobetleri-festivale-cevirdik</a>
58	2017-04-03	Mustafa Yıldırım	Referandum en çok sol kesime yarayacak!	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/843406/mustafa-yildirim/referandum-en-cok-sol-kesime-yarayacak">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/843406/mustafa-yildirim/referandum-en-cok-sol-kesime-yarayacak</a>
59	2017-08-14	Mustafa Yıldırım	Öğrencilerin yurt meselesi ya da dikensiz gül bahçesi	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1221950/mustafa-yildirim/ogrencilerin-yurt-meselesi-ya-da-dikensiz-gul-bahcesi">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1221950/mustafa-yildirim/ogrencilerin-yurt-meselesi-ya-da-dikensiz-gul-bahcesi</a>
60	2017-09-11	Mustafa Yıldırım	Sen hür iradenle düşündüğünü zannedersin	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1231844/mustafa-yildirim/sen-hur-iradenle-dusundugunu-zannedersin">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1231844/mustafa-yildirim/sen-hur-iradenle-dusundugunu-zannedersin</a>
61	2013-03-25	Nedim Odabaş	İzleyici ne ister?	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/862888/nedim-odabas/izleyici-ne-ister">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/862888/nedim-odabas/izleyici-ne-ister</a>
62	2013-08-24	Nedim Odabaş	Sorumlu medya	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/860888/nedim-odabas/sorumlu-medya">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/860888/nedim-odabas/sorumlu-medya</a>
63	2018-02-15	Nedim Odabaş	Kurumsal özeleştir ve muhalefet	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1502675/nedim-odabas/kurumsal-ozelestiri-ve-muhalefet">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1502675/nedim-odabas/kurumsal-ozelestiri-ve-muhalefet</a>

Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
64	2014-12-05	Prof. Dr. Ata Atun	Zenciler ve Beyazlar	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/854631/prof-dr-ata-atun/zenciler-ve-beyazlar">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/854631/prof-dr-ata-atun/zenciler-ve-beyazlar</a>
65	2018-03-24	Remzi Çayır	Amerika müslümanlara nasıl bakıyor?	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1522675/remzi-cayir/amerika-muslumanlara-nasil-bakiyor">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1522675/remzi-cayir/amerika-muslumanlara-nasil-bakiyor</a>
66	2018-02-23	Reşat Nuri Erol	Erbakan, herkesi uyandırmak için hep haykırdı	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1506558/resat-nuri-erol/erbakan-herkesi-uyandirmak-icin-hep-haykirdi">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1506558/resat-nuri-erol/erbakan-herkesi-uyandirmak-icin-hep-haykirdi</a>
67	2018-02-25	Reşat Nuri Erol	Erbakan, herkesi uyandırmak için hep haykırdı	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1507686/resat-nuri-erol/erbakan-herkesi-uyandirmak-icin-hep-haykirdi">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1507686/resat-nuri-erol/erbakan-herkesi-uyandirmak-icin-hep-haykirdi</a>
68	2018-02-09	Sadrettin Karaduman	Şehitlerimiz, CHP ve Afrin Harekâtı	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1500084/sadrettin-karaduman/sehitlerimiz-chp-ve-afrin-harekati">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1500084/sadrettin-karaduman/sehitlerimiz-chp-ve-afrin-harekati</a>
69	2007-02-03	Şakir Tarım	"Cambaza Bak" kurnazlığı	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/868797/sakir-tarim/cambaza-bak-kurnazligi">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/868797/sakir-tarim/cambaza-bak-kurnazligi</a>
70	2007-10-23	Şakir Tarım	Teröre gerçekçi çözüm	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/868764/sakir-tarim/terore-gercekci-cozum">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/868764/sakir-tarim/terore-gercekci-cozum</a>
71	2007-11-08	Şakir Tarım	Kuklacıya dikkat	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/868762/sakir-tarim/kuklaciya-dikkat">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/868762/sakir-tarim/kuklaciya-dikkat</a>

Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
72	2015-07-27	Şakir Tarım	Suriye Bir Olta; Asıl Hedef Türkiye!	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/851577/sakir-tarim/suriye-bir-olta-asil-hedef-turkiye">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/851577/sakir-tarim/suriye-bir-olta-asil-hedef-turkiye</a>
73	2015-09-15	Şakir Tarım	Yangını söndürmek bilgi ve şuur ister	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/850937/sakir-tarim/yangini-sondurmek-bilgi-ve-suur-ister">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/850937/sakir-tarim/yangini-sondurmek-bilgi-ve-suur-ister</a>
74	2015-12-26	Şakir Tarım	Samsun'un ahlâk ve maneviyat çınarları	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/849649/sakir-tarim/samsunun-ahlak-ve-maneviyat-cinarlari">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/849649/sakir-tarim/samsunun-ahlak-ve-maneviyat-cinarlari</a>
75	2016-01-18	Şakir Tarım	Yanlış yapıyorsunuz beyler!	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/849350/sakir-tarim/yanlis-yapiyorsunuz-beyler">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/849350/sakir-tarim/yanlis-yapiyorsunuz-beyler</a>
76	2016-03-12	Şakir Tarım	Suriye, Terör ve İstiklal Marşımız	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/848635/sakir-tarim/suriye-teror-ve-istiklal-marsimiz">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/848635/sakir-tarim/suriye-teror-ve-istiklal-marsimiz</a>
77	2016-07-26	Şakir Tarım	Darbe, Dost ve Düşmanımızı Öğretti	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/846853/sakir-tarim/darbe-dost-ve-dusmanimizi-ogretti">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/846853/sakir-tarim/darbe-dost-ve-dusmanimizi-ogretti</a>
78	2017-07-08	Şakir Tarım	Darbe girişiminin küresel boyutu	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1212293/sakir-tarim/darbe-girisiminin-kuresel-boyutu">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1212293/sakir-tarim/darbe-girisiminin-kuresel-boyutu</a>
79	2018-01-13	Şakir Tarım	Yerli düşüncenin adresi: Milli Gazete	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1484984/sakir-tarim/yerli-dusuncenin-adresi-milli-gazete">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1484984/sakir-tarim/yerli-dusuncenin-adresi-milli-gazete</a>

Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
80	2019-5-18	Şakir Tarım	Hukuk varsa huzur vardır	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/2551445/sakir-tarim/hukuk-varsa-huzur-vardir">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/2551445/sakir-tarim/hukuk-varsa-huzur-vardir</a>
81	2018-09-03	Siyami Akyel	ABD ve Batı sinemasında “din konusu”	<a href="https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1680986/siyami-akyel/abd-ve-bati-sinemasinda-din-konusu">https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1680986/siyami-akyel/abd-ve-bati-sinemasinda-din-konusu</a>

APPENDIX B  
YENİ SAFAK COLUMNS

Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
1	2009-05-12	Abdullah Muradoğlu	Küresel feodalite!	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/abdullahmuradoglu/kuresel-feodalite-16731">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/abdullahmuradoglu/kuresel-feodalite-16731</a>
2	2009-07-29	Abdullah Muradoğlu	Adalet rövaşata..	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/abdullahmuradoglu/adalete-rovaata-17910">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/abdullahmuradoglu/adalete-rovaata-17910</a>
3	2016-06-07	Abdullah Muradoğlu	Muhammed Ali ve Malcolm X	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/abdullahmuradoglu/muhammed-ali-ve-malcolm-x-2029554">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/abdullahmuradoglu/muhammed-ali-ve-malcolm-x-2029554</a>
4	2016-06-12	Abdullah Muradoğlu	‘Siyah İsyan’ın gürleyen sesi..	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/abdullahmuradoglu/siyah-isyanuin-gurleyen-sesi-2029659">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/abdullahmuradoglu/siyah-isyanuin-gurleyen-sesi-2029659</a>
5	1996-11-03	Ahmet Davutoğlu	Amerikan siyasi sistemi ve müslümanlar	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/ahmetdavutoglu/amerikan-siyasi-sistemi-ve-muslumanlar-2027163">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/ahmetdavutoglu/amerikan-siyasi-sistemi-ve-muslumanlar-2027163</a>
6	1999-04-25	Akif Emre	MALCOLM X "İN FİRAVUNLARI	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/akifemre/malcolm-x-in-firavunlari-41590">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/akifemre/malcolm-x-in-firavunlari-41590</a>
7	2015-02-21	Akif Emre	Hakikat avcısı Malcolm X	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/akifemre/hakikat-avcisi-malcolm-x-2008008">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/akifemre/hakikat-avcisi-malcolm-x-2008008</a>

Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
8	17 May 2016	Akif Emre	Dağa çarpan hakikat gönüllüsü	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/akifemre/daga-carpan-hakikat-gonullusu-2029079">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/akifemre/daga-carpan-hakikat-gonullusu-2029079</a>
9	2016-06-11	Akif Emre	Ali'nin sadece bedeni gömülmedi!	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/akifemre/aliunin-sadece-bedeni-gomulmedi-2029641">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/akifemre/aliunin-sadece-bedeni-gomulmedi-2029641</a>
10	2016-08-27	Akif Emre	Hicaz hatıratımız var mı?	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/akifemre/hicaz-hatiratimiz-var-mi-2031455">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/akifemre/hicaz-hatiratimiz-var-mi-2031455</a>
11	2007-09-22	Ali Murat Güven	Uçakan "sıkı bir dönüş"e hazırlanıyor	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/alimuratguven/ucakan-siki-bir-donue-hazirlaniyor-6996">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/alimuratguven/ucakan-siki-bir-donue-hazirlaniyor-6996</a>
12	2010-04-04	Ali Murat Güven	Sinema sanatına yönelik ilgi, bilgi ve algımızın son turnusol kağıdı: "Büşra"	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/alimuratguven/sinema-sanatina-yonelik-ilgi-bilgi-ve-almimizin-son-turnusol-kagidi-bura-21675">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/alimuratguven/sinema-sanatina-yonelik-ilgi-bilgi-ve-almimizin-son-turnusol-kagidi-bura-21675</a>
13	25 Mar 2012	Ali Murat Güven	5 yıl sonra Akkad"ı bir kez daha anacağız	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/alimuratguven/5-yil-sonra-akkadi-bir-kez-daha-anacagiz-31650">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/alimuratguven/5-yil-sonra-akkadi-bir-kez-daha-anacagiz-31650</a>
14	2012-04-08	Ali Murat Güven	Bütün eksik ve gediklerine rağmen, öncü ve ilgiye değer bir çıkış: "Ülkücüler"	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/alimuratguven/butun-eksik-ve-gediklerine-ragmen-oncu-ve-ilgiye-deger-bir-ciki-ulkuculer-31863">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/alimuratguven/butun-eksik-ve-gediklerine-ragmen-oncu-ve-ilgiye-deger-bir-ciki-ulkuculer-31863</a>

Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
15	27 May 2012	Ali Murat Güven	Yavrucuğum, ben size tweet toplayamazsınız demedim ki...	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/alimuratguven/yavrucugum-ben-size-tweet-toplayamazsiniz-demedim-ki-32567">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/alimuratguven/yavrucugum-ben-size-tweet-toplayamazsiniz-demedim-ki-32567</a>
16	03 August 2014	Ali Nur Kutlu	Barack Hüseyin Obama Bir büyük hüsrân	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/alinurkutlu/barack-huseyin-obama-bir-buyuk-husran-55153">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/alinurkutlu/barack-huseyin-obama-bir-buyuk-husran-55153</a>
17	2015-02-08	Ali Nur Kutlu	Benim yemek kitabım	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/alinurkutlu/benim-yemek-kitabim-2007730">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/alinurkutlu/benim-yemek-kitabim-2007730</a>
18	13 Mar 2015	Ali Nur Kutlu	Sen bizi tanımadın	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/alinurkutlu/sen-bizi-tanimadin-2008427">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/alinurkutlu/sen-bizi-tanimadin-2008427</a>
19	2015-07-24	Ali Nur Kutlu	Bazen ‘Katır Boyunduruk’ yersin	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/alinurkutlu/bazen-katir-boyunduruk-yersin-2018261">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/alinurkutlu/bazen-katir-boyunduruk-yersin-2018261</a>
20	2015-09-25	Ali Nur Kutlu	Bir bayram sabahı uyansak	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/alinurkutlu/bir-bayram-sabahi-uyansak-2022008">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/alinurkutlu/bir-bayram-sabahi-uyansak-2022008</a>
21	2016-06-05	Ali Nur Kutlu	Muhammed Ali... Kahramana veda	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/alinurkutlu/muhammed-ali-kahramana-veda-2029497">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/alinurkutlu/muhammed-ali-kahramana-veda-2029497</a>
22	2016-07-12	Ali Saydam	Merhamet, Muhabbet, Maneviyat (3M) olmadan olmaz	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/alisaydam/merhamet-muhabbet-maneviyat-3m-olmadan-olmaz-2030317">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/alisaydam/merhamet-muhabbet-maneviyat-3m-olmadan-olmaz-2030317</a>



Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
23	2014-07-11	Cemile Bayraktar	İhsanoğlu CHP"nin bu ülkeye son hakareti olsun	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/cemilebayraktar/ihsanoglu-chpnin-bu-ulkeye-son-hakareti-olsun-54775">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/cemilebayraktar/ihsanoglu-chpnin-bu-ulkeye-son-hakareti-olsun-54775</a>
24	2014-08-20	Cemile Bayraktar	Ferguson"da MalkomX ve Bedford Forrest posterleri yan yana mıydı?	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/cemilebayraktar/ferguson-da-malkomx-ve-bedford-forrest-posterleri-yan-yanamiydi-55449">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/cemilebayraktar/ferguson-da-malkomx-ve-bedford-forrest-posterleri-yan-yanamiydi-55449</a>
25	2015-02-17	Cemile Bayraktar	"Umutsuz Ev Kadınları" ve umutsuz Obama	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/cemilebayraktar/umutsuz-ev-kadinlari-ve-umutsuz-obama-2007936">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/cemilebayraktar/umutsuz-ev-kadinlari-ve-umutsuz-obama-2007936</a>
26	2013-10-10	Fuat Atik	"İsmail"i kazanmak!	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/fuatatik/ismaili-kazanmak-39991">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/fuatatik/ismaili-kazanmak-39991</a>
27	2016-11-12	Furkan Çalışkan	Özgür dünyanın en güçlü adamı	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/furkancaliskan/ozgur-dunyanin-en-guclu-adami-2034082">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/furkancaliskan/ozgur-dunyanin-en-guclu-adami-2034082</a>
28	2007-07-09	Gökhan Özcan	Zekâ görünce tanımak...	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/gokhanozcan/zek-gorunce-tanimak-5968">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/gokhanozcan/zek-gorunce-tanimak-5968</a>
29	10 June 2010	Gökhan Özcan	Haklı olmak güçlü olmaktır!	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/gokhanozcan/hakli-olmak-guclu-olmaktir-22686">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/gokhanozcan/hakli-olmak-guclu-olmaktir-22686</a>
30	2013-07-04	Gökhan Özcan	Ne güzel eğleniyorduk!	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/gokhanozcan/ne-guzel-egleniyorduk-38441">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/gokhanozcan/ne-guzel-egleniyorduk-38441</a>

Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
31	2013-08-15	Gökhan Özcan	Aynasızlara ayna tutan yaralar	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/gokhanozcan/aynasizlara-ayna-tutan-yaralar-39066">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/gokhanozcan/aynasizlara-ayna-tutan-yaralar-39066</a>
32	2015-07-30	Gökhan Özcan	Boy aynasının eni	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/gokhanozcan/boy-aynasinin-eni-2018391">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/gokhanozcan/boy-aynasinin-eni-2018391</a>
33	2016-06-06	Gökhan Özcan	“Hayal gücü olmayanın kanatları yoktur”	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/gokhanozcan/hayal-gucu-olmayanin-kanatlari-yoktur-2029523">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/gokhanozcan/hayal-gucu-olmayanin-kanatlari-yoktur-2029523</a>
34	2007-01-30	Hakan Albayrak	“Yoksul Afrika” imajı emperyalist bir tezgâhtır!	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/hakanalbayrak/yoksul-afrika-imaji-emperyalist-bir-tezgah-tir-3604">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/hakanalbayrak/yoksul-afrika-imaji-emperyalist-bir-tezgah-tir-3604</a>
35	2007-06-19	Hakan Albayrak	Bir taş at!	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/hakanalbayrak/bir-tas-at-5688">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/hakanalbayrak/bir-tas-at-5688</a>
36	2007-07-03	Hakan Albayrak	Spartaküs, Malcolm X, Şule Yüksel	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/hakanalbayrak/spartakus-malcolm-x-ule-yuksel-5875">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/hakanalbayrak/spartakus-malcolm-x-ule-yuksel-5875</a>
37	2007-12-08	Hakan Albayrak	Kara panter geliyor	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/hakanalbayrak/kara-panter-geliyor-8236">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/hakanalbayrak/kara-panter-geliyor-8236</a>
38	2008-06-25	Hakan Albayrak	Muhterem Fatih Hoca, sevgili millilerimiz...	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/hakanalbayrak/muhterem-fatih-hoca-sevgili-millilerimiz-11595">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/hakanalbayrak/muhterem-fatih-hoca-sevgili-millilerimiz-11595</a>
39	2008-09-24	Hakan Albayrak	İmam Varisuddin Muhammed'in ardından	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/hakanalbayrak/imam-varisuddin-muhammedin-ardindan-12943">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/hakanalbayrak/imam-varisuddin-muhammedin-ardindan-12943</a>

Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
40	2008-11-11	Hakan Albayrak	Siyah devrim hikâyesi	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/hakanalbayrak/siyah-devrim-hikyesi-13760">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/hakanalbayrak/siyah-devrim-hikyesi-13760</a>
41	2008-11-12	Hakan Albayrak	İkiz Kuleler"in altında kalan tazminat davası	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/hakanalbayrak/ikiz-kulelerin-altinda-kalan-tazminat-davasi-13775">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/hakanalbayrak/ikiz-kulelerin-altinda-kalan-tazminat-davasi-13775</a>
42	10 Mar 2009	Hakan Albayrak	Hamid Golpira"nın bir kâbustan mülhem makalesi	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/hakanalbayrak/hamid-golpiranin-bir-kbustan-mulhem-makalesi-15701">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/hakanalbayrak/hamid-golpiranin-bir-kbustan-mulhem-makalesi-15701</a>
43	20 Mar 2010	Hakan Albayrak	Endülüs"ten Harlem"e	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/hakanalbayrak/endulu-sten-harleme-21432">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/hakanalbayrak/endulu-sten-harleme-21432</a>
44	2011-10-01	Hakan Albayrak	Erdoğan Arnavut-Türk ayrımına karşı	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/hakanalbayrak/Erdoğan-arnavut-turk-ayrimina-kari-29194">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/hakanalbayrak/Erdoğan-arnavut-turk-ayrimina-kari-29194</a>
45	2016-06-10	İbrahim Karagül	Muhammed Ali, Malcolm X ve dik duran adamların yolu	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/ibrahimkaragul/muhammed-ali-malcolm-x-ve-dik-duran-adamlarin-yolu-2029621">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/ibrahimkaragul/muhammed-ali-malcolm-x-ve-dik-duran-adamlarin-yolu-2029621</a>
46	2012-04-08	İbrahim Paşalı - Pazar	Muhallif kardeş, hayranı olduğu yönetmenin setteki iktidarına da karşı mısınız?	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/ibrahimpasalipazar/muhallif-karde-hayrani-oldugu-yonetmenin-setteki-iktidarina-da-kari-misin-31848">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/ibrahimpasalipazar/muhallif-karde-hayrani-oldugu-yonetmenin-setteki-iktidarina-da-kari-misin-31848</a>
47	2013-01-20	İbrahim Paşalı - Pazar	Necip Fazıl sen bizim herşeyimiz(mi)sin!	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/ibrahimpasalipazar/necip-fazil-sen-bizim-hereyimizmisin-35920">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/ibrahimpasalipazar/necip-fazil-sen-bizim-hereyimizmisin-35920</a>

Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
48	2016-02-20	İsmail Kılıçarslan	Seni gidi ev zencisi	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/ismailkilarlan/seni-gidi-ev-zencisi-2026938">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/ismailkilarlan/seni-gidi-ev-zencisi-2026938</a>
49	2016-02-21	İsmail Kılıçarslan	21 Şubat: Palahniuk ve Malcolm birader	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/ismailkilarlan/21-ubat-palahniuk-ve-malcolm-birader-2026963">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/ismailkilarlan/21-ubat-palahniuk-ve-malcolm-birader-2026963</a>
50	2019-02-23	İsmail Kılıçarslan	Malik kardeşin asıl başarısı	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/ismailkilarlan/malik-kardesi-asil-basari-2049399">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/ismailkilarlan/malik-kardesi-asil-basari-2049399</a>
51	17 June 2015	Kemal Öztürk	Gerçekler ve hayaller arasında uyanmak	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/kemalozturk/gercekler-ve-hayaller-arasinda-uyanmak-2014473">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/kemalozturk/gercekler-ve-hayaller-arasinda-uyanmak-2014473</a>
52	2016-03-03	Kemal Öztürk	Mursi neden Mandela olmadı?	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/kemalozturk/mursi-neden-mandela-olmadi-2027193">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/kemalozturk/mursi-neden-mandela-olmadi-2027193</a>
53	2018-02-22	Kemal Öztürk	Bize tam olarak böyle insanlar lazım	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/kemalozturk/bize-tam-olarak-boyle-insanlar-lazim-2044556">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/kemalozturk/bize-tam-olarak-boyle-insanlar-lazim-2044556</a>
54	2018-06-20	Kemal Öztürk	Siyasette, Karşıt olanlar Oyun bozanlar Sistem kuranlar	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/kemalozturk/siyasette-karsit-olanlar-oyun-bozanlar-sistem-kuranlar-2046147">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/kemalozturk/siyasette-karsit-olanlar-oyun-bozanlar-sistem-kuranlar-2046147</a>
55	2008-11-18	Kürşat Bumin	Cem Özdemir "Yeşillerin Obama"sı mı?	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/kursatbumin/cem-ozdemir-yesillerin-obama-mi-13884">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/kursatbumin/cem-ozdemir-yesillerin-obama-mi-13884</a>

Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
56	2018-07-25	Mehmet Acet	Adım Mesut, göbek adım Bahtiyar	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/mehmetacet/adim-mesut-gobek-adim-bahtiyar-2046595">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/mehmetacet/adim-mesut-gobek-adim-bahtiyar-2046595</a>
57	09 January 2001	Mehmet Şeker	Ey oğul! Bankaları hortumlama, hortumlatma!	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/mehmetseker/ey-ogul-bankalari-hortumlama-hortumlatma-45808">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/mehmetseker/ey-ogul-bankalari-hortumlama-hortumlatma-45808</a>
58	2008-09-26	Mehmet Şeker	Malcolm Little, Malcolm X ve El Hac Mâlik el- Şahbaz	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/mehmetseker/malcolm-little-malcolm-x-ve-el-hac-malik-el-shahbaz-12978">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/mehmetseker/malcolm-little-malcolm-x-ve-el-hac-malik-el-shahbaz-12978</a>
59	2009-07-09	Mehmet Şeker	Bir kâğıt parçası buldum masamda	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/mehmetseker/bir-kgit-parcasi-buldum-masamda-17640">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/mehmetseker/bir-kgit-parcasi-buldum-masamda-17640</a>
60	1999-02-24	Melikşah Utku	Kara Şubat	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/meliksahutku/kara-ubat-40603">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/meliksahutku/kara-ubat-40603</a>
61	23 January 2007	Melikşah Utku	Kurşun üzerine tereddütler	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/meliksahutku/kurun-uzerine-tereddutler-3501">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/meliksahutku/kurun-uzerine-tereddutler-3501</a>
62	2014-07-17	Merve Şebnem Oruç	İsrail'e bağlı "özgür basın"	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/merve-sebnem-oruc/israile-bagli-ozgur-basin-54866">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/merve-sebnem-oruc/israile-bagli-ozgur-basin-54866</a>
63	2015-12-21	Muhammed Berdibek	Bir adam kendisini yaktı... Ve olaylar gelişti.	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/muhammedberdibek/bir-adam-kendisini-yakti-ve-olaylar-geliti-2024716">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/muhammedberdibek/bir-adam-kendisini-yakti-ve-olaylar-geliti-2024716</a>
64	14 Mar 2016	Muhammed Berdibek	Kunta Kinte, dönüyor	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/muhammedberdibek/kunta-kinte-donuyor-2027445">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/muhammedberdibek/kunta-kinte-donuyor-2027445</a>

Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
65	2016-06-06	Muhammed Berdibek	Elveda Şampiyon, elveda Muhammed Ali	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/muhammedberdibek/elveda-ampiyon-elveda-muhammed-ali-2029520">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/muhammedberdibek/elveda-ampiyon-elveda-muhammed-ali-2029520</a>
66	2017-09-11	Muhammed Berdibek	Mekanikçi Yakub, Elijah Muhammed ve Malcolm X	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/muhammedberdibek/meekanikci-yakub-elijah-muhammed-ve-malcolm-x-2040082">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/muhammedberdibek/meekanikci-yakub-elijah-muhammed-ve-malcolm-x-2040082</a>
67	2017-09-25	Muhammed Berdibek	Siyah Musa: Marcus Garvey	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/muhammedberdibek/siyah-musa-marcus-garvey-2040299">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/muhammedberdibek/siyah-musa-marcus-garvey-2040299</a>
68	2017-12-04	Muhammed Berdibek	Malcolm X'ten sonra Siyahi Müslümanlar	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/muhammedberdibek/malcolm-xten-sonra-siyahi-muslumanlar-2041378">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/muhammedberdibek/malcolm-xten-sonra-siyahi-muslumanlar-2041378</a>
69	2018-01-01	Muhammed Berdibek	Kara Panterler: Malcolm X'in Yaşayan Mirası	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/muhammedberdibek/kara-panterler-malcolm-xin-yasayan-mirasi-2041798">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/muhammedberdibek/kara-panterler-malcolm-xin-yasayan-mirasi-2041798</a>
70	2018-01-08	Muhammed Berdibek	Bir Zamanlar Krallardı...	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/muhammedberdibek/bir-zamanlar-krallardi-2041898">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/muhammedberdibek/bir-zamanlar-krallardi-2041898</a>
71	2012-09-28	Murat Menteş	Türküler hâlâ çok sıcak, Neşet Ertaş fazla uzaklaşmış olamaz	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/murat-mentes/turkuler-hl-cok-sicak-neet-erta-cok-sicak-neet-erta-fazla-uzaklami-olamaz-34234">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/murat-mentes/turkuler-hl-cok-sicak-neet-erta-cok-sicak-neet-erta-fazla-uzaklami-olamaz-34234</a>

Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
72	2013-04-05	Murat Menteş	Adam vuran karton polis	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/murat-mentes/adam-vuran-karton-polis-37097">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/murat-mentes/adam-vuran-karton-polis-37097</a>
73	2016-09-01	Murat Zelan	“Bu güç, tek bir adam için çok fazla”	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/muratzelan/bu-guc-tek-bir-adam-icin-cok-fazla-2031543">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/muratzelan/bu-guc-tek-bir-adam-icin-cok-fazla-2031543</a>
74	2017-11-30	Murat Zelan	Konuşulamaz Türk	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/muratzelan/konusulamaz-turk-2041315">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/muratzelan/konusulamaz-turk-2041315</a>
75	1999-04-05	Nazif Gürdoğan	Milyonların duaya duruşu	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/nazifgurdogan/milyonlarin-duaya-duruu-41218">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/nazifgurdogan/milyonlarin-duaya-duruu-41218</a>
76	1999-04-17	Nazif Gürdoğan	Oyu kurşun gibi kullanma	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/nazifgurdogan/oyu-kurun-gibi-kullanma-41445">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/nazifgurdogan/oyu-kurun-gibi-kullanma-41445</a>
77	1999-04-26	Nazif Gürdoğan	Çile doldurma	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/nazifgurdogan/cile-doldurma-41598">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/nazifgurdogan/cile-doldurma-41598</a>
78	21 Mar 2000	Nazif Gürdoğan	Mekana egemen olmak	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/nazifgurdogan/mekana-egemen-olmak-48221">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/nazifgurdogan/mekana-egemen-olmak-48221</a>
79	2001-06-19	Nazif Gürdoğan	Kırmızı gören boğalar	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/nazifgurdogan/kirmizi-goren-bogalar-52327">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/nazifgurdogan/kirmizi-goren-bogalar-52327</a>
80	2008-11-09	Nazif Gürdoğan	Obama Amerika'nın başkentini New York'a taşıdı	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/nazifgurdogan/obama-amerikanin-bakentini-new-yorka-taidi-13736">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/nazifgurdogan/obama-amerikanin-bakentini-new-yorka-taidi-13736</a>

Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
81	2016-06-07	Nazif Gürdoğan	Kelebek gibi uçan arı gibi sokan siyah efsane	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/nazifgurdogan/kelebek-gibi-ucan-ari-gibi-sokan-siyah-efsane-2029543">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/nazifgurdogan/kelebek-gibi-ucan-ari-gibi-sokan-siyah-efsane-2029543</a>
82	2010-11-29	Ömer Lekesiz	Varlık ağacı	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/omerlekesiz/varlik-agaci-25076">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/omerlekesiz/varlik-agaci-25076</a>
83	08 Mar 2015	Ömer Lekesiz	Öfke marazlı mizacın aynasıdır	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/omerlekesiz/ofke-marazli-mizacin-aynasidir-2008330">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/omerlekesiz/ofke-marazli-mizacin-aynasidir-2008330</a>
84	15 Mar 2016	Ömer Lekesiz	Asıl vahşiler içeridedir	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/omerlekesiz/asil-vahiler-iceridedir-2027471">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/omerlekesiz/asil-vahiler-iceridedir-2027471</a>
85	2016-06-05	Ömer Lekesiz	Biz Ali'yi çok sevmiştik	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/omerlekesiz/biz-aliyi-cok-sevmistik-2029501">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/omerlekesiz/biz-aliyi-cok-sevmistik-2029501</a>
86	2017-12-19	Ömer Lekesiz	Kitaplığınızda bir Kudüs rafı olsun	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/omerlekesiz/kitapliginizda-bir-kudus-rafi-olsun-2041614">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/omerlekesiz/kitapliginizda-bir-kudus-rafi-olsun-2041614</a>
87	2008-11-11	Özlem Albayrak	Obama: Rüya mı, kabus mu?	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/ozlemalbayrak/obama-ruya-mi-kabus-mu-13770">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/ozlemalbayrak/obama-ruya-mi-kabus-mu-13770</a>
88	08 Mar 2001	Rasim Özdenören	"Kafayı düzeltmek"	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/rasimozdenoren/kafayi-duzeltmek-47499">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/rasimozdenoren/kafayi-duzeltmek-47499</a>
89	2006-12-03	Rasim Özdenören	Ziyaret	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/rasimozdenoren/ziyaret-2745">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/rasimozdenoren/ziyaret-2745</a>
90	2007-06-14	Rasim Özdenören	Dil	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/rasimozdenoren/dil-5624">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/rasimozdenoren/dil-5624</a>



Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
91	2011-07-17	Rasim Özdenören	Kirli eller zihnimizi bulandırıyor	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/rasimozdenoren/kirli-eller-zihnimizi-bulandiriyor-28243">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/rasimozdenoren/kirli-eller-zihnimizi-bulandiriyor-28243</a>
92	2011-10-20	Rasim Özdenören	Hile ile ne kadar yol alınır?	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/rasimozdenoren/hile-ile-ne-kadar-yol-alinir-29451">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/rasimozdenoren/hile-ile-ne-kadar-yol-alinir-29451</a>
93	2012-01-15	Rasim Özdenören	Gürültü ve kuru gürültü	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/rasimozdenoren/gurultu-ve-kuru-gurultu-30632">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/rasimozdenoren/gurultu-ve-kuru-gurultu-30632</a>
94	28 Mar 2013	Rasim Özdenören	Özür, yeni bir sayfa açmayı içerir	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/rasimozdenoren/ozur-yeni-bir-sayfa-acmayi-icerir-36971">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/rasimozdenoren/ozur-yeni-bir-sayfa-acmayi-icerir-36971</a>
95	2013-06-09	Rasim Özdenören	Hedefi ya başkası belirlemişse?	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/rasimozdenoren/hedefi-ya-bakasi-belirlemise-38069">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/rasimozdenoren/hedefi-ya-bakasi-belirlemise-38069</a>
96	05 Mar 2017	Rasim Özdenören	Çifte standart ya da dünyanın ikilemi	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/rasimozdenoren/cifte-standart-ya-da-dunyanin-ikilemi-2036588">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/rasimozdenoren/cifte-standart-ya-da-dunyanin-ikilemi-2036588</a>
97	2018-04-22	Rasim Özdenören	Dipsiz ambar boş kile	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/rasimozdenoren/dipsiz-ambar-bos-kile-2045364">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/rasimozdenoren/dipsiz-ambar-bos-kile-2045364</a>
98	2019-02-21	Rasim Özdenören	Bölgesel güç/bölgesel bütünleşme	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/rasimozdenoren/bolg-esel-guc-bolgesel-butunlesme-2049384">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/rasimozdenoren/bolg-esel-guc-bolgesel-butunlesme-2049384</a>

Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
99	17 Mar 2019	Rasim Özdenören	Kan ateş ölüm üçgeninde ırkçılık ve Yeni Zelenda faciası	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/rasimozdenoren/kan-ates-olum-ucgeninde-irkcilik-ve-yeni-zelenda-faciasi-2049676">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/rasimozdenoren/kan-ates-olum-ucgeninde-irkcilik-ve-yeni-zelenda-faciasi-2049676</a>
100	04 May 2001	Sadık Albayrak	Şükreden kazanır!	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/sadik-albayrak/ukreden-kazanir-49358">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/sadik-albayrak/ukreden-kazanir-49358</a>
101	2008-11-06	Salih Tuna	Başkan olmuş Obama Yattara saçın boyama	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/salihlihtuna/bakan-olmu-obama-yattara-sacin-boyama-13678">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/salihlihtuna/bakan-olmu-obama-yattara-sacin-boyama-13678</a>
102	2012-04-18	Salih Tuna	Seni mezun eden kendi okulum olsa yıkardım	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/salihlihtuna/seni-mezun-eden-kendi-okulum-olsa-yikardim-31999">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/salihlihtuna/seni-mezun-eden-kendi-okulum-olsa-yikardim-31999</a>
103	2013-08-19	Salih Tuna	Müthiş mucize: Gökten yeryüzüne inen işaret!	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/salihlihtuna/muthi-mucize-gokten-yeryuzune-inen-iaaret-39118">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/salihlihtuna/muthi-mucize-gokten-yeryuzune-inen-iaaret-39118</a>
104	2013-11-06	Salih Tuna	İşte ben bu CHP"linin arkasındayım	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/salihlihtuna/ite-ben-bu-chp-linin-arkasindayim-40415">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/salihlihtuna/ite-ben-bu-chp-linin-arkasindayim-40415</a>
105	2014-06-24	Salih Tuna	Başbakan eksik söylemiş	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/salihlihtuna/babakan-eksik-soylemi-54463">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/salihlihtuna/babakan-eksik-soylemi-54463</a>
106	2014-10-11	Salih Tuna	Köpekler ayakkabı giymez!	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/salihlihtuna/kopekler-ayakkabi-giymez-56343">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/salihlihtuna/kopekler-ayakkabi-giymez-56343</a>

Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
107	2016-07-16	Salih Tuna	Sekizinci yazı	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/salihlihtuna/sekizinci-yazi-2030410">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/salihlihtuna/sekizinci-yazi-2030410</a>
108	2017-02-22	Salih Tuna	Vallahi çok ayıp!	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/salihlihtuna/vallahi-cok-ayip-2036337">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/salihlihtuna/vallahi-cok-ayip-2036337</a>
109	2017-04-29	Salih Tuna	Ben kimim Asuman nedir?	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/salihlihtuna/ben-kimim-asuman-nedir-2037600">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/salihlihtuna/ben-kimim-asuman-nedir-2037600</a>
110	2006-06-23	Sami Hocaoglu	Amerika'da İslam (2)	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/samihocaoglu/amerikada-islam-2-768">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/samihocaoglu/amerikada-islam-2-768</a>
111	1999-09-19	Selahattin Yusuf	Sivil "Mimik"	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/selahattinyusuf/sivil-mimik-43884">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/selahattinyusuf/sivil-mimik-43884</a>
112	2012-11-05	Sernur Yassıkaya	Obama'nın Afro-Amerikan Damarı...	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/sernuryassikaya/obamanin-afro-amerikan-damari-34821">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/sernuryassikaya/obamanin-afro-amerikan-damari-34821</a>
113	2012-05-18	Süleyman Gündüz	Srebrenica günahının karanlık gölgesi...	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/suleymangunduz/srebrenica-gunahinin-karanlik-golgesi-32441">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/suleymangunduz/srebrenica-gunahinin-karanlik-golgesi-32441</a>
114	31 May 2018	Süleyman Seyfi Öğün	Ahlaki isyan ve isyan ahlakı	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/suleymanseyfiogun/ahlaki-isyani-ve-isyani-ahlaki-2045874">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/suleymanseyfiogun/ahlaki-isyani-ve-isyani-ahlaki-2045874</a>
115	2018-12-15	Taha Kılınç	Kirli ortaklık	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/tahakilinc/kirli-ortaklik-2048514">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/tahakilinc/kirli-ortaklik-2048514</a>
116	2011-07-18	Teodora Doni	"Kuklayı değil kuklacıyı vurmali"	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/teodora_doni/kuklayi-degil-kuklaciyi-vurmali-28251">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/teodora_doni/kuklayi-degil-kuklaciyi-vurmali-28251</a>

Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
117	2016-08-14	Yaşar Söngü	Devletin içindeki Truva atları	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/yasarsungu/devletin-icindeki-truva-atlari-2031172">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/yasarsungu/devletin-icindeki-truva-atlari-2031172</a>
118	2012-10-29	Yasin Aktay	Hac bayramından geriye ne kalıyor?	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/yasinaktay/hac-bayramindan-geriye-ne-kaliyor-34700">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/yasinaktay/hac-bayramindan-geriye-ne-kaliyor-34700</a>
119	2008-11-10	Yusuf Ziya Cömert	Bu "patlama"yı beklemiyordum	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/yusufziyacmert/bu-patlamayi-beklemiyordum-13751">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/yusufziyacmert/bu-patlamayi-beklemiyordum-13751</a>
120	03 May 2011	Yusuf Ziya Cömert	Obama"nın yüzü ışıltıyor	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/yusufziyacmert/obamanin-yuzu-iildiyor-27218">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/yusufziyacmert/obamanin-yuzu-iildiyor-27218</a>
121	2016-02-08	Yusuf Ziya Cömert	Bize yakışmazdı böyle şeyler	<a href="https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/yusufziyacmert/bize-yakimazdi-boyle-eyler-2026654">https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/yusufziyacmert/bize-yakimazdi-boyle-eyler-2026654</a>

APPENDIX C  
YENİ AKİT COLUMNS

Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
1	2016-05-10	Abdullah Yıldız	Öğüt alır mıyız?	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/abdullah-yildiz/ogut-alir-miyiz-14917.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/abdullah-yildiz/ogut-alir-miyiz-14917.html</a>
2	2017-05-16	Abdullah Yıldız	Suçlamayı Bırak, Bir Tohum Ek!	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/abdullah-yildiz/suclamayi-birak-bir-tohum-ek-19467.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/abdullah-yildiz/suclamayi-birak-bir-tohum-ek-19467.html</a>
3	2014-02-20	Abdurrahman Dilipak	Saul'den NeclaÇarpan'a oradan...	<a href="http://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/abdurrahman-dilipak/saulden-necla-carpana-oradan-4929.html">http://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/abdurrahman-dilipak/saulden-necla-carpana-oradan-4929.html</a>
4	2014-04-16	Abdurrahman Dilipak	MAYIS GÜNDEMİ	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/abdurrahman-dilipak/mayis-gundemi-5667.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/abdurrahman-dilipak/mayis-gundemi-5667.html</a>
5	2014-05-12	Abdurrahman Dilipak	Aile ve çocuk üzerine!	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/abdurrahman-dilipak/aile-ve-cocuk-uzerine-6023.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/abdurrahman-dilipak/aile-ve-cocuk-uzerine-6023.html</a>
6	2017-03-14	Abdurrahman Dilipak	Şecaat arz ederken	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/abdurrahman-dilipak/secaat-arz-ederken-18627.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/abdurrahman-dilipak/secaat-arz-ederken-18627.html</a>
7	2018-07-25	Abdurrahman Dilipak	Af meselesi	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/abdurrahman-dilipak/af-meselesi-25148.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/abdurrahman-dilipak/af-meselesi-25148.html</a>

Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
8	2018-09-30	Abdurrahman Dilipak	Af	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/abdurrahman-dilipak/af-25957.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/abdurrahman-dilipak/af-25957.html</a>
9	2015-12-07	Ahmet Anapalı	Genç adam, ümmet işte budur...	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/ahmet-anapali/genc-adam-ummet-iste-budur-12967.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/ahmet-anapali/genc-adam-ummet-iste-budur-12967.html</a>
10	2015-02-21	Ahmet Varol	Şehadetinin 50. yılında Malcolm X	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/ahmet-varol/sehadetinin-50-yilinda-malcolm-x-9614.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/ahmet-varol/sehadetinin-50-yilinda-malcolm-x-9614.html</a>
11	2015-01-15	Ali Erkan Kavaklı	O teröristler İslam'ı öğretmeyenlerin eseri	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/ali-erkan-kavakli/o-teroristler-islami-ogretmeyenlerin-eseri-9194.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/ali-erkan-kavakli/o-teroristler-islami-ogretmeyenlerin-eseri-9194.html</a>
12	2016-03-30	Ayhan Demir	Adaletiniz batsın!	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/ayhan-demir/adaletiniz-batsin-14422.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/ayhan-demir/adaletiniz-batsin-14422.html</a>
13	2013-12-06	Hacı Yakışıklı	İşte Gülen grubunun ajanları!	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/haci-yakisikli/iste-gulen-grubunun-ajanlari-3918.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/haci-yakisikli/iste-gulen-grubunun-ajanlari-3918.html</a>
14	2018-02-26	Hacı Yakışıklı	Almanya'da 28 Şubat'ı Akit yaşadı, 2005'te gazetemiz kapatıldı!	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/haci-yakisikli/almanyada-28-subati-akit-yasadi-2005te-gazetemiz-kapatildi-23214.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/haci-yakisikli/almanyada-28-subati-akit-yasadi-2005te-gazetemiz-kapatildi-23214.html</a>
15	2013-12-15	Hasan Aksay	Şehid Abdulkadir Molla, insanlık ve insanlar	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/hasan-aksay/sehid-abdulkadir-molla-insanlik-ve-insanlar-4024.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/hasan-aksay/sehid-abdulkadir-molla-insanlik-ve-insanlar-4024.html</a>

Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
16	2017-01-08	Hasan Aksay	Mal fakirliği; derin ruhi fakirlik, Kanada örneği	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/hasan-aksay/mal-fakirligi-derin-ruhi-fakirlik-kanada-ornegi-17824.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/hasan-aksay/mal-fakirligi-derin-ruhi-fakirlik-kanada-ornegi-17824.html</a>
17	2017-01-16	Hasan Aksay	TBMM'nin alındaki ihtar	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/hasan-aksay/tbmmnin-alindeki-ihtar-17917.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/hasan-aksay/tbmmnin-alindeki-ihtar-17917.html</a>
18	2017-10-16	Hasan Aksay	Rahmetli Ahmet Zeki Çamlı ve Osman Nuri Önügören	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/hasan-aksay/rahmetli-ahmet-zeki-camli-ve-osman-nuri-onugoren-21434.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/hasan-aksay/rahmetli-ahmet-zeki-camli-ve-osman-nuri-onugoren-21434.html</a>
19	12/11/2017	Hasan Aksay	Trump'ın gündem olma gayretine Kudüs'le devamı	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/hasan-aksay/trumpin-gundem-olma-gayretine-kudusle-devami-22181.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/hasan-aksay/trumpin-gundem-olma-gayretine-kudusle-devami-22181.html</a>
20	2018-01-01	Hasan Aksay	Trump, başarı ve başarısızlıklarla nereye koşuyor?	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/hasan-aksay/trump-basari-ve-basarisizliklarla-nereye-kosuyor-22452.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/hasan-aksay/trump-basari-ve-basarisizliklarla-nereye-kosuyor-22452.html</a>
21	2018-02-15	Hüseyin Öztürk	Amerika'nın musallat olmadığı ülke var mı?	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/huseyin-ozturk/amerikanin-musallat-olmadigi-ulke-var-mi-23062.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/huseyin-ozturk/amerikanin-musallat-olmadigi-ulke-var-mi-23062.html</a>
22	2016-06-13	Kadir Demirel	İki eylem adamı; Muhammed Ali... Malcolm X...	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/kadir-demirel/iki-eylem-adami-muhammed-ali-malcolm-x-15344.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/kadir-demirel/iki-eylem-adami-muhammed-ali-malcolm-x-15344.html</a>

Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
23	2014-05-08	Kenan Alpay	Küme Düş(ürül)menin Fazileti	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/kenan-alpay/kume-dusurulmenin-fazileti-5967.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/kenan-alpay/kume-dusurulmenin-fazileti-5967.html</a>
24	2016-06-06	Kenan Alpay	Mevzuat Despotizminin 'G 87' Kodlu Cenderesi	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/kenan-alpay/mevzuat-despotizminin-g-87-kodlu-cenderesi-15257.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/kenan-alpay/mevzuat-despotizminin-g-87-kodlu-cenderesi-15257.html</a>
25	2017-07-25	Mahmud Sami	Amerika'da Darbe Olur Mu?	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/mahmud-sami/amerikada-darbe-olur-mu-20344.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/mahmud-sami/amerikada-darbe-olur-mu-20344.html</a>
26	2017-12-12	Mahmud Sami	Ortadoğu'nun "KENELERİ"!	<a href="http://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/mahmud-sami/ortadogunun-keneleri-22207.html">http://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/mahmud-sami/ortadogunun-keneleri-22207.html</a>
27	2014-02-08	Mehmet Ali Tekin	Şehidler ayı şubat...	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/mehmet-ali-tekin/sehidler-ayi-subat-4768.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/mehmet-ali-tekin/sehidler-ayi-subat-4768.html</a>
28	2016-02-06	Mehmet Koçak	Onları Anmak, Anlamak ve Anlatmak...	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/mehmet-kocak/onlari-anmak-anlamak-ve-anlatmak-13688.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/mehmet-kocak/onlari-anmak-anlamak-ve-anlatmak-13688.html</a>
29	2018-09-29	Mehmet Koçak	Başkan Erdoğan, konuşmaları, çağrılar ve uyarılarıyla örnek bir lider	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/mehmet-kocak/baskan-erdogan-konusmalari-cagrilari-ve-uyarilariyla-ornek-bir-lider-25950.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/mehmet-kocak/baskan-erdogan-konusmalari-cagrilari-ve-uyarilariyla-ornek-bir-lider-25950.html</a>



Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
30	2016-06-07	Merve Kavakçı	Muhammed Ali Clay'ı uğurlarken	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/merve-kavakci/muhammed-ali-clayi-ugurlarken-15264.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/merve-kavakci/muhammed-ali-clayi-ugurlarken-15264.html</a>
31	2014-07-16	Muhsin Meriç	Tersten okuma meraklısı beyinsizler!	<a href="http://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/muhsin-meric/tersten-okuma-meraklisi-beyinsizler-6878.html">http://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/muhsin-meric/tersten-okuma-meraklisi-beyinsizler-6878.html</a>
32	2014-10-15	Muhsin Meriç	Ortadoğu'nun yandaş, yoldaş, candaş basını!	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/muhsin-meric/ortadogunun-yandas-yoldas-candas-basini-8064.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/muhsin-meric/ortadogunun-yandas-yoldas-candas-basini-8064.html</a>
33	2014-06-08	Mustafa Özcan	Peygamber metodu üzerine hareket	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/mustafa-ozcan/peygamber-metodu-uzerine-hareket-6376.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/mustafa-ozcan/peygamber-metodu-uzerine-hareket-6376.html</a>
34	2014-08-19	Mustafa Özcan	Dünyanın yeni hasta adamı	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/mustafa-ozcan/dunyanin-yeni-hasta-adami-7323.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/mustafa-ozcan/dunyanin-yeni-hasta-adami-7323.html</a>
35	7/11/2017	Osman Atalay	Kadına şiddet, muhacire tecavüz, suçlu kim?	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/osman-atalay/kadina-siddet-muhacire-tecavuz-suclu-kim-20154.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/osman-atalay/kadina-siddet-muhacire-tecavuz-suclu-kim-20154.html</a>
36	2017-08-29	Osman Atalay	Arakanlıları başka bir ülkeye taşıyalım	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/osman-atalay/arakanlilari-baska-bir-ulkeye-tasiyalim-20813.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/osman-atalay/arakanlilari-baska-bir-ulkeye-tasiyalim-20813.html</a>

Number	Date	Author	Title	URL
37	2014-06-08	Serdar Demirel	Obama döneminde siyah ayaklanma	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/serdar-demirel/obama-doneminde-siyah-ayaklanma-15719.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/serdar-demirel/obama-doneminde-siyah-ayaklanma-15719.html</a>
38	2016-07-14	Şevki Yılmaz	Darbelerle “Ezenboğa” Rejimi!	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/sevki-yilmaz/darbelerle-ezenboga-rejimi-18395.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/sevki-yilmaz/darbelerle-ezenboga-rejimi-18395.html</a>
39	2017-08-17	Yaşar Degirmenci	Haccın, Müslüman kardeşliği üzerinde oynadığı rol	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/yaşar-degirmenci/haccin-musluman-kardesligi-uzerinde-oynadigi-rol-20650.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/yaşar-degirmenci/haccin-musluman-kardesligi-uzerinde-oynadigi-rol-20650.html</a>
40	2016-11-29	Zekeriya Say	“Sesini yükselt!..”	<a href="https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/zekeriya-say/sesini-yukselt-17350.html">https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/zekeriya-say/sesini-yukselt-17350.html</a>

## APPENDIX D

### SEARCH QUERIES

Milli Gazete Google Search Queries (2 total)
site:milligazete.com.tr/makale "malcolm x" OR "malcolmx" OR "malcolm-x" OR "malcom x" OR "malcomx" OR "malcom-x" OR "malkolm x" OR "malkolmx" OR "malkolm-x" OR "malkom x" OR "malkomx" OR "malkom-x" OR "malcolm little" OR "malcom little" OR "malkolm little" OR "malkom little" OR "şahbaz" OR "şahbazz" OR "sahbaz"
site:milligazete.com.tr/makale "sahbazz" OR "şabaz" OR "şabazz" OR "sabaz" OR "sabazz" OR "shabaz" OR "shabazz"

Milli Gazete Website Search Queries (52 total)			
(without quotation mark / 26 totals)		(with quotation marks / 26 total)	
malcolm x	malcom little	"malcolm x"	"malcom little"
Malcolmx	malkolm little	"malcolmx"	"malkolm little"
malcolm-x	malkom little	"malcolm-x"	"malkom little"
malcom x	şahbaz	"malcom x"	"şahbaz"
Malcomx	şahbazz	"malcomx"	"şahbazz"
malcom-x	sahbaz	"malcom-x"	"sahbaz"
malkolm x	sahbazz	"malkolm x"	"sahbazz"
malkolmx	şabaz	"malkolmx"	"şabaz"
malkolm-x	şabazz	"malkolm-x"	"şabazz"
malkom x	sabaz	"malkom x"	"sabaz"
malkomx	sabazz	"malkomx"	"sabazz"
malkom-x	shabaz	"malkom-x"	"shabaz"
malcolm little	shabazz	"malcolm little"	"shabazz"

Yeni Safak Google Search Queries (4 total)
site:yenisafak.com.tr/yazarlar "malcolm x" OR "malcolmx" OR "malcolm-x" OR "malcom x" OR "malcomx" OR "malcom-x" OR "malkolm x" OR "malkolmx" OR "malkolm-x" OR "malkom x" OR "malkomx" OR "malkom-x" OR "malcolm little" OR "malcom little" OR "malkolm little" OR "malkom little" OR "şahbaz" OR "şahbazz" OR "sahbaz"
site:yenisafak.com.tr/yazarlar "sahbazz" OR "şabaz" OR "şabazz" OR "sabaz" OR "sabazz" OR "shabaz" OR "shabazz"
site:yenisafak.com.tr/yazarlar "malcolm x" OR "malcolmx" OR "malcolm-x" OR "malcom x" OR "malcomx" OR "malcom-x" OR "malkolm x" OR "malkolmx" OR "malkolm-x" OR "malkom x" OR "malkomx" OR "malkom-x" OR "malcolm little" OR "malcom little" OR "malkolm little" OR "malkom little" OR "şahbaz" OR "şahbazz" OR "sahbaz"
site:yenisafak.com.tr/yazarlar "sahbazz" OR "şabaz" OR "şabazz" OR "sabaz" OR "sabazz" OR "shabaz" OR "shabazz"

Yeni Akit Google Search Queries (2 total)
site:eniakit.com.tr/yazarlar "malcolm x" OR "malcolmx" OR "malcolm-x" OR "malcom x" OR "malcomx" OR "malcom-x" OR "malkolm x" OR "malkolmx" OR "malkolm-x" OR "malkom x" OR "malkomx" OR "malkom-x" OR "malcolm little" OR "malcom little" OR "malkolm little" OR "malkom little" OR "şahbaz" OR "şahbazz" OR "sahbaz"
site:eniakit.com.tr/yazarlar "sahbazz" OR "şabaz" OR "şabazz" OR "sabaz" OR "sabazz" OR "shabaz" OR "shabazz"

## REFERENCES

- Abou-El-Fadi, R (Ed.). (2015). *Revolutionary Egypt: Connecting domestic and international struggles*. London: Routledge.
- Ahmad, F. (2009). Politics and political parties in republican Turkey. In R. Kasaba (Ed.), *The Cambridge history of Turkey (Volume 4: Turkey in the modern world)* (pp. 226-265). Cambridge University Press.
- Akyel, S. (2018). ABD ve Batı sinemasında “din konusu.” *Milli Gazete*. Retrieved from <https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1680986/siyami-akyel/abd-ve-bati-sinemasinda-din-konusu>
- Akyol, M. (2012). The Turkish model. *The Cairo Review*. Retrieved from <https://www.thecaireview.com/essays/the-turkish-model/>
- Albayrak, H. (2007). Kara panter geliyor. *Yeni Safak*. Retrieved from <https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/hakanalbayrak/kara-panter-geliyor-8236>
- Anapali, A. (2015). Genç adam, ümmet işte budur. *Yeni Akit*. Retrieved from <https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/ahmet-anapali/genc-adam-ummet-iste-budur-12967.html>
- Atasoy, Y. (2009). *Islam's marriage with neoliberalism: State transformation in Turkey*. London: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Atatürk'ün cenaze namazı, gazeteciye 15 ay hapis cezasına mal oldu. (2004). *Hurriyet*. Retrieved from <https://www.hurriyet.com.tr/gundem/ataturk-un-cenaze-namazi-gazeteciye-15-ay-hapis-cezasina-mal-oldu-38595850>
- Balkan, N., Balkan, E. & Oncu, A. (Eds). (2015). *The neoliberal landscape and the rise of Islamist capital in Turkey*. New York: Berghahn Books.
- Bayat, A. (2013). Post Islamism at large. A. Bayat (Ed.), *Post Islamism: The changing faces of political Islam* (pp. 3-34). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Bayraktar, C. (2015). “Umutsuz Ev Kadınları” ve umutsuz Obama. *Yeni Safak*. Retrieved from <https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/cemilebayraktar/umutsuz-ev-kadinlari-ve-umutsuz-obama-2007936>
- Benford, R. D. & Snow, D. A. (2000). Framing processes and social movements: An overview and assessment. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 26, 611-639. Retrieved from <https://www.jstor.org/stable/223459>.
- Berg, H. (2009). *Elijah Muhammad and Islam*. New York: New York University Press.

- Bermek, S. (2019). *The rise of hybrid political Islam in Turkey: Origins and consolidation of the JDP*. London: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Women from AKP file a complaint against columnist over Istanbul Convention remarks. (2020). *Bianet*. Retrieved from: <https://bianet.org/english/women/228820-women-from-akp-file-a-complaint-against-columnist-over-istanbul-convention-remarks>
- Biyografya: Hasan Aksay. Retrieved from <https://www.biyografya.com/biyografi/14341>
- Byrne, J. J. (2016). *Mecca of revolution: Algeria, decolonization and the third world order*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- [captioning for the end of the world.] (2014, November 3). *1964, March 29 – Malcolm X – We didn't land on Plymouth Rock – Closed Captioned* [Video]. Retrieved from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=3Aq2Z0i8D6A>
- Calabro, A. (2017). Islamist views on foreign policy: Examples of Turkish pan-Islamism in the writings of Sezai Karakoç and Necmettin Erbakan. *Insight Turkey*, 19(1). Retrieved from <https://www.insightturkey.com/articles/islamist-views-on-foreign-policy-examples-of-turkish-pan-islamism-in-the-writings-of-sezai-karakoc-and-necmettin-erbakan>
- Captagay, S. (2017). *The new sultan: Erdoğan and the crisis of modern Turkey*. London: I.B. Tauris.
- Chabot, S. (2004) Framing, transnational diffusion, and African-American intellectuals in the land of Gandhi. *International Review of Social History*, 49(12), 19-40. Retrieved from <https://www.jstor.org/stable/26405522>.
- Comert, Y. (2016). Bize yakışmazdı böyle şeyler. *Yeni Safak*. Retrieved from <https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/yusufziyacomert/bize-yakimazdi-boyle-eyler-2026654>
- Crawford, M. D. (2005). *Black Muslims and the law: Civil liberties from Elijah Muhammad to Muhammad Ali*. Lanham, Maryland: Lexington Books.
- Curtis, E. E. (2010). *Encyclopedia of Muslim-American history*. New York: Infobase Publishing.
- Dag, R. (2014). *The perception between the pro-Islamic and Pro-Kurdish political streams in Turkey, 1980-2011* (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). University of Exeter, Exeter, UK. Retrieved from <https://ore.exeter.ac.uk/repository/bitstream/handle/10871/14948/DagR.pdf?sequence=2&isAllowed=y>
- Dagi, I. (2013). Post-Islamism a la turca. A. Bayat (Ed.), *Post Islamism: The changing faces of political Islam* (pp. 71-108). Oxford: Oxford University Press.

- DeCaro, Jr., L. A. (1997). *On the side of my people: A religious life of Malcolm X*. New York: New York University Press.
- della Porta, D. & Tarrow, S. (2005). Transnational processes and social activism: An introduction. D. della Porta & S. Tarrow (Eds.), *Transnational Protest and Global Activism* (pp. 1-17). New York: Rowman and Littlefield.
- Davis, A. (1992). Meditations on the legacy of Malcolm X. J. Wood (Ed.), *Malcolm X: In Our Own Image* (pp. 36-47). London: St. Martin's Press.
- Davutoglu, A. (1996). Amerikan siyasi sistemi ve müslümanlar. *Yeni Safak*. Retrieved from <https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/ahmetdavutoglu/amerikan-siyasi-sistemi-ve-muslumanlar-2027163>
- Diani, M. (1992). The concept of social movement. *The Sociological Review*, 40(1), 1-25. Retrieved from [moodle.fhs.cuni.cz/pluginfile.php/51359/mod\\_folder/content/0/05\\_Diani.pdf](https://moodle.fhs.cuni.cz/pluginfile.php/51359/mod_folder/content/0/05_Diani.pdf)
- Dilipak, A. (2017). Şecaat arz ederken. *Yeni Akit*. Retrieved from <https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/abdurrahman-dilipak/secaat-arz-ederken-18627.html>
- Dobbin, F., Simmons, B. & Garrett, G. (2007). The global diffusion of public policies: Social construction, coercion, competition, or learning? *Annual Review of Sociology*, 33, 449-72. Retrieved from [https://scholar.harvard.edu/files/dobbin/files/2007\\_ars\\_dobbin\\_simmons.pdf](https://scholar.harvard.edu/files/dobbin/files/2007_ars_dobbin_simmons.pdf)
- Edwards, B. T., & Goankar, D. P. (Eds.). (2010). *Globalizing American Studies*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Eligur, B. (2010). *The mobilization of political Islam in Turkey*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Entman, R. M. (1993). Framing: Toward clarification of a fractured paradigm. *Journal of Communication*, 43(4), 51-58. Retrieved from [https://is.muni.cz/el/1423/podzim2018/POL256/um/Entman\\_1993\\_FramingTowardclarificationOfAFracturedParadigm.pdf](https://is.muni.cz/el/1423/podzim2018/POL256/um/Entman_1993_FramingTowardclarificationOfAFracturedParadigm.pdf)
- Er, I. (2017). Ezilmişlerin yumruğu “Muhammed Ali Clay.” *Milli Gazete*. Retrieved from <https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/760406/ibrahim-halil-er/ezilmislerin-yumrugu-muhammed-ali-clay>
- Erbakan, N. (1975). *Millî Görüş*. Istanbul: Dergâh Yayınları.
- Erken, A. (2018). *America and the making of modern Turkey: Science, culture and political alliances*. London: Bloomsbury Publishing.
- Euro Topics: European Press Roundup. Retrieved from <https://www.eurotopics.net/en/142186/media>

- Evanzz, K. (2011). *The messenger: The rise and fall of Elijah Muhammad*. New York: Knopf Doubleday Publishing Group.
- Ewing, A. (2014). *The age of Garvey: How a Jamaican activist created a mass movement and changed global Black politics*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Ferguson, M. (2014). White Turks, Black Turks and negroes: The politics of polarization. U. Ozkirimli (Ed.), *The making of a protest movement in Turkey: #occupygezi*. London: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Full Text: Turkish PM Erdoğan's post-election "balcony speech." (2014). *Hurriyet Daily News*. Retrieved from <https://www.hurriyetdailynews.com/full-text-turkish-pm-erdogans-post-election-balcony-speech-64341>
- Fuller, G. E. (2010). *A world without Islam*. New York: Little, Brown and Company.
- Gamson, W. A. (1992). *Talking Politics*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Gamson, W. A. & Modigliani, A. (1989). Media discourse and public opinion on nuclear power: A constructionist approach. *The American Journal of Sociology*, 95(1), 1-37.
- Goffman, E. (1986). *Frame analysis: An essay on the organization of experience*. Boston: Northeastern University Press.
- Gomez, M. A. (2005). *Black crescent: The experience and legacy of African Muslims in the Americas*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Grant, C. (2008). *Negro with a hat: The rise and fall of Marcus Garvey*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Gurdogan, N. (1999). Çile doldurma. *Yeni Safak*. Retrieved from <https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/nazifgurdogan/cile-doldurma-41598>
- Gurel, P. (2017). *The Limits of Westernization: A Cultural History of America in Turkey*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Hale, W. & Ozbudun, E. (2009). *Islamism, Democracy and Liberalism in Turkey: The Case of the AKP*. London: Routledge.
- Haley, A. (2015). Epilogue. M. X. *The Autobiography of Malcolm X as Told to Alex Haley*. New York: Random House.
- Haksal, A. (2008). Barack Hüseyin Obama niçin tercih edilir. *Milli Gazete*. Retrieved from <https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/871356/ali-haydar-haksal/barack-huseyin-obama-nicin-tercih-edilir>
- Handler, M. S. (1964). Malcolm X pleased by whites' attitude on trip to Mecca. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/1964/05/08/archives/malcolm-x-pleased-by-whites-attitude-on-trip-to-mecca.html>

- Kaplan, R. D. (2013). *The revenge of geography: What the map tells us about coming conflicts and the battle against fate*. New York: Random House.
- Karagul, I. (2016). Muhammed Ali, Malcolm X ve dik duran adamların yolu. *Yeni Safak*. Retrieved from <https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/ibrahimkaragul/muhammed-ali-malcolm-x-ve-dik-duran-adamlarin-yolu-2029621>
- Kavakli, A. (2015). O teröristler İslam'ı öğretmeyenlerin eseri. *Yeni Akit*. Retrieved from <https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/ali-erkan-kavakli/o-teroristler-islami-ogretmeyenlerin-eseri-9194.html>
- Kaya, M. (2020). Nefes alamayan George Floyd mu, Amerika mı? *Milli Gazete*. Retrieved from <https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/4784186/mustafa-kaya/nefes-alamayan-george-floyd-mu-amerika-mi>
- Kilicarslan, I. (2016). Seni gidi ev zencisi. *Yeni Safak*. Retrieved from <https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/ismailkilicarslan/seni-gidi-ev-zencisi-2026938>
- Killioglu, I. (2006). Hacc ve organizasyon gereği. *Milli Gazete*. Retrieved from <https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/867568/ismail-killioglu/hacc-ve-organizasyon-geregi>
- Kiransal, A. (2016). Ayasofya'da Fetih Namazı ve İstanbul'un Fethi. *Milli Gazete*. Retrieved from <https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/847624/abdulaziz-kiransal/ayasofyada-fetih-namazi-ve-istanbulun-fethi>
- Kiransal, A. (2018). Çocuklarımız için Andımız. *Milli Gazete*. Retrieved from <https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1723653/abdulaziz-kiransal/cocuklarimiz-icin-andimiz>
- Kirisci, K. (2017). *Turkey and the West: Fault lines in a troubled alliance*. Washington, DC: Brookings Institution Press.
- Kocak, M. (2018). Başkan Erdoğan, konuşmaları, çağrıları ve uyarılarıyla örnek bir lider. *Yeni Akit*. Retrieved from <https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/mehmet-kocak/baskan-Erdoğan-konusmalari-cagrilari-ve-uyarilariyla-ornek-bir-lider-25950.html>
- Kocak, M. (2016). Onları Anmak, Anlamak ve Anlatmak. *Yeni Akit*. Retrieved from <https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/mehmet-kocak/onlari-anmak-anlamak-ve-anlatmak-13688.html>
- Kramer, H. (2001). *A changing Turkey: The challenge to Europe and the United States*. Washington, DC: Brookings Institution Press.
- Kutlu, A. (2015). Benim yemek kitabım. *Yeni Safak*. Retrieved from <https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/alinurkutlu/benim-yemek-kitabim-2007730>



- Lewis, C. (1964). Final views: An interview with Claude Lewis. Gallen, David (Ed.), *A Malcolm X Reader: Perspectives on The Man and the Myths* (pp. 195-206). New York: Carroll & Graf Publishers, Inc.
- Lincoln, C. E. (1994). *The Black Muslims in America*. Grand Rapids, Michigan: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing.
- Lord, C. (2018). *Religious politics in Turkey: From the birth of the republic to the AKP*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Mamdani, M. (2005). *Good Muslim, bad Muslim: America, the Cold War, and the roots of terror*. New York: Doubleday.
- Mango, A. (2002). *Ataturk: The biography of the founder of modern Turkey*. New York: Abrams Books.
- Malcolm X's daughter says Erdoğan “represents” legacy of her father. (2018). *Daily Sabah*. Retrieved from <https://www.dailysabah.com/politics/2018/09/25/malcolm-xs-daughter-says-Erdoğan-represents-legacy-of-her-father>
- Manhattan DA reviewing investigation of Malcolm X assassination (2020). Retrieved from: <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2020/2/11/manhattan-da-reviewing-investigation-of-malcolm-x-assassination>
- Marable, M. (2011). *Malcolm X: A life of reinvention*. London: Penguin Books.
- Marable, M. & Felber, G. (Eds.). (2013). *The portable Malcolm X reader*. London: Penguin Books.
- McAdam, D. & Rucht, D. (1993). The cross-national diffusion of movement ideas. *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, 528, 56-74. Retrieved from <https://www.jstor.org/stable/1047791>.
- Moore, P. (2015). Malcolm X remembered favorably by Blacks but not by whites. *YouGov*. Retrieved from <https://today.yougov.com/topics/politics/articles-reports/2015/02/21/malcolm-x>
- Muhammad, E. (2009). *Message to the Blackman in America*. Irving, Texas: Secretarius MEMPS Publications.
- [mrholtshistory]. (2008, April 20). *Malcolm X- Dr. King is an Uncle Tom* [Video]. YouTube. Retrieved from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=-Rr-aRxItpw>
- Muradoglu, A. (2020). “Siyahlar”a nefes aldırıyorlar. *Yeni Safak*. Retrieved from <https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/abdullahmuradoglu/siyahlara-nefes-aldirmiyorlar-2055253>
- Nadir Kitap: Malcolm X (Malik el- Şahbaz) Hayat Hikayesi (İlk Baskı). Retrieved from <https://www.nadirkita.com/malcolm-x-malik-el-sahbaz-hayat-hikayesi-ilk-baski-alex-haley-kitap9641956.html>

- Fresh Air Remembers Mike Wallace Of “60 Minutes.” (2012). *National Public Radio*. Retrieved from <https://www.npr.org/transcripts/150282652?storyId=150282652>
- New York Public Library: The Malcolm X Collection: Papers, 1948-1965. Retrieved from [http://archives.nypl.org/uploads/collection/pdf\\_finding\\_aid/malcolm\\_x.pdf](http://archives.nypl.org/uploads/collection/pdf_finding_aid/malcolm_x.pdf)
- Nida, M. (2014). AGD İle Yaz Bir Başka. *Milli Gazete*. Retrieved from <https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/856061/meryem-nida/agd-ile-yaz-bir-baska>
- Nida, M. (2016). Ümmet için koşan mücahid? *Milli Gazete*. Retrieved from <https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/848856/meryem-nida/ummet-icin-kosan-mucahid>
- Nida, M. (2017). “Şehid, şehadeti arzulayandır.” *Milli Gazete*. Retrieved from <https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/844169/meryem-nida/sehid-sehadeti-arzulayandir>
- Open Source Center: Turkey -- Guide to Major Turkish Daily Newspapers. (2008). Retrieved from <https://fas.org/irp/dni/osc/turkish-news.pdf>
- Osman, T. (2016). *Islamism: What it means for the Middle East and the world*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Ozkan, A. (2020). ABD, soykırım üzerine kuruldu. *Milli Gazete*. Retrieved from <https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/4810170/abdulkadir-ozkan/abd-soykirim-uzerine-kuruldu>
- Ozturk, H. (2018). Amerika’nın musallat olmadığı ülke var mı? *Yeni Akit*. Retrieved from <https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/huseyin-ozturk/amerikanin-musallat-olmadigi-ulke-var-mi-23062.html>
- Prashad, V. (2007). *The Darker Nations: A People’s History of the Third World*. New York: The New Press.
- President Erdoğan meets daughters of Malcolm X in New York. (2018). *Daily Sabah*. Retrieved from <https://www.dailysabah.com/turkey/2018/09/24/president-Erdoğan-meets-daughters-of-malcolm-x-in-new-york>
- Turkey renames new US embassy street “Malcolm X Avenue.” (2018). *The Guardian*. Retrieved from <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2018/oct/14/turkey-renames-new-us-embassy-street-malcolm-x-avenue>
- Roy, O. (2007). *Secularism confronts Islam*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Schuessler, J. (2018). Missing Malcolm X writings, long a mystery, are sold. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/07/26/books/malcolm-x-book-auction.html>

- Shayan, F. (2018). Ali Shariati and anti-Americanism in the Persian Gulf Region. D. J. Byrd and S. J. Miri (Eds.), *Ali Shariati and the future of social theory* (pp. 226-249). Chicago: Haymarket Books.
- Snow, D. A. & Bedford, R. D. (1988). Ideology, frame resonance, and participant mobilization. *International Social Movement Research, 1*, 197-217. Retrieved from <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/285098685>.
- Snow, D. A. & Bedford, R. D. (1992). Master frames and cycles of protest. A. D. Morris & C. McClurg (Eds.), *Frontiers in Social Movement Theory*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Snow, D. A. & Benford, R. D. (1999). Alternative types of cross-national diffusion in the social movement arena. D. della Porta, H. Kriesi & D. Rucht (Eds.), *Social Movements in a Globalizing World* (pp. 23-39). London: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Snow, D. A., Rockford, Jr., E. B., Worden, S. K. & Benford, R. D. (1986). Frame alignment processes, micromobilization, and movement participation. *American Sociological Review, 51*(4), 464-481. Retrieved from <https://www.jstor.org/stable/2095581>.
- Soule, S. A. Diffusion processes within and across movements. (2004). D. A. Snow, H. Kriesi & S. A. Soule, Sarah A. (Eds), *The Blackwell Companion to Social Movements*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.
- Strang, D. and J. W. Meyer. (1993). Institutional conditions for diffusion. *Theory and Society, 22*(4), 487-511. Retrieved from <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007%2FBF00993595>.
- Strang, D. & Soule, S. A. (1998). Diffusion in organizations and social movements: From hybrid corn to poison pills. *The Annual Review of Sociology, 24*, 265-290. Retrieved from <http://snap.stanford.edu/class/cs224w-readings/strang98diffusion.pdf>
- Tekin, M. (2014). Şehidler ayı şubat. *Yeni Akit*. Retrieved from <https://www.yeniakit.com.tr/yazarlar/mehmet-ali-tekin/sehidler-ayi-subat-4768.html>
- Tilly, C. (2004). *Social movements, 1768-2004*. Boulder, Colorado: Paradigm Publishers.
- Timeline: A history of Turkish coups. (2016). Retrieved from <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/europe/2012/04/20124472814687973.html>
- Toptas, M. (2008). Aaaahlar ateşe dönüşüyor. *Milli Gazete*. Retrieved from <https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/870358/mahmut-toptas/aaaahlar-ate-se-donusuyor>
- Toptas, M. (2013). Zalimin eliyle de bu din yücelir. *Milli Gazete*. Retrieved from <https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/859354/mahmut-toptas/zalimin-eliyle-de-bu-din-yucelir>

- Toptas, M. (2018). Dolara değil adama ihtiyacımız var. *Milli Gazete*. Retrieved from <https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/1681550/mahmut-toptas/dolara-degil-adama-ihtiyacimiz-var>
- Tugal, C. (2002). Islamism in Turkey: beyond instrument and meaning. *Economy and Society*, 31(1), 85-111. Retrieved from [https://sociology.berkeley.edu/sites/default/files/faculty/tugal/Islamism\\_in\\_Turkey.pdf](https://sociology.berkeley.edu/sites/default/files/faculty/tugal/Islamism_in_Turkey.pdf)
- Tugal, C. (2009a). *Passive Revolution: Absorbing the Islamic Challenge to Capitalism*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Tugal, C. (2009b). Transforming everyday life: Islamism and social movement theory. *Theory and Society*, 38, 423-458. Retrieved from <https://link.springer.com/content/pdf/10.1007%2Fs11186-009-9091-7.pdf>
- Tugal, C. (2013). Islam and the retrenchment of Turkish conservatism. A. Bayat (Ed.), *Post Islamism*. The Changing Faces of Political Islam. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Tuncer, F. (2020). Irkçılık bulaşıcı bir virüstür -2-. *Milli Gazete*. Retrieved from <https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/4842256/fatma-tuncer/irkcilik-bulasici-bir-virustur-2>
- Vicari, S. (2010). Measuring collective action frames: A linguistic approach to frame analysis. *Poetics*, 38(5), 504-525. Retrieved from <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0304422X10000458>.
- Waldman, S. A. & Caliskan, E. (2017). *The New Turkey and its Discontents*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- West, C. (1992). Malcolm X and Black rage. J. Wood (Ed.), *Malcolm X: In Our Own Image* (pp. 48-58). London: St. Martin's Press, 1992.
- Wickham, C. R. (2002). *Mobilizing Islam: Religion, activism, and political change in Egypt*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- X, M. (1963). *Message to the grass roots*. Retrieved from <http://xroads.virginia.edu/~public/civilrights/a0147.html>
- X, M. (1964). *The ballot or the bullet*. Retrieved from <http://americanradioworks.publicradio.org/features/blackspeech/mx.html>
- X, M. (2015). *The Autobiography of Malcolm X as Told to Alex Haley*. New York: Random House.
- Yavuz, M. H. (2020). *Nostalgia for the Empire: The Politics of Neo-Ottomanism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Yavuz, M. H. (2003). *Islamic Political Identity in Turkey*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

- Yavuz, H. (2006). Islam and Europeanization in Turkish-Muslim socio-political movements. T. A. Byrnes & P. J. Katzenstein (Eds.), *Religion in an Expanding Europe* (pp. 225-255). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Yavuz, M. H. (2009). *Secularism and Muslim Democracy in Turkey*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Yildirim, M. (2014). Şehitler direnişin adıdır. *Milli Gazete*. Retrieved from <https://www.milligazete.com.tr/makale/858506/mustafa-yildirim/sehitler-direnisin-adidir>
- Zelan, M. (2016). Bu güç, tek bir adam için çok fazla. *Yeni Safak*. Retrieved from <https://www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/muratzelan/bu-guc-tek-bir-adam-icin-cok-fazla-2031543>